Unbearable to the human heart

Child trafficking and action to eliminate it

International Labour Office
International Programme on the Elimination of Child labour (IPEC)
“...[T]he exploitation of childhood constitutes the evil the most hideous, the most unbearable to the human heart...”

Albert Thomas, first Director of the ILO
FOREWORD

The trafficking of human beings is unacceptable under any circumstances, but the trafficking of vulnerable children and young people is a violation of their rights to protection from exploitation, to play, to an education and to health, and to family life. The trafficking of children is not new; it has existed for many years and continues to grow across all continents and all cultures. Today, however, there is a new, strong will to take action to combat trafficking and to bring it to a speedy end.

Child trafficking is emerging as a global issue; nearly all countries are affected by this criminal violation of children’s rights. For some countries, the trafficking of children occurs within national boundaries and remains an essentially national issue. For many, it crosses borders and regions. The victims, mostly separated from their families and communities, end up in prostitution and other exploitative forms of work, such as agriculture, mining, manufacturing, fishing, begging and domestic service. They are vulnerable to abuse and exploitation and traumatized by this accumulation of denied rights. As this report shows, child trafficking is a highly complex phenomenon with no simple answers. While more is known about the problem today, there remains a knowledge gap both in the analysis of the problem and in finding effective solutions.

The denial of fundamental principles and rights at work has been a constant concern for the International Labour Organization. The organization has been promoting considerations of social justice and social progress with relentless determination. The ILO has also stood resolutely against the dangerous proposition that human labour should be valued merely as a commodity. The organization forcefully acts against forced labour, of adults and children alike.

The ILO Convention on the Worst of Forms of Child Labour (182) adopted in 1999 identifies the trafficking of children as a practice similar to slavery. The Convention calls for countries to take immediate action to secure the prohibition and elimination of all worst forms of child labour. By the end of March 2002, 117 member countries had ratified Convention No. 182.

The ILO’s International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC) implements technical cooperation programmes to support participating countries in combating child trafficking. From 1993 to 1995, such programmes operated in only a few Asian countries. Following the first World Congress against Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children in Stockholm in 1996, IPEC expanded its activities to combat trafficking in children worldwide, covering some 30 countries in Asia, Africa and Latin America, with scope for broader participation — including in other regions — in the future. Three IPEC participating countries — the United Republic of Tanzania, Nepal and El Salvador — have adopted time-bound programmes to end the worst forms of child labour, including child trafficking and children in prostitution. This was made possible thanks to donor contributions from Germany, Denmark, Japan, Spain, the United Kingdom and the United States.
Global experience in combating child trafficking is relatively young. Much remains to be understood about the problem and possible solutions. In this context, the sharing of information, experience and knowledge is crucial. It is for this purpose that the present report has been prepared. It aims to bring together the major elements of what is known about the problem of child trafficking around the world. It also presents some positive experiences in combating this highly complex problem, so that we all can learn and benefit from these experiences in planning future action.

The problem is huge in scope, multi-faceted and sensitive, both culturally and politically. Tackling this kind of complex issue is possible — as demonstrated in this report — when countries are committed to addressing the problem as a matter of urgency and when the international community is willing to join them and support them in:

- strengthening multi-sectoral alliances to combat child trafficking within countries and across borders;
- undertaking time-bound measures, programmes and plans — that is, setting specific goals and deadlines — to combat child trafficking and other worst forms of child labour; and linking this with the national development effort, particularly a poverty reduction strategy and the provision of quality education and skills training;
- broadening collaboration at bilateral, regional and international levels, including in fundamental areas such as data collection, planning, evaluation, capacity building and information sharing; and
- mobilizing international support for action to combat trafficking in children and maintaining children’s rights on the international agenda.

Based on the experience accumulated by many agencies and actors, we should be confident that good results can be achieved towards ending trafficking. It is urgent to act: the lives and future of millions of children depend on our individual and collective resolve.

Frans Röselers
Director
International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour (IPEC)
March 2002
COMBATING CHILD TRAFFICKING: At the heart of ILO values

The International Labour Organization (ILO) was founded to promote social justice as the foundation of international peace through the articulation and supervision of fundamental human rights in the world of work. This objective is always permeated by an underlying concern to foster an economic environment conducive to the human being’s aspiration to pursue both spiritual development and material well-being through work. From this perspective, the ILO regards trafficking both as a human rights violation and as a degrading misuse of human resources resulting in undignified and unproductive work.

Throughout its standards-related work, the ILO has dealt with the issue of human trafficking in relation to forced labour, the abuse of migrant workers, discrimination at work (particularly where certain sections of society, such as women or indigenous peoples, are disproportionately affected), and as one of the worst forms of child labour. The ILO stands for firm prosecution of child traffickers and firmly supports state- or civil society-sponsored institutions to prevent child trafficking, withdraw children from exploitation and restore their prospects of becoming responsible and productive citizens.

The ILO views the result of trafficking as an assault on human dignity and a denial of a person’s opportunity both to make the most of his/her resources and to contribute to the economic development of his or her nation. The types of exploitation suffered by victims of trafficking are the antithesis of “full, productive and freely chosen employment”. This is even more the case for children, where immediate exploitation is aggravated by a denial of the child’s rights to development that severely limits his/her potential to become a productive adult.

The ILO has for a long time dealt with child trafficking through its Forced Labour Convention (No. 29), that aims to eradicate “all work or service which is exacted from any person under the menace of any penalty and for which the said person has not offered himself voluntarily”. In its 2001 report to the International Labour Conference, the ILO Committee of Experts invited all States Parties to Forced Labour Conventions to report on measures taken to suppress trafficking in persons. The ILO Committee of Experts, an independent body of legal experts representing worldwide legal expertise, examines government reports on the application of these Conventions, together with any observations of employers’ and workers’ organizations, on a biennial basis.

Since 1999, the combat against trafficking has been reinforced by ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention (No.182) and Recommendation (No.190). This powerful instrument confirms child trafficking as a practice similar to slavery and calls for its immediate elimination.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

Foreword .................................................................................................................. V

Combating child trafficking: At the heart of ILO values ........................................ VII

Table of Contents .................................................................................................. IX

Executive Summary .............................................................................................. XI

## CHAPTER 1: CHILD TRAFFICKING: BEYOND DEFINITIONS

A simple term for a complex reality ........................................................................ 3

Moving towards consensus on a working definition .............................................. 5

- UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) ........................................... 5
- ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention (No. 182) .............................. 6
- UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children ................................................................. 7

## CHAPTER 2: UNDERSTANDING THE TRAFFICKING OF CHILDREN AND THE WORST FORMS OF CHILD LABOUR

How does trafficking work? .................................................................................. 9

The relationship between trafficking and the worst forms of child labour .......... 15

- Commercial sexual exploitation ........................................................................ 16
- Domestic work .................................................................................................... 19
- Armed conflict ................................................................................................... 21
- Other forms ........................................................................................................ 21

Root causes of child trafficking .............................................................................. 23

- Demand-side causes ...................................................................................... 23
- Supply-side causes .......................................................................................... 24

Consequences of trafficking .................................................................................. 29

## CHAPTER 3: EMERGING RESPONSES AND LESSONS LEARNED

National plans ........................................................................................................ 31

Local plans ............................................................................................................. 32

International and regional initiatives ..................................................................... 35

Mapping and situation analysis ........................................................................... 42

Direct action to fend off economic pressures ....................................................... 44

Education as prevention ...................................................................................... 46

Interception, rescue and reintegration: supporting trafficked children .............. 48

Engendering broad-based participation and support ........................................... 52

The law enforcement and judiciary sectors ......................................................... 54

Working with the news and information media.................................................... 55
Community mobilization and outreach .......................................................... 57
Involving children and young people ............................................................... 59

CHAPTER 4: THE WAY FORWARD ................................................................ 61
What the ILO brings to the combat against child trafficking .......................... 62
Setting national priorities and time-bound goals .......................................... 64
Working together at bilateral and international levels .................................. 64
Towards comprehensive programme interventions ........................................ 67
  Data gathering and programme planning .................................................. 67
  In-country capacity building ....................................................................... 68
  Empowerment of individuals ....................................................................... 68
  The force of law ............................................................................................ 69
  Prevention programmes ................................................................................. 69
  Interception, withdrawal, protection and reintegration of victims ................ 70

CONCLUSION ............................................................................................... 72
Acronyms and Abbreviations .......................................................................... 74
Bibliography .................................................................................................... 76
Useful websites ................................................................................................. 84
ILO regional programmes ............................................................................... 86
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The last decade of the twentieth century saw an unprecedented level of international concern over the trafficking of human beings, including broad recognition of the links between trafficking and the exploitation of children. Today, the trafficking of children is recognized as a distinct and egregious violation of children’s rights, comprising one of the worst forms of child labour. It is a growing problem that affects millions of children and families in many countries around the world. Unchecked, trafficking will continue to grow. Combating it, however, will require an intensive, collective effort on many levels.

Trafficking is not a discrete act. It is, in fact, a combination or series of events that takes place in the child’s home community, at transit points and at final destinations. It can occur within one country, across national borders or between regions, and involve several actors. While trafficking patterns vary, it is relatively common for children from rural areas to be trafficked for exploitation in urban centres, and for children from poor countries to be trafficked to wealthier neighbouring countries and beyond. Many different actors may be involved in the trafficking process, including recruiters, intermediaries, counterfeiters, transporters, employers, brothel/inn operators, and even friends and family members. Various means may be used to entrap the victims, including persuasion, deception, threats and coercion. Sometimes it is the children themselves or their families who take the initiative to migrate and who approach recruiters. Generally they have no idea of the fate that awaits them. Even if they are aware that hardships lie ahead, they rarely understand the nature nor the duration of the suffering they will face.

While most children continue to be trafficked into commercial sexual exploitation, a number of recent IPEC studies in Asia and Central and West Africa indicate that children are very often trafficked for other forms of labour exploitation as well. These include domestic service, armed conflict, service industries (restaurants, bars) and various other hazardous forms of work (for example in factories, agriculture, construction, fishing, begging). It has also been found that exploitation of trafficked children can be progressive; those trafficked for work in factories, domestic service or restaurants, may be later forced into prostitution; or children trafficked for prostitution may be resold more than once. It is therefore important to acknowledge the close links between trafficking into the sex trade and for other forms of exploitation.

The trafficking of children is a result of unmet demand for cheap and malleable labour in general and of demand for young girls and boys in the fast-growing commercial sex sector in particular. It is a misperception that child labour is cheap labour, however: children are generally less productive than adults. Children are simply easier to abuse: they are less assertive and less able to claim their rights than adults; and they can be made to work longer hours with less food, poor accommodation and no benefits. By allowing exploiters to keep their costs down, these types of abuse fuel the demand for trafficked children.

There are many supply factors that encourage the trafficking of children. Among the most prevalent are: poverty and the desire to earn a living or help support the family; lack of education and training; political conflict and natural disasters that devastate local economies; cultural attitudes toward children and girls in particular; and inadequate local laws and regulations. Other less quantifiable factors such as the demand for under-age sex and the profitability of relatively low-risk criminal activity also play a role in the growth of child trafficking.
Given these many variables, it is not surprising that the trafficking of children takes different forms in different regions (and indeed countries and sub-regions), depending on the coincidence and combinations of causal factors, actors, routes and mechanisms involved, and the regional predominance of particular variables. What is clear, however, is that globally cross-border trafficking has increased in recent years as a result of increased economic differentials between neighbouring countries and the growth in people movements that has resulted. Conflict in many regions of the world has also contributed to both general relocation of populations and increased vulnerability, both of which are strong precursors of increased child trafficking.

The consequences of trafficking on both children and their communities are many. In the worst cases, it can be responsible for a child’s disappearance or death, or can permanently damage his/her physical and mental health. It might also encourage drug dependency, break families apart, and deprive children of their rights to an education and freedom from exploitation. If trapped in commercial sexual exploitation, a child may suffer violence at the hands of clients, the physical and emotional damage of premature sexual activity, and exposure to sexually transmitted diseases (STDs) including HIV/AIDS. The situation of trafficked girls is especially marked by the risk of pregnancy, early motherhood and reproductive illnesses that might affect their ability to have children in later life.

Combating child trafficking requires programme interventions that are comprehensive in addressing both the causes and the processes associated with trafficking, wherever they are found on the trafficking route. Interventions must not only target children, but also their families, their communities, the recruiters, traffickers and exploiters, and society at large.

Governments, international organizations, civil society groups, communities, and families have taken action to combat the trafficking of children. They have made efforts to better understand the issue and have drawn up policy frameworks at national and local levels. Concrete interventions have been launched to reduce the vulnerability of at-risk children, families and communities, by addressing the root causes of vulnerability, including poverty and social attitudes, while providing alternatives to victims withdrawn from exploitation. More stringent policing and legislation directly targeting traffickers have also been introduced in some countries. The Governments of the United Republic of Tanzania, Nepal and El Salvador, for example, have made a commitment to combat child trafficking and child prostitution in the framework of an ILO-IPEC Time-Bound Programme to eliminate the worst forms of child labour in their respective countries over a set time frame.

Because it is often cross-border or -region, the trafficking of children must also be addressed at bilateral, subregional and international levels. To this end, a number of bilateral and subregional initiatives are being undertaken among countries in Asia, Europe, and Central and West Africa. For its part, the ILO has built on its experience to launch and develop subregional programmes to combat trafficking and sexual exploitation in Africa, Central America, Europe, South America, South Asia and South-East Asia. In its programming, the ILO emphasises data gathering and strategic framework planning, in-country capacity building, prevention, interception, withdrawal and reintegration of trafficked children, legal literacy training and support to the legal rights of victims. The ILO, through IPEC, will continue to harness its operational and technical
expertise in combating child labour in more than 90 countries, its privileged working relationship with labour sector constituents, and the panoply of international legal instruments and mechanisms against child labour, particularly its worst forms, in the combat against child trafficking.

Far too many children have been victims of trafficking and many more are in danger of becoming victims. Building on existing knowledge and experience, all countries are urged to address the problem of child trafficking as a matter of urgency. The international community must support action to combat child trafficking within countries and across borders by undertaking time-bound measures, programmes and plans, and by broadening collaboration at bilateral, regional and international levels.
CHILD TRAFFICKING: BEYOND DEFINITIONS
CHILD TRAFFICKING: Beyond definitions

A simple term for a complex reality

The last decade of the twentieth century saw an unprecedented level of international concern over the trafficking of human beings. Broad recognition of the links between trafficking and the exploitation of children in particular also emerged as the children’s rights movement gained momentum during this period. Today, abhorrence of the slavery-like practices associated with child trafficking has put this criminal activity squarely on the international agenda as a distinct and egregious violation of children rights and comprising one of the worst forms of child labour.

People were first referred to as ‘traffickers’ as early as the mid-sixteenth century, although at that time the label implied neither wrongdoing nor internal or cross-border movements. Traffickers were simply traders, and the two terms were roughly synonymous. By the end of that century, however, ‘trafficking’ had become disassociated from trading and was used to refer to the sale of illicit or disreputable goods. It is in this form that it first appeared in the discourse of politics, law and social development, where it came to denote the smuggling of contraband – often drugs or weapons but not yet human beings – across borders for profit. Towards the end of the nineteenth century, when the term ‘trafficking’ finally came into common usage to also refer to the illicit trade in human beings and their displacement across borders or within a country, it represented an amalgamation of the various meanings attributed to the word at various times: movement, illicit trade, and people as merchandise.

The first international treaty to address trafficking in human beings was the International Agreement for the Suppression of White Slave Traffic (1904). Today, the term has re-emerged on political and operational agendas around the world with an expanded meaning informed by current discourse on migration, changes in prostitution patterns, the feminist and gender debate, increased attention to human rights and, most recently, children’s rights. In effect, ‘trafficking’ has proved a useful and simple label for a complex phenomenon, whose wide-ranging manifestations and root causes necessitate a multi-strategy response.

Although a distinct issue, the trafficking of children is often discussed together with trafficking of women. This is not only because the same mechanisms and processes often apply to both, but also because much of the available data on trafficking of women is not clearly disaggregated by age. For example, many reports on the trafficking of women state that the majority of women coerced into prostitution are between 16 and 24 years of age. However, 16 and 17 year-old girls are children according to the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) and the ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention (No. 182). In order to set priorities for policy and programme interventions that combat trafficking of children, it is essential to understand the context and the magnitude of trafficking of those under the age of 18. At the same time, policy and interventions must make clear distinctions between the suppression of trafficking of adults and that of children. In the case of adults, the recognition of the right to make informed decisions and choices, even if this includes the choice to remain in exploitative situations, will continue to be an issue of debate and has to be considered in
programme interventions. In the case of children, the international consensus is to withdraw them from exploitation without delay. Action to combat the trafficking of children can and should be an integral part of action to combat the trafficking of adults.

Determining whether or not a child or adult is being ‘trafficked’ requires a nuanced working definition of trafficking that distinguishes it from other types of activities. Trafficking as a distinct, discrete act does not really exist. It is, in fact, a combination or series of events that occur at places of origin, transit points and destinations, involving potentially both legal and illegal acts.

Various means can be used to entrap victims, including persuasion, deception, threats and coercion, and these can involve different actors, including recruiters, intermediaries, transporters, employers, brothel/inn operators, and even families and friends. The methods of entrapment, as well as the means of transport/movement and the nature of the exploitation, can also have significant regional and national variations. What transforms this chain of events into ‘trafficking’ is the exploitation of the child or adult who is being relocated, whether that exploitation occurs at the beginning, during or at the end of the trafficking process.

Exploitation, always illegal in international law and national laws, may occur at any point in the chain of events that, taken together, are recognized as trafficking. It may occur, for example, if the child is misled with false reports or promises, coerced, or otherwise forcibly recruited or handed over to transporters. It may also occur when the child is transported: a child might be told s/he is going to a nearby big city, only to be moved elsewhere, or a child or family might be charged an exorbitant fee in order to ensnare them in debt bondage. Trafficking may be said to have taken place when the child is recruited as a dancer but forced into prostitution, or by the withholding of wages or their payment to a third party. It may take the form of exploitative and/or abusive conditions to which the child is subjected, including physical and mental abuse or confinement, inadequate or non-existent health care, poor accommodation and hazardous work.

Alien smuggling is often a component of cross-border trafficking, although the smugglers themselves may not be traffickers if, in the process of transferring the child, they are not involved in exploiting him/her or otherwise subjecting the child to abuse of any kind. According to the United States (US) Congress definition — which seems to be the clearest and most widely applicable — alien smuggling is the “provision of a service, albeit illegal, to people who knowingly buy the service in order to get into a foreign country”. As will be shown in this report, this would apply to those providing services to the many children who willingly seek out ways to relocate to another country in order to work or sometimes just in the vague hope of a better life. Alien smuggling is an issue of relevance to consideration of trafficking, however, because many smuggled people will fall into the hands of exploiters, thus entering the ranks of trafficking victims under international law.

Irregular migration also involves actors who may or may not be traffickers per se. These include recruiting agents who help minors to acquire false documentation so that they can be employed in other countries (for example by providing to 15 year-old girls passports certifying that they are over 18 and documentation that they are to be employed as ‘dancers’); and service, agricultural or industrial sector representatives who employ under-age children and falsify reports or do not report. It also involves corrupt migration,
police or customs officials who facilitate the illegal exit or entry of children. These actors are not only in violation of migration laws, but they also may be committing fraud, counterfeiting or breaking labour laws. Furthermore, if they are at any point deceiving, abusing or exploiting the child, then they are also trafficking.

Traffickers may even follow legal migration procedures to implement their exploitative schemes. As exploitation is the key to determining whether or not a person has been trafficked, it is important to understand what exactly is meant by exploitation.¹ In this report, the focus will be mainly on exploitation in labour and the sexual exploitation of children.

Moving towards consensus on a working definition

If coordinated and comprehensive efforts are to be made to combat trafficking, then there has to be consensus on a working definition of what it is. Reaching international accord on this has been as complex as the issue itself. Early international legal instruments were criticized both for their narrow focus on prostitution and for failing to fully protect children from the many hazards they face across the wide scope of the trafficking process. Negotiations on the UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, especially Women and Children (2000), for example, dwelled extensively on the question of whether trafficking can exist if the victim has not been coerced. The answer matters because it determines the criminal liability of the perpetrator or, more particularly, whether or not the penalties and measures proposed in the overarching UN Convention on Transnational Organized Crime apply to a particular situation.

In some respects, the variations found in the definitions of trafficking in international instruments and frameworks are both inevitable and legitimate, and in no way represent confusion or disagreement. Each international instrument relates to the place the organization of reference occupies in the international multilateral structure, for example as a crime-focused or rights-focused body. As a result, what might at first seem an uneven handling of trafficking issues across organizations is actually more a question of approach and context than a difference of intent, and allows different organizations working in this area to accommodate institutional objectives and contexts. Practically speaking, then, a wide working definition permits accommodation of the specific objectives of the different, yet complementary international instruments that have been adopted by the international community over the years.

From the major international instruments that are of relevance to the fight against trafficking, therefore, has grown sufficient consensus on the nature of trafficking to make debate and joint action possible:

**UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC)**

Because trafficking involves serious violations of children’s rights, the 1989 UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) is highly relevant and applicable. The CRC, while neither defining trafficking nor addressing it as a specific issue, spells out a clear rights-based approach that serves as an invaluable guide for action to combat trafficking and protect vulnerable children. In dealing with children’s rights, the CRC uses

---

¹ The UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons requires coverage of at least four types of exploitation: exploitation in prostitution, other forms of sexual exploitation, slavery/similar practices, and removal of organs.
a protection framework built on its over-arching call for the child to be considered the
subject, not object of rights and of all rights simultaneously. Article 32 of the CRC
stipulates the “right of the child to be protected from economic exploitation and from
performing any work that is likely to be hazardous or to interfere with the child’s
education, or to be harmful to the child’s health or physical, mental, spiritual, moral or
social development”; Articles 9, 10 and 11 also have provisions for illicit movement of
the child; Article 34 calls on States Parties “to protect the child from all forms of sexual
exploitation and sexual abuse... [including] the inducement or coercion of a child to
engage in prostitution or other unlawful sexual practices”, and Article 35 aims to protect
children from being treated as chattels. An Optional Protocol to the CRC, on the Sale
of Children, Child Prostitution and Child Pornography (2000), which entered into
effect in January 2002, explicitly relates to the prostitution and trafficking of children,
although it does not attempt to define trafficking further.

ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention (No. 182) and
Recommendation (No. 190)

Since 1999, the ILO’s work against child trafficking has been reinforced by the adoption of
the ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention (No. 182). This declares child trafficking
to be unacceptable in all countries regardless of their level of development, and calls for
it to be eliminated without further delay. It confirms that child trafficking is a practice
similar to slavery, and belongs in the same category as forced labour. Convention 182
urges countries to both prohibit and eliminate trafficking of children (under 18 years of
age). It not only targets trafficking that leads to exploitation in more recognizable labour
situations (sweatshops, domestic work, agriculture and fishing, for example), but also in
illicit or criminal situations (drug trafficking and prostitution). In addition, Convention
182 suggests operational guidelines to effectively eliminate child trafficking, while
providing protection for boys and girls who have fallen victim to trafficking or are at risk
of doing so. Ratifying States commit themselves to:

1. Undertake immediate and effective measures to secure the prohibition and
elimination of trafficking of girls and boys under 18 years of age.

2. Establish mechanisms to monitor child trafficking: its incidence, development,
patterns, links with organized crime. Monitoring includes developing methods
for gathering critical information, identifying and publishing successful strategies,
and regularly reviewing the success with which various actors (eg labour
inspectors, law enforcement officers, immigration officials, customs officers,
judiciary) discharge their responsibilities.

3. Draw up a programme of action to eliminate child trafficking as a matter of
priority. Measures to combat trafficking must be properly enforced.

4. Implement effective and time-bound measures to:
   • prevent children from being trafficked;
   • provide the necessary and appropriate direct assistance for both the
     removal of children from exploitative situations and for their rehabilitation
     and social integration; eg reporting procedures and helplines, rehabilitation
     programmes and shelters for child victims of sexual abuse and exploitation,
     and family reunification;
• ensure access to free basic education and, wherever possible and appropriate, vocational training for all children rescued from trafficking;
• identify and reach out to children at special risk of being trafficked; and take account of the situation of girls.

5 Designate an authority responsible for coordinating action against child trafficking;

6 Seek and impart international assistance to combat child trafficking and assist victims, for example through bilateral or regional agreements for repatriation of trafficked children.

UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children

The UN Protocol to Prevent, Suppress and Punish Trafficking in Persons, Especially Women and Children adopted in December 2000 represents a direct attempt at comprehensively defining trafficking in international law. Responding to growing organized criminal involvement in trafficking in human beings, this Protocol was designed as a tool for combating cross-border trafficking through judicial and law enforcement means. It supplements the UN Convention against Transnational Organized Crime and emphasizes putting in place effective legal and law enforcement frameworks and responses. These include: the criminalizing of traffickers, not victims; protection of victims from revictimization; sanctioning of individuals and organizations involved in trafficking; and promotion of child-friendly procedures for securing testimony.

The Protocol provides the current internationally accepted definition of trafficking developed in consultation with governments and a wide range of international organizations working in the field of human rights. Article 3(a) of the Protocol defines trafficking as “... the recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of persons, by means of the threat or use of force or other forms of coercion, of abduction, of fraud, of deception, of the abuse of power or of position of vulnerability or of the giving or receiving of payments or benefits to achieve the consent of a person having control over another person, for the purpose of exploitation.” The Protocol points out that, as far as children are concerned, “recruitment, transportation, transfer, harbouring or receipt of a child for the purpose of exploitation shall be considered ‘trafficking in persons’ even if this does not involve any of the means set forth in the definition”. In line with ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention (No. 182), it specifies that exploitation shall include “forced labour or services, slavery or practices similar to slavery [or] servitude”.

UNDERSTANDING THE TRAFFICKING OF CHILDREN AND THE WORST FORMS OF CHILD LABOUR
UNDERSTANDING THE TRAFFICKING OF CHILDREN AND THE WORST FORMS OF CHILD LABOUR

It is important to understand the process of child trafficking from start to finish, including the political, economic, social and cultural contexts in which it occurs, the various actors involved, typical geographic patterns, the types of exploitative labour in which trafficked children are victimized, and the root and contributing causes of the problem. Identifying and analysing these variables allows the planning of a range of interventions at a number of different stages in the trafficking process, including preventive measures, detection and identification of the children at points of departure, transit and arrival, support to children trapped in exploitative work, and post-trafficking rehabilitative efforts. It also allows key players to identify the role they can play according to their strengths, competencies and access.

This chapter does not aim to provide a comprehensive account of child trafficking in every region and country of the world. The examples provided here have been chosen because they illustrate particular types and characteristics of child trafficking. It should also be noted that the trafficking of children for labour and sexual exploitation is generally hidden from the public view, making it almost impossible to quantify so that most statistics are illustrative rather than accurate. Existing data is scattered and in some regions, such as Africa and Latin America, the trafficking of children is considered a ‘new’ issue, with the result that data collection methodologies are not yet fully developed. The full extent of child trafficking is therefore not entirely known or understood. Although statistics are regularly quoted, they must be considered with caution, and their methods of calculation must be noted if they are to have meaning. There is a need for significantly more grassroots-level research and independent monitoring and analysis before a complete picture can emerge, and the challenge of collecting quantitative data using methods that allow comparison and trend-detection has still to be met.

How does trafficking work?

Understanding the various actors and stages involved in the trafficking of children helps target measures to combat it. A comprehensive approach to eliminating child trafficking must address it at every level and must reach every category of actor involved. In this way, not only will trafficking be addressed, but the exploitative work into which children are trafficked can be targeted as well. It is important, then, to begin at the beginning and see how children are caught up at the very start of the trafficking process. This can happen in a number of ways, including:
UNDERSTANDING THE TRAFFICKING OF CHILDREN AND THE WORST FORMS OF CHILD LABOUR

... by force, coercion, complicity, or ignorance

Children may become victims of trafficking by force, coercion, trickery — including the administration of drugs — family and other complicity, or by much gentler persuasion, misinformation, or through ignorance about what really awaits them at their destination. They may subsequently be moved by road, air, rail or sea across international borders or within a country, for example, from a rural community to an urban area or tourist resort.

When children are relocated, they are extremely vulnerable. They are separated from their own environment and may be isolated in illegal situations in unfamiliar places where they are ill treated and unable to communicate or assert their rights. If they have moved or been moved across borders, they may be additionally isolated by inability to speak the language or understand the system in which they must live and work. Even if they are able to seek help, they may not know where to go to find help, or how to ask for it.

... through voluntary recruitment of unsuspecting victims

While coercive or deceptive relocation of children is one way that children are trafficked, the fact is that many children voluntarily go with recruiters who traffic them. NGOs in some parts of Asia, for example, report an increase in voluntary recruitment, with the family or child coming to believe that relocation for employment is beneficial, and where the child may even seek out the recruiters. The trafficking of Eastern European minors into Western Europe is an example of trafficking in which the young people may themselves seek to relocate, so that the process is non-coercive until the point of arrival. Women and children are encouraged to travel voluntarily by pimps, recruiters (often among family and friends), women returning with tales of a better life and higher pay, and a general perception that there is money to be earned elsewhere. They may even willingly pay for travel or for documents. Such situations, regardless of their voluntary inception, frequently lead to exploitation.

"...the smugglers split up families, exchange the children, and say that the child will be left here now and will be sent with the next group, 'and if you catch you and you say anything about us, the child will be hurt'... They drug the children, the adults, and mix sleeping pills into their food so they don't see which route they are taking." 2

Border guard on the Hungary/Romania border

Once children have been forced, encouraged or helped to relocate, they will move either within their own country or across borders, sometimes transiting one or more countries before they arrive at their destination. The relocation element of the trafficking process, therefore, occurs:

... within a country

In very many countries, children are trafficked from rural to urban areas for exploitation in labour and in commercial sex. This reflects both economic differentials - real and perceived - between rural areas and cities, and demand in urban areas that also often includes tourism-related demand. Tourism also draws children from the country to resort areas, and there are additionally patterns of seasonal movement for labour in agriculture. In Brazil, for example, adults and children are trafficked internally on a regular basis from poor areas, where seasonal unemployment and drought increase their vulnerability to recruitment, to work in areas where cheap labour is required for mining, seasonal work in forest clearance, charcoal production and agricultural activities. Adults and children are moved en masse in trucks or buses to labour sites sometimes thousands of kilometres away from their homes. In South-East Asia (for example Indonesia and the Philippines), internal trafficking of children from poor/rural areas to more affluent areas, following typical push and pull patterns from areas of poverty to areas of relative affluence and opportunity, is very common.

... across national borders

Cross-border trafficking is becoming widespread in all regions, as economic differentials between neighbouring countries widen and reflecting increased people movement in general. Patterns of cross-border trafficking are influenced by a variety of factors. Proximity and facility of movement are important determinants. The pull of a thriving economy or tourist industry increases demand and heavily influences trafficking routes. Children are trafficked to countries that share a common language, or to countries that have fairly large immigrant communities from the child’s country of origin. For example, women and children from Nepal and Bangladesh are trafficking to India because of both proximity and high demand in the sex industry. Similarly, in South-East Asia, children are trafficked into Thailand from Myanmar and Laos. In Africa, children from all over West Africa enter Nigeria and also transit the country en route to Gabon, Cameroon, Equatorial Guinea and Benin. South Africa, the largest economy in Africa, is a destination and transit country for children from the whole continent. Growing poverty in the countries of Eastern Europe, increasing demand for labour of all kinds in Western Europe and the facility of open borders have resulted in massive people movements - both legal and illegal – from east to west and in trafficking of both children and adults into and among all the countries of Western Europe.

Having not been able to pay any transportation cost, she went with a bus driver who offered to take her for free to a factory job in Thailand. She was sold to the brothel owner, who told her that she could not leave until she worked off the money he paid to the driver. She was never told how much. She was given 2,500 Baht (US$67), and believes that she cannot leave. She does not know how much she earns per client, or how long it will take her to work off her debt.

A child victim of trafficking into Thailand from the border areas

3- ILO: Stopping forced labour (Geneva, 2001) p.25
5- Molo Songololo: The trafficking of children for purposes of sexual exploitation: South Africa, (Cape Town, 2000) p.44.
At many different stages of the process of trafficking, the child faces the possibility of exploitation and abuse, both physical and psychological. This may involve beatings, sexual violence, the administration of drugs, threats to the child and perhaps the family left behind.

Trafficking, therefore:

... often subjects the child to multiple abuses

Exploitation is often progressive: a child trafficked into one form of labour might be then further abused in another. In Nepal, girls recruited to work in carpet factories, hotels and restaurants have been subsequently trafficked into the sex industry in India.7 Similarly, in the Philippines and many other countries, children who migrate or are recruited for the hotel and tourism industry to work in restaurants, bars, and cafés, for example, often end up in commercial sexual exploitation.8 In Indonesia, it was found that some girls who are recruited to work in small soft drink and food stalls in Jakarta become involved in providing sexual services in order to have sufficient income to survive in the city.9

... involves many different actors and supporting mechanisms

Different actors may be involved at each stage of the trafficking process. First, there may be the recruiter or, in some cases, an agent or a process10 that prompts the child to move. This may be, for example, a village recruiter who identifies the child and gains acquiescence of his or her caregivers, sometimes by deception, sometimes through an agreed payment. Or it may be a friend, family member or an acquaintance who persuades the child that relocation offers benefits. In Acapulco, Mexico, for example, many girls exploited in commercial sex report having been enticed to relocate by family, boyfriends, or pimps with promises of jobs as waitresses or in other service work.11 In Pakistan, pimps approach families and offer money to place the child in work or a suitable marriage – thus putting the child in debt bondage – or they seek out runaway or otherwise vulnerable children directly.12

---

8- See ILO-IPEC: Internal trafficking in children for the worst forms of child labour, the Philippines country report, (Geneva, 2001)
9- ILO-IPEC and University of Indonesia (Department of Social Welfare), op. cit., p. 22.
10- This is a much under-researched area. Processes, for example, include such things as advertising and image transmission that raise children’s expectations of what they want to attain in life and send signals that these are attainable ‘elsewhere’ or with greater income. Many children interviewed by ILO-IPEC rapid assessment teams along the Thai/Myanmar/Laos borders, for example, cited “wanting to buy nice things” as the main reason they decided to relocate for work.
In Central Asia and the Commonwealth of Independent States (CIS), adolescents are lured with promises of jobs as waitresses, dancers or hotel maids, and are sometimes recruited openly for the sex trade. There are a number of avenues of recruitment: low-skilled jobs overseas are advertised in newspapers; marriage agencies or mail-order bride agencies advertise for young women and girls on the Internet or in print adverts; friends, relatives or acquaintances talk the girls into accepting work; trafficked women who have returned recruit others and make a commission on the transaction.¹³

The adolescents who are recruited ‘willingly’ generally have no idea of the conditions under which they will be held and most believe that they will return home with substantial savings after six months or a year. In reality, few keep more than a tiny fraction of the money they earn, and most are subjected to restriction on their movements, regular beatings, psychological threats and violence, unprotected sex, and no access to health facilities.

“I am now about 14 years old. Last year, I was offered work in Denpasar by an older man. I had never seen this man before. He promised to finance my study to the evening junior high school. I was so happy and so were my parents... Things did not go like I wished. The next day, he told us to beg. Every day I do ‘ngangendong’ (begging for goods, not cash) and get about 5 or 10 kilos of rice. He must have gotten a lot of money if he exchanged the rice for cash.”¹⁴

₁⁴-year-old Indonesian boy coerced into begging in Bali

Sometimes children are recruited through more organized mechanisms, ranging from small-time agents working under the guise of a tour agency/employment office to larger crime syndicates. In Burkina Faso, Cameroon and Côte d’Ivoire, children are trafficked by placement agencies that identify opportunities and use intermediaries to recruit children, usually girls, from families with which they may already have made contact.¹⁵ The children tend to be trafficked for domestic service or for work on plantations or in mines.

Once the child is recruited, someone will generally then be responsible for moving him/her to another place or facilitating the transport. In some instances, this may be a local truck driver, a trafficking agent who will accompany the child across a border, or an organized criminal group that will move numbers of children along the routes also used for the transfer of drugs or stolen cars. It may also be a family member or friend who just drives the child to the new location in the family car.

All along the road from acquisition to exploitation, there may be people who can be described as indirectly complicit: taxi and bus drivers, ships’ captains, train guards, immigration officials, border guards, hotel clerks, and even bystanders who do not act when they see a confused or distressed child with an accompanying adult who seems to be unmoved. Along trafficking routes between Nepal and India, for example, it is reported that long-distance lorry drivers are often bribed to transport children.¹⁶

---

¹³- See IOM: Trafficking and prostitution: The growing exploitation of migrant women from Central and Eastern Europe, (Geneva, 1995).
¹⁴- ILO-IPEC and University of Indonesia: op. cit. p. 30.
Accessories to trafficking may be involved in the production and supply of forged identity and travel papers that make the trafficking victim more difficult to trace and leave him or her in a situation of illegal migration, in fear of detection and vulnerable to threats and continued coercion.

... occurs according to some distinguishable patterns

Since trafficking is such a complex and multi-faceted problem comprising so many diverse elements, it is not surprising that these elements combine in different ways according to differing circumstances and that patterns can be distinguished. These patterns, moreover, have definite regional/national variations. Although it remains, of course, true that there is no single pattern of trafficking in a country or region, there are dominant patterns, and it is useful to be aware of these in order to begin programming responses region by region.

The most prevalent form of trafficking in Central and West Africa, for example, relates to traditional schemes of ‘placement’ of children in extended families where, increasingly, they are exploited not only in domestic work but also in other forms of labour. Conflict has also contributed to the trafficking of children, not only by increasing their vulnerability but also through militia-initiated abduction and exploitation. Children are trafficked for domestic service, in family businesses, commercial sex, on plantations and mine sites and general labour.

The countries of Australasia, the Far East and Pacific are in general affluent countries with poor neighbours, and trafficking into the region more regularly follows patterns of irregular migration, especially demand-pulled recruitment of women and girls into the sex trade. Parallel to this, semi-commercial transactions such as mail-order bride schemes and the activities of organized crime syndicates also result from the juxtaposition of affluent and impoverished lifestyles. Children are trafficked for unskilled work, into commercial sex, as mail-order brides or ‘sons’.

In Central Asia and the CIS, trafficking is regularly a result of the ‘push’ of poverty and scarce opportunities in the wake of economic depression and societal dislocation, facilitated by petty criminals who aim to make gains from exploiting those who seek survival opportunities elsewhere. Children and especially adolescents are trafficked into service industries and the entertainment sector, for the sex trade, and for pornography and as mail-order brides.

In Western and Eastern Europe, trafficking is mostly from east to west, reflecting both the ‘pull’ of unmet demand for cheap labour and commercial sex, and increased people movements (both legal and illegal) resulting from conflict, the impoverishment of transition societies, the workforce needs of western economies, and the access provided by open borders. Open borders and functioning criminal routes come into play alongside regular migration. Children are trafficked for unskilled labour, work in the entertainment sector and for commercial sex. Some are used for petty crime. In Northern Europe, there is a clear pattern of trafficking between the poorer Baltic States and the affluent cities of Scandinavia, reflecting historical as well as geographical links, following sea trade and exchange routes and traditional patterns of movement. Children are trafficked into begging, street hawking, unskilled labour and commercial sex.
Trafficking in South-East Asia remains overwhelmingly poverty-pushed, exacerbated by low understanding of the consequences of trafficking, high expectations of life ‘elsewhere’ and shifting economic differentials in the region. It is predominantly from rural to urban areas, from poor to wealthier (but not necessarily wealthy) countries. It reflects both the growth in the sex industry and the commoditization of children and women. In addition to being trafficked into the sex sector, children are also trafficked for a wide range of service, industrial and agricultural work, as well as to beg and hawk on the streets. Young women are also recruited as mail-order brides and for domestic service.

In South Asia, trafficking is an extension of the very serious child labour problem, with poverty, families and ignorance determinant in the vulnerability of children to exploitation. These also characterize the nature of trafficking, which revolves around deception, debt bondage and economic imbalance. Children are trafficked into commercial sex, into carpet and garment factories, for street hawking and begging, on construction projects, tea plantations, in manufacturing or brick kilns. Young boys are trafficked to work as camel jockeys.

Patterns of trafficking in the Americas and Caribbean are only now beginning to emerge. Much of the trafficking is tourism-driven, as children and adults follow demand for both labour and commercial sex in resort areas, although there is also much general movement of children both domestically and across borders for exploitative labour in general. Criminal operations with established trafficking mechanisms for the movement of drugs and contraband are reported to be getting involved in human trafficking. Children are also trafficked as seasonal labour, in service sector jobs, as domestic help, as drug couriers and for commercial sex.

In the Middle East and North Africa, finally, there are a number of different patterns of trafficking, depending to a large extent on the proximity of other regional centres, but into the more affluent countries of this large region, trafficking is mostly characterized by discrimination on ethnic or gender grounds and high demand for child labour and commercial sex. Girls are trafficked to work in domestic service, and boys are trafficked into the region to work as ‘camel kids’.

The relationship between trafficking and the worst forms of child labour

While the relationship between trafficking and commercial sexual exploitation is well established, and while commercial sexual exploitation remains the predominant form of exploitation of trafficked children, a number of IPEC studies in Asia and Central and Western Africa indicate that children are also trafficked for labour exploitation more generally.17 Trafficked children are often placed in exploitative domestic work, unregulated industrial work, work on construction sites, in the service sector such as laundries or restaurants, in agriculture or street-based informal activity, such as hawking or begging, and in the tourism sector, for example as maids or dancers. Some trafficked children become drug couriers or are co-opted into militias in a number of different roles, including to fight.

Many children who are trafficked for labour exploitation may subsequently end up in the commercial sex trade, and vice versa. Their helplessness and illegal status make them

highly vulnerable to coercion, mistreatment and transfer. A good example of this are children – both boys and girls – who cross the land border between Albania and Greece in order to seek casual work as street vendors in tourist resorts such as Thessaloniki. Children returning to Albania report that, after some time in the exploitative care of ‘operators’ who control street hawking, they were encouraged or sometimes forced into commercial sex by their ‘handlers’. Conversely, girls and young women trafficked into commercial sex are sometimes transferred into bar jobs or hotel work when they become ill.18

There is ongoing debate in the child rights sector about whether commercial sexual exploitation should be separated in both debate and programming from other forms of labour exploitation of children. The fact is, however, that the links between the two are so close that it may not be in the interests of child victims of exploitation to make such a clear division. Many children enter sexual exploitation after exploitation in labour. Many young people are motivated to relocate because they are seeking ways to earn a living. Some of them look upon prostitution as ‘work’. With regard to prevention, protection and rescue of the child, therefore, the separation between commercial sexual exploitation and exploitation in labour seems largely irrelevant.

However, as the focus shifts to programming to decrease demand, rather than just protect the child, it is becoming clear that there is a distinction between those who exploit children as cheap labour or to otherwise make a profit from them (including in the sex trade) and those who purchase the sexual services of minors – the ‘clients’ or ‘abusers’. As an illustration of this, it is clear that demonstrating to a factory owner, for example, that employing adults instead of children may make better business sense in the long term (for clear economic reasons including likely capacity of the worker, avoiding legal sanctions, maintaining consumer fidelity etc), such economic realities would hold no sway with child sex abusers, whose motivation is based neither on economics nor on logic. Although there is reluctance to enter debates on morality or behaviour modification programming, it is clear that information and awareness campaigns based on simple logic and accepted values are unlikely to succeed in deterring abusers, whereas they may well influence employers of child labour and consumers subject to market realities. It is therefore important to ensure that both the links between commercial sexual exploitation of children (CSEC) and child labour and the differences between them are always taken into consideration.

Commercial sexual exploitation

Trafficking of girls (and less often boys) for commercial sexual exploitation is widespread, and encompasses all patterns of trafficking: internal, cross border, inter-regional, and international. Although most child sex abusers are local men, regions well known for sex tourism are also frequent destinations for trafficked children brought in to satisfy foreign tourists, underlining the demand-driven nature of this particular form of exploitation. Importantly, recent research shows that in most parts of the world the prostitution of children is an extension of the adult sex trade, with most abusers being regular prostitute users who may, or may not specifically have an interest in purchasing sex with minors. This means that, to a large extent, the trafficking of children into commercial sexual exploitation follows patterns of trafficking in women into the sex trade, and/or patterns of growth in the commercial sex sector. Trafficking for commercial sex occurs in myriad ways.

18- Interview with welfare workers at the Rehabilitation Centre for Torture Victims, Ioannina, Greece.
Women and girls may themselves take the initiative to migrate in the hope of earning a decent income, escaping a miserable life, or supporting a family back home. In such cases, they are sometimes aware that they are going to work in commercial sex, considering this to be an acceptable short-term remedy to a desperate need to earn a living. They very rarely, however, are aware of the nature of the demands that will be made upon them, the conditions in which they are likely to be held or the possible long-term repercussions of the activity (including reproductive illnesses and social exclusion). Research shows that children suffer especially severely in the commercial sex trade: they are forced to accept large numbers of clients, can almost never negotiate safe sex, are often beaten or otherwise ill-treated. Because of the illegal and clandestine nature of prostitution of children, their ‘keepers’ most regularly keep them locked away from public view, depriving them not only of access to education and health facilities but even of fresh air and exercise.

Both adults and minors entering the sex trade may in other cases be recruited by small-scale, individual traffickers or well-established placement agencies, sometimes under false pretences, entering into a form of debt bondage on behalf of their family or to raise money in situations of intense need. In fewer but not insignificant cases, they may be kidnapped and sold, for example by criminal gangs who have links into cross-border crime syndicates, or by militia. Regardless of whether it has been initiated voluntarily or under threat of force, commercial sex is hazardous, exploitative work that puts women and girls at serious risk of ill health, including STDs and HIV/AIDS, reproductive illnesses, premature pregnancy, confinement and physical and mental abuse. In some cases, the victims are forcibly transferred from place to place so that their exploiters can make new profits (resulting also in their being more difficult to trace).

“One day I tried to run away from the brothel, but I was caught by the guard at a railway station and sent back. They tortured me and sold me to another brothel. I refused to be involved in prostitution. So the second brothel owner sold me to a third one.”

Rescued Nepali trafficking victim

In Africa, girls are trafficked for commercial sex to developed countries, for example Nigerian girls to Italy, Belgium and the Netherlands. Estimates of children in prostitution in South Africa range between 28,000 and 30,000, approximately half of whom are between 10 and 14 years of age, and half of whom are between 15 and 18. Young girls exploited in commercial sex arrive from different parts of the region — Mozambique, Angola, Zimbabwe, Lesotho, Swaziland, Zambia, Cameroon, Malawi, Rwanda, Senegal, Kenya, the United Republic of Tanzania, Uganda and Ethiopia.

Much of the trafficking of women and children in the Americas and the Caribbean is tourism-driven, with the destination being resort areas and the high demand for commercial sex by visitors and sex tourists. The same patterns of exploitation, recruitment and trafficking appear in Mexico, Costa Rica, Brazil, Guatemala and El Salvador. Because of its geographical position, Mexico is a major transit country. There is also considerable internal trafficking of girls for commercial sex to Mexican tourist resorts.

Japan is reported to be the largest market in the Far East for non-Japanese women in the sex trade, with some 150,000 mainly Asian women involved.\textsuperscript{23} There is no age disaggregation in these statistics and they very likely include girls below 18 years of age. The Japanese Immigration Bureau, Ministry of Justice, reports that such illicit movement and entry to Japan is arranged by international crime organizations, which are often violent and heavily implicated in exploitation, debt accrual and the forging of documents.

The trafficking of both women and children out of the countries of Central Asia and the CIS is highly organized and widespread. The troubled political and economic transition in these countries underlies a disturbing trend of many disenchanted adolescents turning to cheap alcohol and substance abuse and using prostitution as a way to raise cash. Many adolescents engage in prostitution while still at school, sometimes through pimp ‘boyfriends’. The children also move to wherever demand is greatest and the opportunity to earn money is the most promising, generally cities, industrial areas or tourist zones.\textsuperscript{24}

The location of these regions in the middle of the land mass that includes Eastern and mainland Western Europe, the Middle East and Gulf states and Asia, makes them ideally situated for the movement of people, both transit and outgoing. Young women are trafficked from Russia, Ukraine and Lithuania to Western and Eastern Europe, particularly Germany and Poland. Georgia and Kazakhstan are also source countries for both girls and boys who are trafficked not only for sexual exploitation but also for labour exploitation to Turkey, Greece, Israel, South Korea, the United Arab Emirates and Western Europe.\textsuperscript{25}

In Western Europe, there is a growing demand for commercial sex services, and this has created a market in trafficked women and girls from all over the world. Growth in the commercial sex trade has led to unmet demand and an influx of both adult prostitutes and trafficked women and children to meet this demand. European police forces report that the substantial profits available to traffickers of women and girls for the sex trade in Europe have prompted growing interest from large-scale international criminal groups, who provide their infrastructure - trafficking routes, corrupt border guards, transport and secure locations - to often smaller-scale traffickers. In this way, the organized crime syndicates stand to make substantial profits on the backs of smaller trafficking groups by effectively ‘selling services’.\textsuperscript{26}

There is significant inter-regional trafficking from Eastern to Western Europe: young women and adolescents are trafficked from Bulgaria, Romania, Ukraine, the Czech Republic, Slovakia, Hungary and the Balkans into Western Europe.\textsuperscript{27} Italy is a destination and transit country for young women and girls from Albania, the CIS, China, Nigeria and South America, with some 80 per cent being below the age of 20, and the most represented age group being 14-18 year olds. The International Organization for Migration (IOM) estimates that between 2,000 and 6,000 women and girls may be trafficked each year into Italy. Switzerland, France, the Netherlands and the United Kingdom (UK) are all also destination countries.\textsuperscript{28}

Trafficking is a significant and growing problem in South-East Asia, both within countries and across the region. It has been estimated that 200,000 - 250,000 women and

\textsuperscript{23} Ibid.
\textsuperscript{24} L. Kelly and L. Regan: Rhetorics and realities: Sexual exploitation of children in Europe, University of North London, 2000, Ch. 6.
\textsuperscript{25} US Department of State, op. cit.
\textsuperscript{26} Briefing given by officers of the paedophile unit of Scotland Yard, at the second World Congress against Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children, Yokohama, 19 December 2001.
\textsuperscript{27} See Ministry of Foreign Affairs, Government of Sweden: Trafficking in women and children in Asia and Europe, a background presentation of the problem and the initiatives taken, (Stockholm, 2001) pp. 22-23.
\textsuperscript{28} Ibid.
children in the region are trafficked every year.\textsuperscript{29} Many trafficked Cambodian children end up in the sex industry in Phnom Penh and Sihanoukville, although there is also movement of girls into the sex trade in Thailand. Girls are trafficked into Cambodia's brothels from southern Vietnam, which also faces a serious problem of trafficking of rural children into the sex sector in large urban centres such as Hanoi and Ho Chi Minh City, and from northern Vietnam into China to be sold as wives or for labour exploitation. Children from Lao PDR and Myanmar are trafficked into Thailand for a number of purposes including sexual exploitation. Small numbers of children from Yunnan Province of China are trafficked into the sex sector in Thailand through Lao PDR and Myanmar, although most trafficking from this province is domestic.\textsuperscript{30}

According to the US Department of State, some, 150,000 South Asians are trafficked every year.\textsuperscript{31} Both boys and girls are trafficked internally and across borders, principally into other countries in the region, the Middle East and South-East Asia. This parallels a general increase in illegal and undocumented migration within the region.\textsuperscript{32} Within the region, also, the prevalence of commercial sex outlets at many levels (low-class brothels, high-class escort services, etc.) coupled with increasing rates of HIV/AIDS and STD infection, provides a ready market for those who exploit children for commercial sex. It has been reported that, of the approximately 200,000 sex workers trafficked from Nepal to India, 40,000 are below 16 years of age.\textsuperscript{33} Recent ILO-IPEC Rapid Assessment research suggests a speculative figure of 12,000 children per year.\textsuperscript{34}

In the Middle East and North Africa, women and girls come from a number of regions, pulled by the demand for commercial sex and the wide economic disparities that make the Gulf States, in particular, a potentially profitable market for traffickers and exploiters.

**Domestic work**

The placement of children – particularly girls – in domestic work has been common practice for centuries in many places across the globe. Children are typically placed with extended family members, friends or other families of more affluent means. In some cases, this practice does not result in the exploitation of the child, however in many cases the relationship is either exploitative from the start or becomes exploitative over time. In many countries child domestic labour is directly linked to trafficking because children are systematically recruited from rural areas for domestic work in urban centres through friends, brokers, intermediaries or job placement agencies. Poor girls in particular are vulnerable to recruitment for domestic work and in many places this is seen as culturally acceptable and even desirable.

The use of children as domestic helpers is unregulated and unmonitored. It is therefore very difficult to detect abuse and exploitation. Child domestic workers are under the control and at the mercy of their individual employers. They rarely have access to education. Children who run away report abuse – physical, sexual, and psychological – at the hands of their employers. There are incidences of girls being forced into sexual

\textsuperscript{29} IOM: Combating trafficking in South-East Asia, (Geneva, 2000), p.16.
\textsuperscript{30} ILO-IPEC Mekong Subregional Project to Combat Trafficking in Children and Women: Briefing note on trafficking in Greater Mekong Subregion (Bangkok, 2000).
\textsuperscript{32} See J. Sanghera: Trafficking of women and children in South Asia: taking stock and moving ahead, (UNICEF and Save the Children Alliance, 1999).
\textsuperscript{33} US Department of State, op. cit., p. 51.
relationships with male members of the household, deprived of freedom of movement, and even locked up and subjected to slavery-like conditions. In most cases, these children are far away from home, with very little contact with the outside world, and sometimes with no way of contacting their families.

In Africa, children are trafficked from rural to urban areas within the country and across borders. Trafficking for domestic service is common among and between the countries of West Africa, including in particular Benin, Burkina Faso, Cameroon, Côte d’Ivoire, Guinea, Ghana, Mali, Niger, Nigeria and Togo.35

In the Americas and the Caribbean, children trafficked into domestic servitude go mostly to the US and Canada.36 In addition, in Haiti there is substantial internal trafficking in children similar to the African ‘placement’ pattern. Haitian children have traditionally been placed with extended family and friends. These children, known as ‘restaveks’ (from the French rester avec = to stay with), have often subsequently been exploited in domestic work.

In Indonesia, According to the Central Bureau of Statistics (1999), there are 1,341,712 domestic workers, 310,378 of whom are between 10 and 18 years of age — approximately 23 per cent. In Jakarta alone, the estimated number of child domestic workers in 1999 was 70,792. It is quite common for brokers or older children who have worked in cities like Jakarta to be paid to actively look for newcomers.37

In the countries of the Middle East, children from poorer countries in the region, and from the former Soviet Union (particularly Ukraine, Moldova and Russia), are employed as domestic servants.38 Children in Morocco are also exploited in domestic servitude and trafficked internally for that purpose. It is estimated that more than 50,000 children work as child domestics in that country. While many parents in rural areas send their children to work in domestic service directly, some are recruited by agents who make profits from recruiting and placing girls in domestic work in urban areas.39

In recent years, there have been several high-profile cases of children being trafficked into domestic service in the homes of diplomats stationed overseas, and of overseas aid workers and expatriate staff. A multilateral agency headquartered in Paris lifted the immunity on a member of its staff when a French NGO reported that the diplomat concerned was holding a young girl in slave-like conditions, restricting her movement and withholding pay.40

---

35- See ILO-IPEC: Combating Trafficking in children for labour exploitation in Central and Western Africa..., op. cit.
37- ILO-IPEC and University of Indonesia, op. cit. p 13
38- US Department of State, op. cit., p. 89.
40- Many of these cases are illustrated in the newsletter Esclaves Encore, published by the NGO Comité contre l’esclavage moderne. This French NGO was set up in 1994 in the wake of a number of high-profile cases involving expatriate domestic workers in France who had variously been subjected to exploitation, rape and deportation. The organization continues to work against what it defines as ‘modern slavery’ and since 1999 has been central to the creation of a number of similar organizations throughout Europe who are now federated into a European network.
One day, a man, I have even forgotten his name, came to pick me up at night after he had talked to my godmother. That same night, I travelled with him and nine other children that I didn’t know. We travelled by car and the next morning we walked through the forest until we reached the border of a river. With a pirogue we arrived at Molyko (in the south-east of Cameroon). There were people waiting for us. They gave me to one of them and he took me to his place at Tiko, where I worked as a domestic. He was Nigerian. I only received one meal a day. Whenever I made a mistake, I was badly beaten. If they needed me while I was asleep, and if I did not react immediately, it was the whip that made me get up from my mat. Tired of all the work and the bad treatment I experienced every day, I escaped, hoping to find another compatriot in Douala.41

A child victim of trafficking, Cameroon

**Armed conflict**

There is another distinctive pattern of trafficking found in a number of African countries: that relating to the exploitation of children during armed conflict. This involves the abduction and transportation of children for and by both government and rebel militias. In Angola, for example, National Union for Total Independence of Angola (UNITA) troops are reported to abduct or otherwise acquire Angolan children to work in coercive labour and to undertake military service.42 The tasks they are given are extremely hazardous and may involve carrying heavy loads, dealing with arms and ammunition, and providing sexual services to militia members, in addition to lighter domestic work. There is also often widespread drug use among the militia members and drugs are regularly used to subdue the children and induce their dependency.

This same model applies to Sierra Leone, where Revolutionary United Front (RUF) rebels acquire both children and adults. The trafficked children are abducted and moved from place to place so that they remain under control.43 There is also evidence that during periods of armed conflict, children in vulnerable situations are trafficked and sold into brothels by both armed forces and by exploiters who take advantage of the social disruption and family break-up attendant upon conflict. In the early 1990s, for example, Bosnian children who went missing were later found in brothels in other parts of the country, and girls abducted during conflict in Georgia were located in Turkey.44

**Other forms**

Other worst forms of child labour are found in agriculture, service work (for example in laundries and restaurants), street work (begging and hawking), industrial labour (for example, in textile production, heavy industry, and mining) and the entertainment and tourism sectors (for example, as dancers and hotel maids), and children are regularly

41- ILO-IPEC: Combating Trafficking in children for labour exploitation in Central and Western Africa…, op. cit., p. 20.
42- US Department of State, op. cit., p. 29.
moved into such exploitative situations in all the different ways already mentioned. Patterns of trafficking are similar to those for domestic work and commercial sexual exploitation, with flows predominantly from rural to urban or poor to wealthier areas. The children are subjected to long working hours and hazardous conditions that limit or prevent healthy development. Moreover, they are deprived of educational opportunities that might allow them to build a better future when they escape exploitation.

In this way, a vicious cycle of vulnerability and exploitation is perpetuated.

In West Africa, children are trafficked for many different types of hazardous work on plantations or mine sites. The conditions these children face are severe. Those working on plantations are reported to have limited washing facilities and consequently suffer from skin diseases. They work in the sun during the day and at night share accommodation with up to 20 other children.

Both Canada and the US are receiving countries for children trafficked from Latin America and the Caribbean, as well as from Asia and Africa. The US Department of State estimates that between 45,000 and 50,000 women and children are trafficked into the US every year. About half of them are exploited as cheap labour, often in domestic service or in sweatshops run by members of the same ethnic group, making them easier to conceal.

In South-East Asia, children are trafficked internally and across borders for labour, including construction work, agricultural and factory sweatshop work, fishing, and street begging and hawking. Myanmar, Laos and Cambodia are common source countries and Thailand is a regular destination country. Children recruited from the border areas between Thailand, Laos and Myanmar can be found working in factories, construction and fisheries in Thailand, as well as in the country's tourist resorts.

In South Asia, young boys are trafficked to the Gulf States to work as camel racing jockeys, known in the region as ‘camel kids’. These boys are highly sought after because of their generally small and light physiques - the preferred weight of the boys is around 20 kilos and the limit is 40 kilos. The boys are strapped to the camel and the camel is then whipped to a frenzy. The louder the child screams, the wilder the camel becomes and the faster it runs. Apart from the extreme terror, the children often also suffer injury when they are thrown from the animal, become entangled in the strapping and dragged along.

He worked on a small fishing boat around the clock in shifts. He could not swim and hated being out on the sea. He escaped at the first possible opportunity. He would not recommend work in fishing to anyone.

He worked on many construction sites all around Thailand. He always got the lowest pay because he is a small child. He thinks the work is dirty and dangerous and he did not like it. He wants to work in a factory.

Laotian boys trafficked into Thailand

45- See ILO-IPEC: Combating Trafficking in children for labour exploitation in Central and Western Africa ...


48- Ibid., p. 57.

49- Idem.
The links between the exploitation of children in these forms of labour and in commercial sex are close. Children trafficked into Italy, for example, to work as hawkers or begging on the streets (often accompanying or joining an older sibling who is working legally) are subsequently encouraged or at times forced to enter the sex trade.⁵⁰ Conversely, children trafficked into commercial sex who fall ill or are otherwise unable to provide the services required of them are sometimes exploited in other forms of labour, for example working in the kitchens of clubs, or as couriers. Although the demand may be differentiated, the recruitment and relocation processes are often the same, and a trafficker may move a group of children, singling out the prettiest or otherwise most ‘saleable’ girls for sexual exploitation and offering the other children for other exploitative tasks. In programming terms, therefore, it is difficult and perhaps not desirable to differentiate trafficking for sexual purposes from more general trafficking of children, although the legal frameworks in which such programming takes place might differ.

Root causes of child trafficking

There are many reasons why child trafficking occurs, but it is overwhelmingly a demand-driven phenomenon. It occurs first and foremost because there is a market for children in labour and in the sex trade, and this is matched by an abundant supply of children, most often from poor families, who are easy prey for those who seek to make a profit by exploiting their vulnerability.

Complementing the forces of supply and demand that underlie trafficking are the infrastructure and trends associated with a rapidly globalizing world: increasingly open borders, better transport, and increased overall migration flows. Globalization has provided impetus to both those who wish to migrate and those who traffic the unwilling. In 2000, the United Nations estimated that almost 13 million people, or 2 per cent of the world population, are on the move at any given time.

Demand-side causes

Economic growth tends to result in increased demand for cheap migrant labour, as the domestic workforce is able to move away from low-skilled, low-wage employment. For example, in Thailand children from Laos, Cambodia and Myanmar have migrated and been trafficked for various types of work in a shift that has seen a decrease in the number of Thai children working in exploitative labour. Some sources estimate that under-18 year-olds made up between 14 and 25 per cent of the foreign work force in Thailand in 2000.⁵¹

Economic disparities between regions also lead to more general migration flows, as more affluent countries draw upon the potential workforce of poorer countries as a source of labour. Western Europe, for example, is estimated to need an injection of some 75 million migrants by the year 2050 if it is to maintain current levels of economic prosperity, suggesting significant and sustained migration into Western Europe over the next 50 years. Irregular migration and trafficking generally accompany such large people movements.

---

⁵⁰ Interview with researchers at the Istituto di ricerche economiche e sociali (IRES), Turin.
⁵² Workshop W2/14 at the second World Congress against CSEC, Yokohama, 18 December 2001. This workshop, which looked at trafficking of children, was led by the NGO Terre des Hommes. All the workshop reports from the Congress are available on the Congress website: www.focalpointngo.org/yokohama.
Growing demand for children for commercial sex can be traced, among other things, to growth in the sex industry at the country and international levels. While research shows that most regular prostitute users do not necessarily seek out under-age sex providers, it is true that in many parts, fear of HIV/AIDS and ignorance of its transmission, peer and societal sexualization of youth, and a rising indifference to the consequences of sexual exploitation of children, have seen a growth in demand for younger sex partners. The growth of tourism also draws vulnerable children (and adults) into high-risk situations in the hope of earning some of the tourist dollar. So-called 'sex tourists' are then also drawn to such destinations as word spreads (often via dedicated websites) that children can be bought cheaply for sex, and children and women may be trafficked into the resort in order to meet this increased demand.

It is also now apparent that the motivation for trafficking and its methods, routes and configurations with regard to source, transit and destination countries, change over time. Thailand illustrates this most clearly, partly because it has been studied for longer than other countries. In the 1980s, when the sex sector was booming in Thailand's tourist areas, most of the girls in brothels and other sex outlets were moved in from the poorer provinces of the country. By the 1990s, however, Thailand had become a relatively wealthy country in the subregion, and internal trafficking from these areas had declined. In 1988, 40 per cent of children aged 13 to 14 years were working and not attending school, compared to less than 10 per cent by 1999.\(^\text{53}\) Demand had not decreased, however; the Thai children had been simply replaced by those trafficked from Myanmar, Laos, Cambodia and China.

Finally, with respect to the demand for cheap labour, contrary to widely held popular beliefs, a number of studies have shown that employing children is not, in fact, necessarily cheaper than employing adults.\(^\text{54}\) Children may be paid lower rates than adults (if they are paid at all), but they are also generally less productive. The misperception that child labour is cheap labour persists largely because children are simply easier to abuse than adults: they are less assertive and less able to claim their rights; they can be made to work longer hours with less food, poor accommodation and no benefits. It is, in fact, these abuses that allow the employer to keep costs down.

**Supply-side causes**

There are many factors that increase the vulnerability of children and hence the supply of potential victims of trafficking, both voluntary and coerced. Among the most prevalent causes are: poverty and the desire to earn a living or help support the family; lack of education and access to schools; lack of appropriate means to earn a living; conflict and natural disasters that devastate local economies; cultural attitudes towards children and girls in particular; and local laws and regulations.

The desperation that often underlies a parent’s willingness to surrender a child to traffickers is frequently compounded by a lack of understanding of what exactly this means. Undoubtedly, some families are aware that the child will be offered for commercial sexual transactions or will endure intolerable labour conditions.

\(^{53}\) See W. Im-em, Synthesis report, op.cit.
\(^{54}\) ILO-IPEC: Child Labour: Targeting the intolerable, Report VI (1), International Labour Conference, 86th Session, Geneva 1998. This report gives the example of the Indian carpet and jewellery industries where, “as a portion of the final price of carpets or bangles to the consumer, any labour-cost savings realised through employment of children are surprisingly small - less than 5 per cent for bangles and between 5 and 10 per cent for carpets”.

---

UNDERSTANDING THE TRAFFICKING OF CHILDREN AND THE WORST FORMS OF CHILD LABOUR

---
Returning adults and children report such experiences. But many families also believe that the child will be given child-friendly, light work in agriculture or in a hotel, for example. And, indeed, that may be the case in the first instance. Often, however, the child may be re-sold later and find him/herself in exploitative labour or commercial sex.

**Poverty and the desire for a better life**

Poverty is by far the most important root cause of vulnerability to trafficking and indeed, to exploitation more generally. Children from poor or indebted families, communities, countries or regions are vulnerable to the lure of higher wages and standards of living. They or their caregivers often believe or expect that they will be able to provide for the family if they relocate for work in cities or another country. In South-East Asia, for example, many trafficked minors have been pushed by a desire to escape poverty and to relocate from areas where employment is scarce. Many in Myanmar say that they had heard of chances of a better life in Thailand through media reports and from popular accounts and, faced with the reality of a subsistence rural economy and insufficient education to find alternative employment at home, saw Thailand as an attractive opportunity.55

In addition, poor families are often unable to provide for all of their children and thus see no choice but to send one or more of them to urban areas where they can support themselves. In this case, the child is sent away to reduce costs for the family rather than to provide additional income.

Finally, children will sometimes take the initiative to migrate in the hope of escaping domestic abuse, violence and neglect, or improving job and earning prospects. The family circumstances of the child can play a significant role in pushing the child to leave home. Neglect and physical abuse are factors that children cite as prompting them to run away. They say they drop out of school because teachers are too strict, or because the family puts pressure on them to help in the home or family business. It must be recognized as well that some children also leave home to pursue greater economic gain despite or regardless of the opinions of their parents. Rapid assessment research carried out by IPEC near the Laos/Myanmar-Thailand borders found that parents were rarely the driving force behind the decision that a child should leave for work. In Pakistan, one report concluded that, “it is not only the desire for better living, but also an increasing tendency towards materialism which leads women and children to fall prey to traffickers”. 56

**Lack of educational opportunities**

Children with no or restricted access to education often have little alternative but to look for work at a very early age. Furthermore, inadequacies of education systems in terms of poor infrastructure, poor teaching quality, inadequate number of qualified teachers, teacher absenteeism, abuse and overly strict conditions, as well as the lack of learning materials, also lower the regard that families have for education and discourage school attendance, thus increasing a child’s vulnerability to exploitation.

---

Lack of access to quality education is a major factor contributing to the trafficking of children into the worst forms of child labour in the Myanmar/Laos-Thailand border areas. According to IPEC research conducted in this area, the average time spent in education was only 3.3 years, with boys spending an average of one year more in education than girls. Respondents stated that their limited education prevented them from entering paid employment in their home country. The lowest educational attainment was found among the ethnic minorities from Myanmar who also reported the lack of educational facilities in minority villages or the closure of schools.

There is a strong correlation between the trafficking of women and girls for prostitution and low levels of education, inadequate training and educational opportunities. In Nigeria, a considerable number of trafficked victims in prostitution in the country have only completed primary school or have dropped out of secondary school. In addition to having low educational qualifications, they do not have access to vocational training. They cannot be absorbed by the formal economy because of the economic downturn in this country, and because of their educational limitations. Most of them also do not have access to capital so they are easy prey to traffickers who entice them with the possibility of a better life.

In Nepal, an overwhelming majority of parents of trafficked girls are illiterate, especially the mothers. IPEC rapid assessment research has shown that trafficked girls largely originate from illiterate households, particularly where there are illiterate mothers and sisters. In some trafficking-prone localities of the Sindhupalchowk District, for example, the literacy rate of females six years and above falls far below the average figure of the district and far behind that of boys, thus demonstrating the gender gap in basic educational attainment and consequently in vulnerability to exploitation.

**Conflict and transition**

Political conflict often leads to massive migration flows both within countries and across borders, as people flee to avoid getting caught up in the violence or to escape its aftermath. In Albania, conflict has contributed to increased trafficking. The numbers of Albanian girls being trafficked into and through Italy and Greece swelled in the aftermath of conflict and NATO intervention in Kosovo. A similar wave of conflict-pushed women and girls had been noted from the former Yugoslavia in the first half of the 1990s. In Kyrgyzstan, conflict along the borders with Tajikistan and Uzbekistan has contributed to migration and trafficking flows.

Troubled political and economic transition increase extreme poverty, prompt or facilitate small- and large-scale crime, and contribute to child trafficking. In Central Asia and the CIS, a dramatic rise in child trafficking has occurred as a result of a compromised process of political and economic transition. The IOM estimates that 175,000 people are trafficked from Central and Eastern Europe and the CIS each year – one quarter of the estimated 700,000 to 2 million people trafficked around the world annually — largely as a result of economic marginalization, social disruption and lack of opportunities.

---

57- See: Women Trafficking and Child Labour Eradication Foundation (WOTCLEF), op.cit.
60- See IOM: Trafficking in women and children from the Kyrgyz Republic, (Geneva, 2000).
• Economic crises and natural disasters

Sudden economic downturns, transition and structural readjustment, and natural disasters may all represent ‘the final straw’ for children and families already living in poverty, especially if a country offers few opportunities for development or even survival. The high incidence of natural disasters in Bangladesh, for example, results in frequent movements of people and a high rate of unaccompanied or separated children. Such children are at high risk of persuasion/abduction, and families affected by disaster and displacement are also at risk of being persuaded to allow their children to leave in search of better opportunities.

Structural readjustment in the transition countries of the former Soviet Bloc has resulted in considerably increased vulnerability among children and, particularly, adolescents. In countries where there was once guaranteed employment after school, many adolescents now face long-term unemployment with few social safety nets to help them survive. This has resulted in a marked increase in high-risk lifestyle behaviour, including increased alcohol consumption, smoking, substance abuse, violence and prostitution. In some countries such as Russia and Ukraine, youth suicide rates have also risen. Such extreme behaviour not only indicates vulnerability to exploitation and trafficking but also may lead directly to these as young people enter exploitative situations in order to earn money.

• The cultural context

The magnitude of the problem of child trafficking and labour exploitation in a given geographic area also depends on family and community hierarchies and cultural traditions and values that encourage gender discrimination and a disregard for children’s rights.

The demand for particular types of children is also often related to cultural, ethnic, and/or socio-economic status. Children belonging to marginalized ethnic groups, subservient castes or dysfunctional families (war- or disaster-affected, for example) are often targeted for trafficking. Many cultures have a long tradition of children labouring to help their families at home or in the fields. This traditional attitude that children should work to help their families can sometimes result in the inadvertent placement of a child in a situation of exploitative labour from which it is then very difficult to escape.

In many African countries, for instance, sending children to work in faraway places is seen as socially acceptable and often occurs in the context of family dysfunction related to large family size or an inability to care for a child (or children) because of a death in the family, displacement, severe economic stress or other factors. Associated with this wide acceptance of children leaving home for work is the admissibility of payments to families, intermediaries, agents and other middlemen who can ‘make a cut’. This practice underlies the widespread interchange of children among these countries, with the result that they easily disappear from parental or other view and are more easily exploitable.

---

• The legal and regulatory environment

In many countries, there are legislative loopholes for trafficking and/or commercial sexual exploitation. In addition, many countries suffer from lax regulatory environments and under-funded regulatory mechanisms such as police, border guards, and judiciary. In Africa, the trafficking of children for financial gain is facilitated by the general lack of trafficking-specific legislation, as well as open borders that allow relatively easy transnational movement. In Hong Kong as in many other countries, domestic legislation prohibits trafficking for the purposes of prostitution but not for any other purpose, so trafficking for labour exploitation is technically legal. Restrictive legal immigration may also contribute to the desperation of families and children looking for other ways to enter a country, thus putting them at the mercy of exploiters.63

Discrimination/marginalization on the basis of gender or ethnicity

Gender is an issue in trafficking on both the supply and demand sides of the equation. Girls are often seen as expendable, and laws and law enforcement - not to mention some cultural and traditional contexts - provide them unequal protection. Girls are in many societies expected to sacrifice education and security and take on responsibilities towards parents and siblings. It is also recognized that one day they will marry and leave, bringing little or no money to the parental home. In such situations, girls are seen as a relatively ‘poor investment’, and sending them away to work may seem a viable option. The placement of girls in domestic service is often linked to perceptions that domestic service is a good preparation for marriage, and that girls’ families might raise their dowries by putting them to work. General ignorance of the exploitative nature of much of the work is common since many families are illiterate and exposed only to hearsay evidence from recruiters or returnees.

While in an overwhelming number of countries many more girls are exploited in commercial sex than boys, Sri Lanka is a notable exception. Here the majority of children exploited in commercial sex are boys.64 This is largely because girls receive a greater measure of protection in the Sri Lankan family. Boys are not only given more freedom but are expected to help support the family.

All trafficked children suffer the obvious results of trafficking: isolation from family and community, fear and psychological trauma as a result of their illegal status, physical and emotional harm, loss of childhood and education and, therefore, a blighted future. However, the situation of trafficked girls is specifically marked by the risk of pregnancy, early motherhood and reproductive illnesses that might affect their ability to have children in later life. In addition, girls stigmatized by early sexual activity, or who may return with a child or reproductive complications, are often rejected by their families and communities when they try to return. In many societies, without family acceptance their chances of marriage are greatly diminished and they may fall again into the hands of traffickers or indeed return to exploitative situations in desperation.

63 A useful review of international legal provisions relating to trafficking can be found in: D Weissbrodt and Anti-Slavery International: Contemporary forms of slavery, forthcoming 2002.
Consequences of trafficking

The consequences of trafficking are always devastating on victims whatever their age, but the consequences of child trafficking are especially pernicious and multiple, not least because the child may suffer the repercussions for the rest of his/her life.

In the worst cases, trafficking and the exploitation it involves can be responsible for a child’s death or for permanently damaging his/her physical and mental health. It also potentially encourages drug dependency, breaks families apart, and deprives children of their rights to an education and freedom from exploitation. The impact on communities and countries is similarly severe, causing both short- and long-term instability and slowing rates of economic growth and community development.

The physical impact of trafficking is great on children. The journey involved can sometimes be hazardous, with the child being confined to a restricted space, or moved over unmarked routes. The hazardous work that children are frequently required to perform can cause death or permanent physical damage. Trafficked children are also often deprived of food and access to health services in addition to suffering the consequences of inadequate accommodation, sleep and free movement. If trapped in commercial sexual exploitation, they may suffer violence at the hands of clients, physical and emotional damage of premature sexual activity, and exposure to STDs including HIV/AIDS. When and if a child returns to a community after being trafficked, s/he may be in ill health. Victims of commercial sexual exploitation of both sexes may be HIV positive, and girls may be pregnant, young mothers or unable to have children because of damage to their reproductive organs.

The psychological impact of isolation and domination on children is grave and is aggravated if the child is relocated to a place where s/he cannot speak or understand the language and thus is condemned to silence. Abused and exploited children, particularly in commercial sex, may also be subdued with drugs and become both ill and/or dependent. There have been numerous reports of girl children rescued from brothels who subsequently return to prostitution because they can see no other way of obtaining the substances on which they have become dependent.

The impact on the family, community and home country may take several forms. It may be that sending a child for ‘employment’ elsewhere acts as an incentive to others in the community to follow suit and that a community becomes known as a potential source of children. Fear of trafficking may also alter the choices that girls make about their futures. Reports from Albania, for example, document villages where nine in 10 girls over 14 stay away from school because they are afraid of being trafficked. The loss of an education reduces opportunities, influences family and work decisions, and makes children more vulnerable to being trafficked in the future.

The loss of future productivity and earning power through low educational levels, ill health and potentially premature death is also felt at the country and regional level. Poor nations can ill afford to lose their young people, whose present and future productive capacity is essential to growth. The ravage of disease, including HIV/AIDS, is also an enormous burden on such countries and causes further imbalances between the young and middle-aged potential workforce (most likely to be affected) and older people dependent on them.

In all cases, the rehabilitation needs of trafficked children are complex and long-term. Returned children may require long-term psychosocial or medical support. They will need to be reintegrated to school or work life, to the family and community. If they cannot re-enter or enter education, they will need immediate and appropriate support to be able to earn a living and thus fend off approaches to relocate again. This may require skills training, short-term direct funding and, if work opportunities in the local environment are lacking, secure and safe accommodation near to a workplace. If the child’s family is part of the exploitation problem, the child may have to be provided with a home elsewhere. In short, the child’s life has to be rebuilt in such a way that the child is not only safe but able to survive.

Protection, recovery, reintegration or life reconstruction are thus all elements of programming that tackle the supply side of the trafficking equation. Multi-faceted and comprehensive strategies are also required to address demand-side phenomena, including legal provisions, law enforcement, research and reporting mechanisms. It is no surprise, therefore, that the necessary programmatic responses to trafficking are complex and diverse.
3
EMERGING RESPONSES AND LESSONS LEARNED
EMERGING RESPONSES AND LESSONS LEARNED

Many governments, international organizations, employers’ and workers’ organizations, civil society groups, communities and families have taken action to combat the trafficking of children in numerous countries around the world. They have made efforts to better understand the issue and have drawn up policy frameworks at national and local levels. Concrete interventions have been launched to reduce the vulnerability of at-risk children, families and communities by addressing the root causes of child trafficking including poverty and social attitudes, while providing alternatives to victims withdrawn from exploitation. More stringent policing and legislation directly targeting abusers and traffickers have also been introduced. Some programmes have aimed to mobilize the public at large, while others have aimed to end the trafficking of children within a specific time frame.

Because of its transnational nature, the trafficking of children has to be addressed not only within the country, but also among all other countries concerned at bilateral, subregional and international levels. A number of bilateral and subregional initiatives are emerging among countries in Asia and Europe, Central and West Africa.

Combating child trafficking requires programme interventions that are comprehensive in addressing both the multiple causes and the processes associated with trafficking wherever they are found: at points of origin, transit areas and destinations. Interventions must not only target children but also their families, communities, recruiters, traffickers, exploiters and abusers (clients), in short society at large as well.

Thanks to pioneer actions by so many actors around the world, valuable experience has accumulated and progress has been made, although the work has barely begun. Learning from experience and sharing information are key to continuing and improving efforts against exploitation and trafficking, and it is in this spirit that the examples that follow have been chosen. While not offered as models, they are provided as illustrations of the kinds of work being carried out with some success all over the world.

National plans

One of the roles of governments is to mobilize and guide other sectors in a coordinated offensive against trafficking by providing the legal and policy frameworks that underpin direct action. In addition to the international instruments that call upon governments to act, the Stockholm Declaration and Agenda for Action adopted at the first World Congress against Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children in 199666 provides a brief resume of the action that governments can take (in this instance against CSEC but of course more widely against both sexual and labour exploitation). Paragraph (e) calls upon governments:

66 The Stockholm Declaration and Agenda for Action can be found on the website of the second World Congress against CSEC. It was reinforced by the Yokohama Global Commitment, adopted at the second World Congress in Japan in December 2001.
... in the case of trafficking of children, [to] develop and implement national laws, policies and programmes to protect children from being trafficked within or across borders and penalize the traffickers; in cross-border situations, treat these children humanely under national immigration laws, and establish readmission agreements to ensure their safe return to their countries of origin accompanied by supportive services; and share relevant data.

This undertaking, agreed by 122 governments in Stockholm in 1996, was renewed and extended to 134 governments at the second World Congress in Yokohama in December 2001.

There has been a growing commitment of governments to combat child trafficking at a national level, and a number of national plans of action have been drawn up. Within the framework of ILO Convention No. 182, for example, countries are committing themselves to implementing measures to bring an end to the worst forms of child labour within a specific time frame. ILO-IPEC has been supporting the Governments of the United Republic of Tanzania, Nepal and El Salvador in designing and implementing national Time-Bound Programmes that target trafficking of children (Nepal) and children in prostitution (United Republic of Tanzania and El Salvador).

Other countries, such as Bangladesh and Sri Lanka, are in the process of adopting national frameworks of action to combat child trafficking. Cambodia developed a five-year plan against trafficking and sexual exploitation of children (2000-2004), while Thailand is preparing its ten-year plan to end the trafficking of women and children. Lithuania launched a National Programme on Control and Prevention of Prostitution and Trafficking, and Colombia has an Inter-Institutional Committee for Action to Combat Trafficking in Women and Children. The Government of Haiti has devoted its entire social welfare budget to combating the trafficking of restavek children.

Also at government level, a number of bilateral agreements have been put in place against cross-border trafficking, for example between the Governments of Mali and Côte d'Ivoire, and between Thailand and Cambodia. These may variously cover arrangements relating to border policing, return and support of trafficking victims, extraterritorial jurisdiction, extradition and police cooperation.

Some countries’ national plans also recognize the transnational nature of trafficking and thus include technical cooperation in other countries. The Australian National Plan of Action against CSEC, for example, includes input to the Mekong subregional initiative led by the United Nations Development Programme (UNDP), and overseas information campaigns to prevent the smuggling of people, with information tailored to meet the different requirements of source and transit countries.

The US has an inter-agency working group to address the international crime implications of trafficking. The Clinton Administration also issued a directive establishing a US Government-wide anti-trafficking strategy of prevention, protection and support for victims, and prosecution of traffickers. It includes a Worker’s Exploitation Task Force charged with investigating and prosecuting cases of exploitation and trafficking, and promotes international cooperation and responsibility for cross-border trafficking.

The Clinton Administration also brought before Congress the Victims of Trafficking and Violence Protection Act (2000), which inter alia “enhances pre-existing criminal
penalties, affords new protections to trafficking victims, and makes available certain benefits and services to victims of trafficking”. Under this Act, a pilot federal programme to provide services to victims of trafficking was also initiated.

Importantly, the Act defines “minimum standards for the elimination of trafficking” which cover the need for governments to prohibit and punish acts of trafficking, prescribe punishment commensurate with that for grave crimes and sufficiently stringent to deter, and to make “serious and sustained efforts to eliminate trafficking”. The Act lists criteria to be used to measure whether such efforts are, indeed, “serious and sustained”. On the basis of this measurement, the US State Department in July 2001 issued a report in which countries were put into three categories, or ‘tiers’. Countries are to be assessed annually and re-tiered. Beginning with the 2003 report, countries in the Tier 3 list will be “subject to sanctions, principally termination of non-humanitarian, non-trade-related assistance”. Such countries would also face US opposition to assistance (except for humanitarian, trade-related and certain development-related assistance) from international financial institutions, specifically the International Monetary Fund and multilateral development banks such as the World Bank.

### Time-bound national plans and programmes

A Time-Bound Programme (TBP) is designed as a tool for ILO member countries to translate into practice the ILO Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention (No.182) and Recommendation No.190. It is essentially a set of tightly integrated and coordinated policies and programmes to prevent and eliminate a country’s worst forms of child labour within a defined time frame. The TBP emphasizes the need to address the root causes of child labour, linking action against child labour to the national development effort, with particular emphasis on economic and social policies to combat poverty and to promote universal basic education and social mobilization. ILO-IPEC will support the implementation of TBPs in each country in close collaboration with other UN agencies, the international donor community and international NGOs. All TBPs support the creation of an “enabling policy environment” including the development and implementation of free education and training, poverty reduction, adult employment creation, and health policies. At the secondary level, a series of targeted direct action interventions aimed at highly vulnerable groups of children at district level will be undertaken.

The United Republic of Tanzania’s TBP targets children in prostitution, domestic service, mining and agriculture. At least 5,000 children from 11 districts in Tanzania engaged in prostitution will be reached through this programme, but many more will be prevented from entering prostitution or other worst forms of child labour. In total, more than 30,000 Tanzanian children will be reached through direct interventions. Lessons learned will provide a basis for wider replication of these interventions, aiming at the total elimination of the problem by 2010.

The Government of Nepal has launched a plan to end all worst forms of child labour by 2005. The TBP in Nepal aims to reduce the incidence of children trapped in the worst forms of child labour, including victims of trafficking, children in domestic service and engaged in rag picking. Interventions in the areas of capacity building, access to education, reduction of economic vulnerability and social mobilization have been designed to target 33,000 children and 10,000 families in 22 districts severely affected by the problem.
In El Salvador, the TBP targets children in prostitution, children scavenging in dump sites, those working in hazardous labour in sugar cane production, harvesting and fishing, and will directly benefit some 9,300 working children and 16,780 siblings of working children under the age of 18, as well as 5,050 families.

Local plans

Some countries have also made progress in designing action frameworks at the local level. In northern Thailand, for example, ILO-IPEC has supported the development of provincial plans of action against child labour, including trafficking and CSEC, in Chiang Rai and Chiang Mai provinces. Each of these has involved consultation with a wide range of governmental, law enforcement, NGO and intergovernmental players, and the identification of problems and priority areas for action.

The Chiang Mai plan identifies a number of priority issues, for example supporting migrant children from neighbouring countries, hill tribe children, and northern lowland children who are lured into prostitution. Other areas identified for action include “poor coordination and monitoring” of ongoing action to combat trafficking, CSEC and child labour problems. The plan intends to improve the disaggregation of a database of at-risk children between 13 and 18 years of age.

In Chiang Rai province, the emphasis of the plan is on developing surveillance networks to monitor both children in hazardous work and those at risk. It includes direct actions such as encouraging children to stay in school through scholarships, campaigns and promotional materials, skills training in a wide range of employment sectors, job training for border communities, non-formal education, community-based income generation schemes, surveys and development of protocols, job placement and labour inspection.

Beyond the action plan itself, the consultation and coordination mechanisms used in the development and implementation of these collaborative frameworks also promote multi-sector analysis and response to complex issues like child labour, sexual exploitation and trafficking. The networks set up represent better monitoring and protection potential, and coverage of the target children, families and their communities.

In Bangladesh, similarly, NGOs have come together in a network to collect and disseminate information on trafficking, and their work is facilitated by the establishment of a focal point that not only includes a resource centre but also technical support. Beyond this, however, NGOs themselves have noted that the best way to make a network sustainable and effective is to move beyond sharing of information and begin sharing personnel and programming, so that cooperation translates into working together at all levels.

International and regional initiatives

Strategic action frameworks, networking and information sharing are also at the heart of a number of bilateral and subregional actions that have taken place to combat child trafficking. Within the international community there are now some overarching, global programmes that aim to contribute to efforts against trafficking. The United Nations Interregional Crime Prevention Institute (UNICRI) and the Centre for International Crime

67 This was one of the lessons offered by Bangladesh NGOs in workshop W1/15, second World Congress against CSEC, 17 December 2001.
Prevention (CRIC) have jointly developed a Global Programme against Trafficking in Human Beings, which includes data collection and analysis, the training of criminal justice practitioners, and advisory services on legislative reform and on developing victim assistance and witness protection modalities.

The United Nations Special Rapporteurs on Violence against Women, and on Prostitution, Pornography and the Sale of Children, keep the international community and governments informed of issues and trends. This is an important monitoring and advocacy function at the international level.

The Office of the High Commissioner for Human Rights (UNHCHR) monitors the human rights elements of initiatives against trafficking at national and international levels. All new laws, proposed framework declarations and national, regional and international instruments are studied to ensure that they are consistent with human rights and children’s rights, and input is provided so that the instrument in question answers the needs of children who might be particularly vulnerable. UNHCHR also provides emergency funds for short-term assistance and repatriation, and small grants to human rights and women’s organizations.

ILO-IPEC is building a global network of subregional programmes to combat the trafficking of children for labour and sexual exploitation. Between 2000 and 2001, four such programmes were operational in South and South-East Asia, Central and West Africa and Latin America. Through these programmes, IPEC is proving direct technical support to more than 30 countries.

In South Asia, ILO-IPEC launched its action programme to combat child trafficking in Nepal in 1997. The focus was on direct action programmes, providing assistance to victims and those at risk, and the design of the national plan of action to combat child trafficking. Based on this experience, a subregional programme to combat child trafficking was launched in 2000 in Bangladesh, Nepal and Sri Lanka. At country level, it aims to develop and implement the national frameworks to combat child trafficking. In each country, data is collected on the incidence of child trafficking and the vulnerability of families and communities in areas known to be vulnerable to trafficking. This is followed by implementation of pilot programmes aimed at protection of those at risk and reintegration of victims. Capacity building of implementing partners has figured as a crosscutting issue, with emphasis on policy makers on the one hand and NGOs dealing with rescue and rehabilitation on the other. A new rehabilitation approach has been developed emphasizing the child’s need for professional psychotherapeutic follow-up and a focus on the child’s potential and motivation in relation to subsequent occupational rehabilitation. Subregional cooperation is promoted in the area of data collection and analysis and in the implementation of rehabilitation models.

In the Mekong subregion, an ILO-IPEC programme to combat trafficking in women and children was launched in 1997, covering Cambodia, Thailand, Vietnam, Laos and Yunnan Province of China. The programme aims at strengthening national capacity to combat the trafficking of children and women, and promoting bilateral collaboration among countries in the subregion. In all countries, pilot activities aimed at preventing trafficking at district and provincial levels are being implemented in close collaboration with the government and NGOs. These pilot activities are linked to national policy and plans in each country.
In West and Central Africa, ILO-IPEC launched a major programme in 1999 to combat trafficking in children for labour exploitation. Benin, Burkina Faso, Cameroon, Côte d’Ivoire, Gabon, Ghana, Mali, Nigeria and Togo are all participating in the programme, which targets at-risk children and victims of trafficking in the nine countries of the region. The programme carries out intensive awareness-raising campaigns among the groups at risk, their communities and the wider public, focusing on the establishment of community ‘watchdog’ systems. It will strengthen the capacity of government, NGO and trade union partners to provide multi-disciplinary prevention and rehabilitation programmes, for example in health care, counselling, education and training, social integration, and provision of alternatives for children at risk and their parents.

ILO-IPEC has also been actively involved in developing interventions against child labour and child trafficking in the cocoa industry in these regions, in collaboration with the Chocolate Manufacturers Association (CMA), governments, UNICEF, employers, trade unions and NGOs. IPEC is also working with USAID, CMA and other partners to implement a survey to assess the extent and nature of child labour in commercial agriculture, including cocoa growing, in five West African countries. This investigation will serve as a basis for the design of direct action programmes.

In Latin America, IPEC launched a three-year programme “Prevention and Elimination of Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children and Adolescents” in 2001. The programme concentrates its activities in the border areas of Paraguay/Brazil, and includes a review of gaps in the legal system and a bringing-together of information on CSEC, including possible trafficking networks, as a basis for future planning. Some 1,000 children rescued from commercial sexual exploitation and their families will be provided with alternative means of earning a living.

In Central America, a three-year subregional programme to combat CSEC is planned to run 2002-2005. At the subregional level, the programme will build a knowledge base on the issue through rapid assessments and action research. At the national level, each country will develop an action plan (depending on the country experience and needs) which may include action research, improvement of legislation and law enforcement, direct action to protect children from commercial sexual exploitation, and protection and rehabilitation services to victims.

**Strategies for a subregional programme**

Following the first World Congress against Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children in 1996, ILO-IPEC launched the first phase of its Mekong subregional project to combat trafficking in children and women with financial support from the UK Department for International Development (DFID). The Trafficking of Women and Children (TICW) project began a ‘platform-building’ phase comprising action research on the situation of trafficking in women and children, analysis of lessons learned in other ILO-IPEC projects, and consultation with a wide range of stakeholders.

On the basis of this preparatory phase, a programme of action was designed in collaboration with ILO’s Gender Equality Promotion Programme (GENPROM). The follow-up phase, operational since October 1999, includes Thailand, Cambodia, Laos, Vietnam and Yunnan Province of China. The programme aims at strengthening national capacity to combat trafficking and promoting bilateral collaboration among countries in the subregion. In all the countries, pilot activities aiming at preventing the problem at
district and provincial levels are implemented in close collaboration with the government and NGOs. These projects are linked with the implementation of existing national policies and plans in each country. A range of local organizations – government agencies, NGOs, workers’ and employers’ organizations, academic institutions and the media— are involved in the implementation. Each country has a national steering committee that reviews programme activities and guides the policy orientation at national level.

The project collaborates with other international agencies in developing tools, for example with the Human Resources Development Section of the Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific (ESCAP) on psychosocial counselling methodologies for exploited children and on networking and coordination, and with the United Nations Inter-Agency Project on Trafficking (UN-IAP) and IOM on improving labour migration mechanisms in sectors of the economy that employ high numbers of illegal migrants. The TICW project provides a number of lessons and elements of good practice:

- It is a model of how national initiatives using national competencies can be planned and developed as part of a wider subregional policy and programming undertaking.
- It underlines the importance not only of building multi-sector partnerships that take advantage of individual competencies and experiences, but also of supporting potential gaps in experience through capacity building.
- The project is seen to have led to greater activism and commitment, including volunteer participation, by mobilizing a broad alliance of partners.
- It has been successful at involving national and local governments, who directly participate in interventions and provide additional funding.
- Steering committees established at national, provincial and district levels have strengthened links between national policies and grassroots realities and interventions by local implementing agencies.
- The modular nature of the TICW project and the lessons-learned and information sharing done at the Bangkok project office mean that the project can shift and change direction fairly quickly to take account of changing circumstances – for example, the project originally had a component dealing with rehabilitation and law enforcement, but this was reconsidered when the IOM obtained funding for a subregional project on return and reintegration of victims of trafficking.

In South-East Europe, the Stability Pact Task Force on Trafficking in Human Beings works in the area of government awareness of the human rights and law enforcement aspects of trafficking and in direct action programmes. The Task Force, which works in cooperation with IOM, UNICEF, the International Catholic Migration Committee and local NGOs, also coordinates a multi-year action plan that brings together projects in prevention, response and reintegration. In March 2001, the Task Force launched a ‘core project cluster’ to respond to victim protection needs. This includes a regional clearing point (in Belgrade), national referral systems, a network of shelters and safe houses, support to the return and reintegration of trafficking victims, and a coordination/management element. Again, this coordinated, multi-sector approach to trafficking underlines the importance of recognizing the complexity of the challenge and the contribution that different actors can make.
Clearly, the challenge is to find mechanisms that ensure that these many and diverse networks and frameworks do not work as ‘closed circles’, but that they come together in as many ways as possible to share information and exchange experiences not only on regional trends and responses to trafficking, but also on the modalities of cooperation and administration of frameworks. Such networks of diverse experience are also potentially important points at which evaluation of impact, drawing-together of lessons and realistic assessment of progress can be made and then shared.

The same is true of the several subregional initiatives that have been developed by intergovernmental agencies and NGOs. These may comprise collaborative strategic plans and/or working groups that share the tasks of planning, information sharing and dissemination, exchange of experiences, research and evaluation. They may consist of individual agencies’ subregional plans that are informed by and feed into wider consultative meetings and loose networks, so that opportunities for complementarities and cooperation are recognized.

In many regions, different bodies have developed regional or subregional groupings that bring together different players. These include, for example, government collaborations such as the South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation (SAARC) or the ASEM ‘Action for Children’ initiative that loosely links the 15 EU Member States and the governments of South-East Asia, and aims to “provide a forum for government, international organizations and non-governmental organizations to exchange experience on best practice in the fields of child welfare and commercial sexual exploitation with focus on [prevention, protection, recovery and reintegration, and coordination and cooperation]”.

In 1999 SAARC adopted its Convention on Regional Arrangements for the Promotion of Child Welfare in South Asia, which included the formation of a technical committee on, among other things, measures to prevent inter-country abuse and exploitation, including trafficking. The 1999 Convention requires States Parties to ensure that their national laws protect children from trafficking; and Article 6 requires them to encourage and support bilateral and multilateral agreements and cooperation. In 2002, SAARC adopted a Convention on Preventing and Combating the Trafficking in Women and Children for Prostitution, and created a Regional Task Force to monitor its implementation. The Task Force subsequently recommended, among other initiatives, the creation of a voluntary fund with contributions from Member States, individuals and donor countries and agencies for the rehabilitation and reintegration of victims of trafficking.

In 2000, the 15 Member States of the European Union, represented in the Council of Ministers and European Parliament, considered a Communication from the European Commission on Combating Trafficking in Human Beings and the Sexual Exploitation of Children that included two proposals for framework decisions binding on the Member States. Despite its title, the Communication is intended to cover not only trafficking for sexual exploitation, but also for labour exploitation. The framework decision on combating trafficking puts on Member States an obligation to ensure that trafficking or abetting and attempting it is punishable, and that penalties are “proportionate and dissuasive”. It requires procedural provisions on jurisdiction


69- Framework decisions were introduced by the Amsterdam Treaty and are intended to reinforce common approaches and allow legislative gaps to be filled.
and extradition – important in cases of cross-border trafficking – and is time-bound, with Member States bound to comply by 31 December 2002. Such harmonization of legislative procedures and bilateral arrangements for cooperation are extremely important in a region whose national borders have largely been dismantled.

The European Commission also manages a number of action programmes that aim to promote wider civil society collaboration in implementing European Union policy. Since 1997, the STOP Programme has funded 85 projects in the areas of training, exchanges, multi-disciplinary meetings, studies and research, and information dissemination aiming to combat trafficking of human beings and the sexual exploitation of children. The projects have covered a wide range of different initiatives but, in the early years of the programme, focused particularly on police and judicial cooperation, and awareness raising for targeted groups such as teachers, doctors and social workers. Although the projects have often been multi-disciplinary and have involved more than one Member State, the STOP Programme does not require this.

The European Commission’s Daphne Programme, in contrast, requires that funded projects include partners from at least two Member States. Since 1997, Daphne has funded more than 220 projects in which more than 800 NGOs, academic institutions, local authorities and other civil society groups have participated. The Daphne Programme’s remit is wide: it aims to combat violence in all its forms against women, children and young people. Daphne, like STOP, grew out of the Stockholm Congress of 1996 and the events in Belgium that have come to be known as ‘the Dutroux affair’, in which six young girls were abducted over a period of several months, potentially to be trafficked into child sex networks. The deaths of four of the girls mobilized public opinion in Europe and prompted a number of initiatives by both the European Commission and the Council of Europe. The European-wide public outcry gave rise to a truly European response and a good example of how cross-border actions can be encouraged and supported.

In relation to international, regional and subregional, multi-sector and multi-disciplinary cooperation, an important lesson was noted in the European regional consultation to the second World Congress against CSEC, which took place in Budapest in November 2001. There, a working group looking at effective models of cooperation underlined the importance of not ‘over-cooperating’, but rather of deciding what levels of cooperation are necessary in order to maximize relative strengths but not waste scarce resources on cooperation mechanisms that do not add anything to the impact or efficiency of programming. It was noted, for example, that sometimes cooperation needs to be no more than just sharing information with others working in the same area, whereas in other circumstances it might need to include not only regular meetings and consultation (often having budgetary implications) but also closely coordinated planning and policy formulation. The importance of including young people’s groupings and initiatives was also noted, since often young people’s work is noted and appreciated but not included in ‘adult’ networks or plans.
Encouraging multi-sector, transnational cooperation

The European Commission’s one-year Daphne Initiative of 1997 was renewed twice (1998 and 1999) before the European Parliament voted a legal basis that transformed it into the Daphne Programme 2000-2003. Both the Initiative and the Programme are aimed at combating violence, including sexual violence and other forms of exploitation, against women, children and young people. In the first four years, Daphne supported some 220 projects, including research studies (on risk, clients, legal provisions, offender registers, national, regional and subregional patterns of exploitation, health and other effects of violence and more); training (of youth groups, children, teachers, social workers, health professionals, media, disabled groups, marginalized groups and others); direct action (refuges and shelters, health interventions, legal support); advocacy, lobbying and awareness raising (through schools, media, campaigns, political activism, creation of observatories) and more.

All the projects have had in common a number of important elements that have made Daphne an example of good practice in regional collaboration:

- The projects include partners from at least two Member States and often many more.
- The projects promote multi-disciplinary cooperation, considering the range of needs of victims and children at risk.
- The Commission supports the projects with technical monitoring visits that aim to support the project and provide to the Commission an annual lessons-learned exercise for the future development of the Daphne Programme itself.
- The Commission also undertakes ex-post evaluation of completed projects with a view to assessing overall impact of the Daphne Programme and appropriate future policy directions.
- The Daphne Programme section of the European Commission website includes a database, accessed by keyword search, that includes the final reports of all completed projects and contact details of project implementers, so that organizations preparing new projects can learn from work already undertaken, consult organizations with experience, and identify appropriate partners for future project activity.
- The framework and development of the Daphne Programme to encourage a consistently transnational, pan-European approach have forged valuable cross-border partnerships and action.
- A number of valuable lessons have come out of the Daphne Programme, particularly relating to building national strengths and weaknesses into projects, rather than ignoring them; and sharing and adapting experiences across different cultures within a region.\(^\text{70}\)

\(^{70}\) Lessons from the Daphne Programme were presented in workshop W2/4 at the second World Congress against CSEC.
Mapping and situation analysis

Mapping is an essential tool of effective action and vital to avoiding duplication and wasted resources. This includes not only mapping of the problem of trafficking itself (including disaggregated data on children at risk, trafficked children, mechanisms and exploiters), but also responses to it (government and other initiatives, law enforcement and judicial action including investigations, prosecutions, sentences and rehabilitation programmes), and resources available (funds and funders, NGOs and other implementing agencies, experts, information sources).

Mapping ‘who is doing what’

A pilot mapping project aiming to identify ‘who is doing what’ against CSEC, including trafficking, in eight countries of Central and Eastern Europe and the Baltic States was completed by the Focal Point against Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children, with UNICEF support, in June 2000. The survey, which covered Bulgaria, the Czech Republic, Estonia, Hungary, Latvia, Lithuania, Poland and Slovakia, was based on an identified need to “promote further reliable and systematic information exchanges in a region where the development of an active and credible civil society is a new concept but where there is a great deal of expertise”. A number of important lessons came out of the pilot phase of this project, including that:

- The methodological approach of building groups of reliable and appropriate correspondents in each country, rather than appointing an external researcher to undertake field missions, was extremely successful. Not only did this provide grassroots, on-the-spot information, it began to forge a real ‘team’ of people who would stay in touch with each other and also provide a potential network for future mapping or collaborative work.

- It was important to ensure continuing contact with, and motivation of the correspondents, whose expectations had been raised and whose commitment had been secured. This is not necessarily easy in a short-term project with time-limited funding.

General perceptions of what trafficking is have been greatly influenced by increasing media coverage of trafficking in human beings and through movies and books in which ‘trafficking’ has taken on an almost glamorous connotation, associated with drug dealers, international espionage and thrills and excitement. These have often been further reinforced by the desire of agencies working in this field to present the most compelling picture possible to supporters and funding agencies to prompt action or contributions.

As in many other issues related to the exploitation of children, for example, early reports of trafficking, and responses to it, came out of South-East Asia. This remains the best documented region with regards to trafficking. Since the late 1980s/early 1990s, NGOs and campaigning organizations have rightly raised the call for something to be done to deal with the problem of CSEC in Asia. As their work revealed more and more children in commercial sex from countries other than the country of exploitation, reports began to be written about children who had been trafficked into the sex trade and horrific stories of kidnapping, torture and exploitation began to appear in the media.

71. The full text of the project report is available on the Focal Point web site: www.focalpointngo.org.
There is no doubt that such horrors happened then and continue today. However, the extreme cases that attracted media attention and public interest obscure the much bigger picture.

The reality is that, given the hidden nature of labour and commercial sexual exploitation of children and, indeed, the fact that they are increasingly removed from public view in the wake of more stringent laws and policing, the truth of the matter is not fully known or understood.

More work is consequently needed on research methodologies, particularly in the clandestine fields of trafficking, hazardous child labour and CSEC. Reliable sources of information are difficult to identify and there has been much anecdotal information that has contributed to a body of conventional wisdom that is at best skewed and at worst totally misleading. ILO-IPEC has had some success in the use of rapid assessment methodology\(^2\) that is predicated on surveying small but highly reliable samples of (1) children who are at risk, victims or recovering victims of trafficking, CSEC and/or exploitative labour, (2) traffickers and exploiters and (3) workers and other interested parties who have first-hand knowledge of the situation in the chosen research site.\(^3\)

**Rapid Assessment on the trafficking of girls in Nepal**

The Rapid Assessment survey combines both quantitative and qualitative data-gathering tools, and is aimed at obtaining in-depth knowledge of a given phenomenon within three months. In Nepal, it aimed to understand the plight and lives of girls trafficked within the country and across the border into the sex trade in India. The study focused on the causes, characteristics, magnitude and consequences of trafficking. Primary information consisted of both quantitative and qualitative data generated through interviews and field surveys. The target populations included girls at risk, girls trafficked within the country, and those who had returned from India. Secondary information was obtained from available sources such as reports, newspaper articles and seminar papers.

**Who is being trafficked?**

The study findings estimate that 12,000 children are trafficked every year from Nepal. Trafficking crosses many caste/ethnic groups of Nepal, but most at risk are members of the hill ethnic group and lower castes. About one quarter of the girls in the study sample were trafficked before they reached 14, and more than half were under 16.

**Factors contributing to vulnerability**

Trafficking is related to general vulnerability, exacerbated by poor access to or withdrawal from education. Only one of the 85 girls in the study was attending school at the time of the survey. Family vulnerability, which directly relates to child vulnerability, is also related to low education levels of the parents (mother more than father), insufficient household income and mistreatment.

---

\(^2\) The Rapid Assessment methodology has been developed by ILO-IPEC and UNICEF.

\(^3\) Rapid assessment reports on child trafficking in Nepal, Indonesia, the Philippines, Thailand’s border areas, Sri Lanka and Bangladesh; and on children in prostitution in United Republic of Tanzania, El Salvador, Indonesia, Jamaica and elsewhere were undertaken in 2000/2001.
How are the girls being trafficked?

Trafficking occurs through multiple routes and modes of transportation. Many traffickers make transport arrangements with long-distance truck drivers. The majority of respondents were pulled by promises of good employment, and with hopes of economic improvement. Once sold, they belong to the brothel owner until they can pay back the amount paid for them.

Challenges when returning to their homes in Nepal

Girls return home in four different ways: (i) directly from brothels voluntarily or involuntarily, (ii) by being rescued and put into an Indian rehabilitation centre before returning to Nepal, (iii) by being rescued, put into an Indian rehabilitation centre, then shifted to a Nepalese rehabilitation centre before returning to family, and (iv) by being rescued and put into a Nepalese rehabilitation centre before returning to family.

Rapid Assessment results are useful because they are based on information collected directly from the victims and abusers and those who are in contact with them. Within the sample area, therefore, they can be used for planning programmes that are likely to be highly relevant to the needs of children. However, it would be dangerous to extrapolate the results of such specific research and suggest that it gives a picture of a whole country or region. For a national or regional picture to emerge, it would be necessary to repeat the rapid assessment exercise across a broad geographical area, thus allowing similarities and differences to emerge. Indeed, such an undertaking would give a particularly useful opportunity to note trends, movements and specificities.

A number of pilot projects have also been run to test innovative methodologies of data collection and to allow analysis of causes of vulnerability to exploitation and trafficking. On the Thai/Myanmar border, World Vision, Save the Children and Tearfund have been cooperating to try and stem the flow of migration into Thailand of members of the Shan community. To understand the factors that encourage such movement, the research team has piloted a ‘positive deviant’ methodology, which essentially focuses on interviews with members of the community who have chosen not to migrate. The aim is to learn lessons from these community members that might be used to influence the decisions of other members of the community. This participatory approach, which brings young people and other community members into the action, is proving to be both relevant and sustainable, because it is based on the realities of the community. The NGOs running the pilot have gathered valuable lessons in the pilot stage, including the need to take care not to stigmatize young people who do chose to migrate to Thailand, the importance of taking the time to work with the community, the value of peer support and the positive impact of parents’ participation in the research.  

Direct action to fend off economic pressures

The factors that contribute to trafficking are so diverse that many different forms of response are needed, ranging from wide-ranging government initiatives to tackle poverty to multilateral support for countries from institutions like the World Bank to underpin national efforts at economic growth.

---

74 These lessons and more detail of the project were shared in workshop W1/6 at the second World Congress against CSEC.
In contrast, at a micro level, employment creation and income generation at the community level can have an immediate positive impact on vulnerable people and fend off pressures that encourage or force a child to relocate and to potentially fall victim to traffickers and exploiters. Such programmes, however, need to be both sustainable and widely applied, since there is a risk that reducing the vulnerability of one community will simply result in exploiters moving elsewhere.

NGOs have developed income-generation projects for both vulnerable children and families that are based on market realities. One of the most difficult hurdles to overcome is the fact that young people especially are attracted to work in sectors where they know they can earn more money than in agricultural, light industrial or other similar work near their homes. Many children report that they are prepared to suffer what they see as escapable, short-term exploitation and even abuse if it means they can earn (comparatively) large sums of money. They are not aware that the hardship will be severe, the repercussions long-term and the remuneration probably much below expectations.

Skills training and income generation projects, therefore, must attempt to equip young people with skills that are likely to help them to build the kind of future they hope for. This means undertaking market surveys in the home and neighbouring communities, identifying shifting demands for skills and labour, and providing young people with appropriate skills while helping them to improve their general educational level where possible. Helping young people to understand why better-paid jobs are not necessarily desirable is also important, and this is a good example of where adults who have suffered at the hands of exploiters and traffickers can help. In such instances, the credibility of those who have themselves been victims is a powerful tool.

In Albania, the Swiss Government Cooperation for Development funding arm supports vocational training for young people at risk of trafficking into labour and sexual exploitation. This is based on local job market realities and includes marketable skills such as car maintenance and carpentry for boys. This vocational training is part of a wider project that has several partners and that aims to reduce the vulnerability of Albanian children to relocating and falling into exploitation in neighbouring Greece, and at helping those who have returned from exploitative situations.

In the Mekong countries, ILO-IPEC has supported prevention programmes at community level that comprise vocational training, life-skills education, credits/grants, job placement, small business development, and non-formal education and awareness raising among target families, women and children. Community-based organizations and groups have been mobilized and strengthened to actively participate in the planning and implementation of these programmes.

Encouraging children to stay in education and helping them to fend off pressures from family, friends and exploiters to earn an income is an important prevention measure as well as a support to children who have been trafficked. This can be achieved through special classes in regular schools, alternative non-formal education opportunities or, indeed, in appropriate circumstances through small cash payments.
Direct support with a twist

In northern Thailand, the NGO Thai Women of Tomorrow (TWT) launched a scheme designed to help girls in village communities to stay in school by giving them small cash grants that they could use to pay for school needs and fend off parental pressure to drop out. As they reach an age at which family and community pressure begins, the girls are given a small amount of money, which is handed out at a ceremony in the village. This is as a sort of ‘graduation ceremony’ in which girls, parents and community can acknowledge that the girl is going to be able to help herself and her family but also stay in school. The girls are also trained in simple money management.

After initially funding the project through normal funding channels, TWT came up with the idea of involving the business community as benefactors, thus also engaging them in understanding the reasons why the girls have a right to protection. Each envelope bears the name and address of the sponsor, and the girls are encouraged to write thank-you letters. In some cases, this has led to continued sponsorship of a child right through university.

Education as prevention

UNICEF has a global policy summed up as ‘education at all levels’. This is predicated not only on the role of education as preparation for work and life, but also as a tool for better understanding and awareness. UNICEF runs education-based programmes in 34 countries for children of all ages, including school readiness activities focusing on the child’s early years, quality improvement schemes in schools to reduce drop-out rates.\(^75\)

Adults also need to be targeted with knowledge acquisition and understanding programmes. Examples of educational programming that is much needed but still thin on the ground is that designed for adults and clients of commercial sex outlets, for example on the risks of STDs, including HIV/AIDS. For exploited children and children in highly vulnerable situations, such as those living on the streets, understanding of the hazards of drug and alcohol use is also vital. There has been some reluctance to acknowledge that children in prostitution or in other highly exploitative situations cannot always be immediately removed from such intolerable situations since this might put them and those who try and help them at risk of reprisals, including threats to their life. Such children must, however, be helped to take every precaution to safeguard their health and protect themselves from infection and addiction with a view to improving their chance of successful recovery when they are recovered from exploitation.

In this work, NGOs that work with adult sex workers, with substance abusers and with the health needs of marginalized groups may have valuable experience that children’s organizations do not have. There are clear opportunities for new partnerships here.

\(^{75}\) In a number of different ILO-IPEC rapid assessment exercises, children have reported that they left school and decided to move elsewhere to find work “because school was so bad”.

EMERGING RESPONSES AND LESSONS LEARNED
Sema Pattana Chivit (developing the quality of life) for girls at risk of being lured into prostitution, Thailand

In 1994, the Ministry of Education (MOE) found that in the eight northern provinces of Thailand approximately 10,000 out of 70,000 children completing sixth grade — equally split between boys and girls — did not continue with secondary education. Some 590 girls were found to be on the point of being sold to trafficking agents and 240 about to go to work in the cities.

The MOE established the Sema Pattana Chivit programme to provide educational opportunities for at-risk girls to continue their education with financial support from the government. IPEC, UNICEF and other international agencies provided additional technical support. During its first five years (1994-1999), some 37,395 students were helped.

In 2001, the government earmarked 105 million Baht (US$ 2.5 million) to support 40,000 students nationwide.

The programme provides scholarships and placements of at-risk girls in 15 MOE boarding schools across the country. Teachers and NGOs are involved in identifying children eligible for the scholarships or internship programmes.

To serve the particular needs of girls at risk, there was a need to upgrade the boarding school curriculum. The Ministry’s goal was to ensure that girls left school with skills needed for the labour market in their own communities or in other provinces. The inclusion of marketable job skills (handicrafts, cooking, bakery, computer skills) in the curriculum was an important element of the programme.

The strategy of drawing the girls back to school proved successful. In those three extra years in school, many girls were seen to have developed a more positive attitude towards education and work, reducing their risk of falling into exploitation.

The Sema Pattana Chivit programme offers a number of useful lessons:

• Because it is a government initiative, it stands a good chance of being sustainable. The allocation of the government’s financial resources and personnel demonstrates a high level of commitment.
• Financial support in the form of scholarships benefits at-risk girls directly. Other support such as shelter, counselling and job placement ensures that the girls are provided with options.
• The programme was designed to operate within the education system, with funding from the government. It can be continued even when support from IPEC and other international organizations ends.
• It reaches the targeted girls directly.
• The curriculum meets the specific needs of girls at risk.
• The programme identified teachers as key players in implementing the activities. They best know the problems the girls and their families face and can therefore identify girls at risk most effectively.
Other valuable lessons learned for future interventions, include:

- Educational intervention needs to be accompanied by interventions that aim to change parents’ attitudes towards education.
- The socio-economic survival needs of families must also be addressed.
- Based on the socio-economic background of the girls, the education programme should give priority to occupational and skills training to enable them to earn an income after completing their education.² and development of second-chance opportunities for working children who have missed out on an education.

There has also been reluctance - or perhaps timidity - to work with those who exploit children. Although there is an understandable call for such people to be pursued in law, it has been pointed out that, in some societies, the majority of the male population regularly visits brothels and may potentially engage in sex with minors. To put all these men in jail would be both impossible and impractical. It is therefore important that they be targeted with a view to changing their behaviour over time. Where they are simply ignorant of the exploitation they perpetrate, they can be shown the effects of their action. While ignorance is never an excuse for criminal exploitation, reducing ignorance may be a step forward in reducing demand.

In Brazil, the successful ‘Brazil is watching you’ campaign went some way towards acknowledging that not all exploiters can be immediately identified and stopped, but that mass public messages would reach them (and alert a wider public) and make them understand that the country would not tolerate abusive behaviour. The campaign used mass-marketing techniques to deliver its message: posters and billboards, leaflets, TV and radio spots, t-shirts, a striking graphic that was reproduced on air tickets, in magazines and on stickers. Beyond speaking to exploiters and potential abusers, this campaign was instrumental in influencing public awareness of the criminal behaviour of exploiters.

ECPAT Australia (now operating as ChildWise) has run similar information campaigns in Australia, targeting travellers who might exploit children in other countries in the region and whose demand for child labour and sexual services contributes to trafficking of children into tourist resorts and major cities.

Interception, rescue and reintegration: supporting trafficked children

Effective interception and rescue can prevent child victims of trafficking from further exploitation. Interception can take place at the points of departure, transit and arrival. In the Philippines, IPEC has been supporting the Visayan Forum, an NGO that runs a programme to identify and receive children arriving unaccompanied at Manila Port and to provide them with basic information that will reduce their vulnerability (for example about accommodation, available services, and their rights), as well as access to social services if they need them. The model of identification of at-risk children, reception and introduction to multi-sectoral services at the point where the children become most vulnerable is an extremely effective protection mechanism, since it effectively interrupts the chain of trafficking. It could clearly be replicated and developed at other points where children become vulnerable to predators (airports, train, bus stations).
Another element of the Visayan Forum project also seems to be effective and open to further development and expansion: the NGO has built strong links with the captains of the ships on which the children travel, with the crews of the ships and with the shipping lines. Some captains provide free passage for children to return immediately to their homes if they are not met by the family members they were expecting to meet. Beyond the direct assistance that this offers, again interrupting the trafficking flow, it is also a good example of coalition building and awareness raising among groups directly involved in the movement of children. There is no reason why this team-building approach could not be extended to airline crews, bus and truck drivers, hotel staff and others who may knowingly or unknowingly come into contact with children being or at risk of being trafficked.

The rescue and recovery of children who have been trafficked and their return or reintegration into their home community or some appropriate alternative is perhaps the most challenging area of programme intervention. Children who have been trafficked have multiple, urgent needs. These include accommodation, basic provisions, health facilities, counselling, assistance to return, legal advice, protection from reprisals and support to begin building a future. Some of these may be short- or medium-term, but they may also be long-term.

Rescue is properly the business of law enforcement, since those who have trafficked or exploited the child should be apprehended and brought to justice where possible. However, the police may not be able to move beyond law enforcement action and provide the support that victimized children urgently need. There is generally a need for child-centred services for the children, which could be provided by specialized police teams or, if not, NGO/social services. Most importantly, someone has to ensure that the recovered child is not the immediate focus of legal sanctions. In many instances, children are arrested for illegal activity and taken to holding facilities while exploiters are allowed bail or even to go free.

Many NGOs and intergovernmental agencies work closely with government, municipal and district authorities to ensure that provisions are introduced to avoid re-victimization of the trafficked or exploited child. In some instances, the children are released into the care of an NGO that will coordinate the ‘case’ and consult with partners who can provide varied services in support of the child.

Accommodation will need to be found that is not immediately recognizable as a shelter, since these are often the target of employers, agents, pimps and crooks who do not appreciate interference in their business. Although most refuges and shelters attempt to remain anonymous, this is not easy in small communities. In Ioannina in northern Greece, the NGO RCTVI (Rehabilitation Centre for Torture Victims, Ioannina) has negotiated with local hotels to provide secure hotel rooms for trafficked and abused women and children. These unmarked rooms provide privacy and security while the other needs of the victims are being met.

World Vision International (WVI) has also had good experience in recovery programming in Cambodia. Its project “Neavea Thmey”, which means ‘new ship’ in Khmer, is described as “a vehicle that provides a new way to young people, from darkness to a place of a brighter future”. The Neavea Thmey Centre helped 248 girls between the ages of 7 and 18 in its first five years of operation. Of these, 126 girls were eventually reunited with their families, 42 relocated to group homes with jobs, 37 remained at the Centre, 37 ran away and six died of AIDS.
The centre aims to provide a protective, supportive environment for the girls as well as long-term accommodation, health and foster care, family reconciliation, psychosocial counselling, education, vocational training, recreation and sporting activities. In addition to providing these comprehensive services to the girls, the centre also undertakes research into prevention strategies and advocacy. In the course of its work with Neavea Thmey, WVI has pulled together useful lessons: the location of a centre like this is important, since the girls using the centre need to be able to get to the services they need, like schools and hospitals; "before and after“ monitoring of the girls is important if progress is to be measured – this can be done in simple ways, for example asking staff to note behaviour patterns of the girls and changes over time; basic needs of the girls go beyond services and include security and love, and this is particularly important if the girls come from communities that are likely to reject them.

Also in Cambodia, IPEC has been supporting a local NGO in Phnom Penh, AFESIP, which set up a shelter with facilities to answer the needs of victims of trafficking. The shelter has a medical clinic, two psychosocial counsellors, education and training units, as well as food and lodging facilities. When they arrive at the shelter, girls receive emergency assistance. Thereafter, long-term options are reviewed to take into account the specific situation of the girls. Those above 15 receive basic vocational training, literacy classes, life-skills training and health care at the centre. Whenever possible, vocational training schemes involve potential employers, as this increases the girls' chances of finding a job. When the girls leave the centre, AFESIP supports them through a group reintegration process: girls working in the same area move together into a rented house near their workplace. AFESIP gives them a ‘starting kit’ with the most basic utensils, pays their rent for the first two months, and buys them bicycles if they need transport. For younger children, however, return to their families is the most desirable option. Young girls also receive training and support. Follow-up visits by AFESIP social workers are an integral part of the reintegration process. Girls who live in rural areas are given basic means to set up income-generating activities such as pig husbandry or a small grocery shop. Families are also given counselling and support. A second centre, with a farm, was set up in a rural area for girls under 15 who cannot be reintegrated into their families. The farm is both a shelter and a vocational training centre. Girls are trained in rural-based work such as weaving, animal husbandry and agriculture. These activities both help the children to learn a trade and are a source of income for the centre to sustain its support. In addition, the children attend a nearby primary school.

In Canada, Save the Children has piloted a programme called ‘Exit Routes’, that is predicated on involving young people themselves in supporting those who have survived exploitation. One valuable lesson the project learned is that overcoming substance dependency may be critical to a child/young person’s successful escape from exploitation. Many trafficked or sexually exploited children may have become dependent on drugs used to keep them compliant, and this dependency can often be a reason for their return to their exploiters.76

76 The Exit Routes project formed the basis of workshop W1/5 at the second World Congress against CSEC, on 17 December 2001. The full project report can be found in Exit Routes: Enabling commercially exploited youth in Canada to exit the sex trade, (Canada, Save the Children Canada, 2001).
IOM is active in providing assistance to victims when they have crossed borders (as per IOM’s migration mandate). IOM facilitates voluntary return and reintegration, including vocational training and micro trade. The organization manages a US-supported Global Assistance Fund that provides emergency funding for victims in areas where there is no IOM country programme. Those who require funding provide input to an anonymous questionnaire that traces the trafficking process and, from this, IOM is compiling a database drawing up processes globally.77

Family reunification is also important. Although it may not be possible to return a child to a family that rejects her/him, or where s/he is likely to be vulnerable to being trafficked again, return to the home community is considered an ideal outcome for many trafficked children. In Angola, the Ministry of Social Reinsertion (MINARS) works with UNICEF and NGOs to provide treatment and housing for rescued children and works to reunite them with their families.

Paying attention to children’s needs

Since 1999, ILO-IPEC has funded the work of Fundación Renacer in Colombia. When it began work in this area in 1994, the NGO knew that the first challenge to be addressed in relation to trafficking and exploitation of children was the general lack of awareness and information on the problem. The first phase of their work, therefore, involved development of methodologies for preliminary studies in cities around the country. They then mobilized multi-disciplinary workshops to see how to respond to the challenges defined and to develop action models.

What came out of this preparatory work was the opening of an external ‘attention centre’ in Bogota that began offering health, psychological and legal support to a small group of children and young people. By 1995, it had become clear that the children would need longer-term support and time away from the streets, so a residential centre was added. In 1998, new centres were opened in Cartagena and Barranquilla. The aim of these was to provide a home and a sense of belonging for the children.

But long-term, even permanent service provision is costly. To try and move the work towards self-sustainability, Fundación Renacer decided to open restaurants in which the children could work. In this way the children learn skills, contribute to their own upkeep, and the project has some income (although self-sustainability has not yet been achieved).

The Renacer experience has produced some valuable lessons about the difficulty of long-term support to trafficked and exploited children:

- Skills training provided to the children may be too short to ensure that they have sufficient skills to be able to find employment, however skills such as computer literacy are replacing more traditional activities such as hairdressing and dressmaking.
- Occupational training provided in the restaurants was more successful, and this could potentially be developed with relevant micro-enterprise activity to help them become self-sustaining.
- The work has resulted in the creation of a network of young leaders through which a preventative healthcare strategy has been developed.

77 The IOM trafficking database is in a pilot phase and is not yet available externally.
• Young people who have passed through the ‘reinsertion process’ have been involved in the programme, taking part in awareness raising about the services; they have informed and motivated other exploited children to visit the homes and begin the process of reinsertion.
• The programme helped most of the children to re-enter education or achieve educational levels up to grade school.
• Agreements reached with health centres in different cities have allowed the programme to offer personalized follow-up, gynaecological attention, treatment and prevention of STDs, sex education and programmes for teenage pregnancies.
• Income-generating activities, especially in the restaurants, have allowed the adolescents in the programme to reach their own level of income sustainability.
• Skills training has been undertaken with the support of more than 40 institutions and companies, widening partnerships into the private sector and providing opportunities for young people.

Engendering broad-based participation and support

It is clear by now that efforts to eliminate trafficking require the contributions of a wide range of groups, not only governments and agencies working for children. It is consequently important to harness the skills and outreach of as many different groups as possible, and to learn from their specialized experiences to develop project activity that is innovative and targeted. This will inevitably mean looking beyond traditional partnerships and finding ways to work together despite potentially differing approaches and methods.

Women working in, or with experience of being in prostitution, for example, are likely to know first-hand some of the needs of children who have emerged from prostitution. In Brazil, adult sex workers have been brought into projects aimed at raising the awareness of young girls in tourist areas about the hazards they face. In the Philippines, brothel owners have enquired how they might become involved in actions to reduce child prostitution, which they believe threatens the business of the adult commercial sex sector.78

In Nicaragua, the Asociación Mary Barreda has used the ‘social network’ concept to work with highly targeted groups of people who come into contact with young people in areas where they may be vulnerable to recruiters and traffickers. Among them are women who work as vendors in the local bus station and who observe the activity of travellers and those who meet them. The women themselves say that they have been empowered by their experience with Asociación Mary Barreda’s awareness-raising work, and have begun to watch out for and report possible cases of exploitation.

Other examples of groups of workers who are well placed to identify children at risk of being trafficked include those from transport companies (bus drivers, ships’ crews, train staff, airline crews), ground services (at bus and railway stations, in airports, at ports), and travel-related sectors (hotels, restaurants, entertainment venues, travel agencies).79 As many of them belong to some sort of trade association or union, partnership with unions, professional associations and other work-related groupings is a potentially effective way of reaching them.

78 For additional information on this and the Asociación Mary Barreda project, see: Going where the children are: An evaluation of ILO-IPEC programmes in trafficking and sexual exploitation of children in Thailand, Philippines, Colombia, Costa Rica and Nicaragua, (Geneva, ILO-IPEC, June 2001).
79 A number of examples of ILO-IPEC-supported projects in these areas are included in Going where the children are, op. cit.
Engaging new partners in the Philippines and Brazil

ILO-IPEC has had positive experiences working with trade union partners in projects to combat the worst forms of child labour, including commercial sexual exploitation and trafficking. In the Philippines, the National Union of Workers in the Hotel, Restaurant and Allied Industries, NUWHRAIN, undertook a research and training/awareness-raising project that both used its expertise and also took project activity into areas where traditional child-focused projects had not reached.

NUWHRAIN conducted in-depth interviews with 500 children working in Metro Manila, reaching children in illegal labour situations where many researchers could not go. The children were encouraged, with promises of anonymity and no reprisals, to give information that was used to build a socio-demographic profile of each child, along with detail of their work day, their experiences, their ambitions in life and more. The result was a detailed picture of the situation of the working children – where they came from, how they had entered the workplace, what they faced and where it might lead. Fifty case studies were prepared for use in training and awareness courses that NUWHRAIN’s union leaders ran for workers. The material, At Your Service: Combating child labour in the tourism industry, was also used in advocacy work for government officials, as a source of reference in collective bargaining negotiations with employers, and to mobilize workers in the tourism industry.

The NUWHRAIN project produced some valuable lessons:

- The NUWHRAIN approach provided access both to sources of information and to possible user groups of the information that traditional children’s agencies would probably not have;
- Being an ‘insider’ organization, NUWHRAIN had credibility in working with both the children and adult workers, and the advantage of a traditional relationship with government, labour mechanisms and labour sectors, which gave it leverage and influence;
- As a national union with a professional structure, NUWHRAIN was able to produce high-quality research that was useful outside its own project needs;
- NUWHRAIN’s research laid the basis for mobilization of its members to help identify and remove children from hazardous employment situations as well as to influence demand for child workers.

Evaluation of the project raised a number of issues for future consideration:

- The challenge remained of adapting NUWHRAIN’s work with high-end tourist establishments so that it reached the ‘shadier’ side of the tourism industry – possibly by mobilizing high-end establishments to influence sectors with which they have contact (for example five-star hotels have to work with taxi companies and other service suppliers);
- Clearly trade unions, professional and employers’ associations have access into groups that might otherwise be difficult to reach, and these groups could be considered ‘communities’ in their own right, so that other programming designed to work at ‘community level’ might be adaptable to be used by dedicated actors like NUWHRAIN.

In Brazil, employers’ organizations have also responded to the call for the private sector to join efforts to combat CSEC. The National Confederation for Industry (CNI) set
EMERGING RESPONSES AND LESSONS LEARNED

up a prevention and rehabilitation programme for children in prostitution, providing vocational training and educational courses to children and their families.

The programme was implemented by regional branches of the CNI in collaboration with two local NGOs. The NGOs offered education, health care, social assistance and leisure activities, while the employers’ organizations carried out vocational training courses adapted to the needs of the target group and based on market realities. These included baking, industrial sewing and serigraphy.

Almost 300 children benefited from the programme. Half of them enrolled in school and half of those who received training subsequently found a job. Bakery and sewing courses eventually showed signs of sustainability through commercial agreements with local suppliers.

The project compiled a series of good practice/lessons from the experience:

Professional organizations and NGOs can work together in a complementary way and build on relative expertise, capacities and strengths;

- The employers’ organizations showed their flexibility in adapting their training materials to the needs of the children and families while maintaining high standards. Their knowledge of market opportunities ensured that the children were trained in skills that offered hope of employment;
- Location of the educational centre near the children’s homes, and the involvement of the whole family, minimized the drop-out rate;
- The combination of skills training with educational opportunities improved the children’s general educational standards.

The law enforcement and judiciary sectors

Two other sectors that are important in combating trafficking and helping trafficking victims are law enforcement and the judiciary system. In Cambodia, for example, UNICEF has had some interesting experience working in different ways with the police and lawyers. With UNICEF support, the Bar Association (the professional association of lawyers in Cambodia) provided a technical advisor to help train lawyers to represent child victims of sexual exploitation and trafficking, as well as children in conflict with the law. In the early stages (the project began in mid-2000), two lawyers were supported to provide free services to poor children. The project produced a leaflet to inform NGOs about the services and had plans to produce and disseminate a professional bulletin for lawyers discussing the cases handled by the Bar Association’s specialized children’s lawyers.

In addition to providing a direct service to children, the project also raises awareness of their needs in the judicial sector. The idea of representing victims in criminal cases is still new in Cambodia, and lawyers tend to see their role as ensuring a fair trial for the defendant rather than representing the victim. In addition, cases involving sexual abuse, rape or indecent assault are usually dealt with out of court in the form of a cash settlement between the victim (or his/her family in the case of a child) and the offender, negotiated by the police as intermediary. As a result, the impact of this modest project goes beyond support to the children and attempts to engender change within the system itself.
The same is true of a police training project in Cambodia which is run by the Ministry of the Interior with financial and technical support from IOM, Save the Children Norway, the Cambodia Office of UNHCHR, UNICEF and WVI. The project aims to improve the capacity of the police, investigating judges and prosecutors, to investigate cases of sexual exploitation of children, rescue victims and refer them to appropriate services, arrest offenders and initiate court proceedings.

An expatriate police officer is the technical advisor to the project. With help from two short-term consultants, police operating procedures, an investigator’s manual, a trainer’s manual, interactive training videos and a sensitization video were developed. Five Ministry trainers, a four-member investigation coordination team, 16 Phnom Penh police investigators and two judges participated in initial training and continue to receive on-the-job training. To ensure commitment from high-level officers, a national seminar for all (44) provincial/municipal police commissioners and deputy police commissioners and a training workshop for 28 deputy commissioners in charge of criminal police from the whole country took place in Phnom Penh.

The Ministry team of trainers was prepared to conduct one-week training sessions in the provinces and municipalities for middle-level police officers from the provincial and district level. Trainees learn about existing laws and operating procedures, basic investigation techniques, evidence collection and court case preparation, psychosocial aspects and cooperation with other agencies, including government and NGO social services. Following the first training, police are expected to take up cases that will serve as a basis for more in-depth training during the second session, which takes place several months later. Judges and prosecutors are trained separately on issues relating to sexual exploitation and children in conflict with the law.

In Europe, ECPAT has created a Law Enforcement Group that works specifically on issues that relate to this area of response to CSEC, including trafficking. The group has prepared a series of case studies on the application of extraterritorial jurisdiction, an essential tool in work against this often cross-border crime (extraterritoriality provisions allow a country to prosecute offenders when they return to their own country after committing crimes abroad). Among other things, the group has concluded that NGOs and agencies working for children have a role to play in both sensitizing the judiciary and law enforcement personnel to issues such as trafficking and indeed children’s rights in general, and also in promoting child-friendly procedures in legal systems. This is particularly important since many cases that are brought to court fail because the taking of evidence from children and young people has not been handled appropriately and is considered unreliable, but also because children who have been trafficked or otherwise exploited are already often traumatized and vulnerable, and can easily be revictimized.

Working with the news and information media

Another group that can be influential in raising awareness about trafficking, exploitation and indeed children’s issues in general is the news media. In recent years, a number of projects have begun to look positively on journalists as important partners in efforts to protect children and combat trafficking. Such efforts have attempted to work with journalists to find ways to harness the enormous power of the media to influence public

---

80 The work of the ECPAT Europe Law Enforcement Group was presented at the second World Congress against CSEC in workshop W2/16.
opinion and alert the public, including potential victims, to risks, issues and sanctions, rather than seeing the media simply as providing a service or having a ‘responsibility’ to respond to requests for coverage.

The International Federation of Journalists (IFJ), for example, has done some high-impact work in promoting children’s issues. This professional association, which represents media professionals through its branches worldwide, has included the role and responsibilities of the media in relation to the exploitation of children in its ongoing programmatic work. In 1997, for example, the IFJ undertook a survey of codes of conduct and ethics governing journalists’ work worldwide, and began working with members to draft a code of ethics that takes account of child protection concerns. IFJ initiatives are important not only because they reach mainstream media professionals, but also because IFJ recommendations are seen as coming from inside the profession.

Acknowledging others’ working realities

In some countries, journalists themselves have set up NGOs through which they can work on behalf of children. In Brazil, a group of journalists set up ANDI, the Children’s Rights News Service, through which professional journalists distribute wire stories with, for and about children. In the UK, the NGO PressWise began as an organization to help people who had grievances about the press, and to develop media ethics policy. In 1999, UNICEF’s Regional Office for the CEE/CIS/Baltic States and PressWise produced The media and children’s rights: a practical introduction for media professionals, a pocket guide to child protection issues for working journalists (for example not identifying children in exploitative circumstances who might be at risk of reprisals), and to finding child-friendly angles in news stories (for example considering the impact a budget announcement might have on children).

As part of the project, too, PressWise began a series of training workshops in countries in Eastern Europe, facilitated by UNICEF. These bring together working journalists in a practical workshop in which issues of children’s rights are explored in the context of the challenges of real, everyday journalism. The PressWise trainers are themselves former or working journalists who know and understand the context in which the journalists work and the pressures they face from supervisors, advertisers, political leaders and others who recognize the power of the press and would like to exploit it.

As the workshop series developed, the PressWise trainers included in their itineraries on-site visits to newsrooms, TV and radio stations and press clubs, to learn more themselves about the different conditions in which journalists work, to build contacts with journalists interested in upgrading their skills, and to develop lists of child-friendly journalists for future work.

The workshops produced a number of lessons:

- Projects run by media professionals are more likely to be taken seriously by other media people and thus to have impact and sustainability.
- Recognizing the context in which journalists work - the pressures on them from their organizations, deadlines and ethical codes – is vital if projects are to be effectively targeted and planned.
- Follow-up is important because the nature of news is that it is constantly changing and journalists move from issue to issue on a daily basis.

81: This can be accessed via the Press Information pages of the website of the second World Congress against CSEC.
Community mobilization and outreach

Engaging the community in working to prevent children from becoming vulnerable to relocation and exploitation is essential. A number of successful community mobilization methodologies to protect children from trafficking have been tried and found to be successful. Some of them are described here, although this summary does not aim to be exhaustive.

The organization of Philippine society into barangays – community-level governance structures that also have increasingly decentralized responsibility for social welfare issues – for example has allowed for effective community mobilization on behalf of children. Some barangays have Councils for the Protection of Children. Although the model is new, there are elements of it that are clearly working and others that have potential to be developed.

These include micro-level planning, neighbourhood watch-type teams that monitor abuse of children and report/intervene according to the gravity of the situation, multi-sectoral task forces that respond in emergency cases and, in some instances, telephone hotlines for people to report instances of trafficking and exploitation.

ILO-IPEC has supported a number of barangay-focused action programmes in which NGOs and barangays have cooperated across a wide range of activities. More important than these discrete actions, however, is the reinforcing of community-level coalitions and the empowerment, raised awareness and capacity building of grassroots actors.

ADNET, another NGO partner of ILO-IPEC, has run specific projects to achieve such outcomes in barangays in Caloocan city in the Philippines, giving training to outreach volunteers such as day-care teachers, health workers and community officials. Since 1996 they have reached more than half of the 188 barangays in Caloocan city. Since each group of three volunteer outreach workers signs a Memorandum of Understanding with ADNET to offer at least three advocacy sessions within their barangay, there is a significant multiplier effect. ADNET reports that, as a result of this community outreach, there has been a marked increase in the reporting of child sexual abuse, an important outcome in relation to this hidden problem that research shows pushes many children into trafficking in this country.

Working in the heart of the community

In northern Thailand, ILO-IPEC supported a TWT project to create a volunteer force of teachers and former teachers to take information on the hazards of child labour, the commercial sex trade and the realities of life for young people traded into these into village communities. The volunteers know the villages, are well prepared by TWT, and are clearly determined to make a difference. Their motivation encouraged others to sign up as volunteers, including younger teachers and members of village youth groups whose participation is extremely important for credibility among young people.

An evaluation of the TWT programme in 2000 concluded that, “the model of recruiting committed volunteers within a community, training them in the issue, spreading messages and advocacy methods within their community, equipping them with basic information materials and providing minimal but ongoing backstopping to their work is replicable in other situations and could be further developed”. 82

82- ILO-IPEC, Going where the children are, op. cit., p. 38-39.
The evaluation made a number of proposals:

- Community could be more widely defined to include shopfloors, youth groupings, professional associations, schools, whole sectors of business such as hotels, airline companies, travel agents’ associations, all of which can legitimately be defined as ‘communities’ and in each of which volunteer teams from within that community could be set up to transmit information, influence peer opinion and monitor the situation of children.

- The teams need tools that are regularly updated and refreshed. The TWT team, for example, in the beginning had a series of videos prepared for the project but these eventually became outdated: as satellite television moved into the villages, the NGO-produced videos came to look amateur and dull. Other partners, including media partners, could help in this area. In addition, higher profile role models for children and young people - musicians, TV personalities, sports stars, even fictional characters in cartoons, books or video games — might feature in the materials produced, since they are likely to be very influential ‘members of the team’.

- The volunteer groupings could be given incentives to recognize and encourage their work, and this could also be used for awareness-raising action. In countries or communities where ‘awards’ are considered an important acknowledgement of achievement or commitment, such recognition is likely to be highly motivating. Sponsorship of the awards would be a good opportunity to involve local businesses in the project.

- Children and young people could participate in the volunteer teams, particularly in areas where peer pressure is a major push factor into exploitation and trafficking. They can work in the general community but also in schools, clubs, sports venues and other places where young people form ‘youth communities’.

- Specialist members of the team might be appropriate in some high risk areas, for example where there are high numbers of dysfunctional families, where gambling, drug addiction or criminal activity increase pressure on the child to earn money.

- To ensure backstopping of the volunteer teams, and to provide them with regular information, a focal point for study and reflection, and the opportunity to network, modest resource centres could be set up. The TWT project has a small information resource centre funded by ILO-IPEC that functions well: it is comfortable but not extravagant, well stocked with information and offers computer and Internet access.

A UNICEF-supported NGO in Albania, Ndihme per Femjet (NPF) maintains daily contact with families and communities in four major centres where children are regularly identified by recruiters. They employ social workers, outreach workers and school contacts who identify and refer vulnerable children, often from extremely poor families or Roma minority groups.

A major protection factor for these children is a better education and more potential for economic independence when they begin working, so the protection programme works closely with schools. The high-risk children are given extra classes so that they do not fall behind in school and drop out, and children who have already dropped out are brought back into the class. They have a chance to re-enter regular school classes when
they are ready. Also in the class are children who have been brought back from exploitative situations or who have returned and need support to avoid being re-victimized. The project targeted 400 children overall in four major cities in its first year. For each child an individual work plan was drawn up to cater to that child’s needs.

- The project is still in its early stages, however some positive results have been documented and some important lessons learned:
  - Working with local partners means that daily contact can be maintained with the families and communities; this not only encourages participation in the project but also allows close monitoring of the children, whether at risk or returned.
  - The involvement of different groups of carers – teachers, social workers and community outreach workers – allows cross-referencing of perceptions about children’s vulnerability so that those children particularly at risk are identified clearly and rapidly.
  - Because the carers are part of the community, they can follow up the children who re-enter regular school life; in the first year of the project, all the children identified for extra schooling successfully re-entered regular schooling.
  - Bringing prevention, intervention and reintegration together through a loose grouping of local, international NGOs and a multilateral agency allows for coordination and efficiency, as each partner’s strengths can be used in different ways.

In a variation on the community outreach model, the US-based NGO Free A Child works with a partner organization in Nepal on a project called Putali Yojana (Butterfly Project). Outreach teams travel from village to village to raise awareness about trafficking and child prostitution. They engage in group discussions, workshops and one-on-one consultations and identify and support rescued girls who are willing to share with the community their personal experiences.

Where literacy levels are low, the teams use street drama and video to get their messages across. The dramas show the most common tricks used by traffickers to persuade families to hand over their children. They illustrate the reality of life in brothels and include information on HIV/AIDS. The villagers are encouraged to develop and perform their own dramas, songs and dances based on their own experiences.

**Involving children and young people**

One of the most challenging areas of programming is effectively working with children and young people themselves. Although ‘child participation’ has featured prominently in discussion, plans of action, frameworks and instruments relating to trafficking and exploitation for a number of years, achieving this has been challenging and often fallen short of aspirations. In reality, adult workers who plan, implement and measure programmes to combat trafficking and exploitation often struggle to work alongside young people in ways that are more than merely superficial, or that truly reflect the desire to give young people both a say in decisions and a role in action.

There have been some successes in the area of children and the media. In a number of countries, young people have themselves initiated media activity aimed at reaching
other young people with messages that build up awareness of risks. Youth newspapers, radio programmes, websites and traditional forms of entertainment such as theatre and songs, have all been developed by young people to share information and explore issues affecting them. In the Philippines, Tinggog sa Kabataan (Voice of Children) is a low-cost radio series produced by young people to raise awareness of children’s rights and protection issues.

The NGO Save the Children has begun pilot projects to involve children in participatory research along the borders of China, Myanmar and Thailand. Internationally, the ECPAT Youth Network has mobilized children and young people in many different regions as advocates, implementing agents and outreach workers on issues directly relating to exploitation and trafficking. In particular, ECPAT International has done much to reach out to young people who have themselves survived commercial sexual exploitation and trafficking, and who have become dedicated activists to protect other children from CSEC. Projects include peer-counselling teams that can intervene quickly where children are at risk, and who work alongside police task forces for rapid response. These teams have pulled together a number of important lessons relating to peer counselling, including the importance of ensuring protection for the counsellors themselves in both dangerous and potentially traumatic situations, and the fact that the training of peer counsellors should include technical skills that can be more widely applied, thus improving the potential of the counsellors for future employment in other spheres.  

ECPAT is also considering a peer-based pilot project in Mozambique, Zimbabwe and South Africa, training groups of young people as advocates for legal change relating to trafficking, and to treatment of young people by police and before the courts. The youth advocates will also undertake public awareness-raising projects to help inform communities of the realities of CSEC and trafficking. There remains much to be done, however, in harnessing the expertise, access and creative thinking of young people in the fight against trafficking and exploitation. The major challenge remains finding effective and substantive ways to integrate the work of young people into mainstream debate, decision-making and programme interventions.

---

83 Lessons from ECPAT International’s peer counselling experience was shared in workshop W3/1 at the second World Congress against CSEC on 19 December 2001.
THE WAY FORWARD

As this report has shown, when a child is trafficked, it is not an isolated act, but a string of events involving many actors and forms of exploitation. Eradicating it is, therefore, a similarly complex challenge that necessarily involves a broad coalition of partners, working together and bringing to the partnership their specific strengths and reach. This of course includes children and young people themselves (survivors, at-risk groups and more generally), families and communities.

What the ILO brings to the combat against child trafficking

Within this broad coalition, the ILO has a clear role and contributes particular strengths that have grown out of its labour mandate and the mechanisms and tools that have been built up over years of policy formulation and programming in this area of human development. The ILO has a special responsibility within the United Nations system for the promotion of human rights at work, as enshrined in its international labour standards. Among the issues covered by this, four themes are internationally accepted as fundamental principles: freedom of association, elimination of forced labour, elimination of discrimination in the workplace, and the elimination of child labour. Putting an end to trafficking in human beings for labour and sexual exploitation is therefore a major element in the ILO’s mission of ‘decent work for all’. In this respect, too, the ILO aims to tackle the trafficking of children not as an isolated issue but as an integral part of national efforts for economic and social development.

The ILO has gathered a great deal of experience in directly or indirectly combating trafficking through the implementation of the Forced Labour Convention (No.29) and through its programmes for the protection of labour rights of women, migrant workers, minority groups and for ending child labour. The experience of these programmes provides valuable lessons that can be applied in efforts to eradicate the trafficking of children.

Since its inception, the ILO has been concerned with abolishing child labour; at its first sitting, the International Labour Conference adopted the Minimum Age (Industry) Convention, 1919 (No.5) and subsequent Conventions, Declarations and Recommendations broadened action to eliminate child labour. But the unanimous adoption of the Worst Forms of Child Labour Convention, 1999 (No. 182) focused world attention on the urgent need to take immediate action to eradicate those forms of child labour that are hazardous and deleterious to children’s physical, mental or moral well-being. In particular, worst forms of child labour (including trafficking and also slavery, debt bondage and other forms of forced labour, recruitment for use in armed conflict, prostitution and pornography, and illicit activities) are included in Convention No.182 as ‘unconditionally’ to be abolished.

The latest ILO report on child labour indicates that some 180 million children between the ages of 5 and 17 - 73 per cent of all children working, or one in every eight children in the world- are believed to be engaged in the worst forms of child labour. Of these, an estimated 8.4 million children are trapped in the ‘unconditional’ worst forms of child labour.

84- A future without child labour, the third Global Report under the Follow-up to the 1998 ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work, (Geneva, 2002).
Convention No.182 is a powerful instrument that is already proving to be both a rallying call and a practical tool. Its unanimous adoption and speedy ratification bear witness to the broad international consensus that exists with regard to child trafficking, as well as to individual nations’ determination to eradicate it. Convention No.182 provides the framework for some important action against the trafficking and exploitation of children, and the ILO will continue to support this through IPEC. Through IPEC, the ILO will:

- make available its operational experience and technical expertise in action to combat child labour in more than 90 countries, with specific experience in combating the trafficking of children in some 30 countries in Asia, Africa and Latin America;
- mobilize its constituents, including workers and employers’ organizations, around the world to take action against the exploitation and trafficking of children;
- work to strengthen the global alliance to combat child labour, particularly its worst forms, thus strengthening coalitions and ‘closing the gaps’ in partnerships against trafficking;
- make the best use of relevant ILO Conventions and established mechanisms that allow international monitoring, including complaint procedures; and
- continue its action to combat the trafficking of children and other worst forms of child labour in close collaboration with other UN agencies, international organizations and civil society.

Through many years of working closely with member countries, in particular their Ministries of Labour, Education and Social Welfare, the ILO has been able to facilitate alliances with and between policy makers and grassroots implementing agencies, including those specific to the labour sector such as trade unions, professional and workers’ associations and chambers of commerce. As a result, the ILO has developed practical experience that covers both policy and implementation at grassroots level, importantly in places where child labour is most visible and where exploitation can be stopped. This experience is invaluable in the combat against trafficking of children, because it allows input across sectors, from framework-building authorities to grassroots-level groups. Such wide legitimacy facilitates ILO’s development orientation, which is predicated on the need to combat poverty, improve living standards, empower communities and promote self-sufficiency through decent work for all.

In the context of Convention No.182 specifically, the ILO supports the action of member States in their efforts to implement “immediate and effective measures to secure the prohibition and elimination of the worst forms of child labour as a matter of urgency” (Art.1). Member States are called upon to identify instances of worst forms of child labour, including trafficking, in their countries and, in consultation with relevant government institutions and employers’ and workers’ organizations, to “design and implement programmes of action to eliminate as a priority the worst forms of child labour”. A number of countries have moved already to map worst forms of child labour and to formulate national plans of action to eliminate them.
Setting national priorities and time-bound goals

The first step for states that have ratified Convention No. 182 is to set priorities for national action against the worst forms of child labour as a matter of urgency. A number of countries, including Nepal, Sri Lanka, Cambodia, El Salvador and the United Republic of Tanzania, have set the trend in this direction by adopting a national plan to combat the worst forms of child labour and, in the case of El Salvador, Nepal and Tanzania, have set time-frames for combating CSEC and trafficking.

The challenges are great: within the context of their TBPs, they aim to make quality education and training available for all girls and boys under the age of 18, achieve significant progress in alleviating the economic hardship of families, and revise and enforce legislation to protect victims and apprehend traffickers and exploiters. The international community should support them to achieve their set goals.

For its part, ILO-IPEC will continue to support countries to develop national TBPs to combat the worst forms of child labour, including the trafficking of children, as a national priority. Given the transnational nature of trafficking, moreover, the ILO will continue to support member countries as they move to put in place cross-border agreements, memoranda of understanding and joint programming to combat trafficking across their frontiers.

Working together at bilateral and international levels

Experience has shown that collaboration has the greatest chance of success when all countries concerned take equal responsibility for protecting the rights of children. In addition, substantive policy dialogues and joint action must be undertaken in critical areas including law enforcement, border control and monitoring of trafficking networks, as well as apprehending criminals who cross borders with the purpose of exploiting children. In this same context, cross-border cooperation is imperative to protecting the rights of children who are being or who have been trafficked, to ensure that they are not further traumatized or victimized.

Bilateral or regional agreements on repatriation measures, extradition and prosecution of offenders need to be developed. This requires, however, that differences in levels of information and experience in combating trafficking among the countries involved be overcome. To this end, the international community can help countries to work together more closely at bilateral and subregional level to harmonize policies and exchange information, and to reinforce capacities to implement the agreements put in place. In addition, regional and international cooperation in the areas of data collection and analysis, capacity building of key actors, exchange of good practices, and national and international alliance building would greatly facilitate the process. ILO-IPEC will continue to support international, bilateral and subregional cooperation through participation in international forums as well as in working coalitions in which it participates in tandem with its ongoing programmes to combat the trafficking of children in Asia, Africa and Latin America.

The importance of regional and subregional cooperation to combat trafficking was underlined in the process leading up to the second World Congress against CSEC in December 2001. A series of regional consultations in the two months before the
Congress not only brought actors together at a regional level but importantly resulted in regional declarations and action plans to implement at regional level the Stockholm Declaration and Agenda for Action (1996) and the Yokohama Global Commitment (2001).

Each of these action plans contains region-specific activity that is to take place within a set time-frame, ranging from specific actions such as the promotion of an international warrant for the arrest of traffickers of children (Europe and Central Asia’s Commitment and Plan of Action, Budapest, 20-21 November 2001) to more general commitments such as addressing “the interrelationship between CSEC and child trafficking and ... laws to combat the phenomenon, while ensuring that the child victims of trafficking are not classified or treated as illegal immigrants and that they are able to access support systems to protect their security and safe return home” (East Asia and Pacific Region Commitment and Action Plan, Bangkok, 16-18 October 2001).

As a full participant in these regional consultations as well as at both the Stockholm and Yokohama Congresses, the ILO, through IPEC, will contribute its experience and expertise to the implementation of the regional and global commitments in cooperation with others engaged in this work. This includes continued cooperation with NGOs and other members of the United Nations family. In this regard, it is clear that future activity needs to build on relative strengths and differences, avoiding duplication of programming wherever possible. While information sharing is also important in this regard, early and ongoing cooperation and consultation are needed to ensure cost-effective and comprehensive planning and activity. In some regions ILO-IPEC is already working closely with UNICEF and UNDP, for example in South-East Asia, where IPEC participates in an inter-agency working group that, under the auspices of UNDP, consults regularly on implementation and directions in action against trafficking in this region.

It is also important, however, to make links across sectors, so that ‘families’ of actors do not cooperate in isolation from others who are also engaged in the combat against trafficking of children. This is true, for example, of organizations such as Interpol, whose Specialized Group on Trafficking and Exploitation of Children is central to transnational law enforcement efforts. Interpol (and more recently Europol) have participated actively in multi-sector forums and consultation mechanisms at global level, and NGO and multilateral agencies should similarly strive to keep themselves informed of action and analysis in the law enforcement arena.

Other bodies working actively to combat the trafficking of children are also often present in international meetings but not necessarily included in more regular discussions and in particular in strategic planning. The World Tourism Organization, for example, has been active in the fight against CSEC for more than a decade. Its outreach to many different levels in tourism-related industries is significant. The same is true of the International Federation of Journalists, whose members are instrumental in awareness raising and information-related programming. Although both of these organizations participate actively and regularly in international meetings, they are not always included in regional or subregional task forces, working groups and consultations.

With particular regard to the world of work and the fight against exploitative child labour and trafficking for that purpose, companies of all sizes, employers, workers and the associations and unions that gather them together are powerful agents of change, as well as being ideally placed for data collection, monitoring, protection, interception
and recovery. The few examples given in this report of trade union project activity against child trafficking are just a small sample of the very diverse and wide-ranging activity that is possible within the labour sector and that ILO-IPEC aims to develop further. Through the Global Movement against Child Labour, ILO-IPEC will attempt to include the world of work – from major multi-national corporations to small local trade unions – in efforts against the worst forms of child labour, including trafficking.

At a programmatic level, the future of work against child trafficking is likely to be characterized by closer evaluation and monitoring of the actions undertaken in fulfilment of international, regional and national commitments and in the pursuit of quality action that has a direct, positive impact on children. Monitoring mechanisms are already in place to assess progress in implementation of the CRC and its Optional Protocol on the Sale of Children (viz the United Nations Committee on the Rights of the Child) and ILO Conventions No.29 and 182 (viz the system of supervision under the ILO Constitution and the ILO Declaration). In addition, the regional action plans developed as part of the Yokohama Congress process have in some instances regional monitoring mechanisms built into them. In the case of the Budapest Commitment and Plan of Action, for example, the Council of Europe and UNICEF have been nominated to follow up progress in implementing the action plan, in consultation with other relevant players. A report is to be submitted to the Council of Europe in conjunction with member reporting on Council of Europe Recommendation (2001) 16, and a follow-up meeting is planned for 2003 to review progress.

In terms of evaluating project activity and learning lessons from them, ILO-IPEC will continue to undertake regular and relevant evaluation exercises and share the results and lessons learned with a wide public of those whose work can benefit from them. Evaluations in IPEC are done as evaluations of global programmes, including IPEC as a whole; as thematic evaluations of IPEC interventions on a specific issue; as country programme evaluations for all interventions in a given country; and as specific project evaluations. Evaluation missions are undertaken by independent experts and IPEC staff members and partners, and these are combined to provide both external verification of achievement and lessons learned and immediately usable exchanges within IPEC and its partners.

With clear global, regional and subregional action plans in place, international instruments reinforced and ratified, national agendas and bilateral agreements being developed, the framework is in place for concerted collaborative action against trafficking of children. These important framework developments, however, will only be of value if they are translated into effective programming on the ground.

---

85 The ILO Constitution establishes a system of international supervision of the application of ratified ILO Conventions by regular supervision (governments must submit regular reports to the ILO at specified intervals, and these, along with employers’ and workers’ comments, are examined by an independent Committee of Experts that reports to the International Labour Conference); and through special ad hoc procedures in cases where there are acute problems or persistent non-observance of a ratified Convention. As part of the Follow-up to the ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work, there is a system for gathering information through annual reports from those countries that have not yet ratified the relevant fundamental Conventions, and these are reviewed by the ILO Governing Body. In addition, the ILO Director-General submits a Global report to the International Labour Conference on one of the four fundamental principles each year. The first report on Child Labour was submitted in June 2002.
Towards comprehensive programme interventions

Comprehensive programme interventions must be developed in the context of the situation and the realities in each country or region, and must take account of the national, subregional and regional specificities of the root causes of children’s vulnerability, mechanisms and routes used by traffickers, and the nature of the exploitation that takes place, as well as the legal and cultural context. As a result, the first and most important – but also potentially difficult – stage of any programme intervention must be reliable, geographically specific, comprehensive research, data collection and situation analysis, on which tailored programming can be designed, potentially using elements of programming developed elsewhere and shown to be effective, but with due regard to their appropriateness and necessary adaptation.

Data gathering and programme planning

At the moment no one research methodology has been shown to be universally applicable and reliable. IPEC has had some success with rapid assessment methodology (see above), but this is a specific method of data collection that should not be extrapolated outside its sample area. The same is true of many other data collection methods that unfortunately are too often generalized beyond the boundaries of applicability.

In general, therefore, the most useful data remains that which is built up from a multiplicity of sources, taking into account variations in samples and methods. Based on these limited data, programming can be designed that is similarly limited in size, reach and impact, but which is highly relevant to the targeted group of children. Bringing these modest programmes together within a framework that aims to achieve comprehensive coverage of a country, subregion or indeed region, is the basis on which ILO-IPEC has developed its subregional programming to date.

In West and Central Africa, for example, IPEC launched in June 2001 a regional programme to combat child trafficking, covering Benin, Burkina Faso, Cameroon, Côte d’Ivoire, Gabon, Ghana, Mali, Nigeria and Togo (Nigeria subsequently asked to join the programme). The first phase of the project mapped the problem and suggested preliminary measures to combat it. Phase II, which comprises direct action project to prevent trafficking and to rescue and repatriate trafficked children, will include work with judiciary and police in the countries involved with a view to dismantling trafficking networks and reinforcing victims’ rights. Programming in this region also focuses on awareness raising, to combat entrenched positions regarding child labour in general and the exploitative placement of girl children in particular. The programme is scheduled to last for three years.

In South Asia, a subregional programme to combat trafficking of children is operating in Bangladesh, Nepal and Sri Lanka. It is based on a subregional plan drawn up in 1998 and includes: research, documentation and monitoring; institutional development and capacity building; pilot direct action programmes; and advocacy for subregional cooperation and action. IPEC is working to involve India and Pakistan in the programme. The TICW project in the Greater Mekong subregion of South-East Asia (see above) is based on building a process-based approach that includes capacity building, awareness raising and advocacy, and direct action. In both of these subregional programmes, IPEC’s development orientation aims to take account of economic disparities, extreme poverty and gender attitudes that increase vulnerability.
Finally, in South and Central America, IPEC runs a small-scale cross-border project aiming to combat trafficking of children between Brazil and Paraguay. The project includes rescue and recovery activities but also the provision of credit facilities to 400 families as a prevention measure. In other countries of this region, the problem has gone largely unaddressed, although it is acknowledged to exist. IPEC is therefore compiling information with a view to developing a strategy for action and will aim to capitalize on a tradition of grassroots activism that can be instrumental in combating child trafficking, itself a social evil.

In-country capacity building

Action to combat the trafficking of children will only be sustainable to the extent that there is appropriate and sufficient in-country capacity to undertake the many different actions that have been seen to be necessary if children are to be protected, supported, rescued and helped to rebuild, and if traffickers, exploiters and abusers are to be stopped. ILO-IPEC therefore regularly builds into its programmes capacity-building projects that aim to:

- create or strengthen institutions at the national level in the field of legal, social and economic assistance to victims of child trafficking and to populations at risk;
- strengthen law enforcement agencies and mechanisms, including paralegal education for police and other community-watch programmes against child trafficking, and training them in child-friendly procedures;
- offer training programmes for social workers and organizers in the areas of rehabilitation, trauma treatment and psychosocial counselling services for child victims of trafficking;
- provide training in programme design, monitoring, evaluation and reporting to implementing agencies and project staff.

This is an area where cooperation between international NGOs and members of the UN family is also possible and desirable, since the impact of small capacity-building projects is necessarily less significant than a multi-agency plan aimed at reaching more implementing organizations, sectors and individuals. Additionally, international NGOs and UN agencies have different and diverse programming experience, with different specializations (for example in health, social mobilization or psychosocial counselling), so that pooling resources – both financial and human – might result in capacity-building projects that are more comprehensive and broader in scope.

Empowerment of individuals

Since trafficking often involves false promises, outright deception, misinformation or ignorance, helping vulnerable groups to be aware of the traps they may be lured into is an effective prevention measure. Awareness raising, school, family and community education, and media campaigns (regardless of the sophistication of the media used) are consequently important tools of the programmer working in the area of trafficking and exploitation.
Depending on the nature of the communities at risk, awareness can also be raised, and understanding improved, through community meetings, information at health points, churches and other places where people regularly gather, in door-to-door contact campaigns, and indeed using any channel through which people generally receive information that they consider relevant to their lives. A number of agencies have had experience in one or more of these areas, and there is clearly much to be gained by wider sharing of information in this field, and in making resources developed (e.g. posters, videos, publications) available for potential adaptation by other groups.

Not enough has been done to date to use these same techniques to influence behaviour on the demand side of the exploitation equation. Certain sorts of information are profitably disseminated to traffickers, exploiters, abusers and clients: that relating to the illegal nature of their activity, the sanctions in place and more generally societal intolerance of their actions. This last point is particularly important, since spreading the message that trafficking and exploitation are unacceptable and will not be tolerated gradually breaks down safety nets that passive complicity puts in place. It is regularly shown that broadly targeted information campaigns, for example, aimed at breaking down ‘turn a blind eye’ attitudes in a community, do result in an increase in reports of exploitation and abuse.

The force of law

Although there has been progress on the legal front in recent years, there remain problems relating to the enforcement of laws in many countries.

Corruption remains a problem particularly in countries where law enforcement personnel are poorly paid and undervalued. Community hierarchies which see the police subject to pressures from people in positions of authority – including in the judiciary or local government – are also a hurdle to police action against traffickers. It is not simply a question, therefore, of training police forces to understand, identify and dismantle trafficking mechanisms, but also to understand the professional, personal and societal factors that influence the decisions of individual officers. In this respect the ILO’s close relationship with workers’ organizations and professional associations can also be useful.

With regard to children in confrontation with the law (for example who have moved or been trafficked across a national border without legal documentation and who are thus in an illegal situation), an overall concern is to ensure that laws and procedures take account of trafficked children as victims of exploitation, not perpetrators of related criminal acts such as prostitution or illegal migration. IPEC promotes enforcement of such provisions through legal literacy training of affected communities and general awareness raising on legal rights of victims and sanctions on offenders, but clearly there is also a need for careful legislative review, monitoring and accompaniment of children apprehended by the police, and throughout any legal or pre-legal proceedings.

Prevention programmes

Investment in prevention is not only cost effective (because it reduces the vulnerability of children and their families and increases the opportunity for the future development of the children, families, their communities and country), but should also be at the heart
of all action plans to combat trafficking simply because effective prevention means fewer children’s lives are damaged.

The range of possible interventions that can be used as prevention measures is wide. Often action may not even be classified as ‘protection’, although it might in fact be an essential protection measure. A good example of this is education, which is often seen as the business of government and at most as a ‘place’ where information can be disseminated. In fact, as is clear in this report, education is a powerful and essential tool in the combat against trafficking, since it increases awareness and understanding not only in children who may be at risk of being trafficked but, indeed, in those who may become traffickers or exploiters. In short, programmes that may not necessarily be seen as protection or prevention measures are in fact just that if they impact upon any of the root causes of trafficking outlined above.

Additionally, a number of activities are recognized as having specific value as prevention or protection measures. For example, experience in many countries shows that, since communities play a central role in preventing the trafficking of children, community organizations and groups can be empowered and supported in development initiatives and in organizing community-watch systems to monitor the problem. Work with communities might also include awareness raising, youth leadership initiatives, peer counselling and training schemes, income-generation projects for families and communities at risk (and in particular with groups of women), skills training and small-scale enterprise development.

More broadly, initiatives aimed at reducing poverty (of families, communities and nations), at rebuilding societies after conflict, at creating work and employment opportunities, and at more equitable distribution of income, are all fundamental to the eradication of trafficking and exploitation of children in the worst forms of child labour, since poverty, conflict, and lack of opportunities are at the heart of vulnerability. In some parts of the world, too, attention to lifestyle risk behaviour such as drug and alcohol abuse is also important if exploitation and trafficking are to be prevented, since these add to the vulnerability of children and young people.

Programmes that address discrimination and marginalization, on whatever grounds, are also important, since research clearly shows that marginalized and minority groups are vulnerable to exploitation. In short, almost all elements of general development programming could be considered to be appropriate to preventing trafficking and protecting children from exploitation, since they aim to minimize vulnerability and decrease differentials that make exploitation and trafficking profitable.

**Interception, withdrawal, protection and reintegration of victims**

Until such time as trafficking of children is eradicated, action must be taken to rescue children who have been trafficked and to return them to the extent possible to family and school so that they can rebuild their lives. If return is not immediately possible, or not at all to be desired, then alternative arrangements must be made so that the child’s future is secure and meaningful.

Rescue of children from exploitative situations is in most cases not best carried out by NGOs or multilateral agencies. Generally it is the business of police, customs or other

---

86- See ILO-IPEC: Going where the children are ... op.cit.
government agencies whose legal position with regard to traffickers and their agents is clear, and who are trained to deal with potentially dangerous situations. NGOs and agencies, however, can contribute to the training of migration officers and police to the extent that they often need support in understanding both the exploitative nature of trafficking and the rights of children to be protected from it. Additionally, the rights of the child to be protected from further trauma and victimization, to be treated as a victim and not a perpetrator, and to be treated as a subject of rights in any judicial proceedings, are not always well understood nor respected by law enforcement and judiciary officers.

Other professional groups can also benefit from awareness-raising projects that also engage them in the combat against the trafficking of children. ILO-IPEC has had some success in projects that focus on working with people in the transport sector (porters, port workers, sailors, bus drivers, port police, vendors in bus stations, for example), mobilizing them to report suspected cases of trafficking or to alert agencies to unaccompanied children or those who seem to be at risk. Projects like this can be duplicated in other workplaces - in agricultural settings, on the shopfloors of manufacturing plants, in venues in the tourism or entertainment industries - where children may not only be working but where they are also vulnerable to recruitment by traffickers. Setting up or linking with telephone hotlines for reporting such cases is also a good idea, although it is important not to duplicate services that might already exist - in some countries the growth in the number of telephone services both for reporting abuse and exploitation and for supporting children when they need help, has resulted in a multiplicity of different numbers and deterred users.

The provision of crisis centres along borders or at transit points to provide information and services to victims or possible victims of trafficking is an important activity, although the establishment of such centres must include provisions for long-term funding and staffing. Crisis centres might be no more than a safe room with minimal staff to take charge of the child and transfer him or her to temporary accommodation where a wider range of services is available. Depending on the circumstances and on the nature of police/customs cooperation, however, it might also include staff who can offer immediate psychosocial counselling, food, health care and legal assistance. In such cases, inter-institutional coordination is both necessary and desirable.

Once the immediate needs of the child have been met, s/he will still face two major challenges, and there will be a long-term need for follow-up to ensure that the child remains safe and makes progress, obviating any possibility that s/he will fall victim again to traffickers or exploiters.

The first will relate to immediate confrontation with the law. The second will involve return to the family and community. It is important that the child should be able to return to a risk-free, supportive family environment, and this may require visiting and supporting the family. In some cases it may not be feasible to return children to their families, and in this case long-term care and alternatives need to be made available so that the child will not be at risk of further exploitation. These will include accommodation, education, health services including perhaps psychosocial follow-up, basic necessities and at some point a regular income and the opportunity to live independently. Clearly this is a major undertaking, necessitating multi-actor involvement, long-term planning and ongoing monitoring, as well as resources.
Experience shows that the rehabilitation and reintegration of victims of trafficking is highly complex. Very few countries have the necessary number of qualified professionals in the fields of psychotherapy and counselling, or the resources to undertake long-term programmes to support children. Donor agencies, on the other hand, also face institutional and administrative obstacles in providing long-term funding for such work. Finding alternative strategies to shelter-based programmes, such as community-based rehabilitation, might provide some possibilities for more sustainable action, but this will still require funding and follow-up.

**CONCLUSION**

This report has attempted to bring together what we know about the trafficking of children, and some examples of what has been and is being done to respond to the challenge it presents. It is clear that this work is just beginning. It will be important to continue to explore the issue, share information and pull together lessons. Where possible, these should be based on experience in the field, on field evaluations, and include failures, successes and potential. IPEC’s evaluation exercises have shown that much can be learned from projects that may at times have weaknesses and that it is important to see that in any project there will be elements that work and elements that do not. Above all, there is an urgent need to develop more reliable indicators of impact and achievement that attempt to look qualitatively at the effects of programming on the child and the problem, not just quantitatively. For this to happen, children, including those at risk or who have emerged from exploitation, need to be part of the work that is done.

---

87. Ibid.
ANNEXES
## ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ADNET</td>
<td>Network of Advocates for Children’s Welfare and Development, Inc. (Philippine NGO)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ANDI</td>
<td>Child Rights News Network (Brazil)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASEM</td>
<td>Asia-Europe Meetings (inter-governmental initiative)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AusAID</td>
<td>Australian overseas aid agency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CCEM</td>
<td>Comité Contre l’Esclavage Moderne (French NGO)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEE</td>
<td>Central and Eastern Europe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIS</td>
<td>Commonwealth of Independent States</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CNI</td>
<td>Confederação Nacional da Indústria (Brazilian National Confederation for Industry)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRIC</td>
<td>Centre for International Crime Prevention</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSEC</td>
<td>commercial sexual exploitation of children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CWIN</td>
<td>Child Workers in Nepal (Nepalese NGO)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCI</td>
<td>Defence for Children-International</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DFID</td>
<td>Department for International Development (UK)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECPAT</td>
<td>End Child Prostitution, Child Pornography and Trafficking</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESCAP</td>
<td>Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EU</td>
<td>European Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FBI</td>
<td>US Federal Bureau of Investigation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GENPROM</td>
<td>ILO’s Gender Equality Promotion Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICCB</td>
<td>International Catholic Child Bureau</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IFJ</td>
<td>International Federation of Journalists</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO</td>
<td>International Labour Organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ILO-IPEC</td>
<td>ILO’s International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IOM</td>
<td>International Organization for Migration</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IPU</td>
<td>Inter-Parliamentary Union</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MINARS</td>
<td>Ministry of Social Reinsertion (Angola)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>non-governmental organization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPF</td>
<td>Ndihme per Femjet (Albanian NGO)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NUWHRAIN</td>
<td>National Union of Workers in the Hotel, Restaurant and Allied Industries (Philippines)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

OCPWWC  Operational Centre on the Protection of Working Women and Children (Chiang Mai, Thailand)
RCTVI  Rehabilitation Centre for Torture Victims, Ioannina (Greek NGO)
SAARC  South Asian Association for Regional Cooperation
STD  sexually transmitted disease
STOP  Stop Trafficking of People (EU programme)
TBP  time-bound programme
TICW  ILO-IPEC Trafficking in Children and Women project (Mekong region)
TU  Tribhuvan University (Nepal)
TWT  Thai Women of Tomorrow (Thai NGO)
UAE  United Arab Emirates
UK  United Kingdom of Great Britain and Northern Ireland
UN-IAP  United Nations Inter-Agency Project on Trafficking (Mekong region)
UNDP  United Nations Development Programme
UNHCHR  United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights
UNICEF  United Nations Children’s Fund
UNICRI  United Nations Interregional Crime Prevention Institute
UNIFEM  United Nations Development Fund for Women
US  United States
**GENERAL**


ILO: Stopping forced labour, 2nd Global Report under the Follow-up to the ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work (Geneva, 2001)

ILO: A future without child labour, 3rd Global Report under the Follow-up to the ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principles and Rights at Work (Geneva, 2002)

ILO and IPU: Eliminating the Worst Forms of Child Labour: a practical guide to ILO Convention No. 182 (Handbook for Parliamentarians No.3-2002), (Geneva, 2002).


Save the Children Canada: Exit Routes: Enabling commercially exploited youth in Canada to exit the sex trade, (Canada, 2001).


AFRICA


Molo Songololo: The trafficking of women into the South African sex industry, (Cape Town 2000).


AMERICAS AND CARIBBEAN


ILO et al.: Sexual exploitation of children and adolescents in the Americas, (Brazil, 1996)

IOM: Trafficking in women from the Dominican Republic for sexual exploitation, (Geneva, 1996).


UNICEF and CDHDF: On the other side of the street: juvenile prostitution in La Merced neighbourhood (Mexico City), (Mexico City, 1996).

EUROPE

Council of Europe: Sexual exploitation, pornography and prostitution of, and trafficking in children and young adults, Recommendation R (91) 11, 1993.


Global Survival Network: An exposé of the traffic in women for prostitution from the Newly Independent States, (Global Survival Network, 1997).


IOM: Trafficking in women to Italy for sexual exploitation, (Geneva, 1996).

IOM: Trafficking in women to Austria for sexual exploitation, (Geneva, 1996).


Karlén, H. and Hagner, C.: Commercial sexual exploitation of children in some Eastern European countries (Estonia, Latvia, Lithuania, Poland, Romania, Russia, Hungary), (Bangkok, ECPAT, 1996).


Krassinets, E. Illegal migration and labour trafficking: the case of Moldova, Russia and Ukraine, (Moscow, Russian Academy of Sciences, December 2000).


**SOUTH ASIA**


Goonesekere, S.: Trafficking in child sex workers and migration: the need for an international response to a contemporary form of slavery, (Colombo, 1996).


ILO-IPEC: Trafficking in children and for labour exploitation, including sexual exploitation in South Asia: synthesis paper, (Kathmandu, 1998).


BIBLIOGRAPHY

ILO-IPEC and INCIDIN Bangladesh: Rapid Assessment on Trafficking in Children for Exploitative Employment in Bangladesh, (Dhaka, February 2002).


Sanghera, J.: Trafficking of women and children in South Asia: taking stock and moving ahead (a review of anti-trafficking activities in Nepal, Bangladesh and India), (UNICEF and Save the Children Alliance, 1999).

UNICEF and Ministry of Women’s Affairs: Good practices and priorities to combat sexual abuse and exploitation of children in Bangladesh, (Dhaka 2001).

United Nations: Sexually abused and sexually exploited children and youth in South Asia: a qualitative assessment of their health needs and available services, (Bangkok Economic and Social Commission for Asia and the Pacific, 2000).

SOUTH-EAST ASIA AND ASIA PACIFIC

Ataneo de Manila University Research Team: The Philippine-Belgian pilot project against trafficking in women, (Manila, Ataneo de Manila University, 1999).


Commonwealth of Australia: Tomorrow’s children: Australia’s national plan of action against the commercial sexual exploitation of children, (Canberra, Department of Family and Community Services, 2000).


Emerton, R.: Trafficking of women into Hong Kong for the purpose of prostitution: preliminary research findings, Occasional Paper No.3, Centre for Comparative and Public Law, University of Hong Kong, (Hong Kong, 2001).

ILO: Trafficking in children and women: a regional overview, ILO Background Paper No.4, (Bangkok, 2000).
ILO: Trafficking in children into the worst forms of child labour in Thailand: rapid assessment findings from four research sites along the Thailand-Lao PDR and Thailand-Myanmar border areas, (Geneva, 2000).
ILO-IPEC and Department of Social Welfare: Trafficking of children in Indonesia: a preliminary description of the situation, Jakarta, (Jakarta, 2001)
O’Connell Davidson, J.: Children in the sex trade in China, (Sweden, Save the Children, 2001).
Paret T., Javate-de-Dios A., Hofmann C., Calalang C. and Arpa T.: Trafficking in women and prostitution in the Asia Pacific, Coalition against Trafficking in Women (website download).


UNICEF, Centre for Protection of Children’s Rights, and Foundation for Children Preliminary report on regional child trafficking and prostitution, (Bangkok, 1995).


UNICEF East Asia and the Pacific Regional Office: Children in need of special protection, (Bangkok, 2000).


UNIFEM: Trade in human misery: trafficking in women and children (Asia region), (New Delhi, 1998).

UNIFEM East and South East Asia: Trafficking in women and children: Gender issues fact sheet 2, (Bangkok, no date).

USEFUL WEBSITES

ANDI  
www2.uol.com.br/andi/noticiaseng/

ASEM  
www.asem.org

CATW  
(Coalition against Trafficking in Women)  
www.uri.edu/artsci/wms/hughes/catw/

CECEM  
(Comité Européen Contre l’Esclavage Moderne)  
www.ccem-antislavery.org

Council of Europe  
www.cm.coe.int

CRIN  
(Child Rights Information Network)  
www.crin.org

DCI  
www.defence-for-children.org

ECPAT International  
www.ecpat.net

EU Daphne Programme  
http://europa.eu.int/comm/justice_home/project/daphne

Focal Point on Sexual Exploitation  
www.focalpointngo.org

ILO  
www.iло.org

Immigration News  
www.human.trafficking.immigrationinfo.org/

Interpol  
www.Interpol.int

IOM  
www.iom.int

Save the Children  
www.savethechildren.org/trafficking/

TICW  
www.iло.org/asia/child/trafficking

Trafficking Directory  
www.yorku.ca

UNDP  
www.undp.org

UNHCHR  
www.unhchr.org/evaluate/reports/traffick.pdf

UNICEF  
www.unicef.org

UNICRI  
www.unicri.it

UNIFEM  
www.unifem.undp.org

UN global programme  
www.undcp.org

United Nations Secretariat  
www.un.org

US Government  
http://usinfo.state.gov/topical/global/traffic
World Congress against CSEC  www.focalpointngo.org/yokohama
ILO-IPEC REGIONAL PROGRAMMES

Africa

Mr. Michel Gregoire
CHIEF TECHNICAL ADVISOR
Combating Trafficking in Children for Labour Exploitation in West and Central Africa
ILO RO Abidjan
01B.P. 3960
Abidjan 01
Côte d’Ivoire
Tel: +255.20.21.26.39
Fax: +255.20.21.28.80
Email: gregoire@Abidjan.ilo.sita.net

Central America

Ms. Bente Sorensen
CHIEF TECHNICAL ADVISOR
Combating Commercial Sexual Exploitation of Children in Central America and Mexico
ILO San José
Apartado 10170-1000
San José
Costa Rica
Tel: +506.280.72.23
Fax: +506.280.69.91
Email: sorensen@sjo.oit.or.cr

South America

Ms. Ferreira de Souza
CHIEF TECHNICAL ADVISOR
Programme on Trafficking and Sexual Exploitation of Children and Adolescents on the Paraguayan and Brazilian Border
Pecheco, 4546
Departamento B
(entre Seravi y Legión Civil Estrangera)
Villa Morra
Asunción
Paraguay
Tel: +595.21.612.770
Fax: +595.21.612.770
Email: isa@oitipec.org.py
EUROPE
Ms. Laetitia Dumas
PROGRAMME OFFICER
Combating child and youth trafficking in the Balkan Countries and Ukraine
ILO-IPEC
International Labour Office
4, routes des Morillons
CH-1211 Geneva 22
Tel: +41.22.799.8181
Fax: +41.22.799.8771
Email:ipec@ilo.org

SOUTH ASIA
Ms. Tine Staermose
CHIEF TECHNICAL ADVISOR
Combating the Trafficking of Children for Exploitative Employment
(Bangladesh, Nepal and Sri Lanka)
ILO Kathmandu
Sanepa
Ring Road
Lalitpur
Kathmandu
Nepal
Tel: +977.1.53.17.52
Fax: +977.1.53.13.32
Email:tine@iloktm.or.np

SOUTH-EAST ASIA
Mr. Hervé Berger
CHIEF TECHNICAL ADVISOR
Trafficking in Women and Children in the Greater Mekong Sub-Region
ILO ROAP Bangkok
P. O. Box 2-349
Bangkok - 10200
Thailand
Tel: +66.2.288.17.22
Fax: +66.2.288.30.63
Email: bergerh@ilobkk.or.th