A Systematic Literature Review of the Drivers of Violence Affecting Children: the Philippines

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

UNICEF

October 2016
A Systematic Literature Review of the Drivers of Violence Affecting Children in the Philippines

Cover photograph: © UNICEF Philippines/2016/SNoorani

Design and layout: Beetlebugs Communications, Inc.

© UNICEF Philippines 2016

Any part of this document may be freely reproduced with appropriate acknowledgement.

The findings, interpretations and conclusions expressed in this paper are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the policies or views of UNICEF.

Unicef Office of Research - Innocenti and the University of Edinburgh supervised the research process. The findings, interpretations and conclusions expressed in this paper are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the policies or views of UNICEF. This text has not been edited to official publications standards for the UNICEF Office of Research - Innocenti and UNICEF accepts no responsibility for errors.

Definitions of Types of Violence Against Children

According to the United Nations on the Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989), ‘violence against children’ refers to “all forms of physical or mental violence, injury and abuse, neglect or negligent treatment, maltreatment or exploitation, including sexual abuse.”

UNICEF also defines violence in the following ways in their publication that explores global data on child protection:

“**Physical Violence** against children includes all corporal punishment and all other forms of torture, cruel, inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment as well as physical bullying and hazing by adults or by other children. ‘Corporal’ (or ‘physical’) punishment is defined as any punishment in which physical force is used and intended to cause some degree of pain or discomfort, however light. Most involves hitting (‘smacking’, ‘slapping’, ‘spanking’) children with the hand or with an implement – a whip, stick, belt, shoe, wooden spoon, etc. But it can also involve, for example, kicking, shaking or throwing children, scratching, pinching, biting, pulling hair or boxing ears, caning, forcing children to stay in uncomfortable positions, burning, scalding or forced ingestion.

**Sexual Violence** comprises any sexual activities imposed by an adult on a child against which the child is entitled to protection by criminal law. This includes: (a) The inducement or coercion of a child to engage in any unlawful or psychologically harmful sexual activity; (b) The use of children in commercial sexual exploitation; (c) The use of children in audio or visual images of child sexual abuse; and (d) Child prostitution, sexual slavery, sexual exploitation in travel and tourism, trafficking for purposes of sexual exploitation (within and between countries), sale of children for sexual purposes and forced marriage. Sexual activities are also considered as abuse when committed against a child by another child if the offender is significantly older than the victim or uses power, threat or other means of pressure. Consensual sexual activities between children are not considered as sexual abuse if the children are older than the age limit defined by the State Party.

**Emotional Violence** is often described as psychological maltreatment, mental abuse, verbal abuse and emotional abuse or neglect. This can include: (a) All forms of persistent harmful interactions with a child; (b) Scaring, terrorizing and threatening; exploiting and corrupting; spurting and rejecting; isolating, ignoring and favouritism; (c) Denying emotional responsiveness; neglecting mental health, medical and educational needs; (d) Insults, name-calling, humiliation, belittling, ridiculing and hurting a child’s feelings; (e) Exposure to domestic violence; (f) Placement in solitary confinement, isolation or humiliating or degrading conditions of detention; and (g) Psychological bullying and hazing by adults or other children, including via information and communication technologies (ICTs) such as mobile phones and the Internet (known as ‘cyber-bullying’).

**Neglect** means the failure to meet children’s physical and psychological needs, protect them from danger or obtain medical, birth registration or other services when those responsible for their care have the means, knowledge and access to services to do so. It includes: (a) Physical neglect: failure to protect a child from harm, including through lack of supervision, or to provide a child with basic necessities including adequate food, shelter, clothing and basic medical care; (b) Psychological or emotional neglect, including lack of any emotional support and love, chronic inattention, caregivers being ‘psychologically unavailable’ by overlooking young children’s cues and signals, and exposure to intimate partner violence or drug or alcohol abuse; (c) Neglect of a child’s physical or mental health: withholding essential medical care; (d) Educational neglect: failure to comply with laws requiring caregivers to secure their children’s education through attendance at school or otherwise; and (e) Abandonment.”

Source: UN CRC (1989) and UNICEF, 2014
Executive Summary

Violence against children happens everywhere, across all social groups; and with the most violent acts carried out by people that children know or should be able to trust. The government has called for strong action to prevent Violence against Children, respond to and rescue victims, and prosecute the perpetrators.

- Former Department of Social Welfare and Development Secretary Corazon Juliano-Soliman

In 2016, the Philippines was identified as a potential Pathfinder Country within the Global Partnership on Ending Violence Against Children. It was selected after a National Baseline Survey on Violence Against Children was conducted in 2015, and the Government has committed to ending violence against children (VAC) by supporting this study and through other effective legislation and policy to protect children. A scoping mission was conducted by the Global VAC Partnership in April 2016, putting a spotlight on the country as a pioneer of new and vigorous approaches to ending violence. Pathfinder countries will be at the forefront of the Global Partnership in preventing violence, protecting children and making society safer for them. The Philippines, with its long history of evidence-based interventions such as the well-established Child Protection Units (CPUs) across the country, is well placed to join the Global Partnership as part of its contribution to the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs). Ending VAC is now included as a global target within the SDGs, unlike under the previous MDGs to “end abuse, exploitation, trafficking and all forms of violence and torture against children” (SDG 16.2).

In order to best identify the innovative and pioneering interventions that can end violence, policymakers and professionals have been asking what drives violence against children in the Philippines? The Research to Policy and Practice Process (R3P) Study on the Drivers of Violence Affecting Children is an action-research project. The Systematic Literature Review (SLR) carried out by the UNICEF Philippines Office with local academic partners, the University of the Philippines Manila and the Child Protection Network Foundation, with technical assistance from the University of Edinburgh, also supports evidence on the drivers of violence. The study seeks to understand the mix of factors that drive VAC and allow cycles of violence to continue.

Violence-related vulnerability evolves in complex socio-economic and cultural contexts. This research analyses how structural, institutional, community and individual factors interact to affect violence in children’s lives and identifies causal pathways to better inform national strategies for prevention. It focuses on girls and boys at different stages of life, from the very young to older adolescents.

The purpose of this study is to translate quality research into evidence, and turn that evidence into effective and meaningful interventions (UNICEF OoR, 2016).
This report is the review outcome for the Philippines. A comprehensive systematic review identified 149 research studies (89 which are unpublished or grey literature [informally published written material such as research reports and research briefing papers] and 59 academic journal articles) to explore the risk and protective factors, and how they interact to create drivers of violence.

This study also included a secondary analysis of the 2014 Demographic Health Survey to understand the risk factors for adolescent intimate partner violence and intergenerational violence.

This report not only identifies trends in violence, and gaps and avenues for future research, but also illuminates how violence is locally understood. The findings will triangulate with evidence from the first ever nationally representative Violence Against Children survey in the Philippines conducted in 2015. This report will also help policymakers and key stakeholders prioritize areas of potential intervention and future applied research to improve existing violence prevention efforts.

Findings

Violence against children in the home

Sixty-four studies were included, with findings on prevalence, risk and protective factors related to VAC in the home, including two longitudinal studies (the ‘Parenting Across Cultures’ study and the Cebu Longitudinal Study), and a secondary analysis of the most recent Demographic Heath Survey commissioned specifically for this report.

Physical: Findings show that violent discipline is the most frequent form of violence against both boys and girls in the home, driven by factors including social norms around the use of and effectiveness of discipline, authoritarian parenting, and parent’s levels of education. Other forms of physical violence are also common. Studies show that the combination of parental histories of physical abuse when they were growing up combined with financial stress and substance misuse create a ‘toxic trio’ of risk factors for physical violence in the home.

Sexual: The lack of supervision, single headed households and absent parents increases the vulnerability of children to sexual violence at home. Migration is a significant driver of absentee parenting, which increases children’s risk of exposure to sexual violence at home.

Emotional: Longitudinal data has shown that emotional violence from parents increases children’s negative behaviour, which increases their risk of experiencing violent discipline and perpetrating aggressive behaviour towards others. Parenting practices that include the use of coercion, threats, insults, and a frightening tone increase the risk of child maltreatment and set the stage for similar patterns of behaviour in parent/child and other relationships.

There is very robust data on the nature of intergenerational violence in the Philippines. Longitudinal and large household survey data show that violence often begins at home and impacts on violence in other settings and relationships. Alcohol misuse is a driver of family violence and has been found to be a significant risk factor in every study where the two variables have been measured. Experiencing childhood or familial sexual violence is also a driver of all forms of intimate partner violence victimization for females. Experiencing or being exposed to violence in the home also increases the risk that children will use or experience violence against partners, peers and family members.

Violence against children in school

UNICEF conducted a comprehensive national study on VAC in schools in 2009 in partnership with Plan International and the Council for the

---

*At the time that the systematic literature review was being written the NBS VAC was conducted and data analysis proceeded including a preliminary launch in March 2016 and plans for the final launch at end November 2016.*
Welfare of Children (CWC). The study provides comprehensive information on the scope and nature of physical, sexual and emotional VAC at school. The Philippines also participated in the Global School Based Health Surveys, which measure bullying. This review identified only 16 studies on violence in schools.

**Physical:** This was the most prevalent form of violence in schools perpetrated by adults, with verbal violence the second most frequent. Drivers of this violence include social norms around the use of corporal punishment in school settings as well as the family context. Both children and adults state that corporal punishment in schools is closely linked with violent discipline and family circumstances in the home.

**Sexual:** Sexual harassment is the most frequent form of sexual violence in school settings, occurring in both primary and secondary schools, with girls being particularly vulnerable. Grey literature has also highlighted that lesbian, gay, bisexual and transgender (LGBT) youth may be particularly at risk of sexual violence at school; often from peers.  

**Emotional:** Violence at the hands of other children and young people at school is more common than violence perpetrated by adults. Trend data shows that bullying victimisation is increasing among 13- to 15-year-olds, while physical fights in schools are decreasing for both boys and girls (the opposite trend is found in some European countries and the United States). A secondary analysis of the 2003-2004 World Health Organization (WHO) Global School Based Health Survey found that bullying victimisation and being involved in physical fighting were associated. Parental supervision was associated with less fighting. There is no clear evidence to determine if this is the reason for the decreasing trend in physical fighting, however, it does give some indication of the importance of the home-school link, and that parenting approaches may impact on children’s behaviour, even in school settings. Children’s previous experiences of violence, especially in the home, also drives bullying behaviour in schools.

---

2. A recent study entitled ‘They didn’t help me, they shamed me’, a baseline study on the vulnerabilities of street-involved boys in Manila, by Davis and Miles (2015), highlights the risk of sexual violence faced by boys in particular.
3. The Visayas, Cebu, and Mindanao are historically known as areas with higher rates of trafficking, partly due to poverty, and access to ports for migration, including easy access to Indonesia through Mindanao. There are recognized links between high rates of migration and trafficking.
4. When the war in Syria broke out in 2010, nearly 100 Filipino domestic workers were stranded in the conflict zones. Most were undocumented, having arrived in Syria illegally. Frequent news reports from Hong Kong and middle eastern countries have documented cases of the abuse and exploitation of Filipino domestic workers.
Sexual Violence Against Children

Experience of Violence Across Settings: Children experience sexual violence in a variety of settings, perpetrated by family members, partners, peers and strangers. This review examined 22 articles and reports of studies on sexual violence against children in the Philippines. The prevalence of sexual violence in childhood ranged from 4.5 per cent to 65 per cent, reflecting the variety of questions asked, how sexual violence was measured, the methods used and the type of respondents involved in research.

The only nationally representative data on child sexual violence is from the National Demographic Health Survey (DHS); a population-based survey with over 16,000 respondents that is conducted to provide information on fertility, family planning and health for use by the Government in monitoring progress against the Millennium Development Goals (MDGs).

The DHS shows an increasing trend in childhood sexual abuse in the Philippines between 2008 and 2013. The soon-to-be released National Baseline Survey on Violence Against Children (NBS VAC) findings will significantly add to our knowledge of the prevalence of sexual violence against children in the Philippines.

EMERGING THEMES The three main drivers of sexual violence emerging from the studies reviewed are:

1) **A culture of silence and a fear of reporting**, including taboos against discussing sexuality and reproductive health with children, as well as talking about sexual violence, and thus limiting young people's access to information on protection and prevention mechanisms that might limit their risk of exposure to sexual exploitation/violence.11

2) **The need to strengthen implementation of existing legislation** that provides protection for children, but has not been able to effectively prevent or limit violence, including the minimum age of sexual consent and statutory rape laws that contribute to legal impunity for sexual violence against both boys and girls.

3) **Vulnerability, especially adolescent boys.** More research is needed to identify further the risk and protective factors for children. In addition, an important emerging theme for the Philippines is the dramatic rise of HIV in recent years, particularly amongst adolescents.13 A 2013 UNICEF report indicated a 79 per cent increase in new cases. This rise is partly linked to the lack of reproductive health information and services for young people. It is also linked to the increase in the use of information communication technology, especially smart phones and dating apps.

---


11 It is important to note that plans for conducting the NBS VAC were delayed due to a refusal by the Ethical Review Board in the Philippines to approve research concerning children and sexuality without parental approval. This again emphasizes the cultural reluctance to support research on children and sexuality, and in particular without the parents' involvement or consent.

12 It is important to note that a 2015 UNICEF-supported analysis of laws in ASEAN member states concerned with protecting children from violence, entitled ‘Legal Protection from Violence’, noted that the Philippines emerged as exemplary in terms of its very good legislation designed to better protect children from violence. The weak link remains the implementation of this legislation, and the remaining challenge of the very low age of sexual consent.

13 A 2015 USAID report identified the Philippines as one of seven countries with a more than 25% increase in HIV infection, while globally a decline in cases was reported between 1999 and 2009. It is estimated that more than 50% of cases are attributed to Men who have Sex with Men.
There has also been a significant rise in rates of teen pregnancy in recent years (2013 Young Adult Fertility and Sexuality Study [YAFS]), which is also linked to limited access to reproductive health services designed for young people. In the latest YAF survey, 13 per cent of 15- to 19-year-olds were pregnant, doubling the number of the previous 10 years.14

Physical Violence Against Children

This review explored over 68 studies on physical violence. Physical violence against children occurs in every setting – the home, school and community – yet, globally and in the Philippines it is most frequently found in the home in the form of violent discipline.15 Physical violence outside of discipline also occurs in the same forms (including hitting, kicking and shaking) with prevalence ranging from 30 per cent to 79 per cent, reflecting the wide range of studies and methods of measuring physical violence. Physical violence in schools in the form of bullying appears to be increasing among 13- to 15-year-olds in the Philippines, based on eight years of WHO Global School Based Health Survey data. Several hospital studies have also been conducted which highlight abusive head trauma as a significant concern, primarily as a result of shaking children under the age of two. Most of the studies on physical violence in the Philippines focus on violent discipline and violence between partners and peers. This section focuses on findings on physical violence in different settings and relationships.16

Children and young people perpetrate most of the physical violence against other children and young people. When physical violence is used by adults it is often in the form of punishment, and it is viewed as the most effective form of discipline and necessary to control a child’s behaviour. There are social expectations that parents and teachers will use corporal punishment against children.

Emotional Violence Against Children

In the Philippines, emotional violence is referred to as ‘psychological violence’ under the Anti-Violence against Women and Children Act, which refers to “acts or omissions causing or likely to cause mental or emotional suffering of the victim ... It includes causing or allowing the victim to witness the physical, sexual or psychological abuse of a member of the family to which the victim belongs, or to witness pornography in any form or to witness abusive injury to pets or unlawful or unwanted deprivation of the right to custody and/or visitation of common children.” In the Philippines, the most frequently studied types of emotional violence include verbal abuse and psychological aggression as a form of violent discipline.

This systematic review explored 15 studies that included measurements of emotional violence. Key risk factors include children’s negative behaviours, parents’ own histories of violence and the belief that forms of emotional violence are “natural reactions” to situations and not seen as violence, particularly by teachers. Further research is needed to identify the risk and protective factors of emotional violence in the Philippines, especially as this form of violence is responsible for the largest burden of mental illness and self-harm in the region.17

14 The 2013 YAFS notes a “dramatic rise in teen pregnancy, more than doubling in the past 10 years, from 6 per cent to 13 per cent of 15- to 19-year-old women who have begun childbearing in 2002 and 2013, respectively”.
16 It is important to note that efforts to pass legislation, House Bill 4907, that bars corporal punishment have failed in recent years. A law on positive discipline that would make all forms of corporal punishment in the home and school illegal faced strong opposition in 2014 and 2015. Efforts by save the Children and others to revive this bill have not moved forward because of cultural objections and concerns that parents would no longer have authority over their children.
Emerging Issues: Online Child Sexual Abuse and Exploitation

The online abuse and exploitation of children, including webcam sex tourism, is a growing global concern, and is a particular threat in the Philippines. Cybercrime dens have been operating in many parts of the country since 2012. \(^{18}\) In spite of legislation passed in 2009 (The Anti Child Pornography Act RA 9775) success in prosecuting perpetrators and thus providing deterrents to this multi-billion dollar crime has been limited.

A systematic literature review of online child protection conducted in 2015 found 15 papers on online child sexual abuse and exploitation in the Philippines. Composed mainly of grey literature, these papers found that Filipino children commonly engage in risky online behaviour and are largely unsupervised when they use the Internet, putting them at risk of online sexual solicitation and grooming.

Poverty is a recognized driver of online sexual exploitation. Broken homes, poor parenting, consumerism, peer influence, family values and socio-cultural beliefs and norms have been tied to live streaming of online sexual abuse. \(^{19}\) The Philippines has become a hub for online exploitation of children primarily because of local English proficiency, and an existing sex industry, including trafficking. Easy access to the internet, with nearly half of the population online, is another contributing factor. The online exploitation of children is a multi-billion-dollar industry, thus there is an enormous demand for materials, and their production can easily be hidden in remote locations.

Emerging Issues: Migration

Fourteen papers, including published studies, literature reviews and agency reports, addressed the impact of migration on children and families left behind by overseas Filipino migrants. These studies describe the changes that transnational families undergo, while migrant mothers continue to nurture their children from a distance and the extended family, particularly women, assume caregiving roles. New communication technologies, including Skype, assist in maintaining transnational families, but fail to provide children with proper care and protection. The studies show mixed results with regard to the education and psychosocial status of left-behind children, and suggest that migration may be a driver of violence against them – particularly neglect and sexual violence (as a result of increased vulnerability from having a missing caregiver). Recent news articles\(^{20}\) have profiled the plight of Filipino domestic workers in particular, who often may not see their children for years due to the high cost of return voyages. Older children are left to care for others, and thus adult care and protection are lacking.

Emerging Issues: Disaster

The Philippines ranks fourth among the top 5 countries with the highest number of weather-related disasters, and among the top 10 countries with the highest number of people affected by weather-related disasters in the past 20 years (1995-2015). Post-disaster violence against Filipino children has rarely been studied. However, local agency reports clearly showed an increase in the number of rape and sexual abuse cases after Super Typhoon (“Yolanda”) Haiyan, the terrible natural disaster that hit the country in 2013. A needs assessment conducted as part of international humanitarian response to the disaster also showed behavioural changes, involvement in harsh or dangerous labour, sexual violence, and an increase in the number of out-of-school children.

---

\(^{18}\) UNICEF Philippines Fact Sheet on Child Online Sexual Exploitation. (Unpublished)

\(^{19}\) UNICEF Philippines Systematic Literature Review on Child Online Protection. (Unpublished)

\(^{20}\) ‘The cost of caring’, New Yorker, April 2016
Recommendations and Suggestions for Further Research

**CP Systems**
- Strengthen inter-agency coordination to ensure implementation of child protection laws, under one coordination body
- Develop/establish an integrated inter-agency child protection information system
- Ensure functionality of the referral pathway on responding to child abuse, neglect and exploitation. Increase tertiary prevention (women and child protection units) and early intervention for families affected by domestic violence.

**Laws and Policies**
- Advocacy for improved legislation and policy to prevent and respond to VAC
  - Support legislation that stops corporal punishment in schools and homes
  - Advocate to increase the age of sexual consent through multi sectoral partnerships with the judiciary, social welfare, and education and health sectors.
- Support strengthened implementation of existing laws and policies that protect children from violence, including those on cybercrime and child pornography.
- Address the gaps in the judicial system that cause child abuse cases to be delayed indefinitely

**VAC at Home, School and in the Community**
- Promote parenting support interventions
  - Strengthen child protection messages in existing Family Development Sessions (FDS) provided to families who are beneficiaries of the Government’s conditional cash transfer programme, the *Pantawid Pamilyang Pilipino Program* (4Ps) (in English, the Bridging Programme for the Filipino Family), and ensure monitoring of the impact of FDS to understand how parents/families have embraced these messages for positive social change, and reduction of VAC
  - Promote the adaptation of proven/effective methods of good parenting (i.e. ‘Parenting for Lifelong Health’) for the Philippine context, thus encouraging the implementation of measurable tools for social change
- Explore alcohol abuse prevention and brief interventions (relate to World Health Organization [WHO] work in this area)
Social Norms and Gender

- Promote positive social norms that do not involve violent discipline – utilize findings from the strategic literature review to suggest potential positive norms that could be enhanced.

- Promote development of research capacity on social norms, encourage research to better understand how social norms may condone VAC, and what researchers can do to raise awareness, including development of communication for development (C4D) approaches for social/behavioural change

- Support further research on violence against boys, noting that service delivery currently focuses on services for girls and women, and recognizing that boys may be equally or more vulnerable to violence than girls

- Support efforts to tackle the increasing threat of HIV infection amongst adolescents, noting that men who have sex with men (MSM) account for a high proportion of cases, and that social norms continue to limit access to information and prevention

- Address social norms that discourage adolescent access to information on sexual and reproductive health

Emerging Issues

- **Natural Disasters**
  - Ensure the implementation of the child protection mechanisms stated in the Children in Emergencies Law by developing standardized monitoring systems
  - Ensure greater attention to data collection and monitoring and evaluation of VAC during emergencies and natural disasters to better understand the magnitude of the problem and potential mitigation of risk and improve response

- **Online Child Protection**
  - Use outcomes of planned National Study on Child Online Protection to guide development of policy and legislation
  - Use outcomes of Capacity Gap Analysis (2016) on online child protection to develop training/skills development for key stakeholders/partners on online child protection
  - Pursue regional and global partnerships on online child protection to share experiences and further develop knowledge, tools and resources, particularly around data management and development of technical skills, and building partnerships in the private sector

Authors: Dr. Deborah Fry from the University of Edinburgh (UoE), Dr. Noel Juban from the University of the Philippines, Manila (UP Manila), Dr. Sandra Hernandez and Dr. Bernadette Madrid from the Child Protection Network Foundation (CPN) and the University of the Philippines, and Sarah Norton-Staal, Faye Balanon, Maria Margarita Ardivilla, Marie Michelle Munoz and Leila Coppens from UNICEF Philippines.

This publication provides a summary of the **A Systematic Literature Review of the Drivers of Violence Affecting Children: the Philippines**. The Philippines and UNICEF have prepared this publication as part of the vision for a global community free from violence.

For more information, contact Sarah Norton-Staal (snortonstaal@unicef.org), Chief of Child Protection and Maria Margarita Ardivilla (mmardivilla@unicef.org), Child Protection Specialist at UNICEF Philippines.

The contents of this publication reflect the views of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views of the United Nations Children’s Fund or any other United Nations Organization.

October 2016