Gender Issues in the Criminal Justice System of the Maldives


by

Associate Professor Christine Alder and Professor Kenneth Polk
Department of Criminology
University of Melbourne
For the United Nations Development Program

2 September 2004
Gender in the Criminal Justice System of the Maldives.

Introduction

This report is a component of the general plans for the reform of the Criminal Justice System in Maldives. It focuses specifically upon issues of Gender in the Criminal Justice System and addresses issues concerning both adult women and female children. It is based on a consultancy carried out between 23 August and 3 September, 2004 at the request of the Office of the Attorney-General and the Ministry of Gender, Family Development and Social Security. The Terms of Reference for the consultancy were to review the existing criminal justice system and to suggest action to be taken by the government to reform juvenile justice and to address issues of concern regarding women in the criminal justice system. In the course of the project key stakeholders were interviewed (see Appendix A) and numerous background materials were reviewed (see Appendix B).

The Government of the Maldives accords high priority to women and children and has demonstrated its general commitment by ratifying the United Nations Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination against Women and the Convention on the Rights of the Child. The Maldives provided an initial report to the CEDAW Committee on its achievements and challenges in 2001. The Concluding Comments of the CEDAW Committee commended the political will of the Government of the Maldives to work towards women’s human rights as an integral dimension of national development and welcomed the efforts at gender mainstreaming.

This commitment to working towards assuring women’s human rights was reflected in the reports of background investigations, analysis, consultations, policy and project planning, and program implementation provided to the consultants on this project (Appendix includes a listing of most of these documents). Much of this work has been carried out by the Ministry that is currently titled the Ministry of Gender, Family Development and Social Security. As indicated in the initial report, much has been achieved by this Ministry. The observations and recommendations of this report draw extensively on the work already carried out by this Ministry or at the request of this Ministry by outside consultants. As well as developing some new recommendations, the present report pulls together issues and recommendations regarding women in the criminal justice system that were otherwise scattered across a number of different documents.
The CEDAW Committee in its Concluding Remarks to the Initial Report of the Maldives noted two principal areas of concern relate directly to women in the criminal justice system

25. The Committee notes with concern the under-reporting of violence against women, including domestic violence and the absence of effective laws and law enforcement and a support system for women victims of violence. It is particularly concerned that the violence against women is understood in the community and in the legal system as a private matter rather than as an infringement of human rights and a violation of the Convention.

26. The Committee urges the Government to improve law enforcement measures, enact laws on violence against women, including domestic violence and marital rape, according to general recommendation 19 on violence against women, and work with women’s groups to obtain reliable data and provide to the victims of violence. The Committee requests the Government to respond to this issue in national plans, based on the Beijing Platform for Action and the Commonwealth Plan of Action. It calls upon the Government to create public awareness on violence against women as an infringement of human rights that has grave social costs for the whole community”

(Ministry of Women’s Affairs and Social Security, 2002, p 72-73)

This recommendation remains pertinent to the situation in the Maldives at the time of the writing of this report. Throughout the interviews and in most reports, it is noted that there is a general acceptance that gender based violence is a private and not a public matter. Violence against women is perceived as a shameful issue and acknowledging being a victim of violence may be seen as a shameful act bringing disrepute to oneself and family and having a number of negative repercussions for the victim.

Three outcomes follow from this context:

1. Domestic violence and sexual assault (including sexual assault of children) are significantly under-reported to the justice systems (and other systems such as health and child welfare);

2. When cases are reported to the justice system victims they are not always treated with gender sensitivity, including access to legal advice and health care; and

3. Few perpetrators of gender based violence are convicted for their offences.

The Ministry of Gender, Family Development and Social Security has been active within its current resource constraints to address some of these issues. For example it has commissioned the development of a survey on violence against women, it has requested the International Commission of Jurists to conduct a legal review, it successfully sought international funding for a series of training workshops in the health and criminal justice
systems, and it has obtained funding for a scholarship for a student to complete postgraduate studies overseas.

Many objectives and strategies have been identified in work produced by the Ministry and will be incorporated into the recommendations of this report. Most of these concerns relate the strategies to address the extent of gender based violence in the Maldives and the development of effective strategies to address this significant problem. As noted in documents produced by the Ministry:

"Such changes are necessary because gender based violence is a major constraint to women’s full participation in society, and needs to be eliminated to create a gender equitable and equal society and to achieve and sustain ultimate development goals."

This report will proceed in Section 2 by outlining the key issues and recommendations that evolved during the course of this mission. In Section 3 the report will provide more detail regarding strategies to be implemented in the short to medium term.

**Issues and Recommendations.**

1. Legislative Changes

The way in which women experience the criminal justice, and the decisions that are made in relation to women in these institutions, are a reflection of broader cultural understandings of gender and the general economic, social and political status of women in that society. Therefore changes in the justice system cannot happen in isolation from much broader changes that unequivocally establish gender equality.

*Recommendation 1* – Amend Article 34 and Article 52 of the Constitution of the Maldives that preclude women from the office of the President and Vice President.

We note that amendments to articles 34 and 52 of the constitution are already proposed and that the matter will be considered by the Special Majlis once its settings are resumed.

The related laws, regulations and practices of the criminal justice system are significant in establishing, maintaining and reinforcing the structures and values of the community. It is therefore imperative that issues of gender are very closely monitored and regulated in these systems if a society is committed to ensuring justice and equality for all of its citizens.

In its concluding remarks to the initial report of the Maldives, the CEDAW committee noted, “The Committee regrets that there is an absence of an effective machinery to enforce the rights recognized by the Constitution and claim remedies.” Since that time, the President has initiated the establishment of a Human Rights Commission. While an
office as been established and a Director appointed, the relevant legislation has not yet been passed by the government.

**Recommendation 2.** *That the legislation establishing the Human Rights Commission be approved. That a Human Rights Commission is established that is in full conformity with the “Paris Principles” established by the United Nations in relation to such organizations.*

We note that a Human Rights Commission Bill has been submitted to the People's Majlis and it is being further considered by the parliamentary committee concerned.

The current practice that raises the most concern in relation to women as both victims and offenders are those in relation to cases of “Zina” (sex outside of marriage, consensual and non-consensual). In these cases a woman’s accusations need to be verified by two men or four women. Thus, rape and sexual violence remain impossible to prove in virtually all cases. Consequently, women are reluctant to report these offences, especially given the additional possibility of being re-victimised by the perpetrator in the legal process.

The sentence in relation to “Zina” currently allows for public lashings. Given the strict rules of evidence relating to this offence, case are rarely established against perpetrators. A women’s pregnancy may however establish her commission of this offence. In effect it means that a women who has been a victim of rape can be treated as an offender.

The current law establishes a minimum age limit of 18 for a person to receive adult punishments. There are currently three exceptions, one of which is if a woman has had a child. In practice, this means that current law allows for a young woman under the age of 18, who has been a victim of sexual abuse and is consequently pregnant, to receive lashings in a public setting. The victim must then endure the pain and public humiliation of her situation, both the illegitimate pregnancy and the public lashings, which have significant ramifications for her subsequent life opportunities. The perpetrator, on the other hand, is likely to remain publicly unidentified.

This scenario is in contravention of two international treaties that have been signed by the Maldives - The Convention on the Rights of the Child, and the Convention on the Elimination of Discrimination Against Women. A number of recommendations regarding legislative reform arise from the current practice in this area:

**Recommendation 3:** *Develop a penal code that establishes spousal assault, non-consensual sex (whether inside or outside of marriage) and sex with an underage minor as criminal offences.*

**Recommendation 4:** *Ensure that there is an offence stipulated in the Criminal Code that constitutes payment for sexual services as an offence.*

**Recommendation 5:** *Ensure that in relation to criminal offending, all children under the age of 18 are under the jurisdiction of the Juvenile Court.*
Recommendation 6: Establish new rules of evidence including admissibility of forensic evidence and expert witnesses, and equal value given to evidence given by men and women. Currently rape and sexual violence remain difficult to prove given the strict requirements for eyewitnesses.

2. Changing Criminal Justice System Practices.

Legal changes constitute a significant step in ensuring offences are dealt with in the justice system. But whether or not a victim brings her complaint to the attention of the police, and whether or not she pursues it through the legal system requires that the system is sensitive to her situation and her needs.

This recommendation requires consideration of such things as expert interrogation of child witnesses, the legal counsel and supports made available to victims, immediate referral to a rape support center or a domestic violence support network, the environment in which child sexual assault victims and rape victims provide their first reports and who conducts the interview.

Recommendation 7: To establish policing and criminal justice system processes and procedures that are gender sensitive and take into account social and cultural difficulties in bringing such cases to the attention of authorities.

Anticipating changes in the new Penal Code in relation to admissible evidence, there will need to be capacity building in terms of the collection and analysis of materials both within the investigative phases of the criminal justice system, and also in other services such as hospitals.

Recommendation 8: Enhanced capacity to collect and analyse forensic evidence eg forensic science, set up modern systems of investigation at hospitals, police, island/atoll office level; skilled professionals- trained police, justice, health and social service areas.

3. Professional Development and Training

Most decision-making in the criminal justice system allows for a level of discretion, it is therefore imperative that decision-makers at all levels are well informed about gender based violence. The Ministry of Gender, Family Development and Social Security has held workshops in related areas. This function of the Ministry should be enhanced. However, in the long term, the Ministry should work with each of the other relevant Ministries to develop their own training modules that would be incorporated into their ongoing professional development processes.
Since women are unlikely to report the incident to police in the first instance, personal in other community based organizations need to be trained to recognize signs of gender based violence and to be informed of strategies for responding appropriately to the women and to assist and support her. The appropriate organizations and services need to be identified that are suitable for this sort of training, but they would probably include - hospitals, child support agencies, and schools. That is organizations that women will access as part of her normal daily routine.

Some initial work has already been carried out in relation to this task which needs to be built upon. Social work training on VAW has been provided for a number of women and men within the community in addition to the staff of the Ministry of Gender Family Development and Social Security. Similarly gender based violence counselor training has been provided to six nurses at IGMH. Thus a nurse counseling support service to gender based violence victims is expected to start by the end of October at IGMH.

A referral system has been established with the nurse counselors of IGMH and the social workers at the Gender and development section of the Ministry. The trained social workers in the community will also receive referrals from the social workers to URC.(Unit for the Rights of Children) and the Gender Section of the Ministry. Once the nurse counseling service starts, referrals will also be made to the social workers in the community.

Initial training on DV/VAW was provided to the police in 2003 by Ottawa Police of Canada. A follow-up training workshop with emphasis on investigative skills with victims is going to be held in early 2005.

Such work needs to be supported and extended.

Recommendation 9: Ongoing professional development of police, investigators, prosecutors and judges, and related professionals such as hospital staff and staff in key administrative centers in atolls.

4. Changing Gender Profile of Criminal Justice System and Judiciary.

There are currently no female judges. A strategy needs to be developed to change the gender profile of the judiciary in the near future. No data were to hand regarding the gender profile of the police force, but it is anticipated that there will also be a significant gender imbalance in that organization. Changing the gender profile of significant organizations is not simply based on the assumption that women will be more sympathetic to the circumstances and needs of women. Research on shifts in the gender profile of police forces suggests that, especially when women are still in a minority, that expectation is not always accurate. However as the proportion of women is significantly increased there are some perceptible shifts in gender sensitivity. Changing the gender profile is also about changing social understandings more broadly.
Recommendation 10: Judiciary, Police and Prison Authorities to develop and include in their human resources policies strategies for increasing the number of women.

5. Victim Support

Under Recommendations 5 and 7 in is anticipated that there will be the establishment of processes and services within each of the agencies in the criminal justice (police, prosecution, courts, detention) that are sensitive to gender issues in relation to victims of crime. For example ensuring that all staff are aware of relevant issues and fully informed of relevant services to which the victim can be referred, that female staff are used whenever possible or are available if needed, and that trained counselors are available.

However, the material presented to this project indicated that women are unlikely at the present time to report incidents to the police. Therefore other support services need to be in the community.

Recommendation 11: The establishment of victim support services outside of the criminal justice system eg counseling services, safe houses and legal advice.

6. Drug Treatment

While statistics were not available, the investigators were informed that many, if not most, women and young women involved in the criminal justice system had either been sentenced for drug offences or had committed other offences related to their drug use. The provision of drug treatment programs for women is therefore called for to stem this flow of women into the criminal justice system.

Women sentenced to prison were housed in the same location as men. While their living quarters were separate, any program activities were held with the men.

At the moment treatment is available voluntarily through the Narcotics Control Board. This treatment consists of a Therapeutic Community approach and requires that the person live in a secure center. While the women have separate sleeping quarters within this unit, men and women are brought together for the treatment programs.

This arrangement presents several problems for women.

1. For women with children and/or other family responsibilities, it is not possible to place themselves away from the family home for the length of time required for treatment in a Therapeutic Community.

2. Voluntarily accessing service through an organization such as the Narcotics control board is extremely difficult for women in a society in which drug is even more stigmatizing for women than it is for men. The Fashan report notes that “Drug use
among females appears to be even more hidden than among males.” Parents who are reluctant to acknowledge their son’s drug use, are even more reluctant to publicly acknowledge it in the case of daughters. As a result women, or girls’ parents, are unlikely to seek assistance for their drug use through the Narcotics Control Board.

3. There is a need for some gender specific drug based programs. Women and girls are often using drugs for different reasons to men, there are often differences in their drug use patterns and the ways in which they access drugs.

Recommendation 12: Planning should be carried out to assure (1) the development of a wider range of drug treatment programs in the community that are voluntarily accessed through health services and include programs designed to meet the needs of women; and (2) women in detention should have access to drug treatment programs that are not shared with men.

7. Women’s Imprisonment

Little information was available regarding the situation of women in prison, and time constraints alone did not allow time to visit the prison. Women are currently held at the same site as men. While women have separate living quarters, programs are conducted with men. Young women on pre-trial detention are apparently held in the same center with older, convicted female offenders. Women have access to their children while they are young, but questions were raised about the suitability of the conditions.

International research on women’s imprisonment consistently identifies a number of issues related to women’s imprisonment including: sexual assault and harassment; the need for gender specific services and programs; access to education/work training programs; self harm; access to children and concerns about the welfare of their children; mental health issues and access to drug treatment programs.

No documentation was available regarding these issues and the situation of women in prison in the Maldives.

Recommendation 13: A review be conducted of the secure detention of adult women and juvenile girls.

8. Bureau of Crime Statistics and Research

The development of recommendations regarding women in the criminal justice system would be enhanced by access to more detailed information, both quantitative and qualitative, concerning women in the system at all stages. Further the ongoing review and monitoring of programs, services and reforms and their ramifications for women would be facilitated by a more formalized system of data collection. Gender and age would be
key variables collected in relation to all stages of processing in the criminal justice system.

Therefore the development of a Bureau of Crime Statistics and Research is recommended. This bureau would provide advice to each of the Ministries regarding the development of ongoing information management systems within their departments that would support evidence based decision-making and actions, a system for the efficient collation, management, analysis (both qualitative and quantitative) and utilization of data and information. The Bureau would facilitate each of the Ministries establishing an information management system that met the needs and suited the practice of each Ministry.

The Bureau would be independent of each of the Ministries. Key data and information from each of the Ministries would be accessible by the Bureau for ongoing overall systems analysis and reports presented to the President, tabled in the Government and made publicly available.

The Bureau would be able to initiate and fund specific research projects and to fund independent evaluation projects. In relation to women in the criminal justice system there is an immediate need for research on the following topics: The situation of women in detention; Women’s experiences of the criminal justice system at all levels; and Gender and Judicial reasoning and judicial practices.

**Recommendation 14:** Given the urgent needs for data and information on the issues relevant to this report; it is recommended that (1) a Bureau of Crime Statistics and Research be created; and that (2) as a matter of priority research on Gender in the Criminal Justice System (especially women in prison) be carried out.
9. Recommendations

Legislation

Recommendation 1: Amend Article 34 and Article 52 of the Constitution of the Maldives that preclude women from the office of the President and Vice President.

Recommendation 2: That the legislation establishing the Human Rights Commission be approved. That a Human Rights Commission is established that is in full conformity with the “Paris Principles” established by the United Nations in relation to such organizations.

Recommendation 3: Develop a penal code that establishes spousal assault, non-consensual sex (whether inside or outside of marriage) and sex with an underage minor as criminal offences.

Recommendation 4: Ensure that there is an offence stipulated in the Criminal Code that constitutes payment for sexual services as an offence.

Recommendation 5: Ensure that in relation to criminal offending, all children under the age of 18 are under the jurisdiction of the Juvenile Court (currentl exemptions to be lifted).

Recommendation 6: Establish new rules of evidence including admissibility of forensic evidence and expert witnesses, and equal value be given to evidence presented by men and women. Currently rape and sexual violence remain difficult to prove given the strict requirements for eyewitnesses.

Criminal Justice System Changes

Recommendation 7: To establish policing and criminal justice system processes and procedures that are gender sensitive and take into account social and cultural difficulties in bringing such cases to the attention of authorities.

Recommendation 8. Enhanced capacity to collect and analyse forensic evidence, eg forensic science, set up modern systems of investigation at hospitals, police, island/atoll office level; skilled professionals- trained police, justice, health and social service areas.

Recommendation 9: Ongoing professional development of police, investigators, prosecutors and judges, and related professionals such as hospital staff and staff in key administrative centers in atolls.

Recommendation 10: Judiciary, Police and Prison Authorities to develop and include in their human resources policies strategies for increasing the number of women.
**Victim Support**
Recommendation 11: The establishment of victim support services outside of the criminal justice system eg counseling services, safe houses and legal advice.

**Drug Programs and Services**
Recommendation 12: Planning should be carried out to assure (1) the development of a wider range of drug treatment programs in the community that are voluntarily accessed through health services and include programs designed to meet the needs of women; and (2) women in detention should have access to drug treatment programs that are not shared with men.

**Women’s Imprisonment**
Recommendation 13: A review be conducted of the secure detention of adult women and juvenile girls.

**Bureau of Crime Statistics an Research**
Recommendation 14: Given the urgent needs for data and information on the issues relevant to this report; it is recommended that (1) a Bureau of Crime Statistics and Research be created; and that (2) as a matter of priority research on Gender in the Criminal Justice System (especially women in prison) be carried out.
10. Strategies

Four strategies are outlined in the following section. They do not cover all of the Recommendations of the report, but serve to highlight some actions that are of immediate concern and might be accomplished in the short to medium term.

Strategy 1: Ensuring that the new Penal Code adequately addresses issues of concern to women.
This component refers to Recommendations 3,4,5,6.

**Responsibility:** Attorney General’s Office

**Actions:** The three steps involved here are:
- Prof P. Robinson to be provided with a copy of this report.
- The Ministry of Gender, Family Development and Social Security to be consulted regarding the relevant provisions.
- Consideration be given to inviting the International Commission of Jurists to review the final new Penal Code document. This organization has a National Implementation Programme that is intended to ensure that State Parties fulfil their treaty obligations, particularly in the area of the administration of justice and gender injustice. This organization had previously worked in the Maldives on this project and so should be familiar with the issues.

Strategy 2: Enhancing the capacity of the Gender and Family Development Section of the Ministry of Gender, Family Development and Social Security. This component refers to Recommendations 7,9,10,11.

**Responsibility:** Ministry of Gender, Family Development and Social Security, in collaboration with Police Commissioner, Attorney General’s Office and the Minister of Justice.

An issue raised frequently with the consultants in relation to gender issues in the criminal justice system was the significance of the broader social understandings of gender relations and in particular the deeply entrenched attitudes to gender based violence against women. Current understandings mean that women are unlikely to report violence, and the criminal justice system does not pursue cases that are brought to their attention. The need to address this situation was highlighted by the CEDAW committee. To date the Gender and Development Section has been very active in addressing this issue but it is significantly under resourced in terms of both finances and personnel.
This section could play a crucial role in the following actions related to the recommendations of this report, for example:

**Community** (general public) awareness campaigns

**Capacity Building**
- Professional development and training (e.g., hospitals/nurses/police/magistrates/atoll management) (Recommendation 9)
- Capacity building of other Ministries and government departments by helping to design ongoing professional development *within* the organization (Recommendation 9).
- Advising other Ministries and government departments and the development of strategies to change the *gender profile* of their staffing (Recommendation 10).
- Provide advice to relevant departments regarding the development of *gender sensitive practices and policies* (Recommendation 7).

**Victim Services**
- Engaging in community development activities to facilitate the development of community-based services, networks of assistance and options for women victims of violence (Recommendation 11).

While there is much potential for what could be accomplished by this unit, they are currently significantly limited by the number of staff and on several occasions have had to rely on consultants. The problem is both one of financial resources and the availability of trained staff available for the unit.

There is a real need for capacity building of the Gender and Family Development Section in terms of staff training.

**Actions**: Concrete steps, in addition to the programs suggested immediately above, might include:

- The development of “internships”, where young people leaving school work with the unit on a part-time basis while they attend a post-secondary training program. These education units could be developed in collaboration with the Ministry of Education and should be developed so that they articulated with further tertiary training opportunities in overseas universities.
- The development of applications and negotiations with other Ministries and the Dpt of External Resources to seek funding for more scholarships to support students doing a postgraduate degree on research related to the Section’s agenda.
- Funding proposals for enhancing the overall capacity of the Gender and Family Unit and for individual projects should be developed in consultation with Department of External Resources and relevant UN Offices.

The Gender Section should be financially supported by other Ministries to carry out some of the tasks identified in relation to these Criminal Justice areas.
The Section should also be provided by additional resources from related Ministries to develop proposals for funding to international resources for the funding of the capacity building tasks.

**Strategy 3: Implementation of the recommendations of the Macdonald report of reforms to drug abuse policies and practices. Particular attention to be given to the accessibility and suitability of service for women and girls.** This component refers to Recommendation 12.

**Responsibility:** The Drug Abuse Action Team (an inter-Ministerial Committee to be established by the Juvenile Justice Development Committee).

The majority of women and girls are apparently in prison on the basis of drug offences. The increasing numbers indicate the current highly punitive approach to drug abuse is not working. There needs to be a shift to a greater health focus.

**Actions:**
- establish a set of priorities for implementation of the Macdonald recommendations that acknowledge the particular circumstances and needs of young women.
- work with communities across the Maldives to design programs suitable for drug users of both sexes.
- in collaboration with relevant UN departments, develop funding proposals for Technical Assistance in the framing, development and implementation of programs.
- work with the Consultants developing the new Juvenile Justice Act to ensure consistency of the Act with the Macdonald recommendations.

**Strategy 4. The development of the Terms of Reference for a review of the secure detention of women and girls.** This component relates to Recommendation 13.

**Responsibility:** Ministry of Home Affairs and the Ministry of Gender, Family Development and Social Security.

**Action:** The Terms of Reference should be developed for an external consultant to conduct a review of the secure detention of women and girls. Once the Terms of Reference are established, funds could be sought from external sources.
Appendix A

Consultations with (partial list):

Attorney General:
Dr. Hassan Saeed, Attorney General, Attorney General’s Office, 3rd Floor, Huravee Building, Male’.
Aaishath Azima Shakoor, Deputy Director, Legal Affairs, Attorney General’s Office

Ministry of Justice:
Ahmed Zahir, Minister of Justice
Staff and Judge of the Juvenile Court

Ministry of Education
Dr. Mahamood Shougee, Minister of Education
Staff, Centre for Continuing Education, Male’

Ministry of Gender, Family Development and Social Security
Dr. Aishath Shiham, Director, Unit for the Rights of Children
Maana Rafiu, Director, Gender and Development Section

Ministry of Defence and National Security
Major General Adam Zahir, Commissioner of Police
Maumoon Hameed, Legal Counsel to the Police

Human Rights Commission
Ahmed Mujthaba, Chairman, Human Rights Commission

Staff, NCRB

United Nations
Nashida Sattar, Program Officer, UNDP Maldives
Dunya Maumoon, Assistant Representative, UNFPA

Appendix B
Reports Consulted:


Centre for Continuing Education, Male, Description of the “Second Chance” programme, no date (report indicates that the classes were initiated on 19th January, 2003), 2 pages.


