EVALUATION
Of
UNICEF’s
WELCOME TO SCHOOL INITIATIVE
Kyrgyz Republic

October, 2011
The evaluation was carried out by:

Dr. Birgitte Woel
Box 3671 00200
Nairobi
Kenya

October 2011

LIST OF CONTENTS
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>List of Annexes</th>
<th>3</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of Tables</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Acronyms</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Map of Kyrgyzstan</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acknowledgement</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Executive summary</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>1. Project context</strong></td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 History</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Demography</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Geography and climate</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 Natural resources and economy</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 Development context</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>2. Project description</strong></td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Project background</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Project framework, goals and objectives</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Project, strategy, targets and activities</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 Implementing partners</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 Monitoring and evaluation</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 Inclusion of WTS activities into CP 2012-2016</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>3. Evaluation purpose, objectives and scope</strong></td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Purpose of the evaluation</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2 Objective of evaluation</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3 Scope of evaluation</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>4. Evaluation methodology</strong></td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1 Data sources</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2 Methods for data collection</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3 Constraints</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4 Organisation of the report</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5. Key findings</strong></td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1 Objective 1: Ensuring the return to school of all children</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.1 Child friendly pre-schools</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.1.2 Temporary learning spaces</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.2 Objective 2: Providing psych-social support</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.3 Objective 3: Promoting safe and tolerant schools</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.4 Objective 4: Building capacity and preparedness</td>
<td>33</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5 Objective 5: Coordinating human response</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6 Media Campaign</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.7 Human rights, gender and equity</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.8 Relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact and sustainability</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.8.1 Relevance of WTS Initiative</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.8.2 Effectiveness</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.8.3 Efficiency</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.8.4 Impact</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.8.5 Sustainability</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>6. Lessons learned</strong></td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>7. Conclusions</strong></td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>8. Recommendations</strong></td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>9. Mainstreaming of WTYS activities into CP 2012-2016</strong></td>
<td>52</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**LIST OF ANNEXES**

Annex 1: TORs 54
Annex 2: List of people met
Annex 3: Itinerary
Annex 4: Debriefing paper
Annex 5: List of literature

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1 – Questionnaire
Table 2 – Deliverables to child-friendly preschool spaces
Table 3 – deliverables to temporary learning space and rehabilitation
Table 4 – Provision of kits
Table 5 – Deliverables to psycho-social support
Table 6 – Deliverables to Peace Education
Table 7 – Building capacity of schools and pre-schools to respond to emerg.
Table 8 – Deliverables to Media Campaign
Table 9 – Total impact

LIST OF ACRONYMS

ACTED Agency for Technical Cooperation and Development
CP Country Programme
CMME Center for Multicultural and Multilingual Education
EFCA Euroasia Foundation in Central Asia
EMIS Education Management Information System
FEIS Foundation for Education Initiatives Support
KR Kyrgyz Republic
MOES Ministry of Education and Science
OSI Open Society Institute
PCA Programme Cooperation Agreement
QLP USAID funded Quality Learning Project
PE Peace Education
SC Save the Children Alliance
SSFA Small-Scale Funding Agreements
TORs Terms of Reference
UNESCO United Nations Education, Science and Culture Organisation
UNICEF United Nations’ International Childrens’ Emergency Fund
USAID US Agency for International Development
WFP World Food Programme
WTS Welcome to School Initiative
MAP OF KYRGYZSTAN
ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

I want to express my sincere gratitude for the unusually efficient and warm support of my work from the planning phase and till my time of report writing.

The assignment was short, fifteen days in total. Nevertheless the team managed to capture the essence of the work and tirelessly back it up although several changes in the itinerary were made with a very short notice. Without this back-up from the entire group of staff it would not have been possible to meet as many and diverse people as we did in the few days of data collection.

It was, indeed, a true team work.
EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The main objective of this consultancy was to conduct an evaluation of UNICEF Welcome to School Initiative (WTS), define strengths, weaknesses and challenges of the implemented programme with the view to identify which WTS activities will be relevant for the 2012-2016 Country Programme (CP) or for other partners. The report will be used by UNICEF, MOES and other implementing partners who addressed education issues during and after the emergency.

A total funding of US$3,861,931 was received from seven different sources being:

- Basic Education with US$283,775
- Emergency programme funding with US$748,256
- Thematic with US$256,987
- SIDA with US$350,663
- DFID with US$597,676
- Russian federation with US$450,000 and
- The Government of Netherlands with US$1,174,574

PROJECT BACKGROUND

The ethnic violence between Kyrgyz and Uzbek people in Osh and Jalal-Abad June 2010 resulted in direct barriers to children's access to school. Three schools were destroyed – two in Osh oblast and one in Jalal-Abad oblast – and several other schools in the affected areas suffered damages. Refugees from Barack, a Kyrgyz enclave in Uzbekistan, were informally settled in Kyrgyzstan’s Ak-tash village where no school is available.

Displacement caused by the conflict had adverse affects on school enrolment. Families worried about challenges in enrolling children in new schools, particularly for the many internally displaced children. A rapid assessment carried out before launching of the WTS Initiative showed that out of around 500,000 school children in Osh and Jalal-Abad provinces around 83,000 children were affected.

The violence caused an exodus of teachers to other parts of the country and to the Russian Federation, which worsened already existing teacher shortages. Further, many teachers suffered from post-traumatic problems like the rest of the population.

Children witnessed unimaginable physical violence and burning of homes and other properties and severely needed a daily moratorium away from the stressed parents and caregivers and a generally desperate situation. Families lost income and could not provide basics for their families, even less the costs of sending children to school.

PROJECT CONTEXT

There is a range of factors complicating improving of governance and economy in Kyrgyzstan. The country is land-locked and mountainous, with a geopolitical neighborhood best described as difficult. Kyrgyzstan has a relatively well-educated citizenry, a near-universal literacy rate and relatively acceptable resources for health care. Public expenditure on education has remained between 3% and 4% of GDP, close
to 20% of the government’s budget\textsuperscript{2}. Some sources state that the education budget is around 5\%\textsuperscript{3}.

\textbf{PROJECT STRATEGY AND OBJECTIVES}

A number of conventions concern human and children’s rights, which have to be addressed also under challenging circumstances. The Kyrgyz Republic (KR) as the signing partner and UNICEF as the UN representative for the mentioned conventions had an obligation to react.

Rooted in the above and in Core Commitments to Children in Humanitarian Action, and grounded in UNICEF’s IASC Cluster responsibilities. The overall goal of the WTS Initiative was to minimize the impact of the emergency on children’s education by supporting efforts to ensure that all children have access to quality preschool and basic education through:

- ensuring the return to school of all children and adolescents affected by the June violence and advance equity of access to quality basic education, especially for those most marginalized;
- providing psychosocial support to children affected by the June violence in Jalal-Abad oblast and Osh city;
- promoting safe and tolerant schools, preschools and communities through peace education;
- building the capacity and preparedness of schools and preschools to respond to emergencies;
- coordinating humanitarian response for Education and ensure that cross-cutting linkages are established with Child protection and WASH clusters to strengthen joint results, reduce duplications and avoid gaps.

The activities was meant to help children, families and teachers recover from the impact of the crisis by creating a certain level of normalcy and create risk reduction and social cohesion through Peace Education (PE). Hence the Initiative was a multi-layer, inter-sectoral and multi-partner initiative.

Acknowledging that the obstacles to school enrolment go beyond the education sector, the one-year strategy took a comprehensive, inter-sectoral approach.

The strategy is reflected in the five objectives, which were implemented through a wide range of activities over three phases: Phase 1 from August – 30 September, 2010; Phase 2 from 1 October to 31 December, 2010, and phase 3, which was running from 1 January to 31 July, 2011.

\textbf{POSSIBLE INCLUSION OF WTS ACTIVITIES INTO FUTURE UNICEF ACTIVITIES}

UNICEF is planning for a new five-year Country Plan (CP) for 2012-2016 which aims to promote equity. UNICEF works at policy level with the government to improve the social system, as well as on the ground to make sure that these systems reach all children, with a particular emphasis on the most vulnerable. The government strategy aims to include children with various disabilities.

The WTS as concept aiming at transitioning from emergency into development within a frame of complex psychological, social and cultural challenges should be accommodated in CP 2012-2016. The findings from this report will inform the planning work to ensure response to such special needs.

\textsuperscript{2} BTI: Kyrgyzstan Country report by Bertelsmann Stiftung and the Center for Applied Policy Research (C\textsuperscript{A}\textsuperscript{P}) at Munich University

\textsuperscript{3} CIA fact sheet
EVALUATION PURPOSE, OBJECTIVE AND SCOPE

In accordance with Terms of reference (TORs) the purpose of the evaluation was to find out how some of the successful activities can be mainstreamed into the UNICEF 2012-2016 country programme (CP).

The main objective of this consultancy was to conduct an evaluation of UNICEF Welcome to School Initiative (WTS), define strengths, weaknesses and challenges of the implemented programme.

The evaluation should address issues of project design, implementation, management, lessons learned, replicability and provide recommendations for current and future projects. The questions to be addressed in the evaluation (provided below) are organised to provide an assessment of relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability, and impact on the target population.

EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

The methodology consisted of the following considerations and components:

Data sources

Documents: The consultant was well in advance provided with all relevant documents. Figures were used for entry into this report, where other sources did not exist. Finally the documents were used as one of the sources for triangulation of data.

People: The evaluation included the major groups of stakeholders such as:

- MOES from State Ministry to Department of Education, Principals and teachers
- The beneficiaries in terms of students and parents
- UNICEF staff

Site visits: The data collection in Bishkek involved State Ministry, UNICEF Country Representative and UNICEF Communication Department, Foundation for Education Initiatives Support (FEIS), while Department of Education.

In Osh four schools were visited, namely: Filial Lenin, Altybaev School, Sydyk Alaychi School and 3rd International School.

Methods

It was attempted to apply different methods and meet various stakeholders to allow for data validation.

All interviews were based on the same semi-open questions, which made it possible to compare different experiences with the same activities at various levels.

The same principle was applied for the Focus Group Discussions (FGD). The issue of collaboration was not discussed with the group of beneficiaries. Discussions with beneficiaries included: 2 groups teachers, 2 groups parents (who were all mothers or grand-mothers), 2 groups of students and 1 group of implementing NGOs.

The preliminary findings were presented in a three-hour debriefing meeting to stakeholders in Bishkek. The meeting had representatives from key stakeholders, inclusive of MOES, who were active in discussion of findings and recommendations.

---

4 Annex 1

5 List of Literature annex 5

6 Full list of people met in annex 2

7 The meeting was based on a debriefing note, which was presented with elaborate explanations.
The commented debriefing paper, notes and documents received from UNICEF formed the basis for the report writing. UNICEF and MOES gave comments, which were incorporated.

CONSTRAINTS
The consultant faced some constraints, which in different ways affected the data collection, control and thereby the quality of the report. These were:

- Time constraints
- UNICEF Documentation
- MOES documentation
- Ethics in data collection

LESSONS LEARNED
Multiple lessons were learned from this evaluation. They concern a wide range of issues and include:

Project context:
The root-cause of the violence, namely ethnic differences, still exists and causes a stress which affects normalcy and contributions towards peace building, preparedness and conflict prevention.
The general learning situation is still hampered by the low level of teacher education, migration of teachers and parent desire to enrol children in mono-ethnic schools which MOES' counterproductive interventions in terms of withdrawing Uzbek learning materials without having sufficient materials in Kyrgyz language, sudden transfer of students to neither tally with the human and children's rights to which the government is committed, neither to the intentions in EDS 2020.

UNICEF – Project design and management
Data collection: Traditional data collection tools are not able to capture the essence of such post-conflict situations without either being scanty or causing pain to the target group. If not well prepared the evaluation can have adverse effects.
Design: The different types of impact given by the Focus Group members indicate that there is need for a holistic approach in projects addressing the impact of humanitarian crises.

it was proved that initiatives without a results matrix and RBM can deliver as planned. This should provoke some thinking around the present EBM requirements and their relevance in emergency projects – in the present design.
Better emergency preparation of government and partners is required as timely preparation of all key partners seems to be a precondition for early, streamlined and focused interventions

Education opportunities for youth were in high demand, as quite a number 8 does not attend school and not sufficiently addressed.

CONCLUSIONS
Conclusion on the findings against the above objectives show achievements and drawback as accounted for below.

Strengths
The analysis of findings showed that the WTS Initiative overall delivered to all objectives.

---

8 FGD statements and partly statistics showing that 160 out of 300 transferred youth never turned up in the new school
The Initiative had overall based project design and all operations on the required ethics. The combination of activities in the One Year Education Strategy and within the Initiative itself were complementary and had the desired synergy effect. The WTS Initiative proved fully relevant, overall effective and efficient with intended impact. Due to design, timeframe and the context it cannot be regarded as sustainable, but replicable if extracting a few, actually relevant activities. The inclusion of a wide and diverse scope of implementers made the WTS Initiative deliver while creating a sense of ownership and ability. All implementers engaged whole-heartedly and delivered each their parts despite continued stress.

Weaknesses
The Initiative did not have rigorous use of RBM practices;
The education cluster was not ready and had problems in organising itself;
The present composition of the Education Cluster will not serve the required holistic approach to education.

Challenges
The political uncertainty in Kyrgyz resulted in continued fear during the implementation because of the upcoming Presidential election;
The brittleness of the peace shows in the extensive humiliations of members of the “other” ethnic groups. Constant humiliation generates fear, but also anger, which can result in new outbreaks of unrest;
Pre-schooling comes to have adverse effect in situations where there is no space or enough teachers to accommodate all children in pre-school classes. Upon start in 1st class the fresh students fall behind due to lack of immediate readiness for learning and the learning environment;
Traumatised parents and teachers are not the best support of likewise traumatised children in development.

Overall conclusion:
It is overall concluded that the WTS Initiative was well designed responding to criteria for rights-based approach in choice of activities, approach and timeliness. Despite shortcomings in application of RBM the Initiative overall delivered as planned. The work was well coordinated and the implementation through a wide and diverse scope of partners made activities be people-owned.
If incorporating recommendations the Initiative can continue with the one year extension primarily based on past activities with exemption of rehabilitation of schools.
Due to the challenging learning and ethnic situation in the country there is dire need for continued, extended and coordinated activities under the CP 2012-2016.

RECOMMENDATIONS
The following changes and interventions are strongly recommended:

UNICEF
a) Acute and immense need for extra-curricular education, which need urgent attention
b) Inclusion of youth through above activities
c) RBM in emergency may need re-design
d) Ethics in data collection should influence data quality requirements
e) Planning of transition should be integral part of emergency project designs

Government of Kyrgyzstan/MOES
a) Integration as practiced should be reviewed not be counterproductive to ongoing emergency and development activities
b) Teacher training and learning materials need to be reviewed and re-designed to serve
the purpose of building people, who can develop a nation. This includes full coverage of pre-schooling and modernised vocational training.

**MAINSTREAMING OF WTS ACTIVITIES INTO CP 2012-2016**

It is assumed that all activities will be rights-based and be implemented applying full RBM norms and standards. With that in mind the following is recommended:

1) The CP 2012-2016 should consider a transition period of maybe one year in the affected areas allowing for (new) special post-crisis interventions in the affected areas. Such new interventions should be based on thorough need’s assessments in the affected areas. Based on the above the composition of the Education Cluster should be reviewed and have a composition reflecting the findings in the needs assessment.

2) The governmental institutions repeatedly expressed their interest in supporting future UNICEF activities, which caused some concern. For sustainability purposes it is imperative that governmental institutions take the lead when past activities turn into development activities. The capacity in all partner institutions may need boosting.

3) With regard to continued provision of materials and equipment to schools UNICEF could support in a manner encouraging the government to take the lead.

4) The extensive downstream inclusion of local governments, formal and informal authorities, staff of schools and maybe other institutions, and community members should continue. It should be streamlined through formalised structures and relevant training. Building capacity is also building self-esteem, which helps overcoming trauma.

   Such design in combination with the proposed skilled training of youth would also deliver to broader impact considering psychological, social and economical impact at micro, meso and macro level.

5) Acknowledging that many children live a vulnerable live at home it might be relevant to secure protection of children from neglect, abuse and violence through establishment of community monitoring committees and adequate reporting facilities. Establishment of post-school activities e.g. scout activities and sport activities for young children aged 6-12 years and who cannot attend youth clubs, would also create a protection function.
1. PROJECT CONTEXT

Since this project came in place because of ethnic problems, the history of the country may need some elaboration.

1.1 HISTORY

Kyrgyz history dates back to 201 B.C. The earliest descendents of the Kyrgyz people, who are believed to be of Turkic descent, lived in the northeastern part of what is currently Mongolia. They spread across what is now the Tuva region of the Russian Federation, remaining in that area until the rise of the Mongol Empire in the 13th century, when the Kyrgyz began migrating south. In the 12th century, Islam became the predominant religion in the region. Most Kyrgyz are Sunni Muslims of the Hanafi School.

During the 15th-16th centuries, the Kyrgyz people settled in the territory currently known as the Kyrgyz Republic. The territory was formally incorporated into the Russian Empire in 1876. The Russian takeover instigated numerous revolts against tsarist authority, and many Kyrgyz opted to move into the Pamir Mountains or to Afghanistan. The suppression of the 1916 rebellion in Central Asia caused many Kyrgyz to migrate to China. Almost one-sixth of the Kyrgyz population was killed.

Kyrgyzstan became a Soviet republic in 1936 and achieved independence in 1991 when the USSR dissolved. Nationwide demonstrations in the spring of 2005 resulted in the ouster of President Askar Akaev, who had run the country since 1990. Subsequent presidential elections in July 2005 were won overwhelmingly by former Prime Minister Kurmanbek Bakiev. Over the next few years, the new president manipulated the parliament to accrue new powers for himself.

The major state developments in 2008 were a sharp contraction of democracy, an increase in the repressiveness of the state and the persecution of opposition members. Freedom of expression and of the press came under increasing attack. The quality of elections was seriously compromised, especially in early parliamentary elections of late 2007, leading to the establishment of a puppet Jogorku Kenesh – the parliament of Kyrgyzstan – fully dominated by the president's Ak Jol People’s Party.

In July 2009, after months of harassment against his opponents and media critics, Bakiev won re-election in a presidential campaign that the international community deemed flawed. In April 2010, nationwide protests led to the resignation and expulsion of Bakiev. He was replaced by President Roza Otunbaeva who will serve as president until 31 December 2011. The overthrow of President Bakiev in April, 2010 and subsequent ethnic clashes left hundreds dead and damaged infrastructure. More than 300,000 people fleeing their homes. Of these, some 75,000 crossed the border into Uzbekistan. Presidential elections are scheduled to be held October 30th, 2011.

The country remains beset by a level of instability that is hindering the democratic transition. Endemic problems include rampant corruption, nepotism, and lack of transparent financial management. Organized crime is present and a variety of illicit activities are thriving. Divisions between Kyrgyz and Uzbek communities, real and imagined, garner significant attention; however, other issues - such as inequities between rural and urban areas or competition between northern and southern political elite - can be more polarizing. Furthermore, opportunistic manipulation is enabled by a lack of access to frequent, reliable, and objective information that can dispel rumors and inform citizen decision making.
Despite these obstacles, Kyrgyzstan is brimming with opportunity. The country has demonstrated, relative to its neighbours, a significant potential for democratic reform and openness toward independent media. In addition, Kyrgyzstan has a dynamic civil society and a large number of young people, who are exploring and embracing the power of technology. The country's shared religious identity, historical reliance on collective community initiative, and growing sense of national pride are all factors that can support the peaceful mobilization of the society by responsible leaders.  

1.2 DEMOGRAPHY

Kyrgyzstan has a population of 5,587,443 people (July 2010 estimate), which is composed of: Kyrgyz 64.9%, Uzbek 13.8%, Russian 12.5%, Dungan 1.1%, Ukrainian 1% and other 5.7%

The religion is predominantly Muslim (75%) and Russian Orthodox (12.5%).

The choice of language is presently of great concern among the Kyrgyz and Uzbek populations, as Kyrgyz is the official language and is spoken by 64.5% of the population, while Uzbeks claim a right to speak and be taught in Uzbek, which is spoken by 13.6% of the population. Russian as the second official language is more accepted by the Uzbeks than Kyrgyz.

The age structure shows a major representation of children age 0-14 years (29.3%) implying a considerable and acute need for child and youth education and other learning activities in the coming ten years. Population growth is modest with 1.4 %, which is contrary to the presently high child population. Life expectancy is 70 years.

1.3 GEOGRAPHY AND CLIMATE

The country is landlocked and mountainous dominated by the Tien Shan range. 94% of the country is 1,000 m above sea level with lowest point being Kara-Daryya (Karadar'ya) at 132 m and the highest point Jengish Chokusu (Pik Pobedy) 7,439 m. The country is characterised by tall peaks, glaciers, and high-altitude lakes as shown in the map below.
Kyrgyzstan has 3,051 km of borders neighbouring China, Tajikistan, Uzbekistan and Kazakhstan.

The climate is dry continental to polar in High Tien Mountains, subtropical in southwest and temperate in northern foothill zone.

1.4 NATURAL RESOURCES AND ECONOMY

Kyrgyzstan is a mountainous country with a dominant agricultural sector. Cotton, tobacco, wool and meat are the main agricultural products, although only tobacco and cotton are exported in any quantity. Industrial exports include gold, mercury, uranium, natural gas, and electricity. GDP grew about 8% annually in 2007-08, partly due to higher gold prices internationally, but slowed to 2.3% in 2009. The overthrow of President Bakiev in April, 2010 and subsequent ethnic clashes left hundreds dead and damaged infrastructure. Shrinking trade and agricultural production, as well as political instability, caused GDP to contract about 3.5% in 2010. The fiscal deficit widened to 11% of GDP, reflecting significant increases in crisis-related spending, including both rehabilitation of damaged infrastructure and bank recapitalization. Progress in reconstruction, fighting corruption, restructuring domestic industry, and attracting foreign aid and investment are key to future growth.

1.5 DEVELOPMENT CONTEXT

There is a range of factors complicating improving of governance and economy in Kyrgyzstan. The country is land-locked and mountainous, with a geopolitical neighborhood best described as difficult. Its natural climate, with frequent dry seasons, floods and earthquakes, can severely add unexpected strains on the economy and the country's infrastructure. In general Kyrgyzstan’s road network is undeveloped and its railway system is extremely limited. Kyrgyzstan has a relatively well-educated citizenry, a near-universal literacy rate and relatively acceptable resources for health care. Public expenditure on education has remained between 3% and 4% of GDP, close to 20% of...
the government's budget\textsuperscript{14}. Some sources state that the education budget is around 5\%\textsuperscript{15}.

As most other countries under development Kyrgyzstan faces a number of environmental challenges, which include: Water pollution from rivers and lakes contaminated by nuclear waste deposited in old mines, air pollution and increasing soil salinity due to faulty irrigation practices.

\textsuperscript{14} BTI: Kyrgyzstan Country report by Bertelsmann Stiftung and the Center for Applied Policy Research (C\textbullet A\textbullet P) at Munich University

\textsuperscript{15} CIA fact sheet
2. PROJECT DESCRIPTION

2.1 PROJECT BACKGROUND

The ethnic violence between Kyrgyz and Uzbek people in Osh and Jalal-Abad June 2010 resulted in direct barriers to children's access to school. Three schools were destroyed – two in Osh oblast and one in Jalal-Abad oblast – and several other schools in the affected areas suffered damages. Refugees from Barack, a Kyrgyz enclave in Uzbekistan, were informally settled in Kyrgyzstan's Ak-tash village where no school is available.

Displacement caused by the conflict had adverse affects on school enrolment. Families worried about challenges in enrolling children in new schools, particularly for the many internally displaced children. Children were displaced to areas where schooling is not offered in their language also faced severe social and academic challenges. This was expected to increase the number of school dropouts, particularly among adolescents and at-risk populations. A rapid assessment carried out before launching of the WTS Initiative showed that out of around 500,000 school children in Osh and Jalal-Abad provinces around 83,000 children were affected.

The violence caused an exodus of teachers to other parts of the country and to the Russian Federation, which worsened already existing teacher shortages. According to MOES reports at least 150 teachers were affected directly having their homes burnt or looted, while a rapid assessment showed that up to 25% of the teacher planned to migrate. A study by UNICEF in 2009\textsuperscript{16} showed that there already was a teacher shortage as 72.7% of schools in Jalal-Abad and 71.4% of schools in Osh provinces reported teacher shortage.

Further, many teachers suffered from post-traumatic problems like the rest of the population.

Children witnessed unimaginable physical violence and burning of homes and other properties and severely needed a daily moratorium away from the stressed parents and caregivers and a generally desperate situation. Families lost income and could not provide basics for their families, even less the costs of sending children to school.

However, the fear of further violence acted as a major barrier to enrolment. Where children had to walk through different communities to single-language schools, families worried about the safety of their children en route to school. The continued fear, hopelessness and anger among the two populations is a potential for violence to flare up again and threaten not only children's right to education, but family structures and thus implicitly the entire foundation for child development.

Eighty per cent of respondents in the rapid cluster assessment\textsuperscript{17} estimated that, as a consequence of the conflict and post-conflict situation, both teachers and students urgently needed psycho-social support.

2.2 PROJECT FRAMEWORK, GOALS AND OBJECTIVES

\textsuperscript{16} UNICEF’s Teacher Shortage Study in Kyrgyzstan, 2009

\textsuperscript{17} Education Cluster assessment, 2010
The “Welcome to School” Initiative was a response to the above conflict and was meant to ease the crisis through recovery with a possible continuation to enter into a transition phase. It was a one-year Initiative, which was launched August 2010 and should have come to an end by end July 2011. It was given a one-year extension until end July 2012.

Acknowledging that the interruption of formal and informal schooling delays the recovery of children and their communities in post-emergency situations, immediate and continued action to ensure on-time access to formal and non-formal learning. It was critical to provide structure, normalcy and psycho-social support for children affected by traumatic events. The consequences of inaction for Kyrgyzstan include reduced learning and educational attainment thereby increasing polarisation between ethnic groups, and diminished economic development.

A number of conventions concern human and children’s rights, which have to be addressed also under challenging circumstances. These conventions include: The United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization’s Convention against Discrimination in Education (1960), the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (1966) and the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989). The Kyrgyz Republic (KR) as the signing partner and UNICEF as the UN representative for the mentioned conventions had an obligation to react.

The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989) is based on four core principles: non-discrimination; the best interests of the child; the right to life, survival and development of the child to the maximum extent. This includes concerns related to gender, more specifically the girl child’s right and access maximum development. These core principles are meant to enable fulfilment of the overall goal:

To assure every child a quality education that respects and promotes her or his right to dignity and optimum development.

Rooted in the above and in Core Commitments to Children in Humanitarian Action, and grounded in UNICEF’s IASC Cluster responsibilities. The One Year Education Strategy 2010-2011 was designed to support three initiatives where the Welcome to School was one of them. The MOES initiated strategy had interventions at both local and national levels: (i) At the local level, UNICEF-supported activities targeted children, caregivers and teachers in districts (rayons) directly and indirectly impacted by the violence; and (ii) at the national level, UNICEF supported efforts of the MOES to target marginalised children and young people nationwide with the aim of ensuring education for all.

The overall goal of the WTS Initiative was to minimize the impact of the emergency on children’s education by supporting efforts to ensure that all children have access to quality preschool and basic education through:

- ensuring the return to school of all children and adolescents affected by the June violence and advance equity of access to quality basic education, especially for those most marginalized;  
- providing psychosocial support to children affected by the June violence in Jalal-Abad oblast and Osh city;

---

18 UNICEF: Rights-based approach to education

19 UNICEF: Kyrgyzstan: One Year Education Strategy 2010-2011
promoting safe and tolerant schools, preschools and communities through peace education;
building the capacity and preparedness of schools and preschools to respond to emergencies;
coordinating humanitarian response for Education and ensure that cross-cutting linkages are established with Child protection and WASH clusters to strengthen joint results, reduce duplications and avoid gaps.

The activities was meant to help children, families and teachers recover from the impact of the crisis by creating a certain level of normalcy and create risk reduction and social cohesion through Peace Education (PE).

A total funding of US$3,861,931 was received from seven different sources being:

- Basic Education with US$283,775
- Emergency programme funding with US$748,256
- Thematic with US$256,987
- SIDA with US$350,663
- DFID with US$597,676
- Russian federation with US$450,000 and
- The Government of Netherlands with US$1,174,574

### 2.3 PROJECT STRATEGY, TARGETS AND ACTIVITIES

The document “Kyrgyzstan – One Year Education Strategy” describes the targets and activities of “Welcome to School (WTS) Initiative” and how the initiative coordinated on cross-cutting issues with Water, Sanitation and Health (WASH) in schools and “Protection of Children”. The WTS Initiative was implemented by MOES, UNICEF and other partners and coordinated through the Education Cluster. Education Clusters, is jointly led by UNICEF and Save the Children, aim to ensure a timely, coherent and effective education response by mobilizing stakeholders to respond in a strategic manner to a humanitarian crisis.\(^{20}\)

The Initiative was a multi-layer, inter-sectoral and multi-partner initiative. It went beyond the traditional back-to-school campaign by supporting improved access, equity and quality of education nationwide into the longer term.

Acknowledging that the obstacles to school enrolment go beyond the education sector, the one-year strategy took a comprehensive, inter-sectoral approach. It incorporates strong linkages to activities targeting child protection and improved water and sanitation in schools. All UNICEF activities in Education have been designed in close collaboration with the MOES, other relevant national and local government bodies, and in consultation and coordination with other partners via Education, Protection and WASH clusters.

The strategy is reflected in the five objectives, which were implemented through a wide range of activities over three phases:

**Phase 1 from August – 30 September, 2010:**

\(^{20}\) Details on composition and responsibilities in annex
The first phase focused on ensuring the return to school of all students on 1 September, including nationwide efforts and targeted supports in most-affected areas intended to cover the following activities:

- **Child-Friendly Preschool Spaces**
  Identify safe spaces in 15 schools in affected areas; train teachers on early childhood and psycho-social skills; provide play and learning materials; and build permanent latrines.

- **Temporary Learning Space**
  Construct a Temporary Learning Space for the children of a destroyed school; set up tents; provide locally-built furniture; provide learning materials; and build temporary latrines.

- **Play and Learning Materials to Affected Schools**
  Provide the Temporary Learning Space and 277 of the most affected schools with: learning materials (School in a Box) and sports equipment (Recreation Kit). New Math and Science Kits will be piloted in the Temporary Learning Space.

- **Peace Education Lesson Plans for use Nationwide**
  Secure technical support to develop Peace Education lesson plans for the MOES’ “Month of Peace and Harmony” and support printing and distribution of Peace Education Teacher Guides and Lessons in Russian, Uzbek and Kyrgyz languages for all teachers in the country (72,000).

- **Analyse Preschools and Preschool Curricula for Disaster Risk Reduction**
  Conduct a Situational Analysis of DRR in preschool and a review of Preschool Curricula for attention to DRR, as well as coordinate a DRR in Education planning process with multiple partners and establish a network of emergency focal points in every school and preschool.

- **Community-Led Activities for Security and Tolerance in School Communities**
  Support and engage local partners to mobilise communities in securing safe transit to school, and to promote security and tolerance in 111 of the most affected schools.

- **Flexible Pathways to School**
  Advocate for admission to school for children whose registration papers were lost.

- **Psycho-social Training for School Administrators and Social Pedagogues**
  Partner with the Regional Teacher Training Institute to implement a psycho-social training for Administrators from all 585 schools in Osh Oblast, so that they can help mitigate the psychological impact on schoolchildren and facilitate the return to normalcy. Coordinate with QLP, overseeing the training in Jalal-Abad, and OSI, conducting a similar training for teachers.

- **Child-Friendly Latrines and Hygiene Promotion**
  Construct child-friendly latrines and hand washing facilities, and promote hygiene education in 14 schools where Child-Friendly Preschool Spaces are located. The permanent latrines will help make schools safer and healthier for preschool and primary-age children long into the future.

- **Welcome to School Communication Campaign: “Together to School”**
  Coordinate with the Education Cluster to develop “Together to School” logo, print materials and TV spots to spread WtS messages at national- and local-levels. Mobilize international, national, and local media to expand coverage of WtS Activities.

- **Education Cluster Coordination**
  Coordinate Education Cluster in collaboration with MOES and Save the Children to coordinate actors in Education at the national-level (Bishkek) and for affected areas (Osh).

Phase 2 from 1 October to 31 December, 2010 covered same activities as phase 3, which was running from 1 January to 31 July, 2011. The activities for these two phases included:
• **Child-Friendly Preschool Spaces**  
  Support the transition of children to school and continued quality preschool for ages 4-5.

• **Temporary Learning Spaces**  
  Winterize TLS to ensure safe and warm learning environments as the weather gets colder.

• **Play and Learning Materials**  
  As children transition out of temporary programmes and into permanent school and other settings, transfer play and learning materials to schools so that children can continue to benefit.

• **Most-Affected Children**  
  Continue to monitor the situation of the over 3,000 most-affected children.

• **Peace Education**  
  Develop a longer-term Peace Education plan with the MOES.

• **Disaster Risk Reduction in Preschools**  
  Integrate DRR in preschool curricula and develop teaching and learning materials for young learners – including Magic Journey episodes. Establish a network of emergency focal points in schools and preschools.

• **Community-Led Activities for Security and Tolerance**  
  Continue to support community-led activities that promote safe schools and communities.

• **Welcome to School Communication Campaign: “Together to School”**  
  Continue communication activities that promote access to safe learning environments to all.

• **Education Cluster Coordination**  
  Continue to facilitate Education Cluster coordination as needed to ensure aligned efforts.

### 2.4 IMPLEMENTING PARTNERS

The implementing partners represent the wider development community and cover relevant government departments at all levels, UN agencies, donor agencies, national and international CSOs and local community groups as follows:

- **Government bodies:** Vice-Prime-Minister’s Office, State Directorate on Reconstruction and Rehabilitation of the South, Ministry of Education and Science and local education departments, District state government administrations, local self-government bodies;
- **National and international NGOs:** Save the Children Alliance, Agency for Technical Cooperation and Development (ACTED), Eurasia Foundation in Central Asia (EFCA), Open Society Institute (OSI); HelpAge, Foundation for Tolerance International;
- **Donor agency:** USAID;
- **Local NGOs:** “Sinton”, Foundation for Education Initiatives Support, Centre for Interactive Teaching Methods and Development, “Kosh Araket”, UN organisations: UNESCO, WFP.

The lead was taken by the donor and development agencies as a natural consequence of the emergency situation, which may have left too little opportunity for the government to take sufficient responsibility.
2.5 Monitoring and Evaluation

Monitoring and evaluation was an integral part of the plan. The rapid needs assessment data were used for planning and subsequent monitoring of deliverables for each activity. Particular attention was paid to monitoring the situation and emerging needs in affected communities, and the implementation of school- and community-level activities, which showed as regular updating of progress on deliverables. UNICEF also supported documentation and dissemination of successes, good practices and lessons learnt within the Education Sector response through UNICEF Department for Communication. Most of the projects were implemented through PCAs (Programme Cooperation Agreement) and SSFAs (Small Scale Funding Agreements). UNICEF staff constantly monitored the implementation process. Monitoring notes were used to track the progress and to intervene and guide if there some implementation and management problems were observed. This included financial management. No external monitoring was carried out except this evaluation. But reports on performance was regularly produced and shared.  

NGO partners closely monitored enrolment and attendance in school, especially in affected areas through teacher Associations, Student Parliaments and Territorial Councils. The based monitoring on baseline studies, interim and final surveys.

2.6 Possible Inclusion of WTS Activities into Future UNICEF Activities

UNICEF is planning for a new five-year Country Plan (CP) for 2012-2016 which aims to promote equity. UNICEF works at policy level with the government to improve the social system, as well as on the ground to make sure that these systems reach all children, with a particular emphasis on the most vulnerable. The government strategy aims to include children with various disabilities. Considering the lack of opportunities as well as the role played by youths both as perpetrators and as victims during the June 2010, UNICEF is paying particular attention to improving their civic engagement and setting up youth services to strengthen their participation in decision making processes affecting their lives. The WTS as concept aiming at transitioning from emergency into development within a frame of complex psychological, social and cultural challenges should be accommodated in CP 2012-2016. The findings from this report will inform the planning work to ensure response to such special needs.

---

21 They are part of List of Literature, annex 5
3. EVALUATION PURPOSE, OBJECTIVE AND SCOPE

3.1 PURPOSE OF THE EVALUATION

The UNICEF supported "Welcome to School" (WTS) Initiative under the One Year Strategy for Education was launched August 1st, 2011 and was scheduled to last one year, but had a one-year extension till end July 2012. With the aim to make a status and learn from experiences primarily for inclusion of relevant activities in Country Programme 2012-2016, UNICEF requested to have an evaluation.

In accordance with Terms of reference\(^{22}\) (TOR) the purpose of the evaluation was to find out how some of the successful activities can be mainstreamed into the UNICEF 2012-2016 country programme (CP). The audience is therefore UNICEF, MOES and other implementing partners who addressed education issues during the emergency.

3.2 OBJECTIVE OF THE EVALUATION

The main objective of this consultancy was to conduct an evaluation of UNICEF Welcome to School Initiative (WTS), define strengths, weaknesses and challenges of the implemented programme.

3.3 SCOPE OF THE WORK

The evaluation should address issues of project design, implementation, management, lessons learned, replicability and provide recommendations for current and future projects. The questions to be addressed in the evaluation (provided below) are organised to provide an assessment of relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability, and impact on the target population.

Main specifically the purpose of the evaluation is to:

- Assess if the project has achieved its objectives and identify the challenges encountered in doing so;
- Assess the relevance of the project in the cultural, economic, and political context in the country, as well as the extent to which it is suited to the priorities and policies of the government;
- Assess the intended and unintended outcomes and impacts of the project;
- Provide lessons learned from the project design and experiences in implementation that can be applied in current or future WTS projects;
- Assess whether project activities can be deemed sustainable at the local and national level and among implementing organizations;
- Assess if the gender, the best interest of the child, human rights based approach, ethical considerations and result based management were applied during the project planning and implementation.

\(^{22}\) Annex 1
4. EVALUATION METHODOLOGY

4.1 DATA SOURCES

Documents: The consultant was well in advance provided with all relevant documents such as One Year Education Strategy 2010-2011, Assessment notes, Education Situation Analysis and WTS 2010 results. The documents were used for planning the data collection (methods, participants). Figures were used for entry into this report, where other sources did not exist. Finally the documents were used as one of the sources for triangulation of data.

People: The evaluation included the major groups of stakeholders such as:

- MOES from State Ministry to Department of Education, Principals and teachers
- The beneficiaries in terms of students and parents
- UNICEF staff

Site visits: The data collection in Bishkek involved State Ministry, UNICEF Country Representative and UNICEF Communication Department, Foundation for Education Initiatives Support (FEIS), while Department of Education. In Osh four schools were visited, namely: Filial Lenin, Altybaev School, Sydyk Alaychi School and 3rd International School.

4.2 METHODS FOR DATA COLLECTION

The chosen methodology was influenced by the time constraints allowing for five field days to carry out all data collection. Nevertheless it was attempted to apply different methods and meet various stakeholders to allow for data validation. The methods included desk studies, interviews and Focus Group Discussions.

All interviews were based on the same semi-open questions, which made it possible to compare different experiences with the same activities at various levels:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Item</th>
<th>What worked well</th>
<th>Effect</th>
<th>Difficulties faced</th>
<th>Effect</th>
<th>Future activities</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Activities</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Collaboration</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1 - Questionnaire

The simple questionnaire was used by the consultant and translator together with a list of UNICEF activities to help people know which activities we wanted to discuss.

The same principle was applied for the Focus Group Discussions (FGD). The issue of collaboration was not discussed with the group of beneficiaries. Discussions with beneficiaries included: 2 groups teachers, 2 groups parents (who were all mothers or grand-mothers), 2 groups of students and 1 group of implementing NGOs.

---

23 List of Literature annex 5
24 Full list of people met in annex 2
The focus groups were asked to select 2-3 activities, which they found had been positively outstanding and define the effect such activities had had. Subsequently they were asked to point at the less successful activities and indicate the effect of these. They finally suggested changes to existing activities or new future activities.

The teacher FGDs had women overrepresentation. But all groups had male teachers, as well. The student FGDs had a better gender balance, although the group at 3rd International school had overrepresentation of girls. This did, however, not bar the boys from engaging actively and with very good analyses of the ethnic challenges and education in a school teaching both ethnic groups.

Recommendations are partially based on their suggestions where these match data from other sources.

Initially it was planned to have one or two FGDs. But after the first FGD, which were very informative it was decided to have more views on relevance of activities, implementation and impact from all three groups of key beneficiaries. Another four FGDs were hastily arranged. Despite the short notice the turn-out was very good, so was the openness, although painful, and the engagement in the discussion. There was no FDG without input from all members in the group.

One focus group consisting of the implementing NGOs discussed the two questions in the questionnaire, as it was critical to have their view on the collaboration. Due to the time factor it was not possible have individual interviews. Also here the debate was frank and constructive.

During the discussions the consultant and translator took notes. All answers were later entered into the computer as bullet points. This made it easy to compare answers from different groups of stakeholders and to analyse whether the perception of MOES at various levels corresponded with that of the beneficiaries – or to assess if all levels of MOES are in agreement.

The preliminary findings were presented in a three-hour debriefing meeting to stakeholders in Bishkek. The aim was to correct misunderstandings, have feed-back on cause-effect explanations and have input to proposed changes or amendments. The presentation was well understood and widely acknowledged.

The meeting had representatives from key stakeholders, inclusive of MOES, who were active in discussion of findings and recommendations.

The commented debriefing paper, notes and documents received from UNICEF formed the basis for the report writing. UNICEF and MOES gave comments, which were incorporated.

### 4.3 CONSTRAINTS

The consultant faced some constraints, which in different ways affected the data collection, control and thereby the quality of the report.

**Time constraints:** As mentioned severally the five days for field visits was limited, although sufficient for gaining a detailed picture of a wide range of implemented activities and impact of the same. But it was not enough time to also make data control on the spot through additional or complementary visits, familiarise with other projects under the One Year Education Strategy to assess complementarity of the three initiatives, interview school drop-outs to know the gap in security or education provision

---

25 The word “effect” was used instead of “impact”, the meaning of which might not be understood by all participants.

26 The meeting was based on a debriefing note, which was presented with elaborate explanations.
or visit stakeholders, who came to prove relevant during the five-day data collection. Ideally it should have been previewed by the Cluster or requesting organisation that there was a need for more extensive data collection, especially a desire to have solidly validated and comprehensive inputs for CP 2012-2016. Two weeks would in that case have been more appropriate and three weeks would have allowed for individual meetings with each implementing NGO, for thorough interviews with other UNICEF supported projects under the same education strategy and for data check on the spot. Such more comprehensive data collection would have presupposed that documents for the two complementing projects under the one-year strategy should have been provided in advance to help the consultant understand the full context and plan a more comprehensive, in-depth evaluation.

**UNICEF Documentation:** The project provided detailed information about deliverables against activity targets in TORs\textsuperscript{27}. and two reports: Consolidated report from Education Partners covering activities August-September, 2010 and Laetitia Lemaistre’s report on her work. The evaluation did not find: (i) results matrix - or logical framework - with baselines and clear indication of which partner provides which inputs to defined outputs; (ii) existence of outcomes and results/impact for each objective; (iii) SMART indicators with source of verification; (iv) indications of how the One Year Education Strategy delivers to UNDAF (v) a work plan detailing order of and timeframe for each activity; (vi) schedule for monitoring and evaluation, and (vii) there was no standard monitoring reports describing constraints, explaining changes in approach or lack of under-delivery in a structured and uniform way. This in combination with the timeframe made evaluation of the implementation process and management of the same be based on indirect facts from deliverables, documents, individual staff and elsewhere. Alternatively a serial of in-depth interviews based on corporate memory should have. Still it would not have provided accurate data.

**MOES documentation:** The ministry did not have a monitoring system in place, which could provide relevant ante and post-conflict data. As a consequence available figures were found in rapid assessment papers, which is a one-time exercise without historical context. Further, there is presently no gender disaggregated data neither centrally, nor at the schools, which can only provide details of enrolment. However, records from individual schools cannot provide a picture of the overall situation. Conclusions were based on visits to four schools, the number of which were extended with the aim to have as solid data as possible for a reasonable documentation and specification of impact. MOES is in the process of developing a gender and otherwise data disaggregated monitoring system (EMIS) and procedures for the same.

**Ethics in data collection:** In Osh people across ages and social status are still substantially affected by the crisis both psychologically and socially fearing of a new outbreak of unrest. Parents often cried during the discussions when recalling what had happened. The team consisting of consultant and translator gave them time to compose themselves before continuing. Apart from one grand-mother the respondents seemed not to mind showing their feelings in a gathering of people in the same situation. The reactions put the consultant in a dilemma with regard to ethics. Obviously data collection in such an environment is sensitive. It should be noted that no data collection method can avoid peeling the layer of “oblivion”, or rather “remove” repression of feelings, when asking beneficiaries to consider relevance and impact of given interventions. This is, though, the only way to know which activities should be replicated and which to develop to suit transition and stability purposes – or CP 2012-2016. As they had realised an

\textsuperscript{27} TORs in annex 1
immense need for continued activities they accepted that their experiences and recommendations were critical. Donor agencies should seriously consider the fragility of the environment they want to have evaluated and consider compromising on amount, depth and type of data in such situations. It is overall helpful to have corporate guidelines for evaluations. But intensive, in-depth data collection can have considerably adverse effects in projects, which intend to build recovery and social cohesion.

4.4 ORGANISATION OF THE REPORT

This report starts with an Executive Summary providing an overall picture of the project context, project background, purpose, objective and key questions in the evaluation. Chapter 1 describes the national context of the project with the aim to have a picture of the Kyrgyz limitations, but also potential for development. This puts a perspective of the potential Kyrgyz Republic’s (KR) potential to engage in e.g. improved governmental management (EMIS) and curriculum development (PE) in MOES. Chapter 2 describes the project – its background, goals, objective and targets with some details on the strategy. Chapter 3 describes respectively the purpose and objective of the evaluation, while Chapter 4 presents the methods used, the different groups of respondents and constraints. It also discusses concerns over constraints. Chapter 5 presents the findings which are concluded in an analysis of relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact, sustainability and ethics. Chapter 6 extracts lessons learned, while Chapter 7 extracts overall conclusions on findings and lessons learned, which have recommendations in Chapter 8.
5. KEY FINDINGS

This chapter analyses findings against each of the five objectives given in TORs. The findings for each objective is, at the end of this chapter, followed by cross-cutting and interrelated conclusions on relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, impact, sustainability and ethics of the WTS Initiative. The five objectives are interrelated, wherefore it is difficult to conclude on effect of a single objective. At the time of implementation none of the objectives would have had the high degree of deliverables and impact without adequate deliverables of the other four objectives. For conclusion and recommendation purposes deliverables to each objective is described and analysed in the following.

5.1 ENSURING THE RETURN TO SCHOOL OF ALL CHILDREN AND ADOLESCENTS AFFECTED BY THE JUNE VIOLENCE AND ADVANCE EQUITY OF ACCESS TO QUALITY BASIC EDUCATION, ESPECIALLY FOR THOSE MOST MARGINALIZED

5.1.1 Child-friendly preschool spaces
Fifteen child friendly places were opened with UNICEF support. These places created examples of a conducive pre-school environment to other schools and preschool education institutions by supplying adequate (in number, language, updating and motivation) learning materials.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TARGET</th>
<th>DELIVERABLES</th>
<th>IMPACT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Establish preschool child friendly spaces in 15 schools</td>
<td>10 spaces were established in Jalal-Abad and 5 in Osh. Respectively 609 and 203 children benefited from the classes 467 parents learnt about ECD and were involved in maintenance of the spaces</td>
<td>Children had a highly needed space for learning and playing and thus forgetting – for a while - the continued tense situation at home and in the community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Train teachers on early childhood</td>
<td>31 teachers from Jalal-Abad and 21 teachers from Osh trained in working with ECD and parents</td>
<td>As above Children in preschool proved to be faster at learning in 1st class than students, who had not attended preschool</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The preschool activities were received very positively across all levels of stakeholders. The need for a daily moratorium for both children and adults was obvious when talking with teachers and parents, who are still psychologically affected by the June, 2010 unrest. They reacted with anger or tears when discussing the effect and emphasised on the necessity of UNICEF post-crisis activities. In one of the schools a sudden sound made the children start crying.

In some schools the number of classes, that were opened, did not cover the factual need. Consequently the teachers had difficulties this year handling the difference in school readiness in 1st. class between pre-school students and newcomers, which caused a motivational set-back among the newcomers. This is likely to influence their learning.
Conclusion:
The need for professional pre-schooling shows in the impact. It is specifically relevant for traumatised settings. But the recorded difference in learning readiness in class 1 between pre-school students and fresh students in rampant and leaves the untrained teachers in a dilemma of letting part of a class fall behind. This is contrary to the intention of equal opportunity, non-discrimination and well-being. When all children started in 1st class none of these principles were compromised.

5.1.2 Temporary learning space and school rehabilitation
The work included light rehabilitation of old or alternative schools, supply of electricity, latrines, heating system and canteen service. The schools were equipped with furniture and learning materials

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TARGET</th>
<th>DELIVERABLES</th>
<th>IMPACT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Establishing temporary schools for 2,000 students</td>
<td>Assisted the following schools: Hamza School with 250 students: Community owned small building (tea café) was repaired, permanent WASH facilities and core-package for 250 pupils. In order to gain and official status and get teacher salaries and other current expenses covered by government, the school became a filial of Lenin school (an Uzbek school). Tolstoy school with 650 students: Temporarily school tents were set up to start the school year on Sept 1. Another half-empty school was rehabilitated with basic facilities to accommodate the students for the winter. Standard WASH facilities and canteen were provided together with a core-package of materials. Opened preschool for 52 Students Barack school: Returned 150 students and provided with the core-package. Total students assisted: 1,050 students 45 affected schools were given $900 grant for rehabilitation carried out by the community</td>
<td>The students were given an opportunity for continued learning, which also had a psycho-social effect providing the children with a break from the home community and household problems and made them have a certain level of normalcy.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 – deliverables to temporary learning space and rehabilitation

In total 1,050 children out of the targeted 2,000 children were assisted.
Hamza school was totally destroyed and students from this school were distributed among eight other schools, which were among the ones receiving UNICEF support. A monitoring team reports that 106 students out of the 300 transferred students were not attending school after the transfer.

The new Tolstoy school was planned to be a three storey building to accommodate the around 700 students and teachers. However, orders were given to make a two storey building only. As it is expected that there will be a growth in number of students the Committee for Reconstruction and Rehabilitation for Osh and Jalal-Abad continues with construction of a three storey building, which will require approval of MOES to be endorsed.

NGO partners carried out small school repairs in 45 affected schools in collaboration with local youth to act as an incentive for children and youth to return to school.

As mentioned in the table all temporary schools were equipped with a core package of teaching and learning materials, including complete sets of classroom furniture, school-in-a-box kits, early childhood development kit, math and science teaching kits and recreation kits. Besides, UNICEF organized 24 school buses have been operating in Osh partly paid by UNICEF, partly by the local government and another 9 school and pre-school buses to deliver to/from schools children of Tolstoy school and implemented peace building programs among students and teachers of two schools for better cohabitation.

Provision of various kits to make the worst affected schools operational was comprehensive:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TARGET</th>
<th>DELIVERABLES</th>
<th>IMPACT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Provide the Temporary Learning Space and 277 of the most affected schools with: learning materials (School in a Box) and sports equipment (Recreation Kit). New Math and Science Kits to be piloted in the Temporary Learning Space</td>
<td>The following was delivered: 338 School in a box kits and 268 recreational kits reaching 156,106 students 50 math kits and 50 science kits to 9 schools benefiting 7,500 students 285 primary and 375 secondary school furniture sets, 77 blackboards, 94 teacher’s desks benefiting 9 schools in Osh (7,500 students) 527 tables with 1404 chairs to kindergartens, preschools and hospitals in Batken, Jalal-Abad and Osh provinces for 11,347 children 226 ECD kits to Batken, Jalal-Abad and Osh provinces (11,300 students) 2 boarding schools for blind children were supported</td>
<td>As learning materials are generally scarce or lacking, the access to exiting materials have made both teachers and students have a lot of motivation for the learning. Positive moments help creating a manageable balance between good and bad in daily life</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 4 – Provision of kits

The provision of materials was timely and extensive.

---

Situation Analysis of Education Situation in Southern Kyrgyzstan
With regard to learning materials MOES had removed a significant amount of materials in Uzbek language\textsuperscript{29}, which made parents fear that their children would lose their native language. In 3\textsuperscript{rd} International School, which had recently established both Kyrgyz and Uzbek classes making children have mixed friendships, the parents suggested that Kyrgyz could be introduced in all class 1 to have a gradual introduction of Kyrgyz for all as the learning language.

MOES is generally in under-supply with relevant learning materials in Kyrgyz language, which makes the immediate forced use of Kyrgyz learning materials and removal of materials in Uzbek language unfortunate for the entire learning situation. However, this made the supported, and affected, schools have a comparative advantage despite being affected by other problems. The learning materials were praised by teachers and students as being very interesting and motivating. They found that the materials had contributed significantly to the positive perception of coming back to school despite other insecurity factors.

MOES is aware of the general problem with learning materials and is working at it. Especially Maths and Science materials are outdated and need thorough revision.

In addition, UNICEF is discussing with MOES how drop-outs can re-enter the education system.

A database with details of 164 vulnerable children with disabilities was given to Handicap International for further support. 235 children with various learning and social disabilities were provided with additional psychological assistance from the schools and an Help Line.

Eurasia Foundation of central Asia’s Activities and Immediate Results ensured that children with disabilities in the affected areas were able to attend school. Two schools in Osh, School #12 and #2, which have children with disabilities from different ethnic backgrounds, were paid special attention. The assistance included upgrading of facilities and education of Inclusive education specialists and consultations with parents.

The youth was not visible in this Initiative. Statistics indicate that a part turned to vocational training. The FGDs with students informed that there is an immense and immediately need for training in English and Russian, computer science, sports and relevant technical training. This is overall in accordance with other UNICEF activities establishing youth clubs. The students also confirmed that engagement of youth would act as conflict prevention, as it is often idle youth being paid for engagement in conflict relates activities such as burning house, mopping people, throwing stones etc.

MOES played a very active role and strongly supported UNICEF efforts to create a return to school for children in the affected areas.

To have the process organised and started in time, MOES facilitated, wherever possible, return of teachers to their work places and provided support to those teachers who lost their houses.

Besides, the teaching practice for 5\textsuperscript{th} year students was postponed at the order of the MOES, since most schools did not have vacancies. All subjects were taught upon return to school.

Conclusion:
The deliverables under objective 1 were close to complete apart from the outreach under “Temporary learning spaces”, which was close to half of what was planned.

\textsuperscript{29} UNICEF: Situation analysis of Education in Southern Kyrgyzstan, 2011
Although youth attended the supported schools, there seems to have been few activities addressing the needs and situation of the youth in the affected areas.

The stated impact shows that the normalcy and welcoming environment creates happy hours in school. This helps the affected target groups generate energy for other purposes, e.g. psychological and social healing. Thus deliverables under this objective had the intended effect. Success under objective 4 and 5 depends on this energy, but are also essential for the general feeling of normalcy arising from safety.

5.2 PROVIDING PSYCHOSOCIAL SUPPORT TO CHILDREN AFFECTED BY THE JUNE VIOLENCE IN JALAL-ABAD OBLAST AND OSH CITY

UNICEF provided psycho-social training for school administrators and social pedagogues in Osh Oblast drawing on the model developed USAID/QLP in partnership with MOES. This complemented similar USAID/QLP activities in Jalal-Abad Oblast. In addition Foundation for Education Initiative Support (FEIS) and ACTED carried out the remaining training as indicated below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TARGET</th>
<th>DELIVERABLES</th>
<th>IMPACT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Partner with the Regional Teacher Training Institute to implement a psycho-social training for Administrators from all 585 schools in Osh Oblast, to help mitigate the psychological impact on school-children and facilitate the return to normalcy. Coordinate with QLP, overseeing the training in Jalal-Abad, and OSI, conducting a similar training for teachers</td>
<td>2925 school team members from all 585 schools in Osh Oblast trained Each team developed plan for working with children in post-crisis situation. Each provided with $250 grant for implementation</td>
<td>The training has helped the trained adults and assisted children in handling their trauma and fear enabling them resume a seemingly normal life. Consequently they manage to push on despite continued challenges</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 5 – Deliverables to psycho-social support

A considerable number of parents and teachers are still severely traumatised. Discussion of sensitive issues concerning their safety make parents (and teachers) react promptly by raising their voice, using gestures, become very talkative or crying. Their trauma is evident.

The main feeling among the target population is extensive humiliation when being harassed during shopping, having Uzbek schools closed or given Kyrgyz names and having Uzbek learning materials withdrawn, all of which is adverse to ongoing peace building and conflict resolution activities. Integration will face problems when the parties have not yet overcome the fear and the anger after the 2010 unrest and one party feels culturally "eradicated" through change of school names, forced learning of Kyrgyz etc.

The two groups of parents contributing to this evaluation confirmed – in words and behaviour - that they are very fearful of the future. They suggested a gradual and well-planned integration which respects the interests and needs of both parties. The community around 3rd International School has been mixed for decades. Therefore nobody knew who caused the violence, and the opinion is that the residing ethnic groups would never hurt each other. In fact they helped and supported each other across ethnicity during the unrest. This uncertainty of who instigated the violence

30 Consisting of school administration, social workers, parents and local government representatives
contributes to the fear. People were also fearful of the reactions after the upcoming General Elections.

Despite full and extensive delivery of psycho-social support across a wide group of affected people, 2,925 in total, parents are still fearful, which negatively affects the sense of safety of the children as well. Fearful parents do not provide the required stable and constructive support of their children.

One reason for the continued fear is the interventions from the government, which are counterproductive for stability, integration and the general perception of safety. Another reason is the uncertainty about who really cause the conflict.

5.3 PROMOTING SAFE AND TOLERANT SCHOOLS, PRESCHOOLS AND COMMUNITIES THROUGH PEACE EDUCATION

Two levels of Peace Education were planned for: One which was immediate addressing wider community representatives in securing safe education and another, long-term plan to make Peace Education part of the curriculum in classes. The first one aimed at reconciliation and social cohesion and had the following outreach and impact:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TARGET</th>
<th>DELIVERABLES</th>
<th>IMPACT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Secure technical support to develop Peace Education lesson plans for the MOES’ “Month of Peace and Harmony” and support printing and distribution of Peace Education Teacher Guides and Lessons in Russian, Uzbek and Kyrgyz languages for all teachers in the country (72,000).</td>
<td>PE materials were developed in three languages and distributed to all schools covering almost all of the country schools and reaching 72,000 teachers. An assessment(^3) showed that PE lessons planned were not distributed to all school – and when distributed it was not always in the right language. Further, the plans did not have guidelines which made correct and uniform use render difficult. The recommended group work was often left out and lecture-based approach used instead. Communities of these schools were mobilized to organise escort groups for their children en route to/from schools.</td>
<td>Teacher using the lessons plans during the first month felt mainstreaming into the national curriculum would be beneficial to schools and communities. There were attempts to cohabit peacefully. In some places children interact without problems, while others are still strongly suspicious of each other. Peace is upheld, but the FGDs showed that ethnic mopping of students and old grand-mothers in streets and at markets is extensive.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 6 – Deliverables to Peace Education

The conceptual justification for lesson methodology was prepared at the request of the Ministry. On the whole, the process was carefully worked through for better cohabitation. Teachers were provided with lesson plans based on the INEE Peace Education Programme.

The teachers difficulties in understanding and applying the PE lesson materials as recommended confirm the need for methodological training of experienced teachers. Diversification of methods will ensure that a wider group of students will stay attentive and implicitly learn more.

\(^3\) Laetitia Lemaistre: Assessment of Peace Education Lesson Plans UNICEF  2010
At another level MOES plans to introduce peace education in all classes as part of the ordinary curriculum with the aim to contribute to preparedness and conflict prevention. MOES was in the process of arranging for curriculum development at the time of this evaluation. It will built on lessons learned from the WTS evaluation and from countries, which do already have curriculum for PE. MOES intends to establish a work group, which will go through the materials and develop guidelines for full development of such curriculum.

About 85,500 students, 2100 teachers, 45 Parents Teachers Associations and 222 school administrators from 111 most affected schools participated in various community and NGO-led activities that contributed to safety of children in schools and en route to schools. They were provided trainings on conflict mitigation, peace and tolerance in and around schools.

Objective 3 was meant as conflict prevention and recovery tool through building of social cohesion. The PE was well received across all stakeholders, but need continuity to create more than a momentary positive attitude. The ethnic mopping is a showcase of that the long-lasting negative attitude towards other ethnic communities is generally not changed despite engagement in cross-ethnic activities and practical measures to have peace and safety.

FGDs also informed that there are still children, who are not included in the measures. The continued fear demonstrated in the FGDs across validate that the feeling of peace and safety is far from restored.

### 5.4 BUILDING THE CAPACITY AND PREPAREDNESS OF SCHOOLS AND PRESCHOOLS TO RESPOND TO EMERGENCIES

Part of emergency interventions is to create a foundation for transition into development through building of community preparedness and conflict prevention measures. Activities included:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TARGET</th>
<th>DELIVERABLES</th>
<th>IMPACT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Support and engage local partners to mobilise communities in securing safe transit to school, and to promote security and tolerance in 111 of the most affected schools.</td>
<td>About 85,000 students, 2,100 teachers, 45 Parent teacher Associations and 222 school administrators from 111 most affected school participated in NGO led safety activities. They were provided with training in conflict mitigation, peace and tolerance in and around schools. Each school team developed for their own schools an action plan on how to work with children in post-crisis situations and create enabling for learning environment in schools after the emergency. Small $250 school grants were distributed in March 2011 to all 585 schools for implementation of their own action plans.</td>
<td>Without safe transportation children would not have returned to school. School enrolment was around 70% the first days, but increased to 98% within the first week of the academic year</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 7 – Building capacity of schools and pre-school to respond to emergencies

Apart from the documented positive impact on attendance rate making children return to school the massive inclusion of local NGOs and community members in taking
responsibility for children’s safety and peace building measures implicitly strengthens the feeling of working together.

Recently 134 emergency focal points (three from each of 58 districts and towns) comprising of state administration staff, district education department staff and district emergency department staff were trained on emergency preparedness based on INEE minimum standards for Education.

Moreover, UNICEF upon the request from INEE and supported by SC, translated and edited the recent version of INEE MS into Russian and Kyrgyz. There are plans to carry out a training of about 30 Cluster members and key MOES and Ministry of Emergency staff in the near future.

The recent activity is a next step establishing permanent local structures in terms of focal points. This takes the emergency interventions into a stage of preparedness, which goes beyond the advocacy and knowledge level. The initiative, having tools and structures, is a precondition for feeling safer.

5.5 COORDINATING HUMANITARIAN RESPONSE FOR EDUCATION AND ENSURE THAT CROSS-CUTTING LINKAGES ARE ESTABLISHED WITH CHILD PROTECTION AND WASH CLUSTERS TO STRENGTHEN JOINT RESULTS, REDUCE DUPLICATIONS AND AVOID GAPS

UNICEF together with Save the Children coordinated humanitarian assistance with government counterparts, NGOs and education cluster partners. The Education Cluster was activated in April 2010. It had about 30 national meetings in Bishkek and about 25 sub-national meetings in Osh city. The Government participated very active in the work.

Results of the coordination appears in the findings under the preceding objectives. Some examples: MOES distribution of PE lessons plans to 72,000 teachers; Hamza and New Tolstoy Schools were provided with WASH; two boarding schools for children with disabilities were widely supported under the Child Protection project, while NGOs contributed with locally based initiatives such as training, secure school-going etc.

Without available indicators for effective coordination, the conclusion is based on the findings of timely and overall full delivery to the objectives, which with the very wide and diverse scope of partners certainly requires effective coordination. Further the evaluation recorded no duplications, but complementary activities in the line of WASH and child protection activities accounted for under chapter 5.1.1, 5.1.2. 5.2, 5.3 and 5.4.

5.6 MEDIA CAMPAIGN

The objective of the media campaign was to provide communication and social mobilisation support to WTS Initiative through development, production and dissemination of communication materials and activities encouraging children, parents and communities to attend the schools with focus on the hard-to-reach and migrant settlements.

The overarching message was “Together to School”, which was reflected in banners, posters, TV spots and other media. The messages were:

- In school we learn together
- In school we make friends together
- In school we learn respect each other
In school we grow together
Together to school

The messages were delivered through a wide range of activities:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TARGET</th>
<th>DELIVERABLES</th>
<th>IMPACT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Coordinate with the Education Cluster to develop “Together to School” logo, print materials and TV spots to spread WTS messages at national- and local-levels. Mobilize international, national, and local media to expand coverage of WTS Activities</td>
<td>A diverse dissemination of information took place among others production of 20,000 posters, 2,000 banners, 100,000 leaflets – all emphasising on importance of education of children. In addition there was work with local journalists training them in preparing capturing newspaper articles and TV&amp;radio spots</td>
<td>State Ministry of Education stated that without WTS media interventions children would not have returned to school as there were other parallel official messages circulating asking parents to keep children at home.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 8 – Deliverables to Media Campaign

UNICEF involved own department of communication in a media campaign “Together to School”, which cuts across all of the preceding objectives. The campaign contributed with various initiatives across the five phases of crisis from media encouragement to parents to send children to school as response to the emergency, while developing other materials for training in schools (recovery, social cohesions resulting in risk reduction).

The immediate impact of the campaign in combination with safe transport to school was that parents decided to send their children to school. The messages do overall target social cohesion, the foundation for peace subsequent transition.

5.7 HUMAN RIGHTS, GENDER AND EQUITY


The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989) is based on four core principles: Non-discrimination; the best interests of the child; the right to life, survival and development of the child to the maximum extent.

This includes concerns related to gender, more specifically the girl child’s right and access to maximum development.

Although never mentioning gender concerns in the WTS part of Kyrgyz – One Year Education strategy paper, the WTS Initiative strategy built on these conventions and the core principles in design and implementation by addressing the education needs of the most vulnerable children in the two worst affected provinces: Osh and Jalal-Abad. The Initiative included children with disabilities and pre-school children – the latter having been exposed to gradual governmental cuts in pre-school opportunities in the previous years.
The Initiative further included activities directed at youth, which are not accounted for in the available materials.

The WTS Initiative included both Kyrgyz and Uzbek children and families trying to act as peace builder between the two communities. Further, a wide representation from the community in terms of Head Teachers, teachers, social workers, local government administration, parents, youth and ordinary community members were given PE, trained as peer educators or guards escorting children to school etc. In total 558 schools were given grants for own peace building activities, which in many cases went to much praised cultural days. Virtually each and every community was given an opportunity to take actions helping in recovery, and in being better prepared to discover causes of conflict with the aim to be better prepared. Transition is yet to come.

With a view to assess how the Initiative delivered to the core principles of children’s rights the following give some examples:

Representatives from all levels of the communities and cross ethnicity and gender were given responsibility for a safer future. There was thus no discrimination, although there were no girl specific initiatives.

The slightly more stable environment in combination with access to school and meaningful learning are all in the best interest of the child, core principle 2. The wider conflict prevention measures in terms of PE and access to school for all helped in community healing, while the psycho-social treatment helped individuals start recovering psychologically from the unrest. The Initiative was therefore fully in line with core principle three and four.

With regard to gender it was only possible to have details in two of the schools, as the Principals had not been asked to prepare statistics. In the one school boys and girls were close to being equally represented. In the other girl enrolment were around 10% overrepresented in the higher classes. Statistics from MOES as of December 2010 showed that approximately 46% of the students are girls. As walking to school was not safe for all children despite various interventions, the slightly lower figure for girls can be a reflection of such conditions. One of the FGD parents informed that her adolescent girl was not being sent to school out of fear of what can happen. When asked to explain what could happen, she started crying and never explained.

Overall the WTS Initiative contributed significantly towards “Assuring every child a quality education that respects and promotes her or his right to dignity and optimum development” which is the goal of The United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child. The Initiative was thus implemented applying a rights-based approach.

5.8 RELEVANCE, EFFICIENCY, EFFECTIVENESS, SUSTAINABILITY, AND IMPACT ON THE TARGET POPULATION

5.8.1 Relevance of Initiative

The relevance of the WTS Initiative is assessed against (i) coherence with national education policy, (ii) coherence with actual situation and (iii) mainstreaming of WTS activities into CP 2012-2016.

The national policy to use for assessment of relevance is the Education Development Strategy (EDS 2020) for 2012-2020, which overall builds on the principles of Human Rights and Children’s Rights conventions. The strategy has been under development since 2008 and thereby shows the Kyrgyz government’s direction in education already
during the WTS Initiative. The last part of WTS will be implemented under strategy 2012-2020, so will CP 2012-2016.

Implementation of EDS in 2020 will provide an educational system which prepares citizens to:

- Have strong communication skills;
- Be able to act independently, openly express their views; use creative and innovative approaches;
- Respect cultural, ethnic and political diversity;
- Handle general and specialized knowledge and skills that will allow them to be successful in life and labour market.

It is envisaged that the educational system in 2020 will be the main tool for promoting Kyrgyzstan's social and political development and will ensure its competitiveness in regional and international processes. The EDS 2020 further states: Regarding the development of inclusive education, according to the data at the end of 2010, 10356 children with special needs were covered by general educational programs, among them more than 3670 children of school- and 2243 of preschool-age are covered by inclusive education programs in 635 comprehensive schools; 2,425 children study in 15 specialized boarding schools; 482 children in 4 specialised comprehensive schools; and 1536 children are educated in 14 specialised kindergartens for children with special needs of health.

The WTS Initiative is in keeping with EDS 2020 priorities and the intention to have inclusive education. It will, though, require considerable efforts and support to have an inclusive education framework for the WTS Initiative to withdraw and leave activities to MOES.

Another two actual issues relate directly to the discussions in the evaluation of WTS, namely:

- Preservation of cultural and linguistic diversity and tolerance in multilingual educational environment.

As it appears the design and activities of the WTS Initiative respecting and assisting all ethnic groups with learning materials in their respective languages was fully in accordance with other Kyrgyz Republic (KR) initiatives and plans.

With regard to gender the EDS 2020 finds that:

- It is necessary to revise the National Action Plan on gender equality achievement for harmonization of measures and monitoring indicators with sectoral and territorial development strategies.

32 2nd draft, ED 2012-2012
Implementation of the comprehensive gender approach demands strengthening of the national institutional framework capacity for achievement of gender equality. In order to ensure concerted efforts of state bodies and civil society as well as identification of the gender policy priority directions, it is necessary to continue further strengthening and improvement of the overall performance of the National Council for Women’s Affairs, Family and Gender Development under the President of the Kyrgyz Republic.

The intentions of the KR are in accordance with the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (1989) and other rights conventions. As it appears, the WTS Initiative with its human rights-based approach reflects parallel and similar KR activities and intentions. Hence, the initiative is politically relevant.

With regard to the relevance for the actual situation in June 2010, the rapid assessment provides details, which were presented in chapter 2.

The WTS Initiative response to destruction of homes and schools, loss of income, loss of loved ones, and the looming suspicion and hatred consisted of both response, recovery, preparedness, and risk reduction activities, all of which are accounted for in chapter 5.1-5.4. There was no step into transition at the time of the evaluation, which may also be premature, taking the continued tension and vulnerability of the people into consideration. Transition requires energy, aspirations, and a safe and organised platform to operate from to succeed. None of these components existed in the two provinces at the time of the evaluation.

It is concluded that the design and timeliness of the Initiative was highly relevant and can only be commended.

For mainstreaming of WTS activities into CP 2012-2016, it is pivotal to be realistic about the environment, in which parts of the 2012-2016 CP will operate. As findings and conclusions in chapter 5.1-5.6 document the major need for continued and extended efforts in recovery, preparedness, and conflict prevention, it is relevant to mainstream WTS activities into CP 2012-2016. Furthermore, the close link to EDS 2020 will help facilitating national ownership.

5.8.2 Effectiveness
The analysis of effectiveness discusses to what extent the WTS Initiative delivered as planned.

The Initiative had no results matrix, but a list of activities with targets, which were used for evaluation of deliverables. The deliverables were based on records from implementing partners and concerned deliverables against activities only, which equals outputs. The lack of results matrix means that there were no defined outcomes or results/impact. The outputs are accounted for in monitoring papers, not reports. The papers are not dated, which makes it difficult to be fully sure of when certain achievements were made.

In addition, lack of records in MOES of gender disaggregated data for enrolment, attendance, drop-out rate together with reasons and subsequent occupation makes it impossible to get a verifiable picture of present net enrolment rate against the rate before the unrest. Conclusions on effectiveness are therefore based on available figures and opinions in the FGDs.

33 Key conventions referred to in chapter 2
Arrangements around the Education Cluster took time and delayed launching of the work. Disputes between UNICEF and SC over design of rapid assessment also delayed the start of the work. An MOU was signed to avoid similar delaying differences in perception. The rapid assessment was carried out by UNICEF and came to form the basis for the work.

Despite this initial confusion the WTS Initiative managed to make children return to school within the first week of the school year as intended. The engagement with a wide scope of partners and engagement of beneficiaries in major parts of the implementation made it possible to run many parallel activities, which made the Initiative have considerable achievements already by end 2010.

The Initiative meant to cover all affected children. Results show that there is an almost complete delivery on activities concerning pre-school and primary school children, while initiatives and results for youth do not figure anywhere. One monitoring report informs that around 3,000 students in Osh did not continue to 10th grade in 2010, but chose vocational training. The reasons for drop-out were not captured in the evaluation, as time constraints limited the work to focus on major activities and deliverables.

Some statistics helped in assessing to what extent the initiative managed to make children return to school. By end 2010 Osh had a reduction in enrolment from 51,426 to 44,813— or a reduction of 12%, while Karusu had recorded a reduction from 66,024 to 64,039 — or a reduction of a little more than 3%. Holding this against an estimated displacement of 400,000 people34 a reduction in enrolment should be expected. It is not possible to make an exact calculation of how this had affected the enrolment rate as some people may have fled to find occupation and left the grand-mother or other caregivers behind, while other adults may have sent part of their family to relatives elsewhere, while staying behind to reconstruct their homes.

The outreach was as planned apart from “Temporary learning spaces”, where only 1,050 students out of the targeted 2,000 students were reached.

Taking into account the major migration and the fact that some children were not included in safe transport to school35 it must be concluded that the WTS Initiative overall delivered timely and against targets and thereby effectively.

5.8.3 Efficiency
As mentioned in the preceding chapter and elsewhere there were no work plan with attached budget for the WTS Initiative.

Records were kept as required at all levels and regular “deliverables against expenditures” reporting from NGOs enabled UNICEF as lead agency to keep close record of whether funding was spent accordingly. The reporting was made with relative short intervals and when given activities were completed. Being an emergency Initiative no activities had a long duration.

The absence of results matrix showing which partner delivers what, the outreach, timing and budget together with indicators simplifying management and control. The lack of the same therefore must have resulted in necessary consumption of resources. In this case it never affected the accountability with regard to deliverables against targets or the financial control.

34 Communication strategy note, “Welcome to School”, Kyrgyzstan 2010. EDUCATION CLUSTER

35 FGD information
The coordinated and extensive use of MOES resources (teachers, social pedagogues, facilities), local NGOs and local people as implementers (peer educators, guards etc) made the implementation cost-effective. Further small grants to schools and communities to arrange peace building and conflict preventing activities on their own also reduced costs, as a channelling through organisations would have incurred costs for administration, transport etc.

Based on the approach, availed reports and field visits rather than an audit of the accounts, it is concluded that the design allowed for a high level of efficiency in delivery.

5.8.4 Impact
The evaluation concerned results mentioned under activities in “Kyrgyz – One Year Education Strategy”. The impact column was included when the FGDs provided examples of how the WTS Initiative had had an impact despite the short time of operation. The impact either related to their individual well-being or to the relevant opportunities provided by the Initiative.

An extract from the findings provides consolidated effect against objectives:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OBJECTIVES</th>
<th>EFFECT</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ensuring the return to school of all children and adolescents affected by the June violence and advance equity of access to quality basic education, especially for those most marginalized</td>
<td>Children had a highly needed space for learning and playing and thus forgetting – for a while - the continued tense situation at home and in the community helping in recovery Children in preschool proved to be faster at learning in 1st class than students, who had not attended preschool The students were given an opportunity for continued learning, which also had a psycho-social effect providing the children with a break from the stressful home situation. It made them have a certain level of normalcy and thus mental space for recovery The access to exiting materials had made both teachers and students develop a lot of motivation for the learning/teaching. Positive moments help creating a manageable balance between good and bad in daily life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Providing psychosocial support to children affected by the June violence in Jalal-Abad oblast and Osh oblast</td>
<td>The training has helped the trained adults and assisted children in handling their trauma and fear enabling them resume a seemingly normal life. Consequently they manage to push on despite continued challenges</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Promoting safe and tolerant schools, preschools and communities through peace education</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Building the capacity and preparedness of schools and preschools to respond to emergencies</td>
<td>Without safe transportation children would not have returned to school. School enrolment was around 70% the first days, but increased to 98% within the first week of the academic year</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

CROSS-CUTTING OBJETIVES AND ACTIVITIES

Media campaign Ministry of Education stated that without WTS media interventions children would not have returned to school as there were other parallel official messages circulating asking parents to keep
Coordinating humanitarian response for education and ensure that cross-cutting linkages are established with child protection and wash clusters to strengthen joint results, reduce duplications and avoid gaps

Table 9 – Total impact

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Extract of impact from above allows for certain grouping of impact:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The Focus Groups stated that the <strong>psycho-social</strong> counselling in combination with safety measures had provided them with a level of normalcy and implicitly a mental “better-being.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>There was clear <strong>social impact</strong> for the children, as they returned to school and interacted with other children and professional adults in a time with great need for professional care and interaction. The teachers felt the social impact, as they were able to engage professionally and make live have a meaning. In addition they met with other professionals with whom they could share general and professional concerns. Communities had a social impact as they were given opportunity to engage jointly in activities securing their future lives. This wide social impact provided a common platform across age groups, gender and social status from which communities tried to fight the paralysing trauma through focused and meaningful activities all aiming at creating a more stable situation for all.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The <strong>impact is short-range</strong> and will not last which continued provocations bear witness to. There was no recorded economical impact of the interventions, which should be an aim for continued activities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The <strong>impact is so far only at the micro-level</strong>, as governments interventions at macro-level have adverse effects according to FGD statements. The WTS Initiative has had considerable, recognised and intended effect, which also confirms the effectiveness. The effects mentioned here are not yet sustainable, as it was observed across all Focus Groups that the affected people are still extremely vulnerable.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>It is concluded that the intended effect is achieved, but that it has not yet gained root. It exists in a tense environment in which it is difficult to establish roots. The effect also shows that despite daily challenges the target groups are receptive and positive – they do want recovery and transition. Both of the above are good reasons for expecting continued work to have lasting effect.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5.8.4 Sustainability</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>By nature emergency projects are not meant to be sustainable as it will not happen until a full transition has taken place. However, impact statements shows that sustainability is possible if making activities and approach be continued and/or adjusted to fit a transition-based project.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>5.9 MANAGEMENT</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Being a UN-supported and coordinated activity there are implied requirements for applying Results-Based Management. In brief it entails that there are rigorous systems for accountability for all activities, inclusive of management.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

42
Six important principles are required for a UN organisation to contribute effectively to managing for results:

1) **Foster senior-level leadership** from all organisations with national actors playing a major lead in results-based management;

2) Promote and support a **results culture**, particularly:
   - informed demand for results information;
   - supportive country/national systems,
   - procedures and incentives;
   - a results oriented accountability regime and;
   - fostering learning and adjusting;
   - clear roles and responsibilities for RBM.

3) Build **results frameworks** with clearly defined ownership on the part of national actors at all levels, and the contribution roles of UN clearly agreed upon;

4) Measure sensibly and develop **user-friendly RBM information systems**;

5) **Use results** information for learning and managing, as well as for reporting and accountability;

6) Build an adaptive and RBM regime through regular review and updating of frameworks.

Inclusiveness and national ownership are parameters cutting across the six core principles.

The WTS Initiative made use of the following RBM core principles:

2) Promoted and supported a results culture, as basically all deliverables from the extremely wide and different scope of actors have been made;

3) Clearly defined ownership and roles of national actors and that of UN - but without a results framework;

The Initiative failed to make consequent use of RBM with regard to:

1) Foster senior leadership, which was not possible in the short time. It is the view of the consultant that development of realistic HRD plans is a high priority when responding to an emergency, as relevant training of key stakeholders, partners and UN staff helps in promoting national ownership and thus sustainability

2+3 There was no results framework providing an overview over which delivers what, the outreach and timing, which had consequences already described;

4) Development of user-friendly RBM systems take time, not less than 3-6 months. Many activities had already concluded by then, although others followed. But it would leave the lead agency with non-comparable data and therefore be partially a waste of resources;

5) Use of results for learning and management did not take place though a pre-designed mode of operations or design of systems for the same. Such arrangement takes time and is little relevant for short emergency projects in the present shape;

6) Emergency projects do not allow for time to build a project specific RBM regime. Moreover, it is mainly useful for repeated collection of same data, which is rarely the case in successful emergency projects.

---

36 United Nations Development Handbook: Results-Based Management, 2010

37 More comments in chapter 4
As a result of the above analysis and comments the consultant searched the Internet to look for RBM in emergency, but did only find some experiences with malaria, which is a long-term and repeated emergency and thus not comparable with situations of crisis or outbreak of war.
6 LESSONS LEARNED

Multiple lessons were learned from this evaluation. They concern a wide range of issues and include:

Project context:
The root-cause of the violence, namely ethnic differences, still exists and causes a stress, which has many faces among others: passivity, fear, anger and aggression. When swallowed by energy demanding emotions there is little energy left for adequate adult support of children, engagement in building normalcy and contributions towards peace building, preparedness and conflict prevention.

The long-looming conflicts seem to become a part of normalcy, as the ethnic differences – especially the use of own language – had been an issue for a long time. That is also why MOES were taking measures to withdraw all learning materials in non-Kyrgyz language and replace it with materials in Kyrgyz, as it was viewed by MOES to be the only way to secure higher level of education to immigrants.

This wish to integrate immigrants after decades of residence in Kyrgyz – and the reaction to it, were just but one example of different opinions and values. Yet not measures taken to intervene with conflict prevention activities from any party or with direct integration measures.

The evaluated initiative is a repair of people and assets after an outbreak of violence. The root-cause is still unaddressed explaining the stress of the involved populations.

The general learning situation is still hampered by the low level of teacher education, migration of teachers also during peaceful times resulting in crowded classrooms; parent desire to enrol children in mono-ethnic schools which adds to the overcrowded classrooms.

With students migrating and other changing schools, while still psychologically affected by the crisis, the education situation is demanding, as it requires teacher skills in handling trauma, diversity in knowledge level, diversity in learning ability and different social and cultural backgrounds. The inadequate teacher training does not leave teachers with a likelihood of providing education at a level, which can take the students to an international competitive level of education.

Thus access alone is not enough to secure children equal opportunities at large – or in education.

There seems to be quite a gap between intentions and practices in the approach of the Kyrgyz government. MOES’ counterproductive interventions withdrawing Uzbek learning materials without having sufficient materials in Kyrgyz language, abrupt transfer of students to shared schools teaching only in Kyrgyz, changing of names of Uzbek schools etc. neither tally with the human and children’s rights to which the government is committed, neither to the intentions in EDS 2020.

Non-confrontation of commitments seems to lead to the conclusion that they need not be adhered to.
UNICEF – Project design and management

Data collection in a vulnerable environment has some characteristics, which differ profoundly from those in ordinary settings including psychological, social, economical and cultural vulnerability. Emergency projects will generally engage with people, who have recently encountered great losses of some kind and who were, and may still are, endangered. Traditional data collection tools are not able to capture the essence of such post-conflict situations without either being scanty or causing pain to the target group. If not well prepared the evaluation can have adverse effects, when asking for in-depth information, as it requires forced memory about situations, which the respondent would prefer to forget.

Design
The different types of impact given by the Focus Group members indicate that there is need for a holistic approach in projects addressing the impact of humanitarian crises. Activities should address the entire spectre of impact not to cut off opportunities for people, who need to build new lives. Issues as physical health and a basic economy are key factors for a standard life. The desire to bring back normalcy should be reflected in the project content and approach.

Application of RBM in emergency projects: Further, it was proved that initiatives without a results matrix and RBM can deliver as planned. This should provoke some thinking around the present EBM requirements and their relevance in emergency projects – in the present design.

Better emergency preparation of government and partners is required: The delayed cluster needs assessment due to different understandings between UNICEF and SC, and MOES swift initiatives, which proved to be inadequate for emergencies show how lack of timely preparations can affect effectiveness and in cases, where actors start spending funding on inadequate activities, it will also affect the efficiency. Timely preparation of all key partners seems to be a precondition for early, streamlined and focused interventions.

Education opportunities for youth were in high demand, as quite a number does not attend school. There are different reasons for why youth does not attend school. Some do not fit intellectually or socially, for others the distance to school is far and parents fear the consequences of letting the child walk to school. Since youth is the near future of Kyrgyzstan efforts to provide them with relevant skills and knowledge is urgent. Since idle youth easily engages in socially unacceptable activities including violence against payment, it is critical to lift as many as possible out of a situation as “useless” and help them become useful for the local and wider community.

---

38 FGD statements and partly statistics showing that 160 out of 300 transferred youth never turned up in the new school

39 Concerns across all FGDs
7 CONCLUSIONS

The WTS Initiative aimed at curbing the impact of June 2010 conflict. This was meant to happen through an overall goal, which was:

- To minimize the impact of the emergency on children’s education by supporting efforts to ensure that all children have access to quality preschool and basic education

This should happen materialize through:

a) Ensuring the return to school of all children and adolescents affected by the June violence and advance equity of access to quality basic education, especially for those most marginalised
b) Providing psychosocial support to children affected by the June violence in Jalal-Abad oblast and Osh city
c) Promoting safe and tolerant schools, preschools and communities through peace education
d) Building the capacity and preparedness of schools and preschools to respond to emergencies
e) Coordinating humanitarian response for Education and ensure that cross-cutting linkages are established with Child protection and WASH clusters to strengthen joint results, reduce duplications and avoid gaps.

All the activities under the WTS had been designed and carried out in close collaboration of UNICEF and the Ministry of Education and Science (MOES), relevant national and local authorities, community members and teachers, parents and children themselves, and in consultation and coordination with other partners via Education, Protection and WASH clusters. All were also partners in the implementation.

Conclusion on the findings against the above objectives show achievements and drawback as accounted for below.

Strenghts

The analysis of findings showed that the WTS Initiative delivered to all objectives, apart from under-performance in outreach of “Temporary learning spaces” under objective 1. This proves that the design because of its content and ownership approach and despite several structural and procedural shortcomings could deliver as intended.

The Initiative had based project design and all operations on the required ethics with regard to principles for human and children’s rights conventions and gender. Gender concerns or gender specific activities were not part of the plan. The latter was never viewed in any project descriptions, but was adhered to in practise.

The combination of activities in the One Year Education Strategy and within the Initiative itself were complementary and had the desired synergy effect making the Initiative have recognised impact among stakeholders already after one year and under difficult circumstances.
The WTS Initiative proved fully relevant, overall effective and efficient with intended impact. Due to design, timeframe and the context it cannot be regarded as sustainable, but replicable if extracting a few, actually relevant activities.

The inclusion of a wide and diverse scope of implementers made the WTS Initiative deliver while creating a sense of ownership and ability.

MOES at all levels, partner agencies, NGOs and the involved community members all engaged whole-heartedly and delivered each their parts despite continued stress.

Weaknesses

The Initiative did not have rigorous RBM practices which showed in lack of results matrix, monitoring procedures and reporting formats, systematic learning from the monitoring and other lessons etc. Yet there was overall full delivery to all targets.

The lack of indicators against which to measure deliverables made it more difficult to have validation of evaluation findings and conclusions. These were mainly based on statements.

The analysis of RBM practices made is seem, as if these are not fully applicable in emergency projects.

The Education cluster was not ready and had problems in organising itself and find a common footstep which delayed implementation at a critical time.

Continued response to the pressing needs for integration and psycho-social support in school and as part of the recovery and transition into normalcy is critical for effective and meaningful learning. But is presupposes cross-sectoral collaborations, which were not part of this first one and a half year implementation. The present composition of the Education Cluster will not serve the required holistic approach to education.

Challenges

The political uncertainty in Kyrgyz resulted in continued fear during the implementation because of the upcoming Presidential election. The fear concerned both the process, with intense campaigning, and the post-election situation in case the election would not favour those who expected to win.

The political situation will for some time still affect the feeling of safety and thus affect the recovery negatively.

The brittleness of the peace shows in the extensive humiliations of members of the “other” ethnic groups. Constant humiliation generates fear, but also anger, which can result in new outbreaks of unrest.

Pre-schooling comes to have adverse effect in situations where there is no space or enough teachers to accommodate all children in pre-school classes. Upon start in 1st. class the fresh students fall behind due to lack of immediate readiness for learning and the learning environment.

Traumatised parents and teachers are often short tempered as a reaction to unforeseeable or unmanageable situations, which are in plenty in post-crisis situation. Handling of the trauma is therefore key for normalcy in the children’s life and for the children not develop fear of the parents as well, which will add to an already difficult learning situation.

Overall conclusion:
It is overall concluded that the WTS Initiative was well designed responding to criteria for rights-based approach in choice of activities, approach and timeliness. Despite shortcomings in application of RBM the Initiative overall delivered as planned. The work was well coordinated and the implementation through a wide and diverse scope of partners made activities be people-owned.
If incorporating recommendations the Initiative can continue with the one year extension primarily based on past activities with exemption of rehabilitation of schools.
Due to the challenging learning and ethnic situation in the country there is dire need for continued, extended and coordinated activities under the CP 2012-2016.
The recommendations are not given a number as they are all urgent and the proposed changes/developments should be in place within the next year of soonest thereafter. The recommendations are instead given letters only to facilitate discussions.

The following changes and interventions are strongly recommended:

**UNICEF**

a) Acute and immense need for extra-curricular education, and
b) Inclusion of youth

All levels of stakeholders expressed a strong need for youth education in Russian⁴⁰, English, Computer and Sports. When elaborating on the issue, the stakeholders found that such activities should be placed outside the school to accommodate the youth, which does not attend other types of education.

Such learning centres for youth would fit the present UNICEF youth activities having youth clubs as one of the activities. The design should, however, be considered, as also adults feel a realistic and relevant need for language and computer training. If learning English and computer skills people with limited formal education will be able to engage in online-education. It was also concluded during the discussions that parents and leaders need psycho-social counselling and peace education, as parents and not children are the ones that instigate hatred and violence using children and idle youth as front runners. The investment in the adult population will positively affect the child environment. This is fully in line with the fact that traumatised parents cannot adequately support development⁴¹ of their children

It could be considered also to offer 3-6 months skilled training. In that case youth clubs can be made sustainable through income generating activities. In the rural areas through improved agricultural productions, which also serves as skilled training in e.g. farmer/centre owned yoghurt production from the centre’s 10 cows (given as one-time donation). In urban areas skilled training in e.g. mechanics or quality repair of mobiles, other small electronic gadgets and radios can also generate income. The choice of professions should be based on a needs assessment.

With regard to sports it could be thought of from a wider angle including also in-door games e.g. chess, table tennis, pool and dart.

The centres could have psycho-social counselling in the centre, which would make it just another activity. This would make it less “sickly” to receive the required support.

If placed strategically in the community such youth or learning centres for education could also serve as peace building tool, if activities are offered to all. The overall idea is to have more centres, which compete against each other across all subjects, as it is widely recognised that people forget about ethnicity when having to put the best team in place. Moreover, if the centres are run by a committee composed of people of all ages,

---

⁴⁰ Russian was generally more acceptable to learn than Kyrgyz. But also Kyrgyz students and teachers suggested Russian as an extra-curricular subject.

⁴¹ Development includes intellectual, physical, psychological and social development
social levels and different ethnic backgrounds, they will come to know each other beyond the immediate grouping.

The centres could be used for adult activities in the morning hours leaving for the youth for the rest of the day and early evening.

The development should effectively include MOES and gradually be made part of MOES education system over a 5-10 year period.

c) RBM
The analysis of application of RBM in emergency showed that a traditional or full RBM is not necessary for full delivery and also is too time and resource consuming in some stages of tool development to be useful within a short timeframe, in this case one year. It is therefore strongly recommended that an assessment be made of the relevance and applicability of RBM in emergency projects and a slimmer and/or adjusted version be designed for emergencies if the assessment shows a need for changes. While awaiting the outcome it is strongly recommended to have at least a result matrix and rigorous, but simple monitoring systems in emergency projects.

d) Ethics in data collection
When working with traumatised people, who are in dire need of assistance but also very vulnerable, normally useful methods and level of depth in data collection do not fully apply, as the intensive and repeated questioning, discussions etc forcing people down memory lane when trying to forget or overcome the traumatic past, can have adverse effects. It could be considered to request less in-depth data and accept conclusions based on few case studies or few FGDs strategically planned. It may still serve the purpose of knowing impact and focus of continued activities if findings are validated against interviews with authorities and structured RBM-based data.

e) Planning transition
Any emergency project should be designed, where possible, with a view to continue as a development project not to lose valuable results before they have become sustainable.

Government of Kyrgyzstan/MOES

a) Integration
There are currently governmental moves to introduce Kyrgyz as the main language to all ethnicities. This is done through language training in the schools with the view to provide other ethnic groups with equal opportunities to tertiary education which is conducted in Kyrgyz and Russian languages. Presently other ethnic groups cannot study at university level.

However, discussions in focus groups and in interviews showed that this is not the time for an sudden\textsuperscript{42} integration, which for the Uzbeks is painful so short after the 2010 crisis. Successful integration presupposes that there is a genuine interest in being integrated. Integration means losing parts of your integrity and your past life in terms of language, norms and values. It also means gains, but the gains may not balance the losses exactly at this point in time. Therefore people, who suffered severe losses last year, are not psychologically and socially ready to accept further losses. Enforcement could result in more unrest. Stress is expressed as passivity, defence or aggression. The part of the population, who react with aggressiveness, will not hesitate to react with violence in case of further stress.

\textsuperscript{42} As perceived by Uzbeks, who have lived in Kyrgyzstan for decades or longer using their own language
A changing of the cultural environment of children alone making them “Kyrgyz” in language and culture will over time provide the children with a substantially different social and cultural context than that of their parents with regard to level of education, norms and values. This will either make it difficult for the young person to fully integrate with the new culture, or – if integrating – risk losing parental support, respect and love. It is most often difficult to combine the two.

It was suggested by some groups that integration should be done gradually, for example by mixing all ethnic groups and teach in Kyrgyz in the next class 1 and continue mixing coming classes. This would make families get gradually used to their children having friends from other groups and speaking another language. The gradual introduction would help parents not feel that they “lose” all children at a go to another language and culture. Such gradual school and language integration should be introduced in combination with other interventions recommended in this report.

b) Teacher training and learning materials

Education is the pillar on which all development builds. Investments here cannot avoid giving a comfortable return.

For that to work in Kyrgyzstan there is an immense and immediate need for trained teachers. The need for training includes both increased and updated knowledge of the subject taught and methodological training allowing for inclusive education. The latter is of great relevance also in classes with children without disabilities, as learning readiness and abilities are very different also within a class of so-called normal children. Just to accommodate the majority of children teachers need methodological skills applying different and directly involving methods instead of passive lecturing which only suits the more intellectual part of the children.

There could be a short-term and a long-term strategy. The short-term strategy entails to carrying out a needs assessment concerning both the need teachers per se and the gaps in skills against present (need for) enrolment. Children with disabilities do just limitedly attend school, some youth have apparently also dropped out etc. Based on the assessment there should be training established where gaps are found, maybe engaging with foreign lecturer for some years to have a rapid and effective training. The training could be given to present teacher filling gaps only – and to unemployed, well-educated people designing a one-subject (within their field of education) training together with basic pedagogical and psychological training. It could be a 4-6 months training and they could teach the lower classes, e.g. up to class 5. This would mean that pedagogical and psychological skills should concern children of this age-group.

The long-term strategy concerns design of a modern teacher education of at least 2-3 years’ duration, where teacher specialise in one or two subjects e.g. mathematics and computer skills, and is trained in these for two years together with methodological knowledge and skills based on new sociological, psychological and pedagogical practices and theories. There could be schools attached to such teacher training centres, which were only run by students and a group of lecturers to practise while learning and learn from experiences, while fine-tuning the new curriculum.

 Entirely new learning materials should be developed latest parallel to the first teacher training to ensure that relevant materials are available and known by the teachers upon their graduation.

It is assumed that re-design of the education system will include full pre-school coverage and update vocational training.
It is critical that MOES receive continued support to develop structures and update teacher education to include scientific and other modern subjects for equal and balanced development of Kyrgyzstan at large.
9. MAINSTREAMING OF WTS ACTIVITIES INTO CP 2012-2016

CP 2012-2016 context
The general tendency among all levels of stakeholders to pretend that the conflict is over and that all are ready for development, which may result in launching of inadequate development measures. Many of the affected people have far from overcome the psychological, social and logistical aftermath after the June 2010 crisis. They need to recover and re-establish an adequate life before being ready for focused development – in other words become ready for transition.

The outreach in past period has been wide with a complexity of activities to balance the emergency situation. Assuming that peace will overall prevail, the project design needs to be forward looking and thereby allow for and support a transition. Under the mentioned conditions the present design is therefore not fully relevant for CP 2012-2016. The inclusive approach, however, should continue as the shape of the future can only be decided by the people.

The following recommendations are based on conclusions made and are all meant to be implemented through or on initiative of UNICEF wherefore no other actors are mentioned. There is an obvious need to continue with assistance to traumatised people, improved learning, extra-curricular activities and PE. Some of these activities are regarded as basic activities and were presented under “Recommendations”.

It is assumed that all activities will be rights-based and be implemented applying full RBM norms and standards.

1. The CP 2012-2016 should consider a transition period of maybe one year in the affected areas allowing for (new) special post-crisis interventions in the affected areas. Such new interventions should be based on thorough need’s assessments in the affected areas. Based on prior conclusions in this report, it is expected that there will be need for considerable investments in psycho-social counselling and interventions and that support of strategic work at political level may prove a precondition for establishment of a stable situation allowing for ordinary education interventions.

The design of the new phase should link closely with the emergency phase in terms of type of interventions and target groups. For example development and distribution of interesting school materials is critical for motivation both of teachers, students and parents. Meaningful learning will help preventing early drop-outs, also when these relate to social or cultural norms. Peace education is one area, which has focus at present. But with the government’s aim to integrate, be inclusive and attractive, there may be a need to link this activity with development of future leaning materials as recommended elsewhere.

Based on the above the composition of the Education Cluster should be reviewed and have a composition reflecting the findings in the needs assessment.

2. It was noted during the evaluation that involvement of governmental institutions had been limited to providing inputs with regard to ideas and finances, while UNICEF, other agencies and NGOs took the lead as implementers. It is assumed that this was chosen due to the emergency nature of the project and the need for rapid response. It is difficult for a government during a national crisis, where systems break down, to deliver services as usual while also delivering emergency assistance.

The governmental institutions repeatedly expressed their interest in supporting future UNICEF activities, which caused some concern. There was apparently no strong sense of ownership from MOES, especially not downstream. For
sustainability purposes it is imperative that governmental institutions take the lead when past activities turn into development activities. The capacity in all partner institutions may need boosting. It is therefore recommended that a capacity needs analysis is carried out before determining details of the future collaboration and that the scope of ministries and institutions, e.g. Kyrgyzstan Bureau of Statistics, teacher training colleges, universities with education in psychology to guide design of assistance of traumatised people – maybe jointly with USAID or US universities not to cut positive experiences and existing good work.

3. With regard to continued provision of materials and equipment to schools UNICEF could support in a manner encouraging the government to take the lead. Right now the department in Osh tries to raise funds for provision of computers in schools. UNICEF could top up by adding for example and additional computer for each four they buy out of own funds. Funding could also be made in steps and conditioned by the government having delivered e.g. governmentally paid materials or services on time before release of the next funding.

The change from stopping and preventing a crisis to implementation of development activities need thorough considerations of who to address for continued peace and which support and input these target groups need to play the role as peace builders effectively for the benefit of the children

4. The extensive downstream inclusion of local governments, formal and informal authorities, staff of schools and maybe other institutions, and community members should therefore continue. It should be streamlined through formalised structures and relevant training, which could include use of international trainers or sending of key people to relevant international trainings and conferences. Such external inputs could be relevant for design of extra-curricular learning centres, design of short-term and long-term teacher training etc. But for ownership and sustainability purposes it could also be relevant to send key stakeholders for longer training abroad in e.g. inclusive methods, adult learning methods, institutional building and management, handling of and activities for traumatized people, conflict prevention etc. It could be support of MBAs to a few key stakeholders.

Building capacity is also building self-esteem, which helps overcoming trauma, as self-esteem implies that people develop realistic aspirations and hope being able to handle situations. It further add to conflict prevention, as people who feel able to deal with situations most often also have the will to share e.g. knowledge, skills or other gains. Therefore investments in human capital will help in making a transition be possible and sustainable.

Such design in combination with the proposed skilled training of youth would also deliver to broader impact considering psychological, social and economical impact at micro, meso and macro level.

5. Acknowledging that many children live a vulnerable live at home it might be relevant to secure protection of children from neglect, abuse and violence through establishment of community monitoring committees and adequate reporting facilities. The latter needs special emphasis in a post-crisis situation, where children are psychologically and socially very vulnerable, as they may have been displaced or have lost their closest care-givers.

Establishment of post-school activities e.g. scout activities and sport activities for young children aged 6-12 years and who cannot attend youth clubs, would also create a protection function.
Terms of Reference
Objective of the consultancy/services

The main objective of this consultancy is to conduct an evaluation of UNICEF Welcome to School Initiative (WTS), identify strengths, weaknesses and challenges of the implemented and on-going programmes with an intention to find out how some of the successful activities can be mainstreamed into the UNICEF 2012-2016 country programme (CP). The report will be used by UNICEF, MoES and other implementing partners who address education issues during the emergency.

1. Background

In June 2010 Ministry of Education and Science (MOES) and UNICEF have launched one year “Welcome to School” (WTS) Initiative in response to June 2010 emergency. The overall goal of the WTS Initiative was to minimize the impact of the emergency on children’s education by supporting efforts to ensure that all children have access to quality preschool and basic education through:

- ensuring the return to school of all children and adolescents affected by the June violence and advance equity of access to quality basic education, especially for those most marginalised
- providing psychosocial support to children affected by the June violence in Jalal-Abad oblast and Osh city
- promoting safe and tolerant schools, preschools and communities through peace education
- building the capacity and preparedness of schools and preschools to respond to emergencies
- coordinating humanitarian response for Education and ensure that cross-cutting linkages are established with Child protection and WASH clusters to strengthen joint results, reduce duplications and avoid gaps.

All the activities under the WTS have been designed and carried out in close collaboration of UNICEF and the Ministry of Education and Science, relevant national and local authorities, community members and teachers, parents and children themselves, and in consultation and coordination with other partners via Education, Protection and WASH clusters. Implemented activities included the following:

Establishing temporary schools: By the end of March 2011, UNICEF supported establishing temporarily learning schools for students of Hamza (250) and Tolstoy (650) schools, as well as opening of pre-school classes for 52 pre-school age children and assisted return of Barack school students (150), which are 1,050 students in total out of a targeted 2,000. The temporary schools were equipped with a core package of teaching and learning materials, including complete sets of classroom furniture, school-in-a-box kits, early childhood development kit, math and science teaching kits and recreation kits.
Tolstoy school children were transferred to another half-empty Uzbek school for winter period. UNICEF supported light rehabilitation (improvement of the school insulation, power supply and heating system as well as canteen service) of the hosting school. Besides, UNICEF had been organizing 9 school and pre-school buses to deliver to/from schools children of Tolstoy school and implemented peace building programs among students and teachers of two schools for better cohabitation.

**Distribution of supplies:** In all, UNICEF procured and distributed in time by the beginning of the school year the following school items: 338 School in a Box Kits and 268 Recreational Kits, 50 math kits and 50 science kits distributed, 285 primary and 375 secondary school furniture sets (1 desk and two chairs), 77 backboards and 94 teacher’s desks, 527 tables with 1404 chairs and 226 Early Childhood Development kits to kindergartens, preschools and hospitals in Batken, Jalal-Abad and Osh provinces.

**Community and NGO-led activities that contributed to safety of children in schools and en route to schools:**
- 24 school buses have been operating in Osh city and suburban for two and a half months to ensure safe access of children to schools.
- About 85,500 students, 2100 teachers, 45 Parents Teachers Associations and 222 school administrators from 111 most affected schools participated in various community and NGO-led activities that contributed to safety of children in schools and en route to schools. They were provided trainings on conflict mitigation, peace and tolerance in and around schools.
- 45 schools which suffered various level of damage received and used $900 small grants for school rehabilitation, where the construction and rehabilitation work had been carried jointly with the community efforts based on UNICEF requirement.
- 2925 participants of school team (consisting of school administrators, social workers, parents and local government representatives) from all 585 schools of Osh oblast had been provided psycho-social trainings and each school team developed for their own schools an action plan on how to work with children in post-crisis situations and create enabling for learning environment in schools after the emergency. Small $250 school grants were distributed in March 2011 to all 585 schools for implementation of their own action plans.
- Two boarding schools for 250 children living with disabilities such as blind children were supported to ensure access to education for the most vulnerable children.
- 10 pre-school child friendly spaces in Jalal-Abad and 5 in Osh were established, where 609 children receive preschool education in 25 classes in Jalal-Abad and 9 child-friendly preschool classes in 5 schools in Osh for 203 children. 467 parents learnt about the early childhood development programs and been involved actively in maintaining pre-school child-friendly spaces.

**Advocating for education as a contributor to reconciliation and social cohesion:**
In collaboration with the Education Cluster, UNICEF developed "Together to School" communication campaign to support the Welcome to School Initiative; this included communication messages, school posters, bus stickers, banners, brochures for parents, T-shirts and PSAs designed to welcome all children back to school and to promote education for tolerance and reconciliation. The communication campaign included national coverage as well as targeted efforts in the affected areas.

**Coordinating education emergency response through the UN Education cluster:**
As lead agency for the education cluster, UNICEF together with Save the Children coordinated humanitarian assistance with government counterparts, NGOs and education cluster partners. Education Cluster was activated in April 2010, since then it had about 30 national meetings in Bishkek and about 25 sub-national meetings in Osh.
city. The Government is participating particularly well in Education cluster. Education Cluster coordinated well the preparation of the Flash Appeals and other key documents.

Though the situation had been improved significantly during the past year however long term interventions are needed to ensure that education contributes to peace, tolerance and social cohesion. That’s why MOES on behalf of children, teachers and parents have requested to extend the Welcome to School Initiative for upcoming school year as well.

MOES and UNICEF decided to continue the WTS Initiative for upcoming school year (2011-2012), targeting the issue of safe and equitable access of children to school in Osh, Jalal-Abad and Batken provinces. However an evaluation is needed to identify existing gaps and recommend successful activities that can be mainstreamed into the new WTS initiative as well as UNICEF 2012-2016 CP.

2. **Scope of the Work**

The evaluation should address issues of project design, implementation, management, lessons learned, replicability and provide recommendations for current and future projects. The questions to be addressed in the evaluation (provided below) are organized to provide an assessment of the relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability, and impact on the target population.

**Main specifically the purpose of the evaluation is to:**

- Assess if the project has achieved its objectives and identify the challenges encountered in doing so;
- Assess the relevance of the project in the cultural, economic, and political context in the country, as well as the extent to which it is suited to the priorities and policies of the government;
- Assess the intended and unintended outcomes and impacts of the project;
- Provide lessons learned from the project design and experiences in implementation that can be applied in current or future WTS projects;
- Assess whether project activities can be deemed sustainable at the local and national level and among implementing organizations.
- Assess if the gender, the best interest of the child, human rights based approach, ethical considerations and result based management were applied during the project planning and implementation.

3. **Deliverables and timeframe**

The following deliverables are expected:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outputs/Deliverables</th>
<th>Estimated duration (per working day)</th>
<th>Deadline</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Evaluation methodology and tools developed and agreed with UNICEF staff</td>
<td>September 19-23 2 working days</td>
<td>23 September 2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Desk review of documents, studies and materials related to WTS prior to the in country mission</td>
<td>September 19-23 3 working days</td>
<td>23 September 2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In country consultancy mission comprising meetings in Bishkek and in field locations outside the capital. Meetings may include but are not limited to focus group discussions, observation and stakeholder meetings (subject to prior discussion and</td>
<td>September 26 – October 3 6 working days</td>
<td>3 October 2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prepare the report based on UNICEF Evaluation Report Standards</td>
<td>October 26-10 5 working days</td>
<td>10 October 2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td>16 working days</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A suggested outline for the report will cover the following:
- executive summary
- project background, goals, objectives, targets, and planned activities
- purpose and objectives of the report
- methodology
- key findings & conclusions; among others the analysis would include main achievements by priority areas of intervention, constraints and lessons learned
- recommendations for holistic and comprehensive action towards improving and advancing WTS practices in Kyrgyzstan as well as mainstreaming WTS activities into the 2012-2016 CP
- annexes

The total length of the report should be a minimum of 30 pages and a maximum of 40 pages, excluding annexes.

4. **Qualification/level requirements**
- Postgraduate degree in education/or social sciences, humanities;
- Minimum 10 years of practical experience in the field of education and research, educational policies and reform in the educational sector;
- Familiarity with humanitarian context, initiatives to ensure education in emergencies and post-crisis reconstruction, especially in the CEE/ CIS region.
- Previous research on/work experience in education and particularly in WTS initiative;
- Experience in work with international organizations and consultants; Knowledge of UNICEF priorities would be an asset.

5. **Reporting and supervision**
The consultant will work under the direct supervision of Alvard Poghosyan, Education/ECD Specialist and secondary supervision of Chynara Kumenova, Education Officer

6. **Duration**
The duration of the consultancy is 16 working days, September 19, 2011 to October 10, 2011

7. **Estimated costs to UNICEF**
The costs will be determined based on results of the negotiations. The proposals will be evaluated against the following criteria; relevance, efficiency, effectiveness, sustainability, and impact.

8. **Conditions:**
Interested candidates should submit their offers accompanied with the proof of experience in evaluation design and conducting relevant fieldwork activities.

UNICEF will provide the consultant with:
- Consultancy fee, mutually agreed upon daily rate for the duration of the contract
- Travel payment and DSA, as per UN guidelines while in Kyrgyzstan.
• Office space, photocopier services during in-country mission
• Transportation and translation services during in-country mission

9. **Terms of Payment:**
The consultant will be paid based on the professional qualifications of L3 level and the daily rates proposed. **USD 20,000** is allocated preliminary to cover the consultancy costs. The payment will be administered on a deliverables basis.

10. **Performance indicators**
The Consultant’s performance will be evaluated against the following criteria: timeliness, responsibility, initiative, communication, and quality of the products delivered.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source of funding/PBA reference (date of expiration of the PBA):</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>SM/2010/0572-00 (Exp. Date 31/12/11)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Note:** In all cases, consultants may only be paid their fees upon satisfactory completion of services. In such cases where payment of fees is to be made in a lump sum, this may only be payable upon completion of the services to UNICEF’s satisfaction and certification to that effect, and any advance on the lump sum may not exceed 30% of the fees. In such cases where payment of fees is to be made in installments, the final installment may **not** be less than ten per cent (10%) of the total value of the contract, and will only be payable upon completion of the services to UNICEF’s satisfaction and certification to that effect.
ANNEX 2

List of People Met
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DATE</th>
<th>INSTITUTION</th>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>JOB TITLE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>10/10</td>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>Alvard Poghosyan</td>
<td>Project Coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>Chynara Kumenova</td>
<td>Education Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>Chinargul Ozhumagulova</td>
<td>ECD Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MOES</td>
<td>Damira Kudyaybergenovna</td>
<td>Head of General Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>MOES</td>
<td>Marchenko Larisa</td>
<td>Head of Monitoring and Strategic Pl. Dept.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>Jonathan Veitch</td>
<td>UNICEF Representative Kyrgyzstan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11/10</td>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>Fatima Yandieva</td>
<td>Head of the UNICEF sub-office Osh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>Mira Lakupova</td>
<td>Education Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>Gulzoda Dzhumabaeva</td>
<td>Education Consultant</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Karasu District Educ. Dept</td>
<td>Nazarov Rahmanberdi</td>
<td>Head of Department</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Osh District Education Dept.</td>
<td>Akjolov Abdikalyk</td>
<td>Education Specialist</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Filial Lenin School</td>
<td>Adyl Turgunov</td>
<td>School Principal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Filial Lenin School</td>
<td>Mirkamilova Aliftina</td>
<td>Deputy Head Master</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Filial Lenin School</td>
<td>Karimova Nilufar</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Filial Lenin School</td>
<td>Boltabaev Gulomjen</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Filial Lenin School</td>
<td>Names withheld</td>
<td>Two &quot;parents&quot; – mother and grandmother</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12/10</td>
<td>Altybaev School</td>
<td>Muradiljon Moidunov</td>
<td>School Principal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Altybaev School</td>
<td>Kurbonova Maftuna</td>
<td>Student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Altybaev School</td>
<td>Yangibaev Hojiakbar</td>
<td>Student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Altybaev School</td>
<td>Kosymova Birjahoun</td>
<td>Student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Altybaev School</td>
<td>Sobirov Odilbek</td>
<td>Student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Altybaev School</td>
<td>Ravshanova Ferida</td>
<td>Student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Altybaev School</td>
<td>Rashid Abdullah</td>
<td>Student</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Altybaev School</td>
<td>Hakimova Mehrizamen</td>
<td>Principal Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Altybaev School</td>
<td>Kasymova Nigeva</td>
<td>Principal Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Altybaev School</td>
<td>Hosilova Hursida</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Altybaev School</td>
<td>Yusupov Shukrat</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>School</td>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Position</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Altybaev School</td>
<td>Najibullaev Sherzod</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Foundation for Tolerance</td>
<td>Dilya</td>
<td>Coordinator</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kosh Araket</td>
<td>Erkingul</td>
<td>Director</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FEIS</td>
<td>Kanybek</td>
<td>Coordinator</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CMME</td>
<td>Dildora</td>
<td>Coordinator</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ACTED</td>
<td>Zhyldyz</td>
<td>Coordinator</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Help Age</td>
<td>Asel</td>
<td>Programme Manager</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13/10</td>
<td>OHCHR</td>
<td>Coordinator</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sydyk Alaychi School</td>
<td>Altmysh Topchubaev</td>
<td>Principal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd. International School</td>
<td>Gulchechea Isarova</td>
<td>Principal</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd. International School</td>
<td>Abdurahman Dildora</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd. International School</td>
<td>Astankulova Mohinur</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd. International School</td>
<td>Mahamajaan Mavjudja</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd. International School</td>
<td>Madozimov Anarbek</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd. International School</td>
<td>Mirlan Anara</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd. International School</td>
<td>Ibrohimov Ruslan</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd. International School</td>
<td>Adanbay Aybek</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd. International School</td>
<td>Abdurahman Dildora</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd. International School</td>
<td>Astankulova Mohinur</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd. International School</td>
<td>Mahamajan Mohinur</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd. International School</td>
<td>Adanbay Uulu Aybek</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd. International School</td>
<td>Madazimov Anarbek</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd. International School</td>
<td>Mirlan Anara</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd. International School</td>
<td>Ibrohimov Ruslan</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3rd. International School</td>
<td>Names withheld</td>
<td>6 mothers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Date</th>
<th>Organization</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>14/10</td>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>Fahrad Imambakiyev</td>
<td>Communication for Development Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>Olga Grebennikova</td>
<td>Media Liaison officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FEIS</td>
<td>Aleksandr Ivanov</td>
<td>Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>FEIS</td>
<td>Tatiana Matohina</td>
<td>Educational programs Coordinator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>UNICEF</td>
<td>Jonathan Veitch</td>
<td>UNICEF Representative Kyrgyzstan</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Itinerary
### Agenda for the Visit of Ms. Birgitte Woel

**Welcome to School Consultancy Mission**

**Bishkek, Kyrgyz Republic**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>10 October</strong></td>
<td><strong>Pick up from the airport/Driver</strong></td>
<td>Hotel</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| **10 October, Monday** | 12:30 – 14:00 Lunch with Education team  
Discussion on the mission activities, review of agenda | Place tbd                       |
|               | 14:00 – 15:00 Security briefing with Jan Nadolski                        | UN House, 1st floor             |
|               | 15:30 -16:30 Meeting at the MOES, Damira Kudaybergenovna, Head of General Education Department  
Marchenko Larisa, Head of Monitoring and Strategic Planning Department | MOES building                   |
|               | 17:00-18:00 Meeting with Jonathan Veitch, UNICEF Representative  
Kyrgyzstan | UNICEF office                   |
| **11 October, Tuesday** | 8:00 – 8:40 Departure for Osh  
Meeting at UNICEF Osh Sub office  
Fatima Yandieva, Head of the sub-office; Mira Iakupova, Education Officer, Gulzoda Dzhumabaeva, Education Consultant | UNICEF Osh Zone Office          |
<p>|               | 10:00 – 11:00 Meeting with head of Karasu District Education Department – Nazarov Rahmanberdi | Karasu Education Department, Confirmed |
|               | 12:00-13:00 Lunch                                                       |                                 |
|               | 13.30 – 14.30 Meeting with Education Specialist of Osh District Education Department – Akjolov Abdikalyk | Preliminary confirmed           |
|               | 15:00 – 16:00 Meeting with School Principal Filial Lenin – Adyl Turgunov | Confirmed, in Filial Lenin       |
|               | 16:30 – 17:30 Focus group discussions in Filial Lenin School            | Confirmed, in Filial Lenin       |
| <strong>12 October, Wednesday</strong> | 09:00-09:30 Meeting with OHCHR Coordinator Renate Frech | In Office                      |
|               | 09:30-10:00 Departure to Altybaev (former Tolstoy) School                |                                 |
|               | 10:00 – 11:00 Meeting with Altybaev School Principal, Mr. Muradiljon Moidunov | Confirmed, in school building   |
|               | 11:00-13:00 Focus group discussions                                     | Confirmed, in school building   |
|               | 13:30-14:30 Lunch                                                       |                                 |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time</th>
<th>Activity</th>
<th>Location</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>15:00 –</td>
<td>Meeting with NGO representatives who implemented WTS initiatives in UNICEF</td>
<td>Confirmed with NGO representatives</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:00</td>
<td>Sub Office:</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Help Age,</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Center of Consulting Development and Interactive Teaching</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Foundation for Tolerance International</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Sinton</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Eurasia Foundation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- Kosh Araket</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- ACTED</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- CMME</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>- FEIS Representative in the south</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:00-18:00</td>
<td>Debriefing meeting with UNICEF Education staff</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>13 October, Thursday</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:00-09:30</td>
<td>Meeting with OHCHR Coordinator Renate Frech</td>
<td>In Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:30-10:30</td>
<td>Visit to Sydyk Alaychi school meeting with Principal</td>
<td>In the school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Altnyshe Topchubaev</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30 –</td>
<td>Visit to 3rd International School meeting with Principal</td>
<td>In the school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00</td>
<td>Focus group discussions</td>
<td>In the school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:30</td>
<td>Lunch</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:00 –</td>
<td>Data analyses, work on report outline</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:00</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Arrival from Osh</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>14 October, Friday</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>09:30 -10:30</td>
<td>Meeting with Communication sector on WTS</td>
<td>UN House, UNICEF office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>communication campaign</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:00-12:30</td>
<td>Meeting with Director Aleksandr Ivanov and Tatiana</td>
<td>Office of FEIS NGO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Matohina, head of FEIS NGO, major partner implementing WTS related</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>initiatives</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13:00-14:00</td>
<td>De-briefing with Jonathan Veitch, UNICEF Representative</td>
<td>UN House, UNICEF office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14:00-15:00</td>
<td>Changes in debriefing paper</td>
<td>UN House, UNICEF office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15:00 –</td>
<td>Presentation of Preliminary Findings to Education</td>
<td>UN House, UNICEF office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17:00</td>
<td>Stakeholders</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Participants will be confirmed</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>15 October, Saturday</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Departure</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Debriefing Paper
### DEBRIEFING

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PRELIMINARY FINDINGS</th>
<th>PRELIMINARY CONCLUSIONS</th>
<th>PRELIMINARY RECOMMENDATIONS</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Peace Education (PE)(^{43}) created a positive parental attitude resulting in high (almost 100%) school attendance</td>
<td>A more inclusive approach to PE is critical for school attendance and future conflict prevention</td>
<td>PE should be integrated as an extended, varied and continuous activity in school. The education should also include parents, local leaders, administrators and politicians</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psycho-social training helped teachers in handling own and child trauma. The handling of the trauma made it possible to resume education for both parties.</td>
<td>There is an immense need for education of professionals, who can help people overcome or handle their trauma</td>
<td>Training could take place at TOT and peer education addressing basic issues to have fast and wide outreach. Such peers could be headed by a psychologist, who would also handle more complex matters</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

\(^{43}\) Covers teacher and student training, friendship festival, cultural events etc
A considerable number of parents and teachers are severely traumatised. Discussion of sensitive issues concerning their safety make parents (and teachers) react promptly by raising their voice, using gestures, become very talkative, crying and requesting to leave the meeting. The frustration is evident.

The main feeling is extensive humiliation, which is felt when being harassed during shopping, having schools closed or given Kyrgyz names, which is adverse to ongoing peace building and conflict resolution activities. Integration will face problems when the one party has not yet overcome the fear and the anger after the 2010 unrest.

The two groups of parents contributing to this evaluation both demonstrated and confirmed that they are fearful of the future.

In the community, which has been mixed for decades, nobody knows who caused the violence, and the opinion is that the residing ethnic groups would never hurt each other the way it was done. This uncertainty contributes to the fear. People are also fearful of the reactions after the upcoming General Elections.

Parents, who struggle to keep fear, anger and hate at bay will implicitly influence their children making them view other ethnic groups and the situation from the parental angle.

Traumatised adults cannot adequately act as supportive adults. They are confused and fragile which will hamper healing of the children and the social life and status.

For the sake of the children and their intellectual, social and psychological development it is strongly recommended to apply a holistic approach including parents – or child caretakers – in all activities concerning children.

Activities could include long-term, professional psycho-social counseling of affected parents and children. Such counseling should focus on making people define the desired future and the steps they have to take to reach where they aim. By doing so focus is moved from the traumatic past and present to a relatively prosperous future – and people are made agents of change for their own lives, which implies a belief that they have the capacity and urge to change from worse to better lives. Many will obviously need some sort of short-term support in terms of training, social integration and others to be able take the lead throughout. It is critical that outsiders do not think that they know better, which are the right ingredients of a good life.

44 Caretakers could be grand parents, elder siblings, uncles etc.
All levels of stakeholders from Department of Education to students all emphasised on the importance of having extra-curricular training in English, Russia, computer and sports.

The underlying ethnic tension makes it difficult for the Uzbek people to let their children learn Kyrgyz – even if it opens up for higher education opportunities. Parents will rather send their children to relatives in Russia to make them study there. There is thus a great interest in learning the mentioned languages.

With limited access to education for the Uzbek population due to language barriers it will be relevant to offer computer training, which will provide access to distance education.

Establish community-based youth clubs, which offer the requested education and training. Choosing Russian as a common language for both ethnic groups would (i) provide opportunities for education and/or work in a number of other countries; (ii) provide equal opportunities as none of the two groups has Russian as their native language. Both will have to make an effort to communicate with a wider forum nationally and internationally. English is another option with the same extended opportunities.

English, computer and sports are equally neutral and should be offered to all. The idea is to have several centres, which compete about being the best in any of the four (or more) subjects. This would generate a club team spirit. Experience, also from existing UNICEF Youth Clubs, shows that team spirit is stronger than ethnicity.

The clubs could be headed by a committee consisting of parents, youth, leaders and others members duly representing a given locality. This would add positively to a mutual understanding of each other and provide an opportunity to discover similarities rather than differences. Finally, it would allow for a discovery of how far one can reach if working as a team and choosing team members based on ability and not ethnicity. This covers sports matches, competitions in effective use of computers or presentation of plays, poems or cultural texts in a foreign language.

It could be considered to include 3-6 months skilled training.
Idle youth does easily engage in criminality and conflict provoking activities, which makes them an obvious target group for youth activities.

People of all ages need to have a social framework within which to operate. The framework sets the norms and values for what is socially good and bad activities. When there are no such networks, which appeal to or accept a certain person, it is not uncommon that such person engages in any group, which welcomes a new member.

There are different reasons for why youth does not attend school. Some do not fit intellectually or socially, for others the distance to school is far and parents fear the consequences of letting the child walk to school.

Locally based youth clubs, which offer a mixture of academic subjects and more popular activities such as computer and sports, would to a certain extend appeal to youth, who do not benefit much from traditional school subjects or who has too far to walk.

Opening of pre-school classes was received very positively, this includes the full equipping of the classes. It helps young children to have fun and focus differently making them forget about their trauma.

In some schools the number of classes that were opened did not cover the factual need. The teachers had difficulties in handling the difference in school readiness in 1st. class between pre-school students and newcomers, which has caused a motivational set-back among the newcomers. This is likely to influence their learning.

The trauma is still rampant, so pre-schooling is not the solution to the problems, but an activity, which can ease the pain.

For children to benefit adequately from their education, there need to be comprehensive and streamlined psycho-social counselling and interventions in the most affected areas.

When opening classes in selected schools, these schools ought to have full child coverage not to cause further social and cultural differences among children who have attended preschooling and those, who have not.

It is recommended to establish not less that four urban and four rural youth clubs after thorough feasibilities studies of relevant placing, which subjects to cover, which people to target and mode of management for sustainability.
The campaign in combination with safe transport to school made parents decide to send their children to school. Department of education informed that the parental negativity at that time would otherwise have resulted in children staying at home. The department with its means for operations could not have intervened in a convincing manner. The immediate and timely intervention was determining for (timely) opening of the schools. The back-to-school situation in combination with peace education and psycho-social counselling made it possible to resume a seemingly normal life. As mentioned elsewhere trauma is still rampant among children, teachers and parents. The responsibility for safe school-going should be transferred to the communities. This will require some training in planning and coordination together with information about the wider intellectual, mental and social consequences for children, if they drop-out of school.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>OVERALL ISSUES</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>PRELIMINARY FINDINGS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Involvement of governmental institutions in direct implementation had been limited due to the emergency nature of the project and the need for rapid response.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Integration

The visit to two mixed schools showed that it may be possible to make integration work nationally, if made gradual and with no major enforcement or penalties.

Even in this case, where the mixed community have inter-married, the June 2010 has changed the picture. Most parents are not ready for a full, integration.

Successful integration presupposes that there is a genuine interest in being integrated. Integration means losing parts of your integrity and your past life in terms of language, norms and values. It also means gains, but the not gains may not balance the losses or may not be regarded as sufficiently relevant. Therefore people, who suffered severe losses last year, are not mentally or socially ready to accept further losses and enforcement could easily result in more unrest, as stress is expressed as either passivity, defence or aggression. The people, who already feel the aggression, will not hesitate to react with violence.

A change of behaviour has to have a purpose at individual level for individuals to choose to invest in such change.

It was concluded in the meetings that psychological support is what will make a significant and lasting difference.

It is known that providing children with a considerable different cultural context than that of their parents, e.g. another language and education in a system presently not recognised, or rather feared, by the parents will either make it difficult for the young person to fully integrate with the “other” culture, or – if integrating – lose parental support, respect and/or love. It will most often be impossible to combine the two.

It was suggested that mixing and integration is implemented gradually e.g. making all class 1 be integrated next year and then continue year by year.

Cultural events for parents leaders and others, psycho-social counselling of hard hit child caretakers, long-term peace education for parents and leaders and social support of especially grand parent headed households were all perceived as relevant initiatives, which would help the adult population process the present fear and negativity towards integration and gradually become integrated.

Hope and aspiration can be developed through adequate psycho-social counselling.
| Wide UNICEFcollaboration | A holistic thinking involving a wide scope of direct stakeholders and new types of activities may be required to create a satisfactory stabilisation of the affected area | Need for wide, cross-sectoral UNICEFcollaboration as problems are complex and not sector disaggregated. This could include e.g. Ministry of Health/WHO, UNESCO for curricula and materials development, and UNDP and OHCHR at political level to plan for a viable integration policy. |

The highlighted challenges are complex and deep rooted. Ordinary education support will not have the desired effect in the June 2010 affected areas until this is solved.
List of Literature
LIST OF LITERATUR

Assessment for Peace Education Lessons
Call for proposals 2010
Consolidated education partner report
Consolidated emergency and utilization report
Education_peace building
Kyrgyzstan – One year education strategy 2010-2011
Laetitia Lemaistre final report 2010
Project proposal template 2010
WTS 2010 results
WTS press conference 2011

Kyrgyz Country Development Strategy 2009-2011
Education Development Strategy 2012-2020
UNEG: RBM Handbook