<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Section Heading</th>
<th>Page No.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>List of Abbreviations Used</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Glossary of Terms</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Executive Summary</td>
<td>7</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Object of Evaluation</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Setting the Evaluation Context</td>
<td>17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Evaluation Purpose, Objectives and Scope</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Evaluation Purpose</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Objectives and Scope of the Evaluation</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Evaluation Methodology</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Evaluation Methodology</td>
<td>29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sampling Plan</td>
<td>32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Findings and Analyses</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Relevance</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Effectiveness</td>
<td>48</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Efficiency</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sustainability</td>
<td>76</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Conclusions, Lessons Learnt and Recommendations</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Basis for Recommendations</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Recommendations and Action Points</td>
<td>90</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**ANNEXES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Annex</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Terms of Reference and Theory of Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Approach and Methodology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Consent Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Study Tools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>State Fact Sheets Including Stakeholders Met</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Monitoring Formats</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Findings on Effectiveness from Sample Districts</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Stories of Change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Success Factors and Challenges</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Budget for Implementing Meena Radio Programme (2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Imperatives for Replication</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Enclosed as a separate volume.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AIR</td>
<td>All India Radio</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ALM</td>
<td>Activity Learning Methodology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AMO</td>
<td>Additional Monitoring Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AP</td>
<td>Andhra Pradesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASER</td>
<td>Annual State of Education Report</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ASPD</td>
<td>Additional State Project Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AV</td>
<td>Audio-Visual</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AWP</td>
<td>Annual Work Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPL</td>
<td>Below Poverty Line</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BRC</td>
<td>Block Resource Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRC</td>
<td>Cluster Resource Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRP</td>
<td>Cluster Resource Person</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEO</td>
<td>District Education Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DIET</td>
<td>District Institute of Education and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DISE</td>
<td>District Information System for Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DPO</td>
<td>District Project Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EBB</td>
<td>Educationally Backward Block</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ELTI</td>
<td>English Language Teaching Institute</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FGD</td>
<td>Focus Group Discussion</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GO</td>
<td>Government Order</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GoUP</td>
<td>Government of Uttar Pradesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICDS</td>
<td>Integrated Child Development Scheme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICPS</td>
<td>Integrated Child Protection Scheme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICT</td>
<td>Information Communication Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IEC</td>
<td>Information and Education Communication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IGNOU</td>
<td>Indira Gandhi National Open University</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IRI</td>
<td>Interactive Radio Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KABP</td>
<td>Knowledge Awareness Behaviour Practice</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KGBV</td>
<td>Kasturba Gandhi Balika Vidyalaya</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MCI</td>
<td>Meena Communication Initiative</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MEO</td>
<td>Mandal Education Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MHRD</td>
<td>Ministry of Human Resource Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MP</td>
<td>Madhya Pradesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NBA</td>
<td>Nirmal Bharat Abhiyan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCERT</td>
<td>National Council of Educational Research and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCF</td>
<td>National Curriculum Framework</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NHM</td>
<td>National Health Mission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Full Form</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NPRC</td>
<td>Nyay Panchayat Resource Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OBC</td>
<td>Other Backward Classes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RTE</td>
<td>Right To Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Scheduled Caste</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCERT</td>
<td>State Council Educational Research and Training</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDF</td>
<td>School Development Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SIET</td>
<td>State Institute for Educational Technology</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMC</td>
<td>School Management Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPD</td>
<td>State Project Director</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SSA</td>
<td>Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ST</td>
<td>Scheduled Tribe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>UP</td>
<td>Uttar Pradesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WASH</td>
<td>Water, Sanitation and Hygiene</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# Glossary of Terms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Term</th>
<th>Definition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Cascade Model (for training)</td>
<td>Training passed on from one level to another</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Classroom Pedagogy</td>
<td>Teacher’s method or style of teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District Information System for Education (DISE)</td>
<td>Provides data on elementary education in terms of the number of schools, enrolment, and teachers, classified by school category and school management</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EBB (Educationally Backward Blocks)</td>
<td>Blocks where the basic Female Literacy Rate is below the national average and the Gender Gap in Literacy is above the national average. This list has now been expanded to include blocks that have a rural full literacy rate of less than 45% irrespective of the Gender Gap</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus Group Discussions (FGDs)</td>
<td>A technique in qualitative research where a group of people are asked about their perceptions, opinions, beliefs, and attitudes towards a concept, service, scheme etc. Questions are asked in an interactive group setting where participants are free to talk with other group members.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IEC (Information and Education Communication) Material</td>
<td>Materials like books, charts, calendars, etc. that provide information on a programme/scheme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrated Child Development Scheme (ICDS)</td>
<td>A scheme that aims to provide nutrition, preschool education, and primary healthcare to children under six years of age and their mothers.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Integrated Child Protection Scheme (ICPS)</td>
<td>ICPS is aimed at building a protective environment for children in difficult circumstances, as well as other vulnerable children, through Government-Civil Society Partnership</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>KGBV school</td>
<td>Government run residential school for girls belonging to marginalized communities/ backward classes (Kasturba Gandhi Balika Vidhyalaya)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mandal</td>
<td>Term used to describe ‘a Block of a District’ in Andhra Pradesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meena Day</td>
<td>A day (usually the day when the broadcast of the Meena Radio Programme begins) when students from most schools celebrate Meena’s birthday through school functions involving dance performances and plays etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Meena Focal Person</td>
<td>Government official in charge of ensuring smooth implementation of the Meena Radio Programme in the state (SSA)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Meena Manch
A group comprising of around twenty girls in the age group of 11-14 years in schools to discuss Meena stories. Also includes Meena Cabinets comprising of two children from standards III, IV and V; the Sugamkarta – a female teacher from the school who acts as the facilitator. It is aimed towards promoting the value and rights of the girl child and encouraging equitable school enrolment and retention. Although it was started as an initiative for girls, currently boys are also a part of the Meena Manch.

### Meena Vedika
An equivalent of the Meena Manch initiative in Andhra Pradesh

### Meena Ratna Award
Meena Ratna Awards are given to students from Upper Primary Schools and KGBVs as well as to teachers in recognition of their outstanding ability to learn and acquire new information and knowledge from Meena stories and to demonstrate the strong will power and courage to apply this knowledge to create a significant impact in their family/school/community.

### Nanhi Kali programme
The Nanhi Kali project managed by the K. C. Mahindra Education Trust and Naandi Foundation. Its objective is to provide 10 years of quality education to girl children from economically disadvantaged families. Project Nanhi Kali works with 19 NGO implementation partners at the grass root level to ensure that the girls receive academic and material support.

### National Health Mission (NHM)
Scheme that envisages achievement of universal access to equitable, affordable & quality health care services that are accountable and responsive to people's needs.

### Nirmal Bharath Abhiyan (NBA), Swachh Bharath Abhiyan
A government scheme that aims at eradicating the practice of open defecation and is a demand-driven and people centred sanitation programme. The Swachh Bharath Abhiyan is a national campaign to clean streets, roads and infrastructure of the country.

### Nyay Panchayat Resource Centre (NPRC)
Provide regular academic support, conduct teachers training, and follow up workshops, meetings and opportunities for peer learning as well as sharing of good practices. They operate at the cluster level.

### Paheli
Riddle (Meena related)

### Sarpanch
The Sarpanch or the village head is the focal point of contact between government officers and the village community.

### School Development Fund
Fund given by the government to public schools for administration, repairs and maintenance.

### School Management Committee
Committee of teachers and parents that are responsible for all decision making at the school.

### Sugamkarta
Female teacher from the school who acts as the facilitator during the post broadcast Meena Radio Discussions.

### Tantric/Babaji
Local quack/village doctor. Also referred to as witch doctor.

### The Rajiv Gandhi Scheme for Empowerment of Adolescent Girls (RGSEAG) –SABLA in English
SABLA is a centrally sponsored scheme of the government that aims at empowering adolescent girls and improving their health and nutritional status.
Evaluation of Meena Radio Programme

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

Background

1. “Meena Ki Duniya” (Meena’s World, hereafter referred to as Meena Radio Programme) is an entertainment-education programme that was developed by UNICEF in partnership with the Department of Education, Government of Uttar Pradesh (GoUP) and its Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA) State Project Office. The programme’s aims at the time of inception included:
   a. To cause a measurable change in knowledge, attitude and intent on key child rights issues, and issues related to child health, sanitation, and hand hygiene amongst students.
   b. To address existing social norms that prevent 100% enrolment, retention and completion of upper primary education for girl children.
   c. To improve skills amongst children reached through the programme, in problem solving, negotiation, and prosocial behaviour.
   d. To model and endorse the concept of child friendly schools, and life skill-based education.

2. The Meena Radio Programme was designed as a combination of mass media and interpersonal communication. The 15-minute radio programme was developed comprising of three segments: songs, stories and games. It was decided to include the radio programme as a part of the structured school timetable for middle school students. This ensured that all the students could listen to the programme and engage in a post broadcast teacher-facilitated discussion on the key messages of the day’s episode.

3. The Meena Radio Programme was piloted in 9 districts in Uttar Pradesh (UP) in 2010 and expanded to the rest of the state in 2012. The programme was introduced in Andhra Pradesh (AP) and Madhya Pradesh (MP) in 2012.

4. UNICEF engaged Deloitte Touché Tohmatsu India Private Ltd. (Deloitte) to carry out an evaluation of the Meena Radio Programme in UP, AP, and MP.

Rationale and Objectives of the Evaluation

5. Effectiveness Studies and Impact Assessments commissioned by UNICEF have indicated that the Meena Radio Programme is popular among children. Findings revealed that the programme has generated dialogue around key issues among students. The 2012 Effectiveness Study conducted in UP found that 9 out of 10 respondents reported discussing the Meena Radio Programme inside or outside of school. Discussions on health issues were specifically reported by 30% of the students in the Effectiveness Study. The 2012 Effectiveness Study conducted in the Kasturba Gandhi Balika Vidyalayas (KGBVs) revealed that while 85% of the respondents initiated discussions with their friends, 78.5% of the students spoke about the Meena Radio Programme with family members as well. The Meena Radio Programme is currently being implemented in nine states in India – AP, Bihar, Chhattisgarh, Jharkhand, Karnataka, MP,
Maharashtra, Orissa and UP through each state’s SSA. UNICEF is advocating for the adoption and scale up of the programme across the country with the Ministry of Human Resource Development (MHRD).

6. While previous research and studies have provided UNICEF with some indicator of effectiveness of the programme, an evaluation is needed at this point to objectively and systematically assess the contribution that the Meena Radio Programme has had in enhancing the knowledge and awareness of students and to understand implementation gaps. The evaluation findings will be used to strengthen implementation in the states where the programme is being run, as well as provide evidence for potential replicability or scale up in other states. Lessons learnt and recommendations from the implementation will be examined to ensure improved efficiency and sustainability.

7. The evaluation seeks to examine the Meena Radio Programme across the following criteria:

- **Relevance** to ascertain how relevant and pertinent the Meena Radio objectives and activities are to the national flagship programmes of education.
- **Effectiveness** to ascertain the extent to which the intervention has addressed knowledge gaps, attitudinal shifts, life skills, equity and influenced behaviour change among children and teachers.
- **Efficiency** to ascertain cost effectiveness of the programme and the adequate and optimal utilization of resources - financial, infrastructure, human resources and time.
- **Sustainability** to identify the major factors that influenced or hindered the continuity of the programme through SSA and the factors that are crucial to ensure sustainability.

8. The evaluation also specifically seeks to evaluate the intervention’s focus on gender and equity.

**Approach and Methodology**

The evaluation used a mixed methodology in order to comprehensively and judiciously cover each aspect of the intervention. This comprised of primary qualitative data collection and analysis combined with a secondary analysis of the previously conducted studies on the Meena Radio Programme.

9. The **literature review** and **desk research** helped the team understand the objectives, rationale, operationalization and effectiveness of the programme and provided the basis for conceptualization of the study design and tools.

10. **Secondary analysis** of existing evidence from the Baseline, Endline, Effectiveness and Impact Assessment Studies conducted in the three states were analysed to understand the effectiveness of the programme.

11. The **primary qualitative research** involved in-depth interviews with stakeholders from across the government system at the state, district and block levels as well as with school teachers and Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) with students and parents. The evaluation used participatory methods through the FGDs to obtain qualitative inputs for the evaluation. Stakeholders at each level were selected on the basis of the sampling design which is described in the Methodology Section.
12. **Non-participant observation** by members of the Deloitte Team during the broadcast of the Meena Radio Programme in schools was also carried out.

13. The Evaluation Team ensured that ethical considerations were met by providing students with a detailed understanding of the purpose of the visit and a consent form for them to read and sign for partaking in all primary research activities. Teachers from each school were also provided with detailed information and their consent was taken through a consent form to ensure their agreement to be involved in the study. No conflict of interest was encountered throughout the evaluation process and participants’ identity and privacy have been protected.

14. During the field visits, the team also probed for instances where students or teachers had initiated social change in their community on a thematic area that they had learnt about from the Meena Radio Programme. Whenever any such story of change was identified, the Evaluation Team conducted an in-depth discussion with the identified student/teacher to document it.

**Sample**

15. Due care was given to ensure that the method for selecting the sample districts and schools was nuanced, and incorporated a combination of parameters across social, educational and human development indices. The finalization of the sampling plan and selection of districts/blocks was done in consultation with UNICEF.

16. Each state was geographically demarcated into sub-regions. Post classification of districts, each district (total 136 districts across the three states) was evaluated on a range of demographic and socio-economic parameters. A three-point scale (High, Medium and Low) based on statistical percentiles was used to comparatively grade districts on each indicator\(^\text{[1]}\) and then a cumulative rating was arrived at for each district. To ensure maximum divergence, sample districts were chosen from the highest and lowest scorers for each state. A consistent sample was chosen across the two steps i.e. for a low performing district, Educationally Backward Blocks (EBB) were selected and within those blocks, low performing schools were selected. Similarly for a high performing district, non-EBB were selected and within these blocks, high performing schools were selected. In addition, while selecting the districts, due care was taken to ensure the right mix of districts across geographical regions.

**Data collection and analysis**

17. Interview guides and FGD guides were developed based on the lines of inquiry informed by the desk research and document review. The secondary data, field visits and primary data collected were analysed and triangulated to answer the evaluation questions against the parameters of Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, and Sustainability. Additionally, since all the studies from the secondary data were carried out a few years ago and used a different methodology, the Evaluation Team has relied on the data from the primary research for drawing conclusions. Wherever applicable, the secondary data has been used to corroborate the findings from the primary research. If there are instances where there is a difference between the primary research and the secondary data then this has been specifically called out.

\(^{[1]}\) A normalization of negative and positive parameters was also conducted by assigning reverse weights
Findings and Analyses

Relevance

18. The evaluation aimed to analyse whether contextual realities in the programming environment were taken into account in the design and implementation of strategies/ intervention, and if the programme has responded to changes in priorities. It also aimed to understand whether the programme is aligned to the educational priorities of the Right to Education (RTE) Act. The key evaluation findings are provided below:

- The Meena Radio Programme was introduced in UP based on interest from both the state government and UNICEF officials following the success of the Meena Manch in the state. In MP and AP, there was also a strong interest from the state government in introducing the programme given the evidence of success from UP. Both AP and MP also had prior experience in implementing radio based programmes in schools.
- Contextual realities in the programming environment were taken into account in the design and implementation of the programme. The design and content of the programme were based on the findings of baseline studies conducted in UP and multi-stakeholder consultations. In AP and MP, government stakeholders have selected episodes to broadcast which match their state’s priorities. The primary research revealed that in AP the boys do not find the programme relevant.
- The objectives of the Meena Radio Programme are well aligned with the educational priorities of the SSA/RTE Act. One of the key thematic areas on which the Meena Radio Programme focuses on is education and the importance of enrolling in and attending school. This is one of the main aims of the RTE Act.
- Key messages in thematic areas such as child health, nutrition, child protection and life skills in the Meena Radio Programme are in line with the objectives of other flagship national programmes like the National Health Mission (NHM), Integrated Child Protection Scheme (ICPS), Integrated Child Development Scheme (ICDS) and Swachh Bharath Abhiyan.
- The Meena Radio Programme has responded favourably to priorities or programme strategies that may have changed over the years. Forty new episodes have been developed for broadcast based on feedback received from the implementing states. These episodes focus on the right to education, child rights, child protection and life skills.
- The programme has been cognizant of issues related to gender and equity.
- The programme’s strategies and objectives are well aligned to UNICEF’s strategic plan and equity focus and the five priority areas of UNICEF India established in 2014.

Effectiveness

19. The evaluation examined the extent to which the Meena Radio Programme met its main objectives in addressing knowledge gaps, attitudinal shifts, life skills, equity and influencing behaviour change and the extent to which the programme is recalled by the students. The evaluation also aimed to understand the extent to which the intervention has been able to influence the class room pedagogy or teacher’s style of teaching. In addition, factors influencing the achievement or non-achievement of the objectives were also evaluated. The main findings are as follows:

- The Meena Radio Programme has a high recall value among students of class VI-VIII and has been effective in eliciting participation and keeping the students engaged. Primary research
revealed that students sing along with the title song, try and participate in the games and are able to recount stories from the programme. Students also reported discussing the programme with their friends and siblings. The Effectiveness Studies revealed that the average character recall amongst students is ~ 7.2 and most students were able to recall at least one message from the radio programme.

- The Meena Radio Programme has been effective in improving knowledge and awareness on topics such as hand hygiene, importance of using toilets, nutrition, child labour, child marriage, and importance of education. Gender roles and stereotypes, however, remain deeply embedded.
- The programme has been highly effective in the residential KGBV schools in UP which comprise of girls from scheduled castes and scheduled tribes.
- The objectives of the Meena Radio Programme did not include influencing the teachers’ pedagogy. However, the Evaluation Team found that in 3 of the 30 schools visited, a few teachers have used games from the Meena Radio Programme into their regular academic teaching.
- The 2011 Effectiveness Study carried out in UP revealed that the average post broadcast discussions facilitated by the teachers was 12 minutes. The same study found that 98% of teachers stated conducting discussions, while only 75% of the students shared this opinion. In comparison, 91% of the KGBV students in UP reported a discussion immediately after the broadcast. The primary research in this evaluation study found differing levels of teacher-facilitated discussions. The quality of discussions facilitated by teachers after the programme broadcast was found to be good in the KGBV schools in UP and in all schools in AP. In MP, in all 10 schools visited, the teachers did not facilitate any discussions post the broadcast of the programme.
- Key factors such as government interest in the programme, timing of the broadcast, quality of the radio signal, availability of information and education communication (IEC) materials, the presence of trained teachers to facilitate discussion after the broadcast of the programme and technical support from UNICEF contribute to the effectiveness of the programme. Additionally, the presence of supporting factors, such as the Meena Manch and Meena Ratna Awards, also contribute to the effectiveness of the programme.

**Efficiency**

The study evaluated the extent to which the Meena Radio intervention used resources efficiently and optimally – financial, infrastructure, human resources and time.

- The broadcast costs borne by the SSA in UP, AP and MP are 2.34, 1.14 and 1.91 million INR, respectively. This cost borne by the SSA for the broadcast of the programme constitutes a very small percentage of the total SSA budget – 0.003% in UP and 0.004% in AP and MP. Considering that All India Radio (AIR) is a government-funded radio channel and has the largest reach, broadcasting the programme through AIR is the most optimal use of resources.
- The programme reaches approximately 10.14-18.5, 1.43- 2.5 and 0.78-1.0 million students in UP, MP and AP, respectively. In AP and MP the programme is broadcast in middle schools and the students listening to the programme belong to the age group of 11-14 years. In UP the programme is broadcast in primary schools as well as middle schools and students listening to the programme belong to the age group of 5-14 years. The broadcast cost of reaching each student is Rs.0.23- 0.13 in UP, Rs.1.33- 0.77-1.33 in MP and Rs.1.83-1.1 in AP. The ranges represent the average and maximum values which have been calculated using average attendance rates and a
100% attendance rate of enrolled students, respectively. The figures for the reach and the broadcast costs are based on the assumption that all the schools play the Meena Radio Programme and all students attending school listen to the programme.

- The Meena Radio intervention has used financial resources, infrastructure, human resources and time with differing efficiencies in the three states. The training model followed in AP is most efficient. The efficiency of utilization of existing human resources is good in both UP and AP where the teachers have been trained well and the efficiency of the time spent by the teachers on the programme is also better in these states. Infrastructure constraints limit the efficiency of the programme in schools with a large number of students.

**Sustainability**

21. An important focus area of the evaluation was to assess the extent to which the Meena Radio intervention has been sustainable and the key factors which influenced the achievement/non-achievement of sustainability of Meena Radio in the three states.

- The sustainability of the Meena Radio Programme is dependent to a large extent on a strong buy-in from the state government and technical support provided by UNICEF.
- Broadcast costs of the programme are borne by the government in each of the three states. Government stakeholders met believed that the broadcast of the programme would continue, but they would require UNICEF support to produce more episodes. Officials also felt that UNICEF support for training and monitoring is required.
- Sustainability of the Meena Radio Programme in schools is dependent to a large extent on perceptions of the importance of the programme to the government. Periodic monitoring by the government in UP and AP ensures that the programme is played diligently in the schools.
- The contextualization of language and content of the Meena Radio Programme to the needs of each state influences the sustainability of the programme.
- In schools where the programme has been institutionalized in the school timetable, the implementation of the Meena Radio Programme is sustainable. Where the radio signal is clear, the interest of the students in the radio programme is sustained.
- Availability of trained teachers facilitating discussions on the Meena Radio Programme leads to meaningful discussions and influences the sustainability of the programme. In addition, supporting programmes, like the Meena Manch, enhance interest in the programme and contribute to sustainability.

**Broad Recommendations and Action Points**

22. The evaluation helped in identifying important lessons from the Meena Radio Programme. These are based on factors which have contributed to the success of the programme and actions for overcoming challenges. The recommendations based on the evaluation are put forth in two broad areas:

- Institutional and Policy Level
- Operational Level

### Institutional and Policy Level

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institutional and Policy Level</th>
<th>Ownership</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

Evaluation of Meena Radio Programme
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institutional and Policy Level</th>
<th>Ownership</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The recommendations in this section relate to institutional and policy level interventions. These recommendations are focused towards strengthening the fundamental design and activities of the Meena Radio Programme.</td>
<td>Implementing State Government</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Policy and decision making**

- Government to continue funding the implementation of the Meena Radio Programme (including the broadcast, training of teachers, availability of radios, IEC materials and ensure the institutionalization of the programme in the school timetable) through the SSA budget and other relevant budgets available. Given its effectiveness and efficiency, government can consider introducing it in other states where broadcast is not happening.

**Institutionalize content refreshing and contextualization**

- Develop new content and new episodes on gender and other relevant topics every two years for the programme to be relevant

**Expand programme to private aided schools**

- Inform private aided schools about the Meena Radio Programme and its implementation modality

**Operational Level**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Operational Level</th>
<th>Ownership</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The recommendations in this section relate to operational interventions. These recommendations are focused towards strengthening the implementation of the Meena Radio Programme.</td>
<td>Implementing State Government</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Strengthen implementation of Meena Radio Programme**

- Share clear steps for the implementation of the Meena Radio Programme with district and block level officials including information on the objectives and implementation plan for the programme
- Efforts should be made to ensure clear radio signal. Alternative means (such as using community radio stations) for broadcast to be used where AIR signal is weak.
- The training component needs to be strengthened across the states. The training could also be mainstreamed with regular SSA training and DIETs could be used to train teachers.
- Ensure dissemination of discussion guide to all schools where the programme is broadcast.
- Ensure institutionalization of the Meena Radio Programme within the school timetable to ensure that the Meena Radio Programme is played in schools and does not interrupt regular classes.
- Strengthen and integrate monitoring of programme into regular SSA/Education department’s monitoring system. UNICEF should continue providing technical support to SSA for developing monitoring systems and checklists and mainstreaming them into the government system.
- Effectiveness studies could be conducted by third party organizations
- Strengthen knowledge management and sharing of experiences on the Meena Radio Programme

Evaluation of Meena Radio Programme 13
### Operational Level

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Partnership model to be clearly defined</th>
<th>UNICEF and Implementing State Government</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Clear terms of engagement should be established between UNICEF and the state government from the time of inception of programme</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number of radio sets per school</th>
<th>Implementing State Government</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Number of radio sets in the schools should be commensurate with the number of students. It is recommended that one radio set should be made available for each class in large schools.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Continue organizing annual learning visits.</th>
<th>Implementing State Government and UNICEF</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Annual learning visits could be organized to states where the programme has been successful. Regular fora for discussion of these experiences and systematic documentation will facilitate better knowledge management and consolidation.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### UNICEF Support

23. UNICEF support has been one of the biggest factors for the success of the Meena Radio Programme. As presented in the exhibit below, UNICEF support would be important in the initial stages of the roll out and implementation of the Meena Radio Programme in a state. As the programme implementation reaches a stage of maturity, the government can start taking ownership of increasing responsibilities and UNICEF’s involvement in the programme can be reduced.
### Exhibit 1: Role of UNICEF and Government in roll out and implementation of Meena Radio Programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Pre-Launch</th>
<th>Launch and Early Stage</th>
<th>Intermediate Stage</th>
<th>Mature Stage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Advocacy</strong> for implementing Meena Radio Programme</td>
<td>Technical support in planning high profile launch</td>
<td>Advocacy for an Impact Assessment</td>
<td>Develop new episodes based on contextual need</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Advocacy</strong> for Baseline Study and prioritization of episodes to be broadcast</td>
<td>Capacity development through support for annual refresher training</td>
<td>Technical Support as required</td>
<td>Technical Support as required</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Technical support</strong> for re-versioning of episodes and translation of teachers guide (if required)</td>
<td>Advocacy for regular monitoring through SSA</td>
<td>Support Knowledge Management</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Capacity development - Training of Trainers</strong></td>
<td>Technical support for design of IEC materials</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Advocacy</strong> for institutionalization in timetable</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Technical support</strong> for design of IEC materials</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Support in developing monitoring tools and systems</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Government buy-in for the programme</td>
<td>- Launch of the programme accompanied by media coverage</td>
<td>- Implementation of the Meena Radio Programme</td>
<td>- Implementation of the Meena Radio Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Develop partnerships for technical support and broadcast</td>
<td>- Implementation of the Meena Radio Programme</td>
<td>- Undertake refresher training at district and block levels</td>
<td>- Design and printing of IEC materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Identification of priorities and episodes for broadcast.</td>
<td>- Undertake training at district and block levels</td>
<td>- Mainstreaming monitoring of the Meena Radio Programme with SSA monitoring</td>
<td>- Undertake refresher training at district and block levels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Support for identifying broadcast partners and Master Trainers</td>
<td>- Mainstreaming monitoring of the Meena Radio Programme with SSA monitoring</td>
<td></td>
<td>- Mainstreaming monitoring of the Meena Radio Programme with SSA monitoring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>- Ensure that all schools have at least one radio set</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Government’s role | UNICEF’s role |
INTRODUCTION

1. UNICEF has engaged Deloitte Touché Tohmatsu India Private Ltd. (Deloitte) to carry out an evaluation of the Meena Radio Programme in Uttar Pradesh (UP), Madhya Pradesh (MP) and Andhra Pradesh (AP). This document forms the Final Report for this engagement.

India and the evaluation states

2. India is the second most populated country in the world. The three states that have been covered in this evaluation differ appreciably in terms of their various socio-economic indicators. While UP and MP are located in the Hindi speaking belts of the country, AP is a southern state and the main dialect spoken by the people is Telugu. The table below describes some of the social and demographic parameters of these three states while compared to the country as a whole.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Parameter</th>
<th>India</th>
<th>UP</th>
<th>MP</th>
<th>AP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Population</td>
<td>1,210,193,422</td>
<td>199,581,477</td>
<td>72,597,565</td>
<td>49,378,778</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of backward classes</td>
<td>25.2</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>39.3</td>
<td>22.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(% of Scheduled Castes+ % of Scheduled Tribes)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% of Muslim population</td>
<td>13.4%</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>6.09</td>
<td>6.94</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sex Ratio (Number of females per 1,000 males)</td>
<td>943</td>
<td>905</td>
<td>934.5</td>
<td>996.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infant mortality rate</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>50</td>
<td>54</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total Literacy rate</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>70</td>
<td>69</td>
<td>67.3</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

3. The total literacy rates are lower for all the three states than the national average. In addition, with the exception of AP, the other two states have a sex ratio lower than the national average. ~ 30% of the total population in UP and MP are below the poverty line as compared to the national average of 22%. Governance structures at the state and district levels are considered to be more robust and responsive in AP as compared to MP and UP.

---

1 Census of India 2011
2 Census of India 2011
3 Census of India 2001
4 Census of India 2011
5 SRS, Data from 2014
6 The IMR is for united AP and is not available after the state split in 2014.
7 Census of India 2011
8 http://planningcommission.nic.in/news/pre_pov2307.pdf
Setting the Evaluation Context

**Context for introduction of Meena Radio Programme**

4. Many government schemes and programmes have been launched in the last two decades to enhance the focus on education in India, including the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA), a flagship programme launched by the Ministry of Human Resource Development (MHRD) in 2002. The SSA resulted in an improvement in infrastructure of existing schools and classrooms, construction of new schools, and improvement in the student teacher ratio in the schools. The aims of the SSA were further strengthened and re-enforced by the Right to Education (RTE) Act introduced in 2009. The RTE Act specifies that all children are entitled to free and compulsory education between 6-14 years of age irrespective of their socio-economic background. The main aim of these interventions is to ensure the achievement of universal primary education.

5. The National Curriculum Framework (NCF 2005) aims at providing holistic and meaningful education to children. According to the NCF, one of the broad aims of education should be to instil in children the ability to work towards and contribute to social change. It further states that the teachers must empower all children in their learning across differences in castes, religion, gender, and disability, and ensure health, nutrition and an inclusive school environment. In addition, the NCF states that “every resource must be deployed to enable children to express themselves, handle objects, explore their natural and social milieu, and to grow up healthy.” It advocates for child centred learning with an emphasis on life skills and child friendly schools.

6. Various measures by the Government in the last decade have contributed marginally to an improvement in the educational status of the children in the country. Primary education enrolment rates in India have increased from 96% in 2009 to 96.7% in 2013\(^9\). However, there are variations; states like UP lag behind the national average, while states like MP have seen a marginal decline in enrolment rates from 2011 to 2013, and states like AP have seen stagnation in enrolment from 2011 to 2013\(^10\).

\(^9\) ASER Report 2013  
\(^10\) ASER 2013
7. Similarly, while progress has been made in terms of gender equity, with the proportion of out-of-school girls in the age group 11-14 declining from 6.8% in 2009 to 5.8% in 2013\(^{11}\), it has not been consistent across states. MP has seen an increase in out-of-school girls between 2009 and 2013. UP saw an increase in out-of-school girls between 2009 and 2011, but this declined marginally in 2013. AP has been successful in reducing the percentage of out-of-school girls from 2009 to 2013.

8. The focus of the policies has until now been on achieving universal primary education. Progress has been made in terms of providing school buildings, classrooms and other facilities. On the other hand, life skills education and ensuring schools are child friendly remain areas of concern. In addition, holistic education needs to cover issues related to social inclusion, gender, equity, health and nutrition.

**MEENA COMMUNICATION INITIATIVE**

9. In South Asian countries, and especially in Bangladesh, India, Nepal and Pakistan, female children face differential treatment in all aspects of their lives. Deep-rooted traditional beliefs and practices threaten the protection as well as survival of girls in many instances\(^{12}\). In India, the sex ratio dropped from 972 in 1901 to 933 in 2001\(^{13}\). Most countries in Asia with the exception of Indonesia and

---

\(^{11}\) Ibid.

\(^{12}\) Evaluation of the Meena Communication Incentive, May 2004

\(^{13}\) Census 2011
Japan have low sex ratios. UNICEF launched the Meena Communication Initiative (MCI) in the 1990s as part of the ‘International Year of the Girl Child.’ MCI is a strategic communication programme aimed at changing perceptions and behaviours that hamper the survival, protection and development of girls in South Asia. Under the initiative, a nine year old fictional girl ‘Meena’ was created. Comic books, animated films and posters featuring Meena, her family and her friends were created, aimed at promoting positive social attitudes and practices.

10. The MCI pioneered a number of innovations, such as Meena Manch comprising of a group of around twenty girls in the age group of 11-14 years in schools to discuss Meena stories; Meena Cabinets comprising of two children from standards III, IV and V; the Sugamkarta – a female teacher from the school who acts as the facilitator – aimed towards promoting the value and rights of the girl child and encouraging equitable school enrolment and retention.

11. Officials from the Department of Education in UP and UNICEF recognized the opportunity to use the popularity of the Meena Manch and Meena stories to increase the levels of awareness and knowledge among girls and boys, on issues related to education, child friendly schools, child protection and life skills. The character of Meena was also considered as an effective tool to help increase knowledge around health, nutrition, hygiene and gender roles. The Department of Education therefore embraced the idea of introducing initiatives using the character of Meena as a part of its education initiatives for school children.

Meena Ki Duniya Radio Programme

12. A radio programme, Meena Ki Duniya (Meena’s World, hereafter referred to as the Meena Radio Programme), was developed by UNICEF and introduced in select districts in UP in 2010. This programme was developed based on strategic inputs from the Department of Education, Government of Uttar Pradesh (GoUP) and the SSA’s UP State Project Office.

13. UNICEF developed a Theory of Change for the Meena Radio Programme based on strong behaviour and social change principles, with correct knowledge and dialogue as key determinants. The theory envisaged that the radio programme could increase knowledge amongst the students from upper primary schools on key thematic areas, engage them and induce discussions on the issues; provided it was implemented well in the schools. The ability of the programme to affect change depends on the exposure of the students to the programme, its ability to engage the students and the quality of discussions held after the programme. The quality of the discussions is dependent on the ability of the teacher and her
capacity to facilitate discussions on the issues the programme would cover. The exposure in turn depends on how often the students listen to the programme (regular school attendance and regular programme broadcast). The Theory of Change along with the risks and assumptions are discussed in detail in the Annex I.

14. Meena Radio Programme’s immediate objectives at the time of inception of the programme were:
   - To cause a measurable change in knowledge, attitude and intent on key child rights issues, and issues related to child health, sanitation, and hand hygiene.
   - To address existing social norms that prevent 100% enrolment, retention and completion of upper primary education for girl children.
   - To improve skills amongst children reached through the programme, in problem solving, negotiation, and prosocial behaviour.
   - To model and endorse the concept of child friendly schools and life skill based education.

Design of the Meena Radio Programme

15. A consultative exercise was undertaken prior to the production of the episodes to gather expert advice from stakeholders such as officials of the State Institute for Educational Technology (SIET), SSA, school teachers, parents, district coordinators for gender, script writers and UNICEF technical experts, to discuss the content and format of the programme. The content of the radio programme was also guided by a Baseline Study commissioned by UNICEF in 2010, which aimed to understand the levels of awareness and views among children and teachers on issues such as:
   - Health
   - Child rights / Child protection
   - Nutrition
   - Education
   - Hygiene
   - Gender

16. Three workshops were held to orient writers on the concept of Meena and the aims of the radio programme. The workshops led to the development of content maps for 160 episodes. This was done by the Sesame Workshop India under the guidance of UNICEF with inputs from sector experts.

Format and roll out of the Meena Radio Programme in UP

17. The Meena Radio Programme was designed in an entertainment-education format as a combination of mass media and interpersonal communication. A format for a 15-minute radio programme was developed comprising of three segments: songs, stories and games. It was decided to include the radio programme as a part of the structured school time-table for middle school students. This ensured that all the students could listen to the programme and engage in a post-broadcast teacher-facilitated discussion on the key messages of the broadcasted episode. Schools were given a notice by the Block Resource Centre (BRC) to purchase a radio set (within a certain price range) from the School Development Fund (SDF) and play the programme at the designated time. A Meena calendar developed by UNICEF and distributed by the state to the schools provided the schedule of episodes to be played. UNICEF also developed a teacher’s guidebook, a copy of which was provided to each school through the administrative network (state to district to BRC). Teachers’ training was also conducted to help them undertake participatory activities to facilitate dialogue amongst students after the radio programme.
18. The programme was piloted in the two districts of Lalitpur and Lucknow, and was later extended to nine districts in 2010, reaching almost 5,000 upper primary schools in UP. In 2011, the programme was extended to cover all 746 Kasturba Gandhi Balika Vidhyalaya (KGBV) schools across the state. As of 2012-2013, the programme has been airing in 167,620 primary and upper primary schools and 746 KGBVs in UP.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Year</th>
<th>Reach of Meena Radio Programme</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>2010</td>
<td>5,000 Upper Primary Schools</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2011</td>
<td>5,000 Upper Primary Schools and 746 KGBVs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2012-2013</td>
<td>167,620 Primary and Upper Primary Schools, and 746 KGBVs</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Partnership Model**

19. UNICEF’s role and support to the Meena Radio Programme has changed over the years from undertaking production, content generation and broadcasting during the pilot stage to a limited role of providing technical support to the government. The programme is now implemented by the SSA in the state.

20. The SSA is responsible for broadcasting the programme and makes advance payments to All India Radio (AIR), the broadcast partner for the programme. The funds for purchasing the radio set are a part of the SDF, which is released by the SSA to schools every year. UNICEF is responsible for training of master trainers, monitoring, and evaluation of the radio programme and printing of IEC materials such as Meena calendars and Meena kits/books. The dissemination of IEC materials is done by the SSA administration at the state, district and block level to the schools.

**Teacher’s training**

21. The teacher’s training focuses on enhancing the capacity of teachers to support the Meena Radio Programme intervention by moderating and encouraging discussions amongst students. UNICEF trains Master Trainers at the state level who then train 4-5 participants from each district. The trainings are then provided at the Block level where the trainers train the principal of each school. This is then passed on to a designated teacher who is responsible for conducting the programme. Hence a cascade model for training is followed.

**Monitoring**

22. Monitoring is undertaken by both UNICEF and the SSA. Monitoring activities include regular monitoring visits as well as assessments and evaluations

- **Regular Monitoring**: The UNICEF state consultant undertakes school visits in 2-3 districts every month. Monitoring on behalf of the SSA is done through the BRC/Cluster Resource Centre (CRC) members who enquire about the Meena Programme in their regular monitoring visits to

---

14 Figures as reported by Meena Radio Programme Consultant, UP
the school. A monitoring format is provided to the schools (available in *Annex VI*) which requires them to submit details regarding the Meena episodes aired, student attendance at the time of the programme, and quality of radio signal to the BRC every month. Quarterly state reviews, analysis of letters received from the children, media reports, and feedback through the SSA helpline are additional monitoring mechanisms prevalent in the state.

- **Assessments:** UNICEF has conducted Baseline and Endline Studies of the programme in 2010 and 2012 respectively, two Effectiveness Studies in upper primary schools in 2011-2012, an Effectiveness Study in the KGBV schools in 2012 and an Impact Assessment Study in 2012.

**Additional activities**

23. Meena story books, the radio programme and the Meena Manch have helped in ensuring widespread popularity of Meena in Uttar Pradesh. Every year, schools celebrate 24th September as Meena Day. On this day plays and activities centred on Meena are held in the schools. This also marks the beginning of the Meena Radio session in the new academic year. In addition, Meena Ratna Awards are given to teachers and students in recognition of their endeavours to learn and acquire new information and knowledge from the radio programme as well as apply the same to create a significant impact in their family and school. Schools are asked to submit proposals, and the most convincing stories are chosen and validated. In 2014, 23 students and 26 teachers were awarded Meena Ratna Awards.

**Advocacy for Meena Radio Programme in AP**

24. With the successful roll out of the Meena Radio Programme in UP, UNICEF advocated with the AP state SSA for roll out of the Meena Radio Programme. This was done through a series of meetings and presentations to showcase the model, the mode of delivery and the results of the Meena Radio intervention in UP. Following this, a core team comprising of representatives from the SSA, State Council Educational Research and Training (SCERT), AIR and UNICEF was constituted to develop a state specific strategy for rollout of the programme in the state.

25. In April 2012, an exposure visit to UP was organized for the core group, followed by planning meetings and a Baseline Study. These activities led to the development of an action plan for ensuring the coverage of the programme across the state.

26. The programme was re-versioned in Telugu and a few episodes were pre-tested with children and teachers to seek their feedback on the programme. The re-versioning was undertaken following a consultative process. The baseline data and consultations with the programme managers and teachers enabled selection of the most relevant programme themes for broadcast in AP.

**Roll out of Meena Radio Programme in AP**

27. In 2012, the Meena Radio Programme was introduced in approximately 13,000 primary and upper primary schools (VI, VII, and VIII) in AP. In 2014, the programme was expanded to the KGBV schools in AP.

28. The format of the programme is similar to what is followed in UP, but it is played three times in a week. The episodes that are aired are changed every year based on the priorities of the state. In addition, to increase children’s interest in the programme, Meena Vedika, introduced after the launch of the Meena
Radio Programme, is held in schools through which children participate in various activities such as essay writing (similar to the Meena Manch in UP). Prizes are awarded to the students to encourage their participation. In addition to the Meena Radio Programme, schools also play other curriculum-based radio programmes for primary schools students.

29. The implementation of the Meena Radio Programme in AP is done through the SSA with support from UNICEF. SSA bears all costs related to programme broadcast, printing and distribution of IEC materials. In addition, SSA bore the cost for district level trainings in 2012. UNICEF undertook the cost of production of 40 new episodes and state level training in 2012 and provides the content for IEC materials to the state. For school level implementation, funds from SDF are utilized by the schools for procurement of the radio set and batteries. The state has specified that the school should have one radio set for every 40 students in the school. In addition, rapid assessments have been conducted in AP, the costs of which were borne by UNICEF in 2012 and the SSA in 2013.

**Teacher’s Training**

30. The training for teachers is conducted by both SSA and UNICEF. The state follows a cascade model of training. In 2012, state level trainings were conducted by UNICEF while district and block level training were conducted by the SSA. In 2013 and 2014, the teacher’s training was re-enforced through a video conference based training session. In 2014, the responsibility to train the KGBV schools was handed over to the District Institute of Education and Training (DIET). In the training session, teachers were trained on how to lead discussions after the radio programme.

**Monitoring**

31. The SSA in AP, along with UNICEF, developed a Rapid Monitoring System for monitoring of the Meena Radio Programme. The first Rapid Monitoring round was undertaken in 2012 with the active support of UNICEF and sought to understand the quality of implementation of the programme through data collection across 19 districts. The second round of the Rapid Monitoring was undertaken by SSA in 2013 and visits were undertaken to 11 districts to understand the regularity and quality of the Meena Radio Programme in schools. UNICEF also supported an Effectiveness Study which was conducted in 2013.

32. The SSA in AP has placed an Additional Monitoring Officer (AMO) in each district. The AMO is responsible for monitoring the different schemes and programmes of the SSA. In addition, the District Education Officer (DEO), District Project Officer (DPO) at the district level, the Mandal Education Officer (MEO) at the Mandal level and Cluster Resource Person (CRP) at the cluster level are also involved in regular monitoring of schools. As part of the regular monitoring under SSA, the officers check if the Meena Radio Programme is being played in schools. They also enquire about the teachers' opinions on the programme as well as speak to students to understand if they have learnt anything from the programme. There is no separate monitoring format for the radio programme in the state.

**Advocacy for Meena Radio Programme in MP**

33. With the success of Meena Radio Programme in UP, the scale up of the intervention to other states was envisaged by UNICEF. In April 2011, a Meena Radio orientation workshop was organized in
UP for representatives of the SSA and UNICEF from Jharkhand, Chhattisgarh, MP and Rajasthan. In this workshop, the impact of the Meena Radio Programme in UP was showcased through the Effectiveness Study to answer the queries and concerns from different state member teams.

34. In 2012, UNICEF shared the content for the 160 episodes being broadcast in UP with the state government officials in MP. Following this, a core team was formed with representatives from SSA and the Department of Education, who picked a sub-set of episodes that were relevant to the state’s priorities. Out of the master list of 160 episodes, 100 episodes were shortlisted by the MP government. Episodes related to adolescent health were not selected.

**Roll out of Meena Radio Programme in MP**

35. In 2012, the intervention was launched in approximately 30,000 upper primary schools and KGBVs (for students of class VI, VII, VIII) in all 50 districts in MP.

36. In 2012, a month prior to the broadcast of the first episode of the programme, a letter was sent to the DIET and district officials regarding the Meena Radio Programme. This letter included the details of the programme, the necessity to have a radio set, the time at which the programme would be aired, and requirement for a teacher’s handbook in every school.

37. The format of the programme is similar to what is followed in UP and it is played five times a week. The programme is broadcast by AIR in all middle schools in the state between 2:45pm and 3:00 pm. The state government invested in multiple discussions and negotiations with AIR to ensure that the programme is aired at the same time across the state. The programme is also played through the Vaanya Radio for the tribal areas and until recently was also played through IGNOU stations.

38. The episodes of the programme to be aired are changed every year based on the priorities of the state. In addition to the Meena programme, schools also play other curriculum-based radio programmes for primary schools students.

39. The MP State Education Portal is used to inform the districts about any information related to the Meena Programme. Every year, a notice that serves as a directive from the state to the schools for the broadcast of the Meena Radio Programme is uploaded onto the portal. The Meena calendar and schedule are also published on this portal every year. In addition, a copy of the calendar for each school is provided by UNICEF to the state, which the state then distributes to all the schools. The education portal can be accessed at the district and block levels and in the schools that have access to the internet. Once uploaded on the education portal, it becomes the mandate of the district to ensure that all information pertaining to the Meena Radio Programme is communicated to the schools.

40. The programme is implemented by the SSA with very limited support from UNICEF. SSA bears all the costs related to programme broadcast, training and monitoring for the radio programme. The funds for procurement of the radio set are provided to the school as a part of the SDF. The IEC materials for the programme are printed by UNICEF and distributed by the state.
41. Based on the feedback received from students, teachers and the state government in 2012, UNICEF decided to design an additional 40 episodes which covered topics of child rights and the right to education in more detail. The SSA representatives from MP and AP were closely involved in the design and selection of content for these new episodes.

42. In 2012, UNICEF played an active role in advocacy for the programme, development of IEC materials and supporting the state level training for the Meena Radio Programme in MP. In the last two years, UNICEF has been involved with developing new content for the programme and providing IEC materials such as the school calendar to all the schools. Additionally, in year 1 of the programme, a teacher’s handbook was developed by UNICEF and distributed by the state to all the schools.

43. MP has started a phone-in programme where students can discuss their views on the various radio programmes being broadcast in the state. The phone-in programme is held every 2 months in the 6-month broadcast window. Based on these phone-in sessions, students share that they enjoy the programme and like the character of Meena. However, many of them want the programme duration to be extended.

**Teacher’s Training**

44. In 2012, at the time of the introduction of the programme, an orientation for each teacher (one from every school) towards the Meena Radio Programme was organized. The training was passed on to the school level through a cascade model. A state level training session was organized by the SSA in collaboration with UNICEF where a half day training for the programme was held as a part of a larger three day teacher’s training programme. Two master trainers were trained from every district and the training was then subsequently passed on to officials at the district and block levels and teachers at the school level.

**Monitoring**

45. Although SSA has undertaken the responsibility to monitor the programme, UNICEF undertook monitoring of the programme in 2012. The feedback gathered during these monitoring visits by UNICEF was shared with the state government. Currently, the Meena Radio Programme is monitored as a part of the regular monitoring activity in schools by the SSA. DIET and district monitoring agencies have a fixed number of schools that they are required to visit every month. During these visits they check whether all the radio programmes meant for the primary and middle school are being aired. In addition, there is a video conference session held every month through which district officials present their district summary reports on the status of the various radio programmes to the state. However, no distinction is made between the various radio programmes.

**Current status**

46. The Meena Radio Programme is currently being broadcast in AP, Bihar, Chhattisgarh, Jharkhand, Karnataka, MP, Maharashtra, Orissa and UP. The programme is implemented differently in Maharashtra where schools have been provided with CDs of the episodes and the time of listening to the episodes is left to the discretion of the teachers. The current study is focused on evaluating the programme in the states of UP, MP and AP. These states have been chosen for the following reasons:

- The Meena Radio Programme is a part of the SSA Annual Plan in these three states
- The programme has been broadcast using government funding since 2012
- The broadcast and tuning in model of implementation has been followed in these three states

47. The evaluation scope, methodology and findings are discussed in detail in the sections ahead.
SECTION 2
EVALUATION PURPOSE, OBJECTIVES AND SCOPE

EVALUATION PURPOSE

1. Research commissioned by UNICEF indicates that the Meena Radio Programme is popular among children. Preliminary findings revealed that the programme has played a role in influencing children’s awareness and knowledge levels and promoting behavioural changes by generating dialogue around key issues.

2. Effectiveness Studies have been carried out in UP in 2011 and AP in 2013. These studies have found a high level of engagement with Meena, with around 75% students in UP reporting that their listening sessions were always followed by discussion. More than 60% of the respondents said that they discussed the Meena Radio Programme outside school. The majority of these discussions happened with family members. In AP, 93% reported extending messages among peers/friends.

3. A conscious effort has been made as part of the Meena Radio Programme initiative to design and implement an effective monitoring and evaluation system by periodically tracking critical performance indicators. Reports from schools reveal that children eagerly await the programme. Teachers report that children go home and discuss the programme with their family members.

4. The programme has the potential to change pedagogy and teaching methods, motivate children to go to school and improve learning and recall. The entertainment-education format can also contribute significantly to several flagship programmes of the Government. Besides this, there might be possibilities/opportunities to expand both the range of themes/topics addressed by Meena Radio and its target audience to bring about more wide-scale change.

5. The Meena Radio Programme has been running through the SSA since 2010, and has been scaled up in nine states. UNICEF is advocating for the adoption and scale up of the programme across the country with MHRD.

6. While previous research and studies have provided UNICEF with some indicator of effectiveness of the programme, an evaluation is needed at this point to objectively and systematically assess the contribution that the Meena Radio Programme has had in enhancing the knowledge and awareness of students and to understand how implementation of the programme can be strengthened. The successes and challenges of the Meena Radio Programme across states need to be analysed. The evaluation findings

---

15 UP Effectiveness Study
16 Ibid.
17 AP Effectiveness Study

Evaluation of Meena Radio Programme
will further be used to strengthen replicability in other states and provide evidence for scale up with MHRD. Lessons learnt and recommendations from the implementation will be examined to ensure improved effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability.

**EVALUATION OBJECTIVE AND SCOPE**

7. The evaluation is focused on three states – UP, AP and MP. These states have been chosen since the government has taken strong ownership over the programme in these states by including it in their Annual Plans and by allocating funds for the implementation of the programme since 2012.

8. The evaluation has been designed in line with UNEG and OECD-DAC standards. The evaluation seeks to examine the Meena Radio Programme across the following criteria:

   - **Relevance** to ascertain how relevant and pertinent the Meena Radio objectives and activities are to the education programme and national flagship programmes.
   - **Effectiveness** to ascertain the extent to which the intervention has addressed knowledge gaps, attitudinal shifts, life skills, equity and influenced behaviour change among children and teachers.
   - **Efficiency** to ascertain cost effectiveness of the programme and the adequate and optimal utilization of resources - financial, infrastructure, human resources and time.
   - **Sustainability** to identify the major factors that influenced or hindered the continuity of the programme through SSA and the factors that are crucial to ensure sustainability.

9. The evaluation also specifically seeks to evaluate the intervention’s focus on gender and equity.

10. Impact is not included as an evaluation criterion given the nature of the intervention. The Theory of Change for the programme (provided in Annex 1 along with the Terms of Reference) states that the expected impact of this intervention includes:

   - Children are sensitive to and adopt positive behaviours
   - Children are sensitive to life skills, gender and social inclusion,
   - Girl’s education enhanced - enrolment, retention, quality, and literacy and
   - Improvement in teacher-student relationship and class room pedagogy

11. The programme can only contribute to these changes and causality of achievement cannot be attributed to the Meena Radio Programme, which is only a 15-30 minute structured programme. Therefore, at the time of inception of this study, it was decided to use the criterion of effectiveness to evaluate the programme.

12. The findings of the assessment and recommendations will be helpful in improving the design of the programme, advocating for its continuity and scale up and addressing any implementation gaps.

**USE OF THE FINDINGS**

13. The evaluation findings will help improve the implementation in states and support the continuity of the programme. Learnings and recommendations will also be used to advocate for the scale up of the
programme by MHRD and for programme expansion to other states. Modifications in programme episodes will also be suggested by the evaluation findings. Study outcomes will be synthesized and presented for internal deliberations within UNICEF, and further shared with external stakeholders, such as government partners like MHRD, officials of SSA and State Education Departments.

**MANAGEMENT STRUCTURE**

14. The evaluation was supervised and technically guided by a programme manager from the Communication for Development (C4D) Section at UNICEF India, with active involvement from the Education and C4D officers in the sample states. A Reference Group was set up to provide inputs to the study design and to ensure quality.

15. The responsibility to manage and oversee the evaluation process was transferred to the Research and Evaluation Specialist from the Policy, Planning and Evaluation Section after the completion of the field visits/data collection – at the Draft Report stage – owing to new procedures at UNICEF India to increase transparency and independence of evaluations.

**LIMITATIONS OF THE EVALUATION**

16. The limitations of the study are provided below:

- The study has been conducted in three of the nine states where the programme is being implemented.
- This is a formative qualitative evaluation and is based on the findings from in-depth interviews and Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) with key stakeholders at the state, district, block and school levels. The study has also undertaken analysis of secondary data available from quantitative Baseline, Endline, Impact Assessment and Effectiveness Studies to triangulate the findings. In all three states, it was not possible to have a counterfactual to assess the effectiveness of the Meena Radio Programme since the programme is being implemented in all districts in the states. Hence all the conclusions made in the effectiveness section are drawn from a triangulation of data from the primary field visits and the secondary data sources available.
- In all cases, changes in knowledge and awareness have been linked to the Meena Radio Programme. However, the evaluation cannot attribute or draw direct causal linkages between the Meena Radio Programme and the changes in knowledge and awareness in the absence of a study design that can establish causal linkages. The findings from the evaluation can only demonstrate the contribution that the radio programme has had in influencing knowledge, attitudes and behaviour of the students.
- The primary data from the field visits for the effectiveness section has been collated on the basis of FGDs with the students and the teachers. An attributional bias to the Meena Radio Programme for changes in awareness cannot be ruled out. In all the states visited, multiple other government programmes dealing with the thematic areas of the Radio programme are present.
- The cost efficiency of the Meena Radio Programme could not be compared to any other programme as there are no directly comparable programme.
- The study has not evaluated the impact of the programme, given the nature and duration of the intervention.
EVALUATION DESIGN AND METHODOLOGY

1. The assignment used a mixed methodology- using primary data and analysis of secondary data available- in order to comprehensively and judiciously cover each aspect of the intervention. The evaluation matrix provided by UNICEF (Annex II) captures the key questions, sub-questions, data sources, process and outcome indicators, and methods for analysis across the parameters of Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency and Sustainability based on the terms of reference issued by UNICEF and validated by the Evaluation Team. Gender and equity have been specifically considered as cross-cutting themes.

2. The evaluation was undertaken in a phased manner. The objectives, activities and outputs of each phase and the Evaluation Matrix are shown in Annex II.

3. The section below provides details on the methods of analysis that were used for the evaluation.

Desk Research and Document Review

4. The team has reviewed various relevant documents obtained from UNICEF including strategy documents, programme review documents, progress reports and Government Orders. These documents helped understand the objectives, rationale, operationalization and outputs/outcomes of the programme and provided the basis for the preparation of the Inception Report.

Secondary Analysis

5. Detailed secondary research was conducted to understand the context of the identified states- UP, MP and AP and sampled districts. Available data from UNICEF State Offices and the SSA were used for this analysis. Some of the key types of documents that were reviewed include:
   - Relevant Government Orders/Memos/Circulars
   - Minutes of meetings at state and district levels
   - Baseline and Endline reports
   - Progress/activity reports
   - Project monitoring data
   - Effectiveness studies
   - Budget allocation and utilization data
   - Teacher training guidebooks and reports

A complete list of documents reviewed is provided in Annex II.

Comparison of Radio Programme
6. For the purpose of the evaluation, it was initially decided to compare the Meena Radio Programme with other similar radio programmes for an efficiency analysis. However, a detailed secondary research on other radio programmes found that there was no programme that could be directly compared to the Meena Programme. The other radio programmes differed in term of design, medium of broadcast, time and frequency of broadcast and the level of involvement of teachers.

**Primary Qualitative Research**

7. The qualitative aspect of the evaluation entails primary qualitative research with different groups of stakeholders. Detailed primary research with qualitative tools was undertaken, including key stakeholder interviews, with government representatives at the state, district and block levels, discussions with teachers, and group discussions with children in the age group 11-14 and their parents. Stakeholders at each level were selected on the basis of a sampling design described in the following section. State visits were made to meet with key stakeholders and UNICEF state level staff to understand the contextual realities and collect relevant data. *Annex V* provides state fact sheets including details of stakeholders met in each state during the primary research.

8. The three main data collection methods were:

- **In-depth interviews** with identified stakeholders from across the government system at state, district, block levels; head teachers and teachers responsible for Meena Radio Programme in schools; and representatives from UNICEF involved in the design, implementation and monitoring of the programme.
- Non-participant observation by members of the Deloitte team during the broadcast of the Meena Radio Programme in schools. An Observation Checklist was developed for use during the field visits.
- Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) with students in the age group 11-14 (class VI-VIII) and parents of students in class VI-VIII. The FGDs with students allowed the Evaluation Team to understand group dynamics and interactions between participants.

9. The evaluation used participatory methods through the FGDs to obtain qualitative inputs for the evaluation. *Annex IV* contains the study tools, including the participative methods, used during the FGDs.

10. The Evaluation Team was trained on the tools and carried out a pre-testing of the tools in a school in UP. The tools were finalized based on discussions with UNICEF and the findings from the pre-testing.

**Stakeholder List**

11. The indicative number of stakeholders proposed vis-à-vis the number met is provided in the following table. The list of stakeholders to be met was developed in a consultative manner along with stakeholders from the UNICEF State Offices and the Reference Group members.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stakeholders</th>
<th>Numbers proposed</th>
<th>Numbers met</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In-depth Interviews</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State Level Stakeholders across 3 states</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
12. The secondary data, field visits and primary data collected were evaluated against the parameters of Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency and Sustainability with a focus on gender and equity.

**Ethics**

13. The Evaluation Team ensured that ethical considerations were met by obtaining the consent of all participants during the evaluation. Verbal agreements were taken from stakeholders from the government and UNICEF prior to the in-depth interviews. Detailed understanding on the evaluations purpose and method were provided to all participants and they were given the opportunity to refuse to be a part of the study at any point.

14. Students were provided with a detailed understanding of the purpose of the visit and were provided a consent form to read and sign for partaking in all primary research activities. Teachers from each school were also provided with detailed information and their consent was taken through a consent form to ensure their agreement to be involved in the study. The Consent Form has been provided in Annex III.
15. All identities of the participants in the evaluation have been kept confidential and no conflict of interest was encountered during the evaluation process.

Stories of Change

16. During the field visits, the team also probed for instances where students or teachers had initiated social change in their community on a thematic area that they had learnt about from Meena. Whenever any such story of change was identified, the Evaluation Team conducted an in-depth discussion with the identified student/teacher to document it. In order to maintain privacy of the students/teachers, the names of each participant were changed and substitute names were used. Annex VIII contains the Stories of Change.

Data Collection

17. The data collection for the assignment took place in two phases:
   - Phase One: The Evaluation Team visited one district per state to pilot the tools. The pilot visit allowed the team to refine the data collection tools based on context and findings from the field. A pilot visit report was drawn up.
   - Phase Two: The Evaluation Team visited the remaining sample districts to complete the data collection.

Sampling Plan

18. To meet the objectives of the Meena Radio evaluation, it was imperative to have the right sample for the research. Due care was given to ensure that the method for selecting the sample districts and schools was nuanced and incorporated a combination of parameters across social, educational and human development indices.
19. In the above context Deloitte had deployed a two-stage method to identify the sample:
   - Step A: Identification of sample districts
   - Step B: Identification of blocks and schools within selected districts
20. Post concurrence with UNICEF on the selected districts, Step B of the sample selection was conducted to identify the blocks and schools within these districts.
21. Ensuring maximum divergence in the selected sample had been a guiding principle for this two-step method. A consistent sample was chosen across the two steps i.e. for a low performing district, educationally backward blocks (EBB) were selected and within those blocks, low performing schools were selected based on DISE performance data. Similarly for a high performing district, non-EBB were selected and within these blocks, high performing schools were selected. This was to ensure that the end sample had maximum divergence between low and high performance schools.

Step A: Identification of Sample Districts

22. Stratified sampling was followed for selection of districts. To ensure geographical representation, the three target states were geographically demarcated into sub-regions:
- UP was classified into three geographical zones, namely Western, Central and Eastern UP
  (*Out of a total 73 districts, 27 are in Western, 27 are in Central and 19 are in Eastern UP*)
- MP was classified into 3 geographic zones, namely Western, Central and Eastern MP
  (*Out of a total of 50 districts, 18 are in Western, 16 are in Central and 16 are in Eastern MP*)
- AP was classified into 3 geographic zones, namely Northern, Central and Southern AP
  (*Out of a total of 13 districts, 6 are in Northern, 3 are in Central and 4 are in Southern AP*)

23. Post classification of districts as described above, each district (total 136 districts across the three states) was evaluated on a range of demographic and socio-economic parameters. Due care was taken to align the evaluation parameters with the overall objectives of Meena Radio Programme, such as education, child protection and survival, inclusion, gender equality. The nine parameters considered for each district were:

- Representation of marginalized communities through % Scheduled Caste/Scheduled Tribe (SC/ST) population
- Religious diversity through % Muslim population
- Poverty through % Below Poverty Line (BPL) population
- Sex Ratio
- Infant Mortality Rate (for UP and MP)
- Total Literacy Rate
- Gross Enrolment Ratio (Upper Primary)
- Transition Rate (Primary to Upper Primary)
- Gender Parity Index

*The sources for these indicators include Census 2011, DISE 2011-12, AHS 2012-13 and the Planning Commission.*

24. Post rating on the nine parameters as described above, a three-point scale (High, Medium, and Low) based on statistical percentiles was used to comparatively grade districts. The scale is provided in the following table:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Scale</th>
<th>Percentile</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>&gt; 67 percentile</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>33-67 percentile</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

18 There are a total of 75 districts in UP. However, census data was available for 73 districts
25. Based on the scale, each indicator for each district was assigned a High, Medium or Low rating and a cumulative rating (High, Medium or Low) was arrived at for each district. At this stage the normalization of negative and positive parameters was also conducted by assigning reverse weights.

26. To ensure maximum divergence, sample districts were chosen from the highest and lowest scorers for each state. In addition, while selecting, due care was taken to ensure the right mix of districts across the sub-regions described above.

27. The following tables provide a list of the districts chosen for the study sample in UP, MP and AP based on the methodology described.

**Table 6: Sample for UP**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Western</th>
<th>Central</th>
<th>Eastern</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td></td>
<td>Varanasi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td>Aligarh</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Badaun</td>
<td>Barabanki</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 7: Sample for MP**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Western</th>
<th>Central</th>
<th>Eastern</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td></td>
<td>Jabalpur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Sheopur</td>
<td>Guna</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Table 8: Sample for AP**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Northern</th>
<th>Central</th>
<th>Southern</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>High</td>
<td>West Godavari</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Medium</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low</td>
<td>Prakasam</td>
<td>Nellore</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

28. The sample districts were finalized in discussion with UNICEF.

29. The following map of India depicts the sample states and the districts selected for the evaluation. It also marks out the states where Meena Radio Programme is currently being broadcast.
Step B: Identification of Sample Blocks and Schools

30. Two blocks were chosen within each selected district based on the principle of maximum divergence based on two parameters:
   - Block proximity to the district headquarters – one block close to the district headquarters and one further away.
   - Data on EBBs by the SSA were used to choose the blocks within a district.

31. A total of three schools were chosen in each district.
   - This included Upper Primary Schools/High Schools and KGBVs (as applicable) in rural areas. Efforts were made to include at least one KGBV school in each district in UP and MP.
   - The schools were chosen based on the DISE School Report Cards 2013-14. Representation of high performing and low performing schools was considered.
   - Schools which have been given a rating of 7 and above (on 10) were considered high performing schools and those with a rating of 4 and below (on 10) were considered low performing schools.
   - To ensure maximum divergence in the sample, high performing schools were chosen in high performing districts, and low performing schools were chosen in low performing districts.
32. At the time of inception of this study, KGBV schools in AP were not broadcasting the Meena Radio Programme. Hence the sample schools do not include any KGBVs in the state.

ANALYSIS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

33. Multiple levels of analysis of the data and insights captured during the secondary and primary qualitative assessments were triangulated to arrive at a comprehensive evaluation of the Meena Radio Programme on the parameters of Relevance, Effectiveness, Efficiency, Sustainability, Gender and Equity.

34. Based on the findings and analysis, strategic recommendations have been developed. The recommendations were discussed and finalized in consultation with UNICEF and Reference Group members.
SECTION 4
FINDINGS AND ANALYSES

A. RELEVANCE

1. One of the focus areas of the evaluation was to assess the relevance of the Meena Radio Programme i.e. whether the design and content of the programme were in line with community needs, the goals of educational priorities within SSA/RTE Act and the national flagship programme priorities such as NHM, NBA, and ICDS? The key aspects that were analysed within this parameter include:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Were the contextual realities in the programming environment taken into account in the design and implementation of strategies/ interventions? With what success? Is the content and design of the programme in line with the community needs?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whether and how the intervention / approach has responded to priorities or programme strategies that may have changed over the years?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Was the policy environment and relationship with the government/ SSA officials taken into consideration at the time of designing the programme?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whether the Meena Radio Programme’s objectives and strategies are aligned to the educational priorities within SSA/RTE Act and the NCF?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whether the Meena Radio programme’s objectives and strategies are aligned to the priorities of the national flagship programmes like NHM, ICDS, ICPS and NBA/Swachh Bharath mission?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whether the programme has been cognizant of issues related to gender and equity?</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Whether the programme’s objectives and strategies are aligned to UNICEF’s global strategic plan and equity focus?</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2. The evaluation aims to analyse the relevance of the approach, concept and design of the Meena Radio Programme as an intervention to increase knowledge and awareness amongst students on issues regarded as important by the community and key flagship programmes in education. The key findings from the evaluation are provided below.
Key findings for Relevance

- **The contextual realities in the programming environment were taken into account in the design and implementation of the programme. The design and content of the Meena Radio Programme are aligned with community needs**
  - The Meena Radio Programme was implemented in UP in 2010 and expanded to MP and AP in 2012. The design and content for the programme were designed using baseline studies in UP and content workshops in consultations with various stakeholders responsible for education.
  - In AP and MP, the states reviewed the content provided by UNICEF for the programme and chose to air episodes that were in line with the priorities of the states. In AP, the programme was re-versioned into Telugu language and broadcast of the programme was changed to Telugu while in MP the programme was aired in Hindi.
  - The design of the intervention as a radio programme also was in line with the contextual realities in all three states.
  - In AP it was seen that the boys were not very interested in the Meena Radio Programme.

- **The Meena Radio Programme has responded favourably to priorities or programme strategies that may have changed over the years**
  - After the programme was introduced, based on feedback received from the states, 40 new episodes were designed. These were focused on the right to education, child rights, child protection and life skills.
  - The content for these 40 new episodes was decided based on content workshops with multiple stakeholders linked to the radio programme in all three states.

- **The policy environment and relationship with the government/SSA officials was taken into consideration at the time of designing the programme**
  - The programme was introduced in UP based on interest from both the state government and UNICEF officials following the success of the Meena Manch in the state. Hence in UP there was a very active involvement of the government officials in the conceptualization, design and implementation of the Meena Radio Programme.
  - In MP and AP, there was also a strong interest from the state government/SSA officials in introducing the programme. The government was involved in both states in deciding episodes to be aired and new content addition to the programme.

- **The objectives of the programme are well aligned with the educational priorities of the SSA/RTE Act and the NCF. It is also in line with the objectives of other national flagship programmes**
  - The Meena Radio Programme aims to improve knowledge and awareness amongst students aged 11-14 in areas of importance of school enrolment, regular school attendance, completion of education and importance of education for girls. All these are the main thrust areas of the SSA/RTE Act. However, most teachers felt the programme was not directly relevant to the school academic curriculum.
  - The programme also focuses on building knowledge and awareness on child friendly schools, gender and equity in education, health (adolescent and child health), hygiene, water and sanitation, life skills education and nutrition, all of which are emphasized by the SSA/RTE Act and in part by the NCF.
  - In addition to the SSA/RTE Act the objectives of the Meena Radio Programme are well aligned with those of national flagship programmes such as NHM, ICDS, ICPS and NBA/Swachh Bharat.

- **The programme has been cognizant of issues related to gender and equity**
  - 37 of the 200 episodes in the radio programme focus on the issue of gender and equity.

- **The programme’s strategies and objectives are well aligned with UNICEF’s strategic plan and equity focus and the 5 priority areas of UNICEF India as established in 2014**
A.1.1 Contextual realities of the programming environment in the three states were taken into account in the design of the Meena Radio Programme.

3. The Meena Radio Programme was first designed for and introduced in UP in 2010 and subsequently extended to MP and AP in 2012. The contextual realities of each of these states during the time of the design and introduction of the radio programme have been discussed in detail in the introduction section of the document. These are summarised below:

Uttar Pradesh

4. The Meena Radio Programme was introduced in the state of UP in 2010. It was seen that the character of Meena resonated with the girls very well and the Meena story books and CDs developed as a part of the initiative were very popular with the students. Recognizing the popularity of the character of Meena, the officials from the SSA and UNICEF decided to use Meena as part of their education initiatives for all middle school children. Subsequent discussions led to the conceptualization of an entertainment-education radio programme with Meena as the central character. A format for a 15-minute radio programme was developed with each episode comprising of three segments: songs, stories and games.

5. The content for the programme was decided using baseline studies conducted by UNICEF in UP. Based on these studies it was decided that the radio programme would aim to increase the levels of awareness and knowledge among children and teachers on issues related to education, child friendly schools, child protection and life skills. Meena would also be used to increase knowledge around health, nutrition, hygiene and gender roles. Once the thematic areas had been identified, several content development workshops were held by UNICEF in the state that included parents, teachers, students, SSA officials, and district coordinators as participants. Based on these a content map of 160 episodes was designed. Ideas for the content were also taken from the Meena Manch which was targeting issues such as importance of education of girls, adolescent health and awareness of the ills of child marriage. The episodes were designed by Sesame Workshop in India. The design of the programme in the form of story-song-game was developed as it found to be most engaging for children.

6. Meena Radio was broadcast through AIR in schools across the state six days a week – Monday to Saturday. The broadcast fee for the programme is borne by the state government and UNICEF provides support through a designated Meena Radio consultant. UNICEF also helps with producing the IEC materials for the programme and training and monitoring of the programme.

Madhya Pradesh and Andhra Pradesh

7. In 2012, following the success of the Meena Radio Programme in UP, the programme was introduced in MP and AP. Officials from the MP and AP governments expressed an interest in the radio programme. Radio programmes for primary school students were present in both states, hence they were already in favour of using radio as a medium for dissemination of education to students.

8. The content and language of the programme were in line with the community needs in MP. The programme was re-versioned in Telugu for AP. In both states, the governments decided on a sub-set of episodes from the list of 160 episodes that they felt were suitable to their state. The programme was aired
in both states from October 2012. The training and monitoring of the radio programme are a mandate of the SSA in both states.

**A1.2 The design and content of the programme is in line with the community needs**

9. Effort was made during the conceptualization phase of the Meena Radio Programme to ensure that the programme in its design, content and mode of delivery to the students was in line with the contextual realities of the state as well as the needs of the community.

**Benefits of the radio format**

10. As described above, the programme was first designed for the state of UP and then extended to MP and AP based on demand from the respective state governments. Based on state level discussions in UP with UNICEF and the SSA, the Evaluation Team found that the decision to air Meena as a radio programme was based on the fact that the state has irregular electricity supply and faces power shortages especially during the day. The intervention as a radio programme in this context was regarded as cost-effective and practical and envisaged as being able to reach all children in all areas of the state. State level discussions in AP and MP similarly revealed that all officials felt that broadcasting Meena in the form of an interactive radio programme ensures that the programme can reach students across schools in all the regions of the state.

**Involvement of a wide section of stakeholders in development/selection of programme content to ensure that the content is in line with the local needs**

11. The content of the programme was informed through formative discussions with educators, government officials and DIET lecturers. Several content development workshops were held by UNICEF in the state that included parents, teachers, students, SSA officials and district coordinators as participants. Based on these, a content map of 160 episodes dealing with the thematic areas of education, gender and equity, nutrition, sanitation and hygiene was designed. Ideas for the content were also taken from the Meena Manch and the baseline evaluation study conducted in UP. In AP and MP, the states modified the programme to their local context and selected episodes out of the 160 which were more in line with their own priorities.

**Programme in line with the needs of most students. Girls more engaged in the programme than boys**

12. Majority of the teachers and parent met during field visits across the schools in all ten districts agreed that the needs of the students are met by the programme content. The issues covered by the programme were seen as relevant and important by a majority of students in the schools visited. The Evaluation Team observed the broadcast of the programme in some of the schools visited and found that the programme is enjoyed by the large majority of students and elicits their participation. In most schools however, it was seen that girls were more engaged in the programme as compared to boys. In AP, the programme is viewed as being more relevant for girls. Teachers met during the primary research for this evaluation felt that the programme was focused on girls and hence the boys are not interested in the programme. In the schools visited in UP and MP, the teachers felt that the programme is relevant for both

---

19 Meena Ki Duniya, the Production Process
boys and girls. In addition, even though teachers were closely involved in designing the content for the episodes in all three states, when interviewed many of them felt that the programme interfered with the regular academic curriculum of the school. Most of them maintained that the programme was relevant for the overall development of students but it was not an academic programme.

13. Despite the involvement of multiple stakeholders in deciding the content of the programme, the Evaluation Team observed that the content of some episodes, especially those that deal with early childhood development such as the importance of breastfeeding and early childhood vaccination, was not seen to be relevant for students in the age group of 11-14.

Programme needs to be further aligned to the socio-economic context

14. Through discussions and observations from the field it was seen that there are potential opportunities to improve the relevance of the content to the socio-economic context of the students in schools. For instance, while the episodes talk about the importance of a balanced diet and green vegetables they do not take into account that many families are not able to afford many food items, such as vegetables and milk. The programme does not provide information on alternative sources of nutrition that are locally available.

A2. The programme has responded favourably to changes in priorities as expressed by the states

15. From discussions with the UNICEF consultant in UP and the state government officials in MP and AP, the programme was expanded and content for 40 additional episodes focusing on the right to education was developed based on the feedback received from the states. The content for the new episodes was decided in a workshop where SSA officials and UNICEF officials from the states of AP, UP and MP were present. Feedback was also taken from the students and teachers in these states. Currently, UNICEF has provided content for 200 episodes of the Meena Radio Programme. The states have had the flexibility to adapt and choose the episodes that they want to air based on their areas of focus. In AP and MP, a committee comprising of teachers, DIET lecturers and SSA officers decide on relevant themes and episodes to be broadcast each year.

16. The programme can further be strengthened by taking active inputs from government officials and teachers on the content of the programme and suggestions on any changes which could be made to the format of the programme to make it less repetitive and more exciting for students, especially those in class VIII.

A3. The policy environment and the relationship of UNICEF with the government/SSA officials were very favourable during the design/implementation of the programme

Favourable Programming Environment

17. As discussed earlier above, the Meena Manch introduced earlier by UNICEF in UP was a successful initiative. After the introduction of the Meena Manch, teachers reported that girls became more vocal and engaged more in dialogues regarding their rights. In 2009, the State Project Director (SPD) in UP suggested that a radio programme could be developed using the character of Meena given the
popularity and impact of the Meena Manch. UNICEF was also independently very keen on enhancing the reach and popularity of Meena and hence there was a very favourable environment for programme design and introduction in the state. Therefore, the state government and UNICEF collaborated well together as they shared a common interest in furthering the impact of Meena.

**Interactive radio programme format present in AP and MP**

18. In both AP and MP, interactive radio programmes were being used to mainstream academics (such as the English is Fun radio programme) in the primary schools. Hence, a radio-based intervention for middle school students in both states was very well received by government officials, students and teachers.

19. The design and content of the programme were found to be conducive to the policy environment present in all the three states at the time of its introduction. The RTE Act was introduced in 2009, and the Meena Radio Programme was envisaged in 2010. Meena re-emphasized and reiterated the importance of education and hence was in line with the priorities of the states. The objectives of Meena were also aligned closely with the NCF present in all the states.

**A4. The objectives of the Meena Radio Programme are directly relevant to the objectives of the National Curriculum Framework (NCF) and further the aims of the Right to Education (RTE) Act**

20. The design and approach of the Meena Radio Programme have been relevant to achieving the goals states in the NCF. The Meena Radio Programme includes topics that span the areas of education, child protection, sanitation, hygiene, nutrition, child health, gender and equity and life skills. The SSA/RTE Act and NCF have many objectives. Some of these have high/moderate synergy with the objectives of Meena as shown in the next exhibit:
Exhibit 5: Areas of Synergy between Meena Radio Programme, RTE/SSA and NCF

SSA/RTE
- Free and compulsory education for children aged 6-14
- Standards for student-teacher ratio, appropriately trained teachers in schools
- Involvement of local authorities, parents and governments in achieving universal education
- Child friendly and child centered learning
- Bridge gender and social equity gaps
- Retention of students and completion of education
- Convergence with schemes on sanitation, hygiene, clean water, health, nutrition of children etc.
- Norms on location of schools, school infrastructure, civil maintenance etc.
- Life skills focused education
- Special focus on girl’s education and education of children with special needs
- Availability and use of teaching-learning materials and aids
- Prohibits physical punishment, harassment, corruption etc.

Meena
- Education for all – ensuring enrolment, retention and completion of school for all students with an emphasis on girls
- To cause a measurable change in knowledge, attitude in area related to hand hygiene, sanitation, nutrition and health
- Gender and Social Equity – Rights of the girl child; Social Inclusion
- Life skill based education: Problem solving, decision making, critical thinking, communication, negotiation, coping with emotions and stress, self-assessment, conflict resolution and management, and relationship skills such as empathy
- To model and endorse the concept of child friendly schools, modeling good teaching, congenial and friendly ambience; Child Protection

NCF
- Connect knowledge to life outside school
- Non-rote based learning
- Making examinations flexible
- Make education more relevant and meaningful and have a child centered curriculum
- Have parents and local community engaged in education
- Gender and social equity in schools
- Enabling and nurturing environment in schools, child friendly classrooms
- Emphasizes on health and nutrition
- Teaching pedagogy in line with child centered and child focused learning
- Teaching aides and learning materials, use fit technology to enhance learning
- Focus on moral and ethical education

Key
- High Synergy
- Moderate Synergy
A5. The objectives and strategies of the Meena Radio Programme are aligned well to the priorities of the national flagship programmes like NHM, ICDS, ICPS, SABLA and the NBA/Swachh Bharath mission.

21. The Meena Radio Programme has episodes focusing on issues related to education, health, hygiene, nutrition, child protection etc. and hence is closely aligned with the priorities of national flagship programmes such as the NHM, ICDS, NBA, SSA/RTE Act ICPS, SABLA. The exhibit below depicts areas of synergy between the Meena Radio programme and the related national flagship programmes.
Exhibit 6: Mapping of Flagship Programmes with Objectives of Meena Radio Episodes

**SESA:** Universalisation of Quality Elementary Education & strengthening school infrastructure

**Meena Objectives:** Improve life skills in children to address existing social norms which prevent 100% enrolment, retention and completion of upper primary education

**RTE:** Right to free & compulsory education and ensure all-round development of the child

**Meena Objectives:** Improve nutrition & health status of children

**ICDS:** Improve nutrition & health status of children

**Meena Objectives:** To increase awareness on issues related to health & intent to washing hands properly after defecation & before handling food

**SABLA:** To increase awareness on issues related to health, girl education and gender roles

**Related Episodes**

**Episode 1:** School se bhula bhula conveys the message that teachers should be friendly with students and make them believe that classrooms can be a joyful place.

**Episode 2:** The story Faridabad makes a father realise that it is very important to enrol his child in school when he was not able to calculate a bill.

**Episode 52:** In Trophy ka raaz Meena’s classmate Sunil is caught stealing a trophy from school. He is then told by his teacher that by attending school every day and working hard he can win a trophy himself.

**Episode 174:** The story Tigaana Maa conveys the message that immunizations are important. Though there are minor side effects of immunization but it is easily manageable.

**Episode 38:** The story Main Bhole grayi conveys the importance of eating indicated salt.

**Episode 45:** The story Ullik bharo stresses on the point that building toilets at home is not expensive. It can be done by saving money.

**Episode 20:** The story Ghar Leja Barati stresses on the importance of keeping the community around you clean.

**Episode 152:** In the story Darr ka raaz Meena’s friend gets very disturbed after she is punished by the teacher indicating that corporal punishment at school is not acceptable.

**Episode 23:** Sur Lagaan talks about how child labour is a punishable offence.

**Episode 126:** In Billo ka gossa kyaon aas hai Billo prefers to stay at school because he is scolded by his parents at home. The story conveys that elders should realise effect of long-term emotional abuse.

**Episode 11:** Patang meanaata conveys the importance of consuming iron supplementation & a diet rich in iron to prevent anaemia in adolescent girls.

**Episode 10:** Sabse shabd padaahat stresses on equal rights to girls and boys for going to school. It also teaches that girls and boys are equally intelligent.

**Episode 97:** In Ab tum Badi ho grayi bo Meena’s sister feels very weak and faints which conveys that iron tablets should be taken each week by girls above the age of 10.

*The episodes of the radio programme listed in the exhibit are representative examples.*
A6. The programme has been cognizant of issues related to gender and equity.

Content related to gender and equity

22. Based on an analysis of the content of the 200 episodes, the Meena Radio Programme has 18.5% of episodes that are centred on gender and equity issues. These episodes deal with topics such as equal rights for education and food, equal opportunities for girls and boys, gender parity/stereotypes, equity in education, equity in behaviour and interactions, adolescent health and freedom. However, since the states air only some but not all the Meena episodes designed, a state-wise analysis of the content is presented below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Total number of episodes aired in 2014-2015</th>
<th>Episodes focused on gender and equity</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Uttar Pradesh</td>
<td>103</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madhya Pradesh</td>
<td>101</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andhra Pradesh</td>
<td>57</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Reach to further equity and access for girls

23. The Meena Radio programme is broadcast through AIR and radio as a medium has widespread reach. This ensures that the programme can reach all schools even in remote rural areas assuming that the schools procure a radio set and the quality of the radio signal is clear. Therefore, given the above mentioned constraints, it was found that the programme in its current form and design reaches all children that attend school. Data from the UP Effectiveness Study in 2011 revealed that 63% of enrolled students listen to the Meena Radio Programme. In all the schools visited across the 10 districts, over 90% students who studied in the schools belonged to marginalized communities and tribal populations and hence the programme is able to reach this group, thus furthering the programme’s focus on equity and reaching the most vulnerable population.

24. Furthermore, at its inception, the Meena Radio Programme targeted not only upper primary schools but also KGBV schools, which provide an educational opportunity to girls from marginalized communities. This meant that a wide range of students from different economically backward communities, including girls in KGBV schools, had access to the radio programme to enhance their knowledge and awareness based on its contents.

A7. The programme objectives are well aligned with UNICEF’s global strategic plan and equity focus and the priorities established by UNICEF India in 2014

25. Analysis of UNICEF’s global strategic plan shows a strong focus on issues of gender and equity, improving education levels amongst girls and ending child marriage. In addition, the strategic plan focuses on improving health, hygiene, nutrition, water, sanitation and quality of education for all children. Another issue that is of importance in the plan is child protection and child-centred teaching pedagogy. All these issues are discussed in the various episodes of the Meena Radio Programme. The 200 episodes of the Meena Radio Programme span topics of water, sanitation and hygiene, nutrition, child health,
education, child protection, gender and equity, life skills, ill effects of tobacco, importance of hand hygiene and right to education. The table below depicts the number of episodes on these key focus areas.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Theme</th>
<th>Number of episodes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Child friendly schools</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child protection</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Education</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>WASH (including hand hygiene)</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nutrition</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life skills</td>
<td>39</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender and equity</td>
<td>37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

26. The five priority areas defined by UNICEF India in 2014 include:
   - Reduction of open defecation
   - Reduction of stunting
   - Protection of children from violence and exploitation
   - Reduction of neo-natal deaths
   - All children are in school and learning

27. The original 160 episodes of the Meena Radio Programme developed by UNICEF contain episodes that focus on all these areas. The 40 new episodes developed by UNICEF in 2013-14 focus exclusively on strengthening knowledge and awareness amongst the students about the concept of child friendly schools, child protection and right to education. In addition, they also emphasize the development of essential life skills amongst the students, which is an important area of focus for a more holistic approach to education. The 40 episodes comprise 9 episodes on RTE, 5 episodes on child friendly schools, 12 episodes on life skills, 12 episodes on child protection (including child labour and child marriage) and 2 episodes on gender and equity.

Conclusion

The Evaluation Team found that the content of the Meena Radio Programme is seen as relevant for the overall development of students by all the stakeholders. Government officials, students, teachers, DIET and SIET officials have all been closely involved with designing/selecting the episodes to be produced and broadcast in all three states. The objectives of the Meena Radio Programme are very well aligned with the goals of the SSA, the vehicle for implementing the RTE Act, with episodes that focus on promoting enrolment and regular attendance in schools. However, most of the teachers interacted with during the primary research felt that the programme is not directly relevant to the school academic curriculum. Teachers and boys interacted with in AP felt that the programme is more relevant for girls and hence boys are less interested in the programme than girls. The objectives of the programme are also

20 The total exceeds 200 as there are episodes that talk about more than one theme
very well aligned with UNICEF’s global strategic plan and the five priority areas for UNICEF India in 2014.

**B. EFFECTIVENESS**

28. An important focus area of the ongoing evaluation is to assess the *effectiveness* of the Meena Radio Programme i.e. *the extent to which the objectives of the radio programme have been achieved*. The key aspects that were analysed within this parameter include:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Key questions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• The extent to which the Meena Radio Programme has met its main objectives – i.e. addressing knowledge gaps, attitudinal shifts, life skills, equity and influencing behaviour change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The extent to which the programme is recalled by the students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The extent to which the intervention has been able to influence the class room pedagogy or teacher’s style of teaching</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Whether the strategies adopted by the Meena Radio Programme have been effective in furthering the aims of the SSA and the RTE Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The extent to which the programme has been cognizant of issues related to gender and equity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• The extent to which the episode broadcasted is discussed after the radio programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Factors influencing the achievement or non-achievement of the objectives</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

29. The key findings from the evaluation of the effectiveness of the Meena Radio Programme are presented below:
Key findings for Effectiveness

- The Meena Radio Programme has been effective in meeting its objectives – i.e. addressing knowledge gaps, attitudinal shifts, life skills, equity and influencing behaviour change in some thematic areas
  - The main objective of the Meena Radio Programme is to increase knowledge, awareness and intent among students on key areas of education, health and nutrition, water, sanitation, hygiene, child protection and life skills.
  - The programme has been effective in improving knowledge and awareness on topics such as hand hygiene, importance of using toilets, nutrition, child labour, child marriage, and importance of education.
  - The areas where knowledge gaps remain are infant health, immunization and gender stereotypes.
  - The programme has been very effective in the residential KGBV schools in UP.

- The Meena Radio Programme has a high recall value among students and has been effective in eliciting participation and keeping the majority of students engaged
  - The characters of Meena and Mithu have high recall amongst the students.
  - In the schools visited, there is a high recall value of the Meena Radio Programme amongst most of the students. Many students can recount stories from the programme while others sing along with the title song while some of them try to solve the puzzle after the programme.
  - Students report discussing the programme with their friends and siblings. The awareness amongst the parents including SMC members on the radio programme is, however, very poor.

- The Meena Radio Programme has had very limited influence in the class room pedagogy or teacher’s style of teaching
  - The objectives of the Meena Radio Programme did not include influencing the classroom pedagogy of the teachers. However, there are a few episodes that deal with innovative and interesting ways to help children to learn.
  - Very few of the teachers met (3 out of a 110) have incorporated examples from Meena into their regular academic teaching. 1-2 of them have tried to use puzzles in their classes to elicit student participation.

- The strategies adopted by the Meena Radio Programme have been effective to some extent in furthering the aims of SSA and the RTE
  - The parents, students and teachers in all schools visited were aware of the importance of education and regular school attendance

Focus on gender has been relatively high in the Meena Radio Programme; however, the effect on students has been limited. The Meena Radio Programme has a strong focus on socio-economic equity via its reach and content

- 37 of the 200 episodes of the Meena Radio Programme focus on gender and equity. While awareness on gender discrimination and equal rights to education and food has improved amongst students, the awareness of gender stereotypes remains particularly low.
- The Meena Radio Programme has a strong focus on socio-economic equity including caste. The programme is targeted to government schools where majority of the students (>90%) belong to backward and marginalized communities and tribal populations.

- Discussions facilitated after the broadcast of the programme are limited
  - The quality of discussions facilitated by the teachers after the programme broadcast is very good in the KGBV schools in UP and in the schools in AP.
  - In MP, in all the schools visited, the teachers did not facilitate any discussions post the broadcast of the programme.

- Multiple factors have contributed differentially to the success of the programme in meeting its objectives in the three states
  - The effectiveness of the programme is more when it is supported by additional interventions such as the Meena Manch in UP, the Meena Vedika in AP, and the presence of Meena-related storybooks in schools.
  - Some of the other factors that contribute to effectiveness include the quality of the radio signal, training of teachers, regular monitoring of the programme and IEC materials for the programme, amongst others.
Using primary and secondary data sources for arriving at conclusions for the Effectiveness section

30. The conclusions in this section have been arrived at based on a triangulation of the data from the primary research for this study and secondary data sources. While the primary research study was qualitative in nature, all the secondary studies are quantitative. The Evaluation Team has analyzed all the data available to draw conclusions on thematic areas where the Meena Radio Programme has been effective in terms of increasing the knowledge and awareness of students.

31. The following documents have been referred to in this section:

- **Baseline Studies**: Baseline Studies for the states of UP, MP and AP were conducted prior to the introduction of the Meena Radio Programme in these three states. These studies probed for the awareness amongst students on issues related to education, hygiene, nutrition, sanitation etc. The findings from the Baseline Study in UP were used to identify themes around which the content of the programme was developed. These studies were conducted in 2010 in UP and 2012 in AP and MP respectively. In addition, a Baseline Study was conducted in the KGBV schools in UP prior to the introduction of the Meena Radio Programme in these schools.

- **Endline Study**: The Endline Study was conducted in UP in 2012. It is important to note that this study was conducted a year after the scale-up of the programme in the state. In the Endline Study, levels of awareness amongst students on thematic areas probed for in the Baseline Study were assessed. In addition, the study compared the effect of the Meena Radio Programme on the levels of awareness amongst the exposed and unexposed students. The exposed group consisted of students who attended school regularly and had been listening to the Meena Radio Programme. The unexposed group comprised of students with limited exposure to the Meena Radio Programme.

  The Endline Study revealed that around 50% of the students had been listening to the Meena Radio Programme regularly and they heard an average of 4.6 episodes per week and recalled an average of 7.2 messages each.

  The Endline Study found that for some thematic areas such as child labour, child marriage, hand washing, nutrition, etc. the overall awareness of the students was less than that found in the Baseline Study in UP. This trend was reaffirmed by comparing the levels of awareness between the exposed and the unexposed group as this can be correlated more strongly with the Meena Radio Programme. However, since these studies were conducted three years ago, it is difficult for the Evaluation Team to identify reasons for this difference and the Endline Study has not commented on these either. Additionally, the difference in the awareness levels between the exposed and unexposed groups for most thematic areas are small. This can be attributed to the fact that students had been listening to the programme for a short time period and it is not possible to expect significant changes in knowledge levels of students.

- **Effectiveness Studies**: Two rounds effectiveness studies were conducted in UP in upper primary schools and one in the KGBV schools. The studies were conducted in 2011-2012. An Effectiveness Study was also conducted in AP in 2013.

- **Impact Assessment**: A study to assess the impact of the Meena Radio Programme in UP was conducted in 2012.

- **Rapid Assessment Studies**: Two rounds of Rapid assessment were conducted in AP in 2012 and 2013 respectively.
32. One of the major limitations in the triangulation of the secondary data with the primary research findings is that there is a difference in the data collection methods. The Evaluation Team has therefore relied on the data from the primary research for drawing conclusions. Wherever applicable, the secondary data has been used to corroborate the findings from the primary research. If there are instances where there is a difference between the primary research and the secondary data then this has been specifically called out. Furthermore, a comparison between the Baseline and the Endline Study is available only for UP.

B1.1 The analysis of the qualitative research conducted through FGDs and triangulated with secondary analysis of existing studies indicate that the Meena Radio Programme has achieved mixed success in improving awareness across the various themes and issues addressed by it.

33. The core objective of the Meena Radio Programme has been to enhance knowledge and awareness on issues of gender and equity, health, hygiene and sanitation, child friendly schools and right to education amongst middle school children in the community. The goal of the programme is to improve the students’ general awareness by creating or building on their existing knowledge. Any positive behaviour change from such increased awareness is to be seen as an added achievement to the cause.

34. The following section gives an overview of the findings of this evaluation on the major themes covered by the programme and the extent of its effectiveness in developing and improving awareness and promoting positive change in behaviour and practice among the sample students. Annex VII has detailed descriptions of the findings from each state. This section is based on the findings from the participative primary research and has been triangulated with the findings from the Baseline Studies, Endline Study, Effectiveness Studies, Rapid Assessment Studies and Impact Assessment Reports. This section does not aim to draw a causal linkage between the Meena Radio Programme and the changes in knowledge, awareness or behaviours. Instead it recognizes that the Meena Radio Programme is one intervention amongst other influences.

35. The analysis of the qualitative research conducted through FGDs indicates that the Meena Radio Programme has achieved mixed success in improving awareness across the various themes and issues addressed by it. There is a high level of awareness among the students on some of the thematic areas focused on by the programme but not all, which implies that the level of effectiveness in its key objective of enhancing knowledge and awareness is somewhat limited. Nevertheless, the increase in knowledge and awareness has in some cases translated into a desired behavioural change. However, as discussed in the preceding sections, behaviour change was not an objective of the programme.

The table below provides a comparison of the awareness levels and positive attitudes of the students exposed to the Meena Radio Programme as compared to the students who are not exposed to it. This table has been taken from the Impact Assessment Study conducted in UP in 2012.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator</th>
<th>Endline (Exposed)</th>
<th>Endline (Unexposed)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Positive attitude to child labour (knowing that it is wrong)</td>
<td>66.9</td>
<td>63.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>High self-efficacy in postponing marriage till legal age (self)</td>
<td>55.4</td>
<td>48.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluation of Meena Radio Programme</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

| Knowledge about the correct steps for hand washing | 96.1 | 91.5 |
| Hand washing behavior for self | 90.6 | 68.2 |
| Positive attitude to gender equality | 71.5 | 63.0 |
| Knowledge that immunizations protect from disease | 95.7 | 80.0 |
| Positive attitude to children with disabilities | 84.8 | 70.3 |
| Positive attitude to education | 82.1 | 75.1 |
| High self-efficacy in completing class VIII | 86.7 | 83.3 |
| Knowledge about impact of iron deficiency | 74.5 | 49.7 |
| High self-efficacy in shunning open defecation | 63.3 | 56.7 |

36. Data comparison between the exposed and unexposed groups in the Endline report from UP show an increase in the overall levels of knowledge in the exposed group across all the adjudged indicators. Significant changes in knowledge and positive attitudes between the exposed and unexposed groups were found on topics related to nutrition, attitude to children with disabilities, immunization and hand hygiene. On other topics such as child labour, child marriage, gender equality, ills of open defecation and positive attitudes towards education the difference in awareness between students exposed to Meena were marginally higher than those not exposed to the programme. Marginal differences between the exposed and unexposed groups were seen with regards to positive attitudes towards education and completion of school till class VIII.

37. The findings from the primary research study found that in all the three states visited, students interacted with had high levels of awareness on topics related to nutrition, sanitation and hand hygiene (both knowledge and practice). In addition in all three states, high levels of knowledge amongst students on issues of child protection (child labour and child marriage) were observed. For example, majority of the students interacted with knew the legal age for a child to marry.

38. While attitudes towards gender equality, immunization, education and children with disabilities were seen to be more positive in the exposed group as compared to the unexposed group, findings from the primary research revealed that most students had poor awareness on these topics. On the topic of education, the Evaluation Team found that in UP (in Barawaniki and Baduan in particular) and in MP even though students felt it was important to get educated, most students interacted with believed it was their responsibility to help their parents in the fields, and were willing to skip school to do it. Teachers across the three states reported that attendance rates were as low as 20% during harvest seasons. However, it was interesting to note that the majority of the parents interacted with felt responsible to fully educate both boys and girls.

39. During the FGDs, the Evaluation Team probed for changes in behaviour adopted by the students after listening to Meena Radio Programme or because of the programme. Most of the students across the states reported having changed their practices related to WASH (hand washing, hygiene and sanitation) and personal grooming. In the KGBV schools, the majority of the students stated to have become more confident to ask questions, express themselves and not give into peer pressure after listening to the Meena Radio Programme.

Awareness and practice of hand washing is high
40. Hand washing was seen to be one of the key areas where the Meena Radio Programme has been effective in increasing knowledge and awareness amongst the students. In most cases, this awareness has resulted in a behavior change with students washing their hands before and after meals as seen in the schools. Many students interacted with knew the importance of hand washing before and after eating and after defecating. They also were aware of the five steps of hand washing. The Evaluation Team also observed students washing their hands with soap before and after eating.

41. A majority of the students claimed to have learned about hand washing from the Meena Radio Programme. The findings from the primary research corroborate well with Effectiveness Studies and Impact Assessments conducted in UP and AP where it was seen that the most recalled messages from the Meena Radio Programme were centered on water, sanitation, hand washing and hygiene. The Effectiveness Study conducted in UP in 2012 and in AP in 2013 indicated that messages around water, sanitation, hand washing and hygiene elicited the highest level of recall, reported by over 27% and 29% of the respondents respectively. In the Endline Study in UP in 2012, 90.6% of those exposed to Meena Radio Programme reported positive behaviour on hand washing compared with only 68.2% of those that were unexposed to the programme. From the primary visits for this study, it was seen that in 27 out of 30 schools visited, students identified hand washing as one of the key learnings from the Meena Radio Programme. The major exception was found in a school in a tribal area in Sheopur district where students would clean their hands with mud rather than soap. Parents and teachers reported that students wash their hands before and after eating and after using the toilet.

42. The knowledge and awareness about hand washing and the change in behavior is the combined effect of the Meena Radio Programme, other WASH initiatives and constant reinforcement from the teachers.

*The primary research found that majority of students interacted with across the three states are aware about issues related to personal hygiene. These findings are corroborated by secondary sources with the Effectiveness Study in UP and AP stating that more than 90% of students were aware of the importance of cleanliness and were well groomed.*

43. During the present evaluation, it was observed that students in all the three states seemed to have an improved sense of personal hygiene and cleanliness. Interactions during the FGDs with the parents in most schools revealed that children were very particular about having a bath, keeping their nails clean and ensuring that their hair was combed before leaving for school. Students reported learning about hygiene and cleanliness from the Meena Radio Programme. During the present evaluation, teachers in one school in AP reported that ever since the broadcast of the Meena Radio Programme started at their school, finger nail cutting sessions have been organized for the students every Thursday. Uniforms have been distributed by school authorities in AP and UP and a large majority of students in schools in these states came to school dressed in their uniforms. Awareness on the importance of keeping oneself neat and tidy in appearance has increased for both boys and girls in all the three states. In particular, girls at the KGBV schools in UP appeared to be more conscious about personal grooming, whether it means properly tied hair, wearing of uniforms or cut finger nails.

44. This finding was corroborated by secondary sources. Effectiveness Studies in UP in 2012 revealed that 92.1% of the students reported taking actions such as cutting nails on time, bathing
regularly, maintaining cleanliness and wearing slippers, etc. as a result of listening to the Meena Radio Programme. The 2013 Effectiveness Study conducted in AP probed for teachers’ opinions on the impact of the Meena Radio Programme on the personal grooming habits of students. In the study, 96.5% of the teachers reported students taking care of their personal hygiene washing their hands properly, maintaining cleanliness and taking a bath regularly.

**Awareness on use of toilets and need for separate toilets for boys and girls is high in all three states, despite its low use due to constraining factors**

45. Awareness on the importance of having and using clean toilets at home is relatively high in all states visited. Most students recognize the need for separate toilets for boys and girls in schools. There have also been actions taken by some students in all states to get toilets built in their homes.

46. In 7 out of 9 schools in AP, both boys and girls used the toilets at school. Teachers in almost all schools visited in AP stated that the importance of using of toilets is one of the key areas where the awareness of students has increased. This awareness has translated into a behavior change amongst the girls in the schools.

47. The Effectiveness Study from UP reported that 16% of students specifically mentioned a desire to help with the construction of toilets in their homes as an action they intended to take after listening to the Meena Radio Programme. However, the Evaluation Team observed that in many schools in UP the toilets were locked or broken.

48. The Baseline Study conducted in MP found that 81% of the students reported the absence of a toilet in their household. Out of the students who reported having toilets in school, only 55% claimed to utilize them. The major reasons reported for not using the toilets in school were that the toilets were dirty (40%), they did not feel like using toilets (37%) and toilets were locked (27%). In MP, the Evaluation Team found that majority of the students in Sheopur and Guna did not have toilets at home and did not use the ones at school (especially the boys who had a habit of going in the open to defecate). In Jabalpur, comparatively, more students claimed to have toilets at home; however, the majority of the boys met would still go out in the open during school times even though toilets were available at school. They reported the poor conditions of the boys’ toilets as the main reason for not using them.

49. The Evaluation Team found that in all three states, students reported poor financial conditions as one of the main reasons for the absence of toilets at the students’ homes. Secondary analysis of data from the Baseline, Endline and Impact Assessment studies from the three states found that students reported dirty toilets as the main reason for not using toilets in the school.

**Students have high awareness on the importance of regular attendance and completion of education. However, most students miss school during the harvest season to help their parents at home.**

50. FGDs with the students revealed that they regard education and regular attendance of school as important. Both of these aspects are key messages of the Meena Radio Programme. Previously conducted Effectiveness Studies in UP and AP revealed that one of the reasons students loved the Meena Radio Programme was because it taught students to attend school regularly. The Impact Assessment study conducted in UP found that more than 82% of students exposed to the Meena Radio Programme had
positive attitudes towards education, compared to ~75% of students not exposed to the programme. Furthermore, almost 90% of students believed they had the capability to resist pressure to drop out of school. The Effectiveness Study conducted in AP in 2013 also revealed that 77% of the students perceived it as important to attend school every day so as to do better in studies. Similar responses were received by the Evaluation Team as most students felt coming to school was important to do well in studies. The attendance rate amongst the students was seen to be high and absenteeism was seen to be the least in AP compared to UP and MP during the primary research for this study.

51. Nevertheless, on the issue of contributing to workload in the fields or at home, most students felt it acceptable for them to study during the day and work in the fields/shops after school. During the harvest season the students feel obliged help their parents in the field and teachers reported that attendance could fall to as low as 20% during harvest time. This goes to further demonstrate that while awareness is high, this does not always translate to actual behaviour change. Domestic work is a major factor contributing to girls not attending school regularly except in KGBV schools in UP.

52. Interactions with parents revealed that they felt that both boys and girls should be given equal opportunity to pursue higher education. They felt education would help their children secure a better future for themselves and improve the quality of their lives. However, girls often did not study further as they would get married early in UP (Barabanki, Badaun) and MP (Sheopur, Guna). The proximity of a high school to the village was another important factor that determined the willingness of the parents to get the girls educated further.

High degree of awareness of the legal age of marriage. However, teachers reported that many of the girls in UP and MP get married before the age of 18.

53. The awareness of the issue of child marriage is high across all schools visited. Boys and girls are aware that the legal age for marriage is 18 for girls and 21 for boys. The Effectiveness Study conducted in AP in 2013 showed that >90% of the respondents were aware of this fact. However, only 10.3% of the students reported discussing the issue of child marriage with their family while 8.4% stated discussing it with their friends. A few teachers in UP and MP reported that the age at which most girls get married has gone up from 12-13 to about 16-17.

54. While knowledge and awareness levels are high in MP, it was found that in Sheopur parents stated that though their children are married at an early age (5-6 years) they do not send their daughters to the husband’s house until later. Baseline studies in UP reported that nearly three fourth of the students interacted with felt it was okay for a girl to get married at a young age if her father deemed it fit. The impact assessment in UP, however, showed higher awareness on the subject of child marriage in students exposed to the Meena Radio Programme as compared to the unexposed group (Table 11). This finding was corroborated in the current evaluation. In one of the KGBVs visited in Barabanki, a student convinced her family to prevent an arranged marriage of a friend. Similarly, in West Godavari in AP, when students found out that their classmate was going to get married, they spoke to their teacher and visited the girl’s parents to collectively convince them to not get their daughter married until she had completed her education (Refer to the stories of change in Annex VIII for more details).
55. The Meena Radio Programme has contributed to this increased awareness amongst students as revealed in the discussions with the students and the teachers. There has been a constant reinforcement of this message by the teachers in the classrooms, textbooks in school, efforts of district officials in raising awareness about the issue, and police interventions in cases of child marriage. This awareness has not influenced behavior change significantly as a 15-minute intervention like the Meena Radio Programme cannot be expected to change the social and cultural practices and norms in the community.

Findings from the primary research reveal that awareness about gender discrimination is high; however, gender roles remain entrenched. The secondary data found that very few students could recall messages related to gender from the Radio Programme.

56. The Meena Radio Programme aims to raise awareness about gender, specifically about differential treatment and discrimination. The Evaluation Team found that while students were aware of some aspects of gender discrimination, gender roles were found to be deeply engrained in the minds of the students. The roles are dictated by their families and communities and this is one area where there has been very limited increase in awareness.

57. Baseline Studies conducted in MP and UP found that gender roles were defined and ~50% of girls and boys felt that different sports were appropriate for girls and boys. The 2012 Effectiveness Study in UP found that positive attitudes towards gender equality were observed to be higher amongst the exposed group (71.5%) compared to the unexposed group (63%). During the first Effectiveness Study in UP in 2011 it was found that only 4.7% of the messages recalled were on gender-related issues, out of which a majority were on non-discrimination between boys and girls. When asked about discussions with friends about the Meena Radio Programme, only 6.8% of the students reported talking about gender-related topics. Analysis of secondary data from Effectiveness and Endline Studies show similar results with boys and girls identifying household jobs such as washing clothes, cooking and cleaning as tasks for girls and tasks such as earning money and taking the sick to the doctor as tasks for boys.

58. In accordance with these studies, conversations with the students during the FGDs did reveal strong perceived gender roles; girls across most schools (especially in UP and MP) had concrete ideas about the role of the girl within the household. Most students felt that helping with household work such as cooking, cleaning and looking after younger siblings were tasks to be performed only by girls. Even where students expressed that “girls can do anything,” they were of the opinion that household work was a woman’s job while the man is the main wage earner for the family. The students also thought that sports such as kabaddi and cricket are not meant for girls as they are considered to be rough. Where students reported that girls and boys can play all sports, they were also clear that boys and girls must play sports separately as the girls might get hurt if they play rough sports with boys.

59. Furthermore, the Evaluation Team found that in Sheopur and Guna districts in MP, gender roles are very strictly defined. A lack of ambition in the girls was noticed in these areas. The situation was found to be better in Jabalpur in MP where students (boys and girls) were seen to be ambitious. Many girls claimed they wanted to become doctors and lawyers when they grew up.

60. Similarly, in AP across all the districts visited, gender differences were not as stark. More than 80% of the girls interacted with claimed they had aspirations to become doctors or engineers. However, as
discussed previously, gender roles still remain strictly defined. In UP, there were signs of shifts in perceptions of gender roles and abilities of girls; however, there has not been much change in practice.

61. In the context of education, boys and girls are given equal opportunity in all the states visited. Parents in Barabanki claimed it is their duty to educate their children, both boys and girls, so that they can lead a better life. In Nellore district in AP one teacher claimed 90-95% of her students (both boys and girls) pursue further studies. Equal opportunities are provided to boys and girls; however, discrimination in terms of quality can be observed. If parents can afford it, boys are sent to private schools (which are considered to be better) and girls to public schools. This is a common phenomenon across all schools/states.

62. In the school environment in all the districts visited, it was noticed that boys and girls tend to always sit separately during the broadcast of the radio programme. Interaction between boys and girls was limited in many schools as was seen while students played sports, with boys and girls playing separately in more than half of the schools visited.

63. In AP, the Meena Radio Programme is viewed as an initiative for girl empowerment. There is a large focus on girl child equality in health, education and opportunity. Teachers in all schools in West Godavari and some in Nellore feel the programme is very important for girls and do not consider it as important for boys. Hence boys’ participation was seen to be limited while girls were listening attentively.

64. Some aspects of gender have seen an improvement; education for girls is one such avenue where equal opportunities are provided to a large extent. However, gender bias and discrimination can be observed in many aspects of life. In general, to improve focus on gender and equity, a multi-pronged approach with other programmes that target the community, teachers and parents is necessary as gender roles are strongly defined by the environment in which the children are brought up. Furthermore, it is to be noted that a 15-minute intervention like the Meena Radio Programme cannot be expected to make a difference in gender roles and discrimination, given how deeply entrenched they are. Therefore, the aim of the programme – to spark conversations and provide students with negotiation skills – has been met to a certain extent.

Students are aware of foods which are nutritious and the importance of a balanced diet

65. The Evaluation Team found that students were aware of the importance of a balanced diet and of eating nutritious food. About 70% of the students in the FGDs were aware that green vegetables contain vitamins and minerals. Students felt that both boys and girls have equal rights to food and that there should be no discrimination on this account. The Endline Study conducted in UP showed that in terms of knowledge on consumption of a balanced diet, those exposed to Meena have a higher level of knowledge (31.5%) as compared to those unexposed (28.5%). Additionally, Effectiveness Studies conducted in AP in 2013 showed that 10% of the messages recalled by the students were related to child rights nutrition. In terms of recall, this represents the third most recalled message from the programme with WASH and child protection being recalled more. These findings demonstrate that the Meena Radio Programme has contributed to raising awareness on this subject. It is important to note that this increase in awareness has also been influenced by chapters on nutrition in the school text books and discussions on health and nutrition initiated by the teachers in the schools.
66. The ability of the students to consume a healthy and nutritious meal is constrained by their economic conditions and the local availability of food. Many students interacted with in UP (especially in Barabanki and Badaun) resisted eating the midday meal at the schools. Some of the teachers and parents interacted with stated that the quality of the mid-day meal was poor and lacked nutritious value. In most of the schools visited by the Evaluation Team, the students appeared to be underweight.

*Students are aware about the importance of seeking support from qualified health professionals at times of ill health. However, they also believe that quacks and traditional healers should be consulted in some situations. Awareness about issues related to child health is low.*

67. In general, primary qualitative research for the evaluation revealed that most students were aware of the importance of seeking medical care from qualified health professionals at the time of an illness. In cases involving non-medical situations such as possession or evil eye, a tantric/babaji was preferred to a doctor. In UP, around 60% of the students felt that a doctor can provide the correct medicine while a tantric may or may not help. However over 80% of the students felt that a tantric should be called in case of any evil eye, possession by ghosts and spirits or snake bites. Similarly, in MP ~75% of the students claimed during the FGDs that a nurse or doctor could cure a disease as they were qualified and could prescribe the correct medicines.

68. Due to financial considerations and the non-availability of a doctor in the proximity of their homes, students in a few districts, namely Barabanki, Badaun, Sheopur and Guna, visit the local quacks or traditional practitioners.

69. The students in the sample schools had poor awareness on issues related to child health. In the pilot visits, when awareness amongst students on immunization related issues was probed, it was seen that even though students know that children need to be immunized, they were not aware of the number of doses or the frequency required. This could be because these issues did not seem relevant to the students. Hence awareness on the importance of immunization was not probed in the next phase.

*Corporal punishment is considered acceptable by most students and teachers*

70. Even though child protection and child friendly schools are a core focus area of the Meena Radio Programme, and there are episodes which emphasize that corporal punishment is not allowed, there was very limited awareness amongst the students on this topic. Only 0.8% of the students claimed to have discussed the topic of corporal punishment with their friends during the 2013 Effectiveness Study conducted in AP. Students interacted with during the primary research of this evaluation believed that the teacher should first try to explain the concept with love. However, if the child fails to grasp it, the teacher has the right to punish them physically. Teachers also felt that the students needed to be hit in order for them to understand what is being taught.

**B1.2 Influence of Meena Radio Programme on students has increased knowledge and awareness on life skills and enhanced decision making and negotiation skills**

71. Amongst many others, one of the focal areas of the radio programme is the development and improvement of life skills in students. Through its nuanced messaging, the programme seeks to help
students build a repertoire of skills that can be used to handle problems and questions encountered on a daily basis. Improving the ability of students to tackle problems individually by a combination of enhancement of decision-making prowess, development of negotiation skills and encouragement of critical thinking is a key objective of the radio programme.

72. A comparison of the Baseline and Endline Studies conducted in UP showed a significant improvement in students’ levels of self-efficacy on life skills-related issues. In the Endline Study, 54.2% of those exposed to the Meena Radio Programme had a high level of self-efficacy compared to 40.9% of those who were unexposed to the programme. Significant differences between exposed and unexposed groups were also seen in the knowledge on good listening and speaking skills (88% as compared to 60.6%). High levels of self-esteem were also reported by 46.8% of those exposed as compared to 29.7% of those unexposed to Meena at the Endline Study.

73. Findings from the FGDs with the students enumerate a heightened level of awareness with respect to life skills. In particular, “The Way Forward” exercise as an element of the participatory tool provided students the opportunity to showcase their decision-making ability. As part of the exercise, one of the case studies was used to discern students’ knowledge on the necessity of using clean toilets. On being given a hypothetical situation where one toilet was available for both boys and girls at the school, majority of the students realized the need for separate toilets for boys and girls. Students’ suggestions also included building of additional toilets at school, for which most felt it was their responsibility to approach either the teacher or the Sarpanch. This revealed how students correctly identified the problem and used their decision-making skills to combat it.

**B1.3. The Meena Radio Programme was found to be very effective in the residential KGBVs in UP.**

74. This evaluation found that the effectiveness of the Meena Radio Programme was the highest in the residential KGBVs in UP where the girls stay and study on the school premises, in contrast to the KGBVs in MP where the girls stay in the hostel and go to a nearby school to study. During the field visits, it was found that the recall value of the Meena Radio Programme was the highest in KGBV schools in UP. Students were able to recall characters, stories and poems from the programme. The Effectiveness Study carried out in the KGBVs in UP in 2012 showed that besides Meena, Raju and Mithu, 55 characters were recalled by the students with an average character recall of 11.6 characters. This was comparatively higher than the two rounds of Effectiveness Studies conducted in upper primary schools in UP, where the average character recall stood at 7.2 and 8.7 characters, respectively. There was 100% recall of Meena, followed by Raju (98.3%), Mithu (96.7%) and Deepu (85.6%) during the 2012 Effectiveness Study.

75. A large majority of students are very attached to the character of Meena and are inspired by her strength and courage. The main reason for the effectiveness of the programme in these schools is due to the fact that students stay in the school premises and discuss the programme and its teachings in their free time. The relationship shared between the teachers and students in these schools is more informal as the teachers also act as their guardians. Hence, there are a variety of discussions and conversations that take place between teachers and students. In general, girls in these schools were found to be more vocal and confident. The Baseline Study carried out in these schools prior to the broadcast of the Meena Radio Programme found that while 62% of the girls hoped to complete college, the confidence to do so was low, with only 28% believing that they could accomplish the same. In the primary research, the Evaluation
Team observed high levels of ambition amongst the girls met. All the girls interacted with were interested in pursuing higher studies and had varying career ambitions, from becoming teachers, doctors, nurses, to police officers. They were also confident in their abilities to be able to achieve these career ambitions.

76. In all the KGBVs in UP, the teachers have been trained on how to conduct the programme and facilitate discussions post the programme broadcast (either directly or the training had been passed on from previously trained teachers). In all the schools visited, the quality of discussions facilitated after the programme were found to be very good and all students were very involved in the activity. In many of the schools, the teachers had started their own initiatives to expand the effectiveness of the programme, such as making the students write newsletters which had a description of a Meena episode they liked or the problems faced by them in the school and how they would solve them.

77. Similar findings were reported during the previously conducted Effectiveness Study in the KGBVs in UP. Of the students surveyed, 91% of them stated that a discussion followed the broadcast of the radio programme. This figure is comparatively higher than what was reported by the previous studies conducted in the Upper Primary Schools, which stood at 75% and 69% respectively. The average duration for post session discussion was recorded at 12 minutes, with discussions revolving around the stories (82%), learnings from the stories (71%), songs (58%), games (51%) and intended actions (38%).

78. In the FGDs with the students and in the interactions with the teachers it was seen that students had increased knowledge of key thematic areas discussed in the Meena Radio Programme. In all cases, the students reported that they had learnt about themes of education, personal hygiene, sanitation, nutrition, gender and equity from the Meena Radio Programme amongst other sources. The KGBV Effectiveness Study in 2012 found that 88% of the students felt they learnt something new from the radio programme, with maximum information gain on topics such as child survival and nutrition, WASH and child protection. 94% of the students recalled at least one message with 6.4 being the average number of messages recalled. The highest recall was seen in messages on WASH.

79. Teachers reported that students had become more aware of their rights and were more confident in expressing themselves as a result of the Meena intervention. Active Meena Manch have been a key factor leading to this change. The Baseline Study conducted in the KGBVs found high knowledge and intent to practice amongst students on the issue of child marriage, with 65% confident to postpone their own marriages. The Evaluation Team also observed similar awareness and confidence levels amongst the students interacted with. Teachers also reported that none of the students from these KGBVs got married before the age of 18 and almost all of them went on to pursue higher studies. Although the Baseline Study reported low confidence in girls to prevent other people’s marriages (21% of girls), a few students met during this evaluation shared instances of how their efforts helped avert early marriages in their communities. There were cases, especially in Barabanki, where girls in the KGBV school had encouraged other children to get enrolled into school. In Badaun, Barabanki and Aligarh, child marriages have also been stopped as a result of the concerted efforts of the KGBV teachers, students and their parents.

80. The 2012 KGBV Effectiveness Study found that 85% of students reported that they had discussions with their friends on Meena-related topics while 78.5% discussed Meena with their family members. The major issues discussed with friends and family were cleanliness (17.8%) and child
marriage (10.2%). These findings were corroborated in the field visits conducted. A large majority of the girls in the KGBVs reported sharing the knowledge imbibed from the radio programme with their family members and friends; they claimed to talk about the programme with their siblings, and children going to other schools. Most of the girls interacted with had initiated discussions at home on issues such as child marriage, continuing education and the importance of having toilets at home.

81. In the Effectiveness Study conducted in the KGBVs, 77% of the students reported that their school had one radio set for the broadcast of the radio programme, while 14% reported having two radio sets. 32% of the students reported that the students were made to assemble together 15 minutes before the show, while 60% stated that they assembled in a designated room 5 minutes before the show. The average number of teachers that attended the broadcast sessions was reported as three. In all schools visited, the Meena CDs and story books along with IEC materials like the Meena calendar were found to be present. In addition, in many schools, students documented the episodes aired in the Meena register with illustrations. The foresight into programme introduction, training and monitoring in these schools has played an important role in influencing the success of the Meena Radio Programme. All these factors enhance the effectiveness of the programme in the KGBV schools.

82. The only area where the awareness was limited was related to corporal punishment, with most girls believing that it was acceptable for their teachers to hit them to enable them to learn.

B2. The Meena Radio Programme has a high recall value among students and has been effective in eliciting participation and keeping the students engaged

83. Through primary interactions it was found that the Meena Radio Programme is popular among the students. The 2012 Impact Assessment report from UP found that students recalled an average of 10.3 characters from the programme. In AP, the findings from the Effectiveness Study were similar, with students spontaneously being able to recall 10.1 characters. The primary research for this study found that most students were able to recollect the names of the protagonists Meena and Mithu. These were also the two most popular characters, with close to 85% of the students claiming them to be their favourite characters. The Effectiveness Studies carried out in UP revealed similar findings with all students recalling the character of Meena and 90% recalling Raju and Mithu. The most common characters recalled were Meena, Mithu, Raju, Deepu, Summi and Teacher Behenji. Students in schools in Badaun, Barabanki, Guna and Prakasam had the least recall of characters.

84. The Impact Assessment Report in UP found that 99.5% of students could recall at least one message and on an average, 7.2 messages were recalled by the participants. The 2011 Effectiveness Study from UP found that 97% of participants could remember at least one message and on an average 5.2 messages were recalled from the programme. The messages recalled most were on WASH, child rights and child protection. The Evaluation Team found that students were able to completely recall and narrate certain stories from the Meena Radio Programme. In addition almost all (98.8%) of the students could recall at least one game from the programme.

85. The Evaluation Team observed that during the broadcast of the programme a number of students in all three states would take notes. The teachers also maintain a register with all the episodes that have been aired. In a few schools in UP, teachers reported that students were given the responsibility of
maintaining the Meena registers. This usually contains the episode name, content and key message, apart from administrative details such as number of students present and the teachers’ remarks. It was reported across all schools that students often ask for the Meena register to read the stories. In one of the schools visited in Nellore in AP, even though the teachers were not given the recording manual, they arranged it from another school, photocopied it, and maintained their own record of the Meena Programme.

86. The primary research for this study found that the programme has been successful in ensuring participation from the students, especially in areas like West Godavari and Nellore in AP, Barabanki and Varanasi in UP and in Jabalpur in MP. This is also corroborated through the Impact Assessment conducted in UP where 83% of students were found to have a high involvement with the programme. In AP, the Effectiveness Study found a high level of involvement with the character of Meena among 93% of the students and with the radio programme among 91% of the students. Conversely, in Sheopur and Guna in MP and to a lesser extent in Badaun district in UP, the students did not show as much interest in the programme.

87. The Evaluation Team observed that in all districts in AP, majority of districts in UP and one district in MP, students sing along with the title song of the show at the time of broadcast. The Effectiveness Study in AP revealed that the song was the most enjoyed part of the broadcast. In UP, the KGBV Effectiveness Study also found that students could recall many of the songs played in the programme. These findings were also corroborated by the Evaluation Team through discussions with teachers in the sample schools. It was found from primary interactions with the students through the FGDs across all the schools, that the Meena stories and the Meena song were the two favourite parts of the programme for both boys and girls. In Barabanki, West Godavari, and Guna especially it emerged that around 75% of students enjoyed the game at the end of the episodes the most.

88. Students in Aligarh, Jabalpur, West Godavari and Nellore specifically stated that they discuss the Meena stories with their friends. Usually, discussions were on the episode broadcast on that day. The Effectiveness Study from AP reported that ~74% students discussed the Meena Radio Programme with their friends and ~62% discussed it with their parents, siblings, neighbours and grandparents. The UP Impact Assessment found that 91% students discussed the Meena Radio Programme inside or outside the school. However, the primary research for this study found that most of the students do not discuss the stories with their parents. Less than half the students across all states said that they discussed the programme with their family members. Girls in the KGBVs in UP, however, stated they often spoke about the programme at home.

89. In AP, it was found that interest and participation in the programme by boys is limited, as has been discussed in other parts of the evaluation report. The programme is perceived to be mainly for girls and dealing with girls’ issues. Participation by the boys in West Godavari and Prakasam was limited. Majority of the teachers met in schools in AP believed that the programme was focused mainly on girls. District meetings in Nellore and Prakasam revealed that senior officials also shared this opinion. However, they also felt that despite the focus on girls issues, the programme was relevant for boys too as it would teach them how to respect and treat women equally. In UP, Badaun and Aligarh saw greater involvement of girls in the programme while in Barabanki and Varanasi there was equal participation by boys and girls.
90. Issues with the signal, timing of the programme and lack of interest of the teachers are the major reasons for limited participation by the students in some of the schools visited. In the 2013 Effectiveness Study conducted in AP, 48% of the teachers complained about the timing of the broadcast as they felt it disturbed the classes. During the KGBV Effectiveness Study in UP majority of the students (62%) reported no complaints while listening to the programme. However, poor reception and sound clarity, insufficient volume and disturbance in the classroom were reported as some of the implementation problems during the broadcast by 35%, 6% and 4% of the students, respectively. Nevertheless, the Evaluation Team found that the overall participation by boys and girls in the programme was reasonably satisfactory.

B3. Some teachers use Meena stories as examples and have adapted games from the Meena Radio Programme to use in their classes. Many teachers feel that the programme is not directly relevant to the school academic curriculum and its broadcast timing interferes with the school timetable.

91. At the time of inception of the programme, teachers were considered a secondary audience for the Meena Radio Programme. None of the episodes of the programme focus on changing classroom pedagogy. In fact, changing teaching pedagogy is not one of the key objectives of the programme. The primary research found that a large majority of teachers had not made any changes to their teaching styles. State level stakeholders in UP and AP felt that the programme was meant for students and it would be difficult for teachers to change their style of teaching inspired by the Meena Radio Programme. However, it has been observed by the Evaluation Team that a few teachers in some of the schools visited have adapted certain formats such as puzzles, riddles and games from the Meena Radio Programme into their academic lesson plans. Some teachers in a school visited in Varanasi felt that mathematics could be taught with the help of the Meena games. In Prakasam District in AP, some teachers stated that they shared the messages of the Meena Radio Programme with students in those classes that did not hear the broadcast. Few teachers met in Barabanki and Badaun (UP) had adopted the games from Meena to teach their regular classes.

92. Most teachers met, roughly 80%, felt that the aim of the programme was to only support the academic learning of the students and was not directly relevant to meeting the objectives of the prescribed academic curriculum. According to the teachers, the radio programme was important for the students to enhance their understanding on issues related to gender, importance of education, health and nutrition. However, in general, teachers in MP saw the programme as a problem as the broadcast interfered with the Activity Learning Methodology (ALM) programme and clashed with lunch time. In Sheopur most teachers felt the programme was just for entertainment and aired the programme since it was a directive from the state. In Guna, the programme was also viewed by the teachers as unnecessary during the school day.

93. Although the teachers did not believe that the Meena Radio Programme was directly relevant to the academic curriculum, they believed that it had empowered the students to become more expressive and vocal, which was one of the main objectives of the programme. The teachers felt the programme encouraged the students to open up and voice their opinions as well as share personal experiences and problems with the teachers. They expressed that both boys and girls had started interacting more in the
classroom. Girls in Badaun also felt their ability to speak out had improved post the programmes broadcast.

**B4. The programme has been somewhat effective in furthering the aims of the SSA and RTE by encouraging regular attendance and promoting school completion for both boys and girls**

94. As discussed in the section on Relevance, the Meena Radio Programme is considered relevant to help further the aims and objectives of the SSA, RTE Act and other national education flagship programmes. The programme’s influence to some extent can be seen in its attempt to encourage regular attendance and promote completion of education for both boys and girls. The Endline Study in UP found a higher level of self-efficacy regarding completion of education amongst students exposed to the Meena Radio Programme versus those not exposed.

95. Most students interacted with across all schools were aware of the importance of regular attendance and completion of education. The large majority of parents also wished for their children to complete their education, at least until class 12. There was little discrimination between boys and girls in education; some fathers in Barabanki believed it was their responsibility to educate their daughters as well to get a decent marriage offer. However, in areas where high schools and colleges are far from the village (especially in UP), parents are concerned about sending their daughters for further education.

96. Many students across the schools visited had made efforts to increase the enrolment at their schools. In a school in West Godavari, a student with a learning disability had dropped out-of-school in class VI. However, on hearing about the Meena Radio Programme from his classmates, he re-joined school after a few months. In Badaun, the principal of a KGBV school intervened to stop parents from arranging the marriage of their 11 year old daughter and ensured she was enrolled in school. The girl currently resides with her and is completing her higher education.

97. Teachers in UP also felt that students’ language was improving and they were able to speak in textbook Hindi after listening to the Meena Radio Programme. In MP, teachers felt that the Meena Radio Programme has helped students to learn idioms and proverbs in a fun manner. In most schools the teachers believed that the Meena Radio Programme has helped to play a supporting role in their academic endeavours. The content of the programme may not be directly from the students’ curriculum; however, it is considered to be linked to their course and is seen as an additional source of learning.

**B5. The Meena Radio Programme has been cognizant of issues relating to equity through its reach and content but the evidence is mixed on actual behaviour and practices**

98. The Meena Radio Programme has a strong focus on socio-economic equity, including caste. The programme is targeted to government schools where majority of the students (>90%) belong to backward and marginalized communities and tribal populations. In addition, the implementation of the programme in KGBV schools ensures that it particularly reaches girls from marginalized communities.

99. It was observed that within some schools there does not seem to be a high degree of identification to caste. This could be due to the fact that majority of students in government schools where the programme is broadcast are either Scheduled Caste (SC) or Other Backwards Community (OBC),

Evaluation of Meena Radio Programme

65
recognized by the Government of India as being from disadvantaged communities. Additionally, all students come from similar economic backgrounds. Students from all communities were also seen playing with one another in many schools visited. However, the situation in villages is slightly more complex, with some more progressive than others. The headmaster of a school visited in Prakasam (AP) claimed a mixed population (SC, Scheduled Tribe (ST) and OBC, Muslim) was staying in the neighbouring village without any discernible problems. This was not the case in Jabalpur (MP) in one school where the headmaster stated that there was strong caste differentiation and discrimination in the area with the Muslim population being ousted and secluded from the rest.

100. A lack of sensitivity and compassion could be observed among students while dealing with other students having special education needs. In one of the schools in Barabanki, the teacher along with other students slighted and laughed at a student with a learning disability. Similarly, students were seen hitting another student with special needs in a school in Sheopur and the teachers did not intervene to stop this.

101. Given that the Meena Radio Programme is a 15 minute programme, it was not intended to change behaviour. While the programme has been designed to reach children from marginalized communities, a combination of interventions targeted at the community level would be required to change attitudes and behaviours with respect to discrimination based on caste and sensitivity in dealing with those with special needs.

**B6. Discussions facilitated post the broadcast of the radio programme are limited**

102. The design of the Meena Radio Programme includes a 15-minute radio programme followed by a discussion facilitated by a teacher on the theme/topic covered during the episode. Across all previously conducted Effectiveness Studies, it was observed that majority of the discussions conducted after programme broadcast revolved around the story, its learnings, the songs and games and any intended actions. The Effectiveness Study in AP and in the KGBVs in UP found that on average students reported discussions of around 11 minutes and 12 minutes post the broadcast of the programme, respectively. The Impact Assessment report from UP found that almost 80% students reported that discussion sessions were conducted after the broadcast of the programme.

103. However, during the primary field visits it was seen that the discussions carried out by the teachers after the radio programme was aired were limited across all the schools visited. Most schools visited in Barabanki, Sheopur and Guna had no discussions post the radio programme sessions. Teachers in the schools visited in Badaun, Jabalpur, Aligarh and Prakasam did hold limited discussions after the radio programme was aired; however, these were short and inadequate.

104. One of the main reasons for such poor facilitation of discussions on behalf of the teachers could be the lack of appropriate training provided to them. UP followed a cascade model for training; however, none of the teachers met in Barabanki during the evaluation had been trained. MP does not have a specific training programme for the Meena Radio Programme. It is a part of the general training manual under Interactive Radio Interventions (IRIs). Teachers in Sheopur and Guna had not received any form of training for proper facilitation of the radio programme. In most schools in Jabalpur, the trained teacher had retired or left the school and there had been no formal hand over of responsibilities or replacement for such a teacher. The format for training in AP was via a video conference conducted by the state. Teachers
met in the sample schools in AP had been trained on the programme and how to conduct discussions post
the broadcast of the episode.

105. In a few schools, the teachers did facilitate the discussions in an effective manner and elicited
participation from all the students. During the discussions, the story was repeated, the key learnings were
reiterated and games were also played. These sessions lasted a full 30-40 minutes with 15 minutes for the
broadcast and a follow up discussion. Such an outcome was only possible because of two factors, the ease
with which the radio programme had been slotted into the timetable as a separate period of 40 minutes
and the interest shown by the teacher to maximize the time and make sure his or her students reap the
most out of the radio programme. In the KGBV school visited in Badaun, the Principal claimed she
conducted a 15-minute discussion with the students after every episode. She also stated that she ensured
that more girls participate by directing more questions to the girls.

B7.1. The effect of the Meena Radio Programme is more in areas where multiple interventions
are targeted

106. The Meena initiative commenced in UP with the start and success of ‘Meena Manch,’ launched
as a part of the MCI to support the education and rights of girls. According to the Baseline Study, 19,000
Meena Manch were established in UP at the time of inception of the MCI in India in 2002. Through the
Meena Manch, girls were given the opportunity to debate amongst each other on various themes central to
Meena such as education, health, life skills and child friendly schools. This Manch provided students with
a platform to be involved in and take action on matters at the school or community level. The Evaluation
Team found that in schools where the Meena Manch is still active (despite a lack of funds for the
initiative from the government) students are more invested and learn more from the Meena Radio
Programme. The Meena Manch intervention was only observed in schools in UP. A similar alternative
version of this initiative, Meena Vedika, was observed in some schools in AP. However, any such
initiative was completely absent in the schools in MP. Additionally, the Meena Ratna Awards have also
played a very large motivating factor for students and teachers in UP.

107. The interest levels of the students in the Meena Radio Programme in schools where Meena
storybooks were present were found to be much higher as compared to schools in which these books were
absent. Students were found to borrow the books to read the stories or read them in their free time in
schools. In one instance, a student had taken the Meena books home to read and her mother had read the
books as well. In the past, some of the KGBV schools in UP and MP had received Meena CDs as well.
Teachers from the UP KGBVs reported playing the CDs for the students over the weekend and stated that
it contributed to sustaining interest in the Meena programme.

108. In some schools across UP and AP, Meena Day is celebrated by the students. Approximately 50%
of the schools visited in Badaun (UP) celebrate Meena’s Birthday on the 24th of September every year. A
cultural function is organised for this occasion in the schools. The cultural function includes dances,
songs and plays performed by the students. Other schools in UP and AP also celebrate Meena Day,
usually on the day the broadcast of the programme begins for the academic year. These activities tend to
maintain an active interest of the students in the Meena programme, therefore furthering its effects.
B7.2. The Meena Radio Programme has been effective in improving knowledge and awareness on some key themes. Differential levels of success in the three states are dependent on a variety of factors.

109. In some schools visited in all three states, if the Meena Radio Programme is aired regularly, then students’ knowledge, awareness and intent in some of the areas that are central to the programme are improved. In some of the districts visited, however, the programme is aired intermittently and the radio signal is poor in the schools. Therefore, there are key factors that influence the success of the programme’s implementation and effectiveness:

- **Format of programme and contextualized content** which keeps the students interested in the programme is a key factor leading to the effectiveness of the programme. Re-versioning of episodes and selection of relevant episodes for broadcast in a state leads to students’ interest. The format of the programme with a story, song and game keeps students engaged and promotes the effectiveness of the programme.
- **Trained teachers** can facilitate the Meena Radio Programme and discussions post the broadcast of the programme in an effective manner. This is a key factor for ensuring effectiveness of the programme.
- **Presence of supporting interventions like Meena Ratna Awards, Meena Manch and the Meena story books** help in reinforcing the key messages of the Meena Radio Programme. Students in schools where such supporting interventions are active have demonstrated a higher degree of awareness and knowledge of the key themes of the Meena Radio Programme.
- **Government interest in the programme** ensures the launch and implementation plan is developed and shared with the districts and schools. The government’s interest in the programme is important to ensure effective implementation of the programme at the school level.
- **UNICEF technical support** helps states develop strong implementation plans, support the monitoring of the programme and support the government to respond to any challenges faced in the implementation.
- **Timing of broadcast** influences whether teachers prioritize the Meena Radio Programme. In schools where the programme has been institutionalized in the timetable, teachers spend more time in discussions with the students, leading to a higher degree of effectiveness.
- **Quality of radio signal** influences whether students are able to listen to the radio programme and understand its message.
- **Availability of IEC materials** like calendars and posters as well as teachers guides helps in implementing the programme. Teachers are aware of the days of broadcast and methods of facilitating effective discussions.

110. Details on how these factors have contributed to the differential success of the programme in each of the three states is provided in Annex IX.

**Conclusion**

The Meena Radio Programme, a 15 minute intervention, was designed to raise awareness about key issues related to education, health, nutrition etc. amongst middle school students. It was not expected that the programme would lead to changes in behaviour. The programme has high recall value as a result of
eliciting participation and keeping students engaged, especially in the KGBV schools in UP. Analysis of data from the primary qualitative research and the secondary quantitative data shows different levels of effectiveness of the Meena Radio Programme. One of the major limitations in the triangulation of the secondary data with the primary research findings is that there is a difference in the data collection methods. Overall it was found that the Meena Radio Programme has largely been effective in its objective to increase knowledge, awareness and intent on some key areas of education, health and nutrition, water, sanitation and hygiene, child protection and life skills. On areas such as immunization, and corporal punishment; however, awareness levels remain low. The programme has helped in furthering the goals of the SSA and the RTE. Post-broadcast discussions, facilitated by teachers were found to be inadequate in a majority of schools. The effectiveness of the programme is further enhanced when it is supported by additional interventions like Meena Manch, Meena Vedika, Meena Ratna Awards and Meena story books. Similarly, adequate training and monitoring of teachers and availability of IEC materials at school help sustain the interest of the teachers and students in the programme. Therefore, comprehensive focus on all aspects of implementation – broadcast, teachers’ training, availability of trained teachers in the schools, post broadcast discussions, Meena reading materials in schools and regular monitoring of the programme – further enhances its effectiveness.
C. EFFICIENCY

111. The evaluation covered an assessment of the efficiency of the Meena Radio Programme i.e. whether resources have been used optimally in achieving its objectives

Key question
- To what extent has the Meena Radio intervention used resources efficiently and optimally – financial, infrastructure, human resources and time? Were they adequate?

112. The key findings on Efficiency are presented below:

Key findings Efficiency
- The Meena Radio Programme reaches a large number of schools and students and is a cost-effective initiative
  - The cost borne by the SSA for the broadcast of the programme constitutes a very small percentage of the total SSA budget.
- The Meena Radio intervention has used resources, including financial, infrastructure, human resources and time, with differing efficiencies in all the three states
  - The training model followed in AP is most efficient
  - The efficiency of utilization of existing human resources is good in both UP and AP where the teachers have been trained well. The efficiency of the time spent by the teacher conducting the discussions on the programme is also better in these states.
  - Infrastructure constraints limit the efficiency of the programme in schools with a large number of students or those with space constraints
  - Poor quality of radio signals also impact the efficiency and reach of the programme.
- The efficiency of the Meena Radio Programme could not be compared to any other programme as there are no directly comparable programmes
C1. The Meena Radio Programme reaches a large number of schools and students and is a cost-effective intervention. The cost borne by the SSA to broadcast the Meena Radio Programme is a very small fraction of the total SSA budget of the states

113. The cost for broadcasting of the Meena Radio Programme is borne completely by the SSA in all three states. The table below provides details of the cost for broadcast of the programme in UP, AP and MP.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 12: Broadcast Cost as a percentage of the SSA budget across States</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>State</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uttar Pradesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Andhra Pradesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madhya Pradesh</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

114. As can be seen in the table above, the cost for broadcast of the Meena Radio Programme is a small fraction of the total SSA budget in each state. The major expenditures under the SSA budget are towards teachers’ salaries, infrastructure and management. The programme is broadcast through AIR in all three states. Considering that AIR is a government-funded radio channel, this makes the process of funds transfer easy as it is a government to government transfer. Hence, this is the most optimal use of resources.

115. The reach of the programme and the cost for reaching each school is detailed in the table below. The calculation below is based on the assumption that all the schools in the three states have purchased the radio set and broadcast the programme regularly. The broadcast cost per school is very low for UP as the UP government decided to broadcast the programme in primary schools as well thereby enhancing the reach of the programme. In its original design the Meena Radio Programme was intended only for students in the upper primary schools.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 13: Cost of reaching each school</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>State</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>----------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uttar Pradesh</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

21 www.ssa.nic.in (PBA minutes)
22 The AP AWP budgeted for broadcast of 50 episodes, however, the broadcast schedule has 57 episodes. The unit cost broadcast of each episode was calculated from the AWP and then cost for broadcast of 57 episodes was calculated.
23 SSA 2014-2015 budget briefs, Accountability Initiative
116. The total reach in terms of the number of students reached and the cost for reaching students enrolled in schools by the Meena Radio Programme is detailed in the table below. The reach and broadcast cost per student have been calculated based on the number of students enrolled in each school. This represents the reach and cost assuming 100% attendance of all enrolled students in schools and that all the schools have radio sets with good signal and that the schools broadcast the programme regularly and all students attending school listen to the programme. In addition, the reach and cost per student has also been calculated based the average attendance rate in schools. Collectively this represents the maximum and average reach and cost per student of the radio programme.

117. However, in reality the reach of the programme is likely to be less than the average figures. The Effectiveness Study in UP found that only 63% of students surveyed confirmed that they listened to the programme. Additionally during the harvest season the attendance rates are as low as 20% as reported by the teachers and the students. This reduces the actual reach of the programme. In UP, the programme has wide reach and particularly low costs as the programme is played in primary schools as well.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Number of schools where the programme is broadcast (excluding the KGBVs)</th>
<th>Average number of students per school</th>
<th>Average attendance rates in schools</th>
<th>Total number of students reached (in millions) assuming all students attend school</th>
<th>Total number of students reached (in millions) based on average attendance rates</th>
<th>Broadcast cost per student assuming 100% attendance (max possible reach)</th>
<th>Broadcast cost per student assuming actual attendance rate</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Andhra Pradesh</td>
<td>13,000 Upper Primary and High Schools</td>
<td>Rs. 87.69 per school</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Madhya Pradesh</td>
<td>30,000 Upper Primary Schools and KGBVs</td>
<td>Rs. 63.8 per school</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 14: Cost of reaching each student

118. As evident from the table above, the broadcast cost per school is minimal. The programme reaches approximately 18.5, 2.5 and 1.0 million students at the maximum in UP, MP and AP, respectively. The cost per child (assuming 100% attendance and listenership) of the Meena Radio Programme is Rs. 0.13, Rs 0.77, and Rs. 1.1 in UP, MP and AP. The cost per child (assuming average

---

24 UNICEF ICO guidelines
25 DISE state report cards (2013-2014)
26 ASER state reports (2014)
attendance and listenership) of the Meena Radio Programme is Rs. 0.23, Rs. 1.33, and Rs. 1.83 in UP, MP and AP, respectively.

119. In all states, the broadcast of the Meena Radio Programme is an efficient way of reaching the schools and students. However, in ~ 25% of the schools visited, the quality of the radio signal was very poor and students could not understand the programme. This impacts the efficiency by limiting the reach of the programme.

C2. Various components- human resource requirements, training model, duration and time slot of broadcast, fund availability for procurement of radio sets and infrastructure availability- influence the efficiency of implementation of the programme

The human resource requirement for the implementation of the programme is minimal in its current form

120. It was observed that in general, most schools visited suffer from a shortage of staff. This was especially true in UP and MP. The human resource requirement for the implementation of the programme is minimal. In the current form, one teacher is appointed the Meena radio focal point/ Sugamkarta and facilitates the programme. In around 30% of the schools visited, three teachers were made in charge of the programme and would take turns to facilitate it. In most schools visited, it was observed that other teachers were not engaged with the programme and would use the time of the broadcast as a free period. This is an inefficient use of the teacher’s time in schools.

The training model being followed by AP uses time and resources efficiently

121. Training of teachers in the Meena Radio Programme is essential for the successful implementation of the programme. All the three states follow a cascade mode of training with master trainers being trained at the state level, and this training being passed on to officials at the district and block levels and to teachers at the school level.

122. It was found that while UP has a training system in place, training of teachers in the upper primary schools has not taken place in the past two years. The Evaluation Team found that around 50% of the schools did not have a trained teacher for the Meena Radio Programme.

123. In MP, the training of teachers was carried out at the time of inception. Currently, no training is being carried out specifically for Meena Radio Programme. The SSA training of teachers has a component on IRIs, and one of the programmes discussed in the training is Meena Radio. None of the teachers met in the schools in MP had been trained on Meena Radio Programme specifically.

124. In AP, the SSA uses existing resource centres in each mandal to carry out the training for teachers. These resource centres provide a one-way video and two way audio conferencing facility. Use of these audio-video conference facilities at the mandal level is an efficient way of carrying out the training of teachers. It allows teachers to be trained at the mandal level, not too far from the schools and through the use of existing resources. This allows the state to save on costs related to travel and training session organization and additionally saves on the time of the teachers as well.
The 15-minute time of each episode is considered optimal by teachers. However, discussions are not conducted in an appreciable manner after the broadcast of the episode. The timing of broadcast interrupts classes and is considered an inefficient use of time by the teachers.

125. The Meena Radio Programme is designed to have a 15-minute episode broadcast, followed by a discussion facilitated by teachers about the key themes of the episode. While a few stakeholders expressed the need to have a longer episode, the majority felt that a 15-minutes episode is optimal to maintain the interest of the students.

126. The last section of the programme, a game, was found to be enjoyed by all students met. However, the time spent on the game within the episode does not allow for the students to fully participate in the game.

127. It was observed that the themes and issues of the broadcasted episode were not discussed in any appreciable manner in most of the schools visited with the exception of the KGBVs in UP. In MP none of the schools visited held discussions after the broadcast of the episode. The situation was better in UP and AP, where some teachers facilitated a short discussion about the key themes and tried to contextualize the topic with the lives of the students. It was found that in schools where teachers had been trained on the Meena Radio Programme, they were able to make more efficient utilization of the time through effective discussions with the students.

128. The timing and duration of the Meena Radio Programme clashes with the time-table prescribed by the state especially in AP and MP and in the KGBV schools in UP. This limits the discussion around the programme and its utility as seen by the teachers as it interferes with the regular academic curriculum in the school. In MP, the state has implemented the Activity Learning Methodology (ALM) and the timing for the Meena Radio Programme has not been taken into account. Most teachers were of the opinion that while the programme was important, it was not relevant to the curriculum. Therefore, the teachers feel that it is an inefficient use of their time.

Availability of infrastructure is a problem in general in schools. Students sit in the verandah or in an open area to listen to the programme.

129. Availability of infrastructure was observed to be an issue in most schools visited. In a large majority of the schools visited in UP and MP, teachers reported space constraints for regular classes. In UP, the SSA has mandated the building of a multi-purpose room which is used as a ‘Meena room’. All schools visited in UP during the evaluation had such a room. However, only about 40% of the schools were using this room for listening to the Meena Radio Programme. While this suggests that the infrastructure is not efficiently used, the Meena rooms in all schools are generally small and cannot accommodate all the students from class VI – VIII.
130. In most schools visited (~70%) at the time of broadcast, students gather in the school verandah or in an open area to listen to the programme. These areas are not conducive during rains or extreme temperatures.

**Funds for procurement of radio sets come from the School Development Fund, which is already considered insufficient by most schools.**

131. The funds for the procurement of the radio sets are made available to schools from the Annual School Development Fund. Principals and teachers met in all schools expressed that the budgets made available through the School Development Fund are insufficient for the schools in general. Though the purchase of the radio is a onetime cost, it amounts to nearly 10% of the annual fund, depending on the quality of the radio set. Hence, it is seen that many schools either procure cheaper radio sets or buy the radio set as and when possible. This affects the efficiency and effectiveness of the programme as students are not able to listen to the programme in school.

132. In some of the larger schools visited, principals have purchased a second radio set or a loudspeaker and mic system so that students are able to hear the programme at the time of the broadcast. This enhances the effectiveness of the programme. However, no extra funds have been provided to these schools and often the teachers have purchased these items from their personal funds.

133. The table below draws a comparison between the utilization of resources by the different states.

**Table 15: Efficiency of Utilization of Resources across States**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component</th>
<th>UP</th>
<th>AP</th>
<th>MP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Availability of trained human resources</td>
<td>🚪</td>
<td>⬜️</td>
<td>🚪</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training model</td>
<td>🚪</td>
<td>⬜️</td>
<td>🚪</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Radio sets in accordance with number of students</td>
<td>🚪</td>
<td>⬜️</td>
<td>🚪</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time spent by teachers on facilitating the programme</td>
<td>🚪</td>
<td>⬜️</td>
<td>🚪</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Timing of programme</td>
<td>🚪</td>
<td>⬜️</td>
<td>🚪</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Infrastructure availability</td>
<td>🚪</td>
<td>⬜️</td>
<td>🚪</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

134. As depicted in the table above, the implementation of the Meena Radio Programme has been the most efficient in AP as compared to MP and UP though there are still areas for improvement.

**C3. There are no directly comparable radio programmes for the efficiency analysis.**

135. The Evaluation Team had initially planned to evaluate the efficiency of the Meena Radio Programme by comparing it to similar programmes. However, a thorough analysis of the available programmes revealed that they differed from the Meena Radio Programme in terms of their medium of broadcast, content or reach. For example, an education learning initiative “Galli Sim,” developed by the Sesame Workshop, is broadcast through the television and hence cannot be compared to the Meena Radio Programme.
Programme. Similarly, other radio programmes, such as “English is Fun,” differ in their duration and target audience. English is Fun is broadcast in primary schools in AP and MP and is a half hour in duration. It is aimed at teaching students to speak English and is directly relevant to the academic curriculum in the schools.

Conclusion

The cost borne by the SSA for the broadcast of the programme is a small fraction of the overall SSA budget. The available resources - financial, infrastructure, human resource and time; have been used with varying efficiencies in all the three states. Utilization of existing human resource has been largely optimized in UP and AP, with AP having the most effective training model for teachers. Except for the teacher responsible for facilitating the discussions post the broadcast of the radio programme the time of other teachers who are not involved with the Meena Radio Programme is inefficiently used. Even with regards to the teacher who serves as the Meena facilitator, an efficient use of time is seen only in AP. In MP, no discussions are held post programme broadcast and in UP the discussions (with the exception of the KGBVs) are of short duration. Infrastructure constraints and radio signal quality are other factors that hinder the efficiency of the Radio Programme sessions. The Meena Radio Programme’s wide reach has led to it being cost effective.
SUSTAINABILITY

136. An important focus area of the evaluation was to assess the sustainability of the Meena Radio Programme i.e. what systems are in place or are required to ensure that states can sustain and run the programme independently with limited support from UNICEF. The key aspects that were analysed within this parameter include:

Key questions

- To what extent has the Meena Radio intervention been sustainable?
- What factors influenced the achievement/non-achievement of sustainability of Meena Radio in the three states?

137. The key findings on Sustainability are provided below:

Key findings for Sustainability

- The sustainability of the Meena Radio Programme is dependent to a large extent on a strong buy-in from the government and technical support provided by UNICEF
  - The content of the Meena Radio Programme in UP was designed by UNICEF in consultation with GoUP and other relevant stakeholders. UNICEF advocated and provided technical support for the successful roll out of the programme in AP and MP.
  - The broadcast costs are borne by the government in each of the three states.
  - UNICEF provides active support through a consultant placed in the SSA in UP and AP, while in MP, UNICEF support is limited.
  - Officials in all states feel a partnership model with support from UNICEF for training and monitoring is needed.

- Sustainability of the Meena Radio Programme in schools is dependent to a large extent on the perception of the government officials on the importance of the programme and its institutionalization into the school timetable
  - In UP and AP, the government has integrated the radio programme into the school timetable. Periodic monitoring by the government in these two states ensures that the programme is played diligently in all schools.
  - In MP, the monitoring for the programme is very weak. The timing of broadcast of the programme interferes with the ALM schedule prescribed by the government. The programme is therefore implemented poorly in the schools.
  - KGBVs in UP and some schools in AP also felt the timing of the programme interrupts the school schedule.
  - Only around 30% of the schools visited had set aside 30 minutes for the radio programme.

- The contextualization of language and content of the Meena Radio Programme to the needs of each state influences the sustainability of the programme
  - The radio programme has been re-versioned to the local language for AP.
  - The new content of 40 episodes was designed based on the needs and inputs of the government in MP and AP.
  - The governments of MP and AP select and broadcast episodes that are relevant to their priorities.

- Supporting programmes like the Meena Manch and Meena Vedika enhance interest in the programme and contribute to sustainability
  - The programme is most sustainable in schools in UP where students are interested and inspired by Meena through the Meena Manch initiative which is active in schools and schools have Meena books and Meena CDs.

- Availability of trained teachers facilitating discussions on the Meena Radio Programme leads to meaningful discussions and influences the sustainability of the effect of the programme
  - In UP and AP the teachers facilitate discussions with the students after the broadcast of the programme, as compared to MP where no discussions are held.
  - The training model followed in AP is most effective and sustainable.

- Quality of the radio signal and availability of radio sets in the schools influence the sustainability of the programme
  - In schools where the radio signal is clear, the interest of the students in the radio programme is sustained.
Evaluation of Meena Radio Programme

D1. The sustainability of the Meena Radio Programme is dependent to a large extent on a strong buy-in from the government and technical support provided by UNICEF

138. As discussed earlier in the section on Relevance, the Meena Radio Programme was conceptualized, designed and developed by UNICEF in consultation with the UP Government. Based on the success of the programme in UP, UNICEF undertook advocacy efforts to replicate the programme in other states including MP and AP. The relationship between UNICEF and the state government is a major factor influencing the sustainability of the Meena Radio Programme. In the different states visited, there have been varying degrees of responsibilities, duties and ownership of the programme between the state government and UNICEF, leading to varying levels of sustainability for the programme.

Initial content co-designed by the GoUP and UNICEF

139. The design and content of the programme was developed based on a consultative exercise with participation from key stakeholders such as SSA officials, representatives from the SIET, District Coordinators for Gender as well as school teachers and parents. The multi-stakeholder consultation and the participation of government stakeholders in the design of the programme led to a high degree of ownership over the programme. Since the programme began in UP, GoUP and UNICEF host learning and orientation workshops in Lucknow annually for other states to attend. This gives the UP administration a higher degree of ownership over the programme.

Involvement of the governments of AP and MP in adapting relevant content for their states

140. Based on the success of the Meena Radio Programme in UP, UNICEF has undertaken advocacy efforts to scale up the programme in other states. In 2011, a Meena Radio orientation workshop was organized in UP for representatives from SSA and UNICEF from MP and AP, among other states. Following this workshop, both AP and MP expressed an interest in airing the programme.

141. In AP, a core team with representatives from SSA, SCERT, AIR and UNICEF was constituted to develop a state specific strategy for the roll out of the programme. The Meena Radio episodes were re-versioned in Telugu and pre-tested with children and teachers. Similarly, in MP, a core team with representatives from the DIET, SSA, and SIET reviewed the content provided by UNICEF and selected a sub-set of episodes in line with their priorities. The administration’s involvement in developing state specific strategies in both states has been a major factor in ensuring the sustainability of the programme.

142. The 40 new episodes of the Meena Radio Programme which have been developed in 2013-14 are based on feedback from students, teachers and SSA officials in AP and MP. The multi-stakeholder consultations and workshops for developing the content of episodes are an effective method of building sustainability for the programme with key decision makers and implementers involved in the programme since the inception.

Broadcast costs borne by the government in all three states

143. In all three states - UP, MP and AP - the cost of airing the programme is borne completely by the state government. The state governments have ownership over the broadcast of the programme and have
partnered with AIR for the programme broadcast. This partnership model with financial investment by the government allows for ownership and accountability to lie with the government and contributes to the sustainability of the programme.

144. As discussed in the section on Efficiency, the investment of the government towards the broadcast of the Meena Radio Programme is a very small fraction of the total budget of the SSA in the state. Given the reach of the programme and the perceptions about the effectiveness of the programme, the government stakeholders consulted during the evaluation process in all three states believe the programme should continue. Stakeholders in AP expressed that since they have a ready resource in the form of the radio episodes, they would continue broadcasting the episodes even without the support of UNICEF.

145. Apart from the production of the episodes, UNICEF has designed and developed the IEC materials for the Meena Radio Programme for all three states. IEC materials – brochures, posters and calendars – for the programme are designed and printed by UNICEF, and distributed by the state governments in UP and MP. In AP, the IEC materials are provided by UNICEF to the state and the state is responsible for their printing and distribution.

**Technical Support by UNICEF to the states**

146. In UP and AP, UNICEF provides active support to the Meena Radio Programme through a consultant placed within the SSA who is in-charge of the Meena Radio Programme. The role of the consultant is to provide support in training and monitoring activities as well as support the SSA in any other activities with respect to interactive radio programmes. In MP, UNICEF support is extremely lean and the ownership for the programme lies completely with the state government.

147. The sustainability of the programme in UP and AP is at different levels despite similar support provided by UNICEF in both states. While the buy-in of the government in UP was extremely high at the time of inception of the programme, more recently, interest in the continuation of the programme has fluctuated. This can be attributed to some extent to the frequent change in leadership in the SSA in UP. There have been nine different State Project Directors (SPDs) in UP since the inception of the Meena Radio Programme. Through in-depth interviews with UNICEF officials and the UNICEF consultant in Lucknow, it was found that each change in leadership requires UNICEF and the Meena Radio Consultant to be involved in advocacy for the continuation of the programme in its existing format of a radio show.

**Importance of the programme as viewed by the Meena focal person/ senior SSA officials**

148. In the interactions with the Focal Person for the Meena Radio Programme within the SSA in UP, it was found that there is a clear understanding of the programme and its value. Having realistic expectations from an intervention like the Meena Radio Programme...
Programme - essentially a behaviour change communication intervention - is a contributing factor for sustainability. While the Focal Person was aware of the details of the programme, its objectives and its effect, the senior leadership within the SSA in UP was not aware about of programme despite having visited a number of schools recently. Further interest and commitment is required from senior leadership for the programme’s sustainability and to strengthen the effectiveness of the programme.

149. In AP, there is a high level of interest in interactive radio programmes in general, and in the Meena Radio Programme in particular. The SSA also implements interactive radio programmes for primary school students in the state. There is a dedicated officer within the SSA who is in-charge of the Meena Radio Programme and other interactive radio interventions. This has led to a high level of ownership within the SSA and contributed to the sustainability of the intervention in the state.

150. In MP, the senior leadership within the SSA has remained stable since the time of inception of the Meena Radio Programme. The SPD in MP is reportedly very passionate about the programme and invested in its success. In addition, MP implements a number of other radio programmes for primary school students in the state. The English Language Training Institute (ELTI) - under the SSA is in charge of the implementation of the radio programmes and there is a dedicated person in-charge of the Meena Radio Programme. This set up, similar to AP, with a high degree of interest from the SSA can lead to a high level of sustainability at the policy level. However, as discussed in the section on Effectiveness, the implementation of the Meena Radio Programme needs to be strengthened for operational sustainability of the programme.

Key expectations for sustainability

151. Interactions with state level stakeholders from the government and UNICEF in UP, MP and AP allowed the Evaluation Team to understand expectations for a strong and sustainable partnership model. In UP and AP, UNICEF provides active support to the government for the programme. The government believes it necessary to have strong collaboration from a partner like UNICEF in order to ensure the programme gets due importance. However, as the programme stabilizes, UNICEF’s support to the governments can be in the form of a strategic advisor rather than a handholding partner.

152. Government stakeholders in all three states visited believed that they would continue broadcast of the programme even if there was no support provided by UNICEF. However, they also expressed the need for UNICEF’s support in continuing to develop new materials and episodes for broadcast to ensure that the programme remains relevant.

153. Clear understanding between the two stakeholders is imperative for a strong and stable partnership. This is evident in AP where the roles and responsibilities of both partners are clearly laid out and adhered to. The Department of Education is responsible for the implementation of the programme completely.

“UNICEF’s involvement creates greater excitement and interest for a programme.”
- Meena Radio Focal Person, Andhra Pradesh

“Collaborations need to be both technical and financial for sustainability”
- Meena Radio Consultant, Andhra Pradesh
154. UNICEF’s support for training of teachers is considered important by state level stakeholders, especially in UP and MP. In UP, the government stakeholders are keen to strengthen training and ensure that one teacher in each school is trained in the Meena Radio Programme. Stakeholders are also keen to explore how the training for Meena Radio Programme can be integrated with the regular SSA trainings for teachers. In MP, training of teachers was only undertaken in the first year and there has been no refresher trainings. Discussions with state level stakeholders revealed that they were keen to strengthen the training component of the programme to ensure effectiveness of the programme.

155. State level stakeholders in MP, also expressed the need for strengthening the monitoring of the Meena Radio Programme. Currently, UNICEF is not involved in the monitoring of the programme and the SSA has reduced the monitoring of the programme. There is recognition that monitoring of the programme is important to sustain interest and commitment to the programme among the district authorities and teachers.

**“Having external support for monitoring is good. The more monitoring there is, the better.”**  
- Meena Radio Focal Person, Madhya Pradesh

**D2. Sustainability of the Meena Radio Programme in schools is dependent to a large extent on perceptions of the importance of the programme to the government. The institutionalization of the Meena Radio Programme into the school timetable contributes to the sustainability of the programme**

156. From meetings with stakeholders at the district and in schools in the three states it was seen that the sustainability of the Meena Radio Programme is strongly correlated with the level of interest and ownership taken by the state government. Where clear instructions have been issued by the state about the broadcast of the Meena Radio Programme, schools make an effort to institutionalize the programme in the timetable and to ensure that the programme is aired in the schools on a daily basis. Regular monitoring of the programme also helps in reinforcing the importance of the programme to the government.

157. Institutionalizing the Meena Radio Programme in the school timetable is a major factor contributing to the programme’s success and sustainability. The government in all three states had issued instructions for time to be demarcated in the school timetable for the Meena Radio Programme. The state issues a suggestive timetable to the districts. The final school timetable (including a separate period for the Meena Radio Programme) is decided by the school administration in consultation with the SMC for each school.

158. The Evaluation Team found that in most schools visited, teachers felt that the programme interrupts regular classes. The timing of the broadcast was also considered inconvenient by teachers in KGBVs in UP and in schools in AP and MP. In AP the teachers felt that the programme was interrupting classes. In MP the radio programme was considered inconvenient since it interrupted the Activity Learning Methodology (ALM) - another state mandated curriculum for upper primary schools. In Jabalpur district it was found that the programme was broadcast right after the lunch break. The teachers reported that most students preferred playing to coming to hear the programme. Only around 30% of the schools visited had set aside a half hour slot in the timetable dedicated to the Meena Radio Programme.
This ensured that no teachers’ regular class was being interrupted by the radio programme. Teachers in other schools felt that changing the timings of classes or modifying the school timetable was not in their hands.

159. The implementation of the Meena Radio Programme is better in states where the schools feel that the government thinks the programme is important. In UP, where schools received a Government Order (GO) about the timings of the programme as well as a calendar designed by UNICEF with the broadcast schedule, schools take the programme seriously. In addition, all schools visited in UP fill out a monitoring format which they send to the BRC or Nyay Panchayat Resource Centre (NPRC) coordinator monthly. The regular monitoring by SSA - visits by BRC/CRC members and by the district administration - also focuses on the Meena Radio Programme. The organization of Meena Day at the state level with high profile guests of honour and the felicitation of students and teachers with Meena Ratna Awards is another method through which the value of the programme is reinforced.

160. In AP, the government has undertaken two rounds of monitoring - one with UNICEF’s support and one independently. Mandal Education Officers (MEO) and CRC members visit schools periodically and in addition to general monitoring for SSA also monitor the IRIs and Meena Radio Programme. District officers in Prakasam and West Godavari (two of the three districts visited) have taken a keen interest in the monitoring of the Meena Radio Programme. In Prakasam district, a six member Monitoring Team has been formed for monitoring IRIs in primary schools and Meena Radio Programme in middle schools. The Evaluation Team found that each school visited was tuning in to the programme and facilitating discussions with the students after the broadcast of the programme.

161. In stark contrast to AP and UP, it was observed that in most schools in MP, teachers felt that the programme was not given importance by the government officials and hence it was not mandatory to play the programme. This was mainly due to the lack of any monitoring of the programme by the government officials. Compared with the high degree of focus on other interventions by the government in the state - the ALM for instance – teachers believe that the Meena Radio Programme is not a priority for the government.

D3. The Meena Radio Programme needs to be contextualized to the needs of each state and to the needs of students from class VI to class VIII in order to sustain the interest of the students

162. It is imperative that the content, language and format of the Meena Radio Programme be contextualized to each state. The Meena Radio Programme was started in UP and the content and design of the programme were designed based on the local context of the state. In AP, the government has translated the programme into the local language and takes keen interest that the episodes that are aired are in accordance with the state’s needs. Through interactions with government and UNICEF stakeholders in AP, it was found that the SSA in AP sets up a committee each year to decide on the themes to prioritize and the episodes to broadcast in the state. In MP, when the programme started, the SSA had set up a committee to hear all 160 episodes and to pick the themes and episodes thought to be relevant for the state. The committee did not pick the theme of adolescent health to be broadcast due to the political environment in MP.
Evaluation of Meena Radio Programme

To ensure sustainability the context and format of the programme should keep changing. There should be variety of formats to keep the audience excited for the radio session... The songs and games in the episode should be upgraded as they are not suitable for the age group of class VII and VIII.”
- State Academic Monitoring Officer, Andhra Pradesh

"Along with the radio programme, groups like Meena Manch should be made more active... If Meena Manch is made stronger then the learnings can be percolated down to school, teacher and society level... Synchronising of all platforms will have greater impact in the society.”
State Academic Monitoring Officer, Andhra Pradesh

D4. Supporting programmes like the Meena Manch, Meena Ratna Awards, Meena Day, and Meena Vedika lead to a high degree of interest in the programme, furthering sustainability

166. The programme has been seen to be most effective and sustainable in KGBV schools. The Evaluation Team found that all the KGBV schools visited in UP had received Meena CDs and books. Teachers and students met in the KGBV schools reported that they play the CDs during the weekend and students take a keen interest in reading the books. This was found across many upper primary schools visited in UP as well.

D5. Availability of trained teachers facilitating discussions on the Meena Radio Programme leads to meaningful discussions and influences the sustainability of the effect of the programme

167. Training teachers on how to facilitate the Meena Radio Programme and the discussions post its broadcast is imperative to making the programme successful and effective. UP and AP follow a cascade mode of training from the state level to the schools. Each school is supposed to have one teacher trained
on the Meena Radio Programme. However, the majority of schools visited in UP did not have a trained teacher. Most schools visited in AP had teachers that had been trained on facilitating discussions after the broadcast of the programme. In MP, none of the teachers met had been trained on the Meena Radio Programme.

168. The Evaluation Team saw a stark difference in the approach to implementing the Meena Radio Programme between teachers who had been trained and those who had not. As expected, trained teachers were more aware of the objectives of the programme and how to facilitate discussions with students post the broadcast of the programme. This difference was visible during observations of the broadcast of the Meena Radio Programme as well. Trained teachers were able to better facilitate discussions with students.

169. All teachers met during the evaluation expressed the need for training. Strengthening of the training component would allow for more meaningful discussions on the themes covered by the Meena Radio Programme. Government stakeholders suggested that a guide for facilitating discussions based on each theme/episode should be developed and shared with teachers.

**D6. Quality of radio signal and availability of radio sets influence schools’ ability to hear the Meena Radio Programme and hence its sustainability**

170. Schools are required to purchase radio sets from the Annual School Development Fund. However, most schools find the School Development Fund to be inadequate in general and it was found that schools delayed procurement of radio sets. In UP and MP the guidelines suggest that each school should have one radio set. In AP, it has been suggested by the government that schools purchase one radio set for every 40 students. However, during the evaluation it was found that most schools visited in AP had only one radio set. A written notice was issued by the district authorities to all schools to buy two radio sets for each school in Nellore district, Andhra Pradesh. However, most schools did not follow the orders. A limiting factor for schools is the inadequate School Development Fund from which they are expected to purchase the radio sets.

171. In large schools (in terms of number of students) and those with limited infrastructure in terms of availability of a separate covered area for students to sit together, one radio set is not adequate. It was found that many schools which had more than one section per class rotated the radio set and students were usually able to listen to the programme only once a week.

172. In addition, strength of radio signal is an important factor affecting whether schools can tune in and hear the radio programme clearly. In Prakasam district in AP, the district administration received complaints about the signal from one block. The district officials spoke with the Radio Station Master in the district and managed to resolve the issue. However, this is not always possible. Weak radio signal acts as a limiting factor and is a challenge for sustainability of the programme.

173. In MP, two of the three districts visited reported that the radio signal is weak at times. The schools visited by the Evaluation Team reported tuning in to hear the programme at the time of broadcast. However, many schools contacted in these areas where the signal is particularly weak reported that since they cannot hear anything, they do not listen to the programme.
Cost of implementation of Meena Radio Programme

174. This section looks at the costs of implementing the Meena Radio Programme. The table below presents the costs (one time and staff time) that are incurred by UNICEF for implementing the Meena Radio Programme. It is assumed that no translation or re-versioning is required for the programme.

Table 16: Costs incurred by UNICEF

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component</th>
<th>Cost (in INR)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Production</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design and production of 200 episodes (one time cost, already incurred)</td>
<td>37,800,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edit of episodes and development of promos (one time cost, already incurred)</td>
<td>1,380,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Advocacy</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Advocacy with the Department of Education for appointing a nodal Department, procuring radio sets and participating in the programme, budgetary allocations, documentation, review meetings at state level and field monitoring</td>
<td>~5-10% of UNICEF Staff Time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Training</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers guidebook (original + translation)- one-time cost</td>
<td>230,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Monitoring</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Developing monitoring tools and systems</td>
<td>Staff Time</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monitoring (Consultant attached to SSA for technical support)</td>
<td>Staff Time</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

175. The table below presents the cost of implementing the Meena Radio Programme. These costs are estimated based on the costs of implementing the Meena Radio Programme as presented in the “Briefing Paper Series: Innovations, Lessons and Good Practices; Meena Ki Duniya: An Entertainment-Education Radio Programme” and have been adjusted for inflation.
### Table 17: Cost to government for implementing Meena Radio Programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Component</th>
<th>Cost (in INR)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Broadcast</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broadcast cost for 100 episodes (annual)</td>
<td>2,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Programme CDs for AIR relay centres</td>
<td>163,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Launch</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Launch event for Meena Radio Programme</td>
<td>1,630,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Procurement of Radio Sets</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Procurement of radio sets</td>
<td>750/school</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Training</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers guidebook (Printing)</td>
<td>1,630,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training of Trainers</td>
<td>1,630,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Teachers training at district level</td>
<td>2,037,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>IEC</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Design and printing of broadcast map, IEC materials, CD stickers and CD covers</td>
<td>1,630,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Research and Evaluation</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Baseline Study</td>
<td>2,037,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Effectiveness Study</td>
<td>2,450,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Monitoring</td>
<td>To be integrated with regular SSA monitoring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>15,207,000 + 750/school as a one-time cost (not including costs for regular SSA monitoring)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Conclusion**

Strong buy-in from the government and technical support from UNICEF have contributed to the sustainability of the Meena Radio Programme. While government officials are confident about continuing broadcast of the programme, they requested UNICEF support for developing new episodes when required to maintain the relevance of the programme. The government’s perception of the importance of the radio programme affects the implementation and sustainability of the programme in the schools. The contextualization of language and content of the Radio Programme to the state priorities influences sustainability as well. Institutionalization of the Meena Radio Programme in the school timetable helps keep teachers involved and interested while presence of additional interventions such as Meena Manch and Meena Vedika encourage active participation from students.
SECTION 5
CONCLUSIONS, LESSONS LEARNED, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

1. The detailed evaluation, analyses and conclusions presented in the earlier section form the basis for assessing the key achievements and factors that are critical to the success of the Meena Radio Programme as well as the various challenges/limitations and possible areas of improvement while introducing the programme in other states. This section draws upon these learnings as the basis to arrive at possible recommendations/ action points for future development, replication and scaling-up of the Meena Radio Programme.

Basis for Recommendations: Success Factors, Challenges and Learnings for Replication

Conclusions and Learnings from the Evaluation

2. The evaluation helped in identifying important lessons from the way the Meena Radio Programme has been implemented in UP, MP and AP. These can be incorporated while introducing the programme in other states or when designing any similar education-learning initiative elsewhere.

Conclusions and Learnings from the Evaluation of the Meena Radio Programme

- The Meena Radio Programme was launched based on the success of the Meena Manch in UP. The content and design of the programme were decided on based on discussions with all the relevant stakeholders. Hence, the programme was evidence-based in its programmatic focus, which ensured that its objectives were relevant and effective towards the main goal of increasing the knowledge and awareness of the students on key aspects of education, life skills, health, gender and equity, etc. In the states of MP and AP, the states chose to air episodes relevant to their own local context and focus areas.
- The objectives of Meena are in line with the RTE Act and the goals of education stated in the NCF. The programme also has shared objectives with key flagship programmes such as the NHM, ICPS, ICDS etc. All these help in increasing the relevance of the programme and its benefit as perceived by the various stakeholders responsible for implementing the programme.
- A strong interest in implementing the programme from the respective state governments has been crucial in determining its impactful functioning and sustainability. Based on the programme’s success in UP, it was introduced in MP and AP after the respective state governments showed an active interest in the programme. In all three states, costs related to programme broadcast, monitoring and teacher’s training are all borne by the state governments. The active ownership of the programme by the state government is key to the effective implementation of the programme.
- Clear statement of goals and objectives and well-laid out processes for the implementation of the radio programme at every administrative level is important for the programme to run effectively. In states like AP, where the programme goals have been clearly communicated to the districts and the
Conclusions and Learnings from the Evaluation of the Meena Radio Programme

- **schools, the programme runs smoothly. On the other hand** in MP where most of the information related to the programme get uploaded onto the state’s education portal, the district officials are less clear on the importance of the programme.

- **The role of UNICEF both as an advocacy and technical support partner has been crucial in ensuring the sustainability of the programme. In UP and AP where there is a dedicated UNICEF consultant to support the programme, it was seen that the programme is implemented well. Additional monitoring support from UNICEF also helps to maintain a sustained interest in the programme.**

- **IEC materials provided by UNICEF also help to keep the schools informed about the Meena schedule. The calendars provide details about when the programme will air. Meena books and Meena CDs that have been provided in UP as a part of the Meena Manch also help to generate and sustain interest in the programme.**

- **Launching the programme with media support and publicity also helps generate interest in the programme. This was done in AP and built interest and curiosity in the programme.**

- **A trained and dedicated teacher in charge of conducting the Meena radio programme ensures that the programme attains its objectives. It ensures that the discussions facilitated after the programme help the students to understand the message conveyed in the programme. In all the three states training workshops for teachers were organized when the programme was launched. However, very few teachers in MP and UP in the schools had received this training. In AP, the state has used video conferencing to train teachers and this has resulted in a larger number of trained teachers who are adept at conducting the programme.**

- **The quality of the radio signal is an important factor that determines whether students and school staff remain interested in listening to and airing the programme respectively. In areas where the quality of the radio signal is poor such as Guna and Sheopur in MP and Aligarh in UP, the students are unable to hear and understand the programme.**

- **The institutionalization of the Meena Radio Programme in the school time table leads to its better implementation. This has been done in some of the KGBV schools in UP and in some schools in AP. In other schools, where Meena is viewed as interfering with the regular school time table, the quality of discussions is poor and the teachers are less interested in conducting the programme.**

- **The presence of supporting activities such as the Meena Manch in UP and the Meena Vedika in AP plays an important role in building interest and influence the sustainability of the programme. The celebration of the Meena Day and the Meena Ratna awards in UP have contributed to the sustainability of the programme at the school level. The students and teachers are excited to participate in celebrating Meena’s birthday and the Meena Ratna award provides recognition to students and teachers alike. No such awards or initiatives are present in MP and AP.**

- **The messaging through Meena Radio Programme is also strengthened when there are other programmes that also discuss similar themes. For example, in Sheopur in MP where the Nahi Kali programme is active, the girls are far more aware on issues related to their health, hygiene and rights.**

- **Regular monitoring of the programme ensures that schools play the programme regularly. In UP schools need to fill out a monitoring form in which they need to list the dates on which the programme was aired, the episode that played, the number of students who were present etc. However, in MP where there is no monitoring from UNICEF and limited monitoring of the programme by the SSA/government officials the implementation of the programme is poor at the school level. Many schools reported not playing the programme as they felt that it was not a priority area for the
Conclusions and Learnings from the Evaluation of the Meena Radio Programme

- The content of the programme needs to be regularly modified based on the needs of the state. Where the programme has been contextualized well to the local needs the students can connect to it better. This is true of AP where the programme was re-versioned in Telugu. In both MP and AP based on the need expressed by the students and teachers, 40 new episodes were developed by UNICEF in 2012. However, in the tribal belts in MP students find it hard to relate to the language in which the programme is aired.

- In general, in most schools visited, there is one radio set for the entire middle school which is used to broadcast the programme. However, in schools with infrastructure constraints, such as limited space to make all middle school students sit together, the programme is not heard by all the students on all the days. This was found to be the case in some schools in UP. Human resource constraints, such as the lack of a teacher to conduct the radio programme, also impact the effectiveness of the programme.

- The programme has adequate focus on gender and equity. However, in schools in AP the teachers feel that the programme is meant for girls. In UP owing to the focus on Meena Manch on girls, boys are slightly less interested in the radio programme.

- In all three states, the programme is broadcast for all middle school students. Students who are in class VIII often find the programme repetitive. The games at the end of the programme also get repeated often and the programme does not provide enough time for students to engage in the games and solve the puzzles. Therefore, in most schools the students felt that the programme should be extended in duration and the content be made less repetitive.

3. Based on the learnings described above, the recommendations are discussed below. The recommendations have been developed based on the primary research and interactions with stakeholders from the government and UNICEF and teachers, as well as from the findings from the FGDs with students and parents. The overall framework for the recommendations is presented in Exhibit 7 below. The recommendations and action points have been classified as Policy Level and Operational Level and are based on the following:

   - Factors that have contributed to successful outcomes
   - Factors that will help overcome challenges in the implementation of the programme
   - Factors essential for scale up

4. It is expected that if the recommendations for strengthening implementation are followed then the programme would achieve its objectives.
Exhibit 7: Overall Framework for Recommendations

Achieving successful outcomes
Factors that have contributed / critical to achieve the objectives

Enabling scale-up
Implementation model for other states

Recommendation and action points for future at
A) Policy Level
B) Operational Level

Overcoming challenges
Constraints faced by the Meena radio programme in operationalization/implementation of its objectives
Recommendations and Action Points

5. The recommendations based on the evaluation are put forth in two broad areas –
   - Institutional and Policy Level
   - Operational Level

Table 17: Broad Recommendations and Action Points for the Meena Radio Programme

A. Institutional and Policy Level

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Institutional and Policy Level</th>
<th>Ownership</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>The recommendations in this section relate to institutional and policy level interventions. These recommendations are focused towards strengthening the fundamental design and activities of the Meena Radio Programme.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Policy and decision making</strong></td>
<td><strong>Implementing State Government</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government to continue and strengthen the implementation of the Meena Radio Programme – Given the relevance of the Meena Radio Programme and its effectiveness as an intervention to raise awareness and change intent of behaviour, it is recommended that the programme be continued and implementation strengthened (including the broadcast, training of teachers, availability of radios, IEC materials, and ensure the institutionalization of the programme in the school timetable) in the states where it is being implemented. The Meena Radio Programme can be contextualized and replicated in other states.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Government to continue funding the implementation of the Meena Radio Programme – The budgets for the Meena Radio Programme are currently available through the SSA budget. The SSA should continue funding the implementation of the programme and funds could be classified under the Media / Radio Programmes budget heads as in UP, MP and AP.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Institutionalize content refreshing and contextualization</strong></td>
<td><strong>UNICEF</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Develop new content and new episodes on gender and other relevant topics every two years for the programme to be relevant – It is important for the intervention to remain relevant to the current context and to students in class VI-VIII. Developing new content and episodes every two years based on feedback from the states will help the programme in remaining relevant and contextualized. New episodes and content will keep students (especially those in class VIII) interested in the programme. The new episodes could also explore different formats for the programme. New episodes could also increase the programme’s focus on gender. Currently 14% of the episodes are focused on gender. These episodes focus largely on issues such as gender discrimination, right of education for girls and adolescent health. The evaluation found that while discrimination based on gender has decreased, gender roles are still deeply defined. The messaging on gender</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Institutional and Policy Level

Stereotyping and gender roles need to be clearly defined and strengthened. More episodes on these themes should be developed.

- Inform private aided schools about the Meena Radio Programme and its implementation modality – Currently, the Meena Radio Programme is only being played in government schools. Given the relevance of the programme and that many parents prefer to send their sons to private schools, the government could inform private aided schools about the programme and the implementation modality. Interested schools could then set aside time in their timetable to tune in to the programme and facilitate discussions based on the episodes broadcast. This will also significantly improve the efficiency of the funds allocated to the programme by States, as the reach in terms of number of children would increase significantly.

B. Operational Level

The recommendations in this section relate to operational interventions. These recommendations are focused towards strengthening the implementation of the Meena Radio Programme.

Strengthen implementation of Meena Radio Programme

- Share clear steps for the implementation of the Meena Radio Programme with district and block level officials – Information on the objectives and implementation plan for the programme and details on operationalization, including the training and monitoring mechanisms, should be shared by the state government with district and block level officials. State governments should ensure that the programme is taken seriously and implemented by district and block level authorities; Government Orders (GOs) issued by the state government should be clearly worded. Government Orders signed by senior leaders show the administrations seriousness of interest about the programme and drive its implementation.

- Efforts should be made to ensure clear radio signal. Alternative means for broadcast to be used where AIR signal is weak – Regular monitoring to include assessment of signal strength and ongoing feedback to AIR on regions with poor signal reception. Where the signal is weak, the administration should work along with AIR officials to rectify the issue. Additionally, alternative methods can be used, such as:
  - Broadcast of programme on community radio stations to ensure clear broadcast.
  - Provision of good quality radio sets in poor signal reception areas.
  - Development of a website to host all Meena related resources- radio episodes as well as videos and stories. The link for this website could be shared with all schools and where schools/teachers/students have access to the internet, they can view these resources.
### Operational Level

- **The training component needs to be strengthened across the states.** The training process in AP through AV mode is an efficient and effective method and could be used by other states as well. The training could also be mainstreamed with regular SSA training provided to teachers. Care should be taken to stress the importance of the programme and a separate component on the Meena Radio Programme should be added to the regular training programme. The DIETs in the different states could be used to provide the trainings. This will help strengthen both the ownership over the programme by the state government and its sustainability.

- **Ensure dissemination of discussion guide to all schools where the programme is broadcast.** The dissemination of the teachers' guidebook, discussion guide, broadcast map and reporting formats to all schools implementing the Meena Radio Programme needs to be strengthened. A ready guide book available in all schools will allow teachers who have not received training on the Meena Radio Programme to understand the objectives and ways of facilitating the programme. A section should also be included on how to conduct the programme in areas where the local dialect in which the students converse is different from the language used in the programme.

- **Ensure institutionalization of the Meena Radio Programme within the school timetable** – to ensure that the Meena Radio Programme is played in schools and does not interrupt regular classes. Clear instructions should be given to schools to set aside a separate ‘Meena period’. Currently, most schools feel that changing the timetable is not in their purview. A clear mandate and instructions from the government will help rectify this issue and ensure the programme is played without interruption to other classes.

- **Strengthen and integrate monitoring of programme into regular SSA/education department’s monitoring** – the state governments should integrate the monitoring of the Meena Radio Programme into the regular monitoring conducted by SSA. This will lead to efficient use of resources as well. UNICEF should continue providing technical support to SSA for developing monitoring systems and checklists and mainstreaming them into the government system. For instance, the rapid monitoring system developed by and used in AP could be contextualized and used in the other states as well.

- **Effectiveness studies could be conducted by third party organizations.** The monitoring of the programme should include a clear statement of programme-specific primary and secondary indicators of interest linked to the interventions. For example, regular tracking of behaviour change indicators in terms of knowledge and awareness levels as well as intent of change in behaviour on the key themes should be incorporated in a rigorously designed results monitoring framework. This would help in corrective action, as well as in measuring change on an on-going basis to inform programme resource allocation.
Evaluation of Meena Radio Programme

6. For ease of reference, *Annex XI* presents the key imperatives for the replication and scale up of the programme.

C. UNICEF Support

7. UNICEF support has been one of the biggest factors for the success of the Meena Radio Programme. This section presents the role that UNICEF should play at different stages and maturity of the implementation of the Meena Radio Programme in the states and the corresponding role of the government. As presented in the exhibit below, UNICEF support would be important in the initial stages of the roll out and implementation of the Meena Radio Programme in a state. As the programme implementation reaches a stage of maturity, the government can start taking ownership of increasing responsibilities and UNICEF’s involvement in the programme can be reduced.

---

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Operational Level</th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Strengthen knowledge management and sharing of experiences on the Meena Radio Programme – A number of factors and strategies have made the Meena Radio Programme successful in different states. Documentation of these best practices, innovations, localized strategies and processes adopted will be extremely useful for the programme in the future as well as in planning/designing replication models.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Clear terms of engagement should be established between UNICEF and the state government from the time of inception of programme – At the time of introducing the programme in a state, clear terms of engagement including roles and responsibilities should be established between UNICEF and the state government. Ownership of the programme by the state government should be established at the time of inception. In case there is UNICEF support provided in the state at the time of inception of the programme, it is important to develop a clear understanding of how this support will vary over the years. This will enable a smooth transitioning of the ownership of the programme from UNICEF to the respective state governments.</td>
<td>UNICEF and Implementing State Government</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Number of radio sets in the schools should be commensurate with the number of students – while in AP the government has mandated one radio set for every 40 students, schools in UP and MP have one radio set for the entire school. It is recommended that one radio set should be made available for each class in large schools. This will also allow teachers to facilitate contextualized discussions with students in different classes and will keep the programme relevant for students in different classes.</td>
<td>Implementing State Government</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Continue organizing annual learning visits – An annual learning visit is organized by UNICEF to UP. This practice should continue and learning visits should be organized to other states as well where the programme has been successful. Regular fora for discussion of these experiences and systematic documentation will facilitate better knowledge management and consolidation.</td>
<td>Implementing State Government and UNICEF</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Exhibit 8: Role of UNICEF and Government in roll out and implementation of Meena Radio Programme

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>PRE-LAUNCH</th>
<th>LAUNCH AND EARLY STAGE</th>
<th>INTERMEDIATE STAGE</th>
<th>MATURE STAGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Advocacy</strong> for implementing Meena Radio Programme</td>
<td><strong>Technical support</strong> in planning high profile launch</td>
<td><strong>Advocacy</strong> for an Impact Assessment</td>
<td><strong>Technical Support</strong> as required</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Advocacy</strong> for Baseline Study and prioritization of episodes to be broadcast</td>
<td><strong>Capacity development</strong> through support for annual refresher training</td>
<td><strong>Technical Support</strong> as required</td>
<td><strong>Technical Support</strong> as required</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Technical support</strong> for re-versioning of episodes and translation of teachers guide (if required)</td>
<td><strong>Advocacy</strong> for regular monitoring through SSA</td>
<td><strong>Support Knowledge Management</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Capacity development</strong> - Training of Trainers</td>
<td><strong>Technical support</strong> for design of IEC materials</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Advocacy</strong> for institutionalization in timetable</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Technical support</strong> for design of IEC materials</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Support in developing monitoring tools and systems</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Government buy-in for the programme</td>
<td>• Launch of the programme accompanied by media coverage</td>
<td>• Implementation of the Meena Radio Programme</td>
<td>• Implementation of the Meena Radio Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Develop partnerships for technical support and broadcast</td>
<td>• Undertake training at district and block levels</td>
<td>• Undertake training at district and block levels</td>
<td>• Design and printing of IEC materials</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Identification of priorities and episodes for broadcast</td>
<td>• Mainstreaming monitoring of the Meena Radio Programme with SSA monitoring</td>
<td>• Undertake refresher training at district and block levels</td>
<td>• Undertake refresher training at district and block levels</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Support for identifying broadcast partners and Master Trainers</td>
<td></td>
<td>• Mainstreaming monitoring of the Meena Radio Programme with SSA monitoring</td>
<td>• Mainstreaming monitoring of the Meena Radio Programme with SSA monitoring</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Ensure that all schools have at least one radio set</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Government’s role  UNICEF’s role

— Implementation of the Meena Radio Programme
— Design and printing of IEC materials
— Undertake refresher training at district and block levels
— Mainstreaming monitoring of the Meena Radio Programme with SSA monitoring