Table of Contents

Submitted By:                                                                                     Submitted To: ........................................
(An ISO 9001:2008 Organisation)........................................................................................................1

Acronyms..................................................................................................................................................4

2.1 Purpose and Objective of Evaluation ...............................................................................................14

2.2 Scope of Evaluation ...........................................................................................................................14

2.3 Methodology of Evaluation ................................................................................................................14

3.1 Project Component 1: Creating and strengthening CP structures to adequately protect children against exploitation and abuse ...........................................................................................................21

"UNICEF’s presence and interaction with Government at various levels has ensured speedy actions towards establishment of child protection structures in many districts. Various notifications, orders, circulars have been issued from district and block offices for the establishment of CP structures in continuation of State notifications and orders in a time bound manner, which is appreciable. Without the support of UNICEF it was a very time consuming and long procedure." .................................................................................................................................21

Project Component 2: Improving the quality of education to increase enrolment and retention .... 33

Project Component 3: Raising awareness and empowering families and communities so that they take collective action against child labour ........................................................................................................44

Project Component 4: Addressing exclusion of vulnerable families to service provision and social protection schemes .........................................................................................................................52
## Acronyms

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Acronym</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>AWC</td>
<td>Anganwadi Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AWW</td>
<td>Anganwadi Worker</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BDO</td>
<td>Block Development Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BEO</td>
<td>Block Education Officer</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BPL</td>
<td>Below Poverty Line</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CBO</td>
<td>Community Based Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CC</td>
<td>Condensed Course</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CFS</td>
<td>Child Friendly School</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CP</td>
<td>Child Protection</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CSO</td>
<td>Civil Society Organisations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CWC</td>
<td>Child Welfare Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCLTF</td>
<td>District Child Labour Task Force</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DCPU</td>
<td>District Child Protection Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DoE</td>
<td>Department of Education</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DoL</td>
<td>Department of Labour</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DSIE</td>
<td>Department Social Justice Empowerment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DWCD</td>
<td>Department Women Child Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GoG</td>
<td>Government of Gujarat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gol</td>
<td>Government of India</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICDS</td>
<td>Integrated Child Protection Scheme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ICPS</td>
<td>Integrated Child Protection Scheme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IEC</td>
<td>Information Education and Communication</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JJA</td>
<td>Juvenile Justice Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>JJB</td>
<td>Juvenile Justice Board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MIS</td>
<td>Management Information System</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non-Governmental Organisations</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OOSC</td>
<td>Out of School Children</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PRI</td>
<td>Panchayati Raj Institution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RTE</td>
<td>Right to Education Act</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SC</td>
<td>Scheduled Caste</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCLTF</td>
<td>State Child Labour Task Force</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SCP5</td>
<td>State Child Protection Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SDP</td>
<td>School Development Plan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SHG</td>
<td>Self Help Group</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SJPU</td>
<td>Special Juvenile Police Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SMCP</td>
<td>School Management Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SOP</td>
<td>Standard Operating Procedures</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SRP</td>
<td>School Readiness Programme</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ST</td>
<td>Scheduled Tribe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>STP</td>
<td>Special Training Package</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VCPC</td>
<td>Village Child Protection Committee</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Chapter 1: Introduction

1.1 Context
It is estimated that 150 million children aged 5–14 are engaged in child labour worldwide.\(^1\) Child labour is a marked loss of childhood interfering with education and reinforcing the intergenerational cycle of poverty. It is associated with exploitation of children who often work in hazardous conditions harming both to their physical and mental development.\(^2\) \(^3\)

Child labour is internationally recognized as a violation of children’s rights and defined by Article 32 of the Convention on Rights of the Child (CRC), as ‘any work that is likely to be hazardous or to interfere with the child’s education, or to be harmful to the child’s health or physical, spiritual, moral or social development’. Having ratified the CRC in December 1992, India has made considerable progress towards addressing the issue of child labour in recent years with an overall decline by nearly half in the number of child labourers. According to the National Sample Survey Office (NSSO), India, an estimated 5 million children were engaged in child labour in 2009-10 as compared to 9 million in 2004-05.\(^4\) While this is a positive development, a significant proportion of children in India have yet to be granted their fundamental human rights. In line with the CRC, UNICEF aims to build a protective environment for children across several states in India.

The Project ‘Promoting Protection and Education Rights of Children in Cotton Areas’ is an initiative that was implemented in Gujarat, Maharashtra and Rajasthan over the period 2009-2013 to tackle the problem of children working in cotton fields. New Concept Information Systems (NCIS) has been commissioned by UNICEF to conduct an evaluation of this Project, which builds on the previous and ongoing IKEA Foundation support to the UNICEF Child Protection (CP) Programme.

1.2 Dynamics of Child Labour and BT Cotton
Child labour in cotton fields is endemic in the states of Andhra Pradesh, Gujarat, Maharashtra, Rajasthan, Tamil Nadu and Karnataka. The use of child labour in cotton seed production especially for the purposes of cross-pollination is widespread in all the major cotton and cotton seed producing states of India. Gujarat, Maharashtra and Rajasthan have the highest proportion of children aged 5-14 years engaged in child labour in India. Gujarat and Rajasthan each account for approximately 8 percent of child labourers aged 5-14 years in India with Maharashtra accounting for an estimated 5 percent (NSSO, 2009-10).\(^5\) Gujarat and Maharashtra are consistently among the top producers of cotton in India. The cotton seed production areas in these states in particular are widespread with

---


\(^5\) NSSO 2009-10 data estimates the total number of children aged 5-14 years engaged in child labour in India is 4,983,871 children. The estimated number of child labourers aged 5-14 years in Gujarat is 390,687 (166,432 male and 224,255 female); Rajasthan is 405,936 (136,239 male and 269,697 female); and Maharashtra is 260,673 (120,600 male and 140,073 female). Retrieved 13 May 2014. URL: http://labour.nic.in/upload/uploadfiles/files/Divisions/childLabour/NSSOEstimatedChildLabourinMajorIndianStates.pdf
genetically modified varieties of cotton seeds known as *Bacillus Thuringiensis* (BT) cotton.\textsuperscript{5} It has been reported that BT cotton cultivation has a high demand for labour per unit area. The absolute increase in area under BT cotton has increased the overall demand for labour for this crop.\textsuperscript{6} Research conducted on child labour in the cottonseed producing state of Andhra Pradesh showed that labour costs for hybrid cottonseed production account for approximately half of the total cost. Farmers employ children because they can make them work longer hours and they are easier to control as compared to adult employees.\textsuperscript{7} In addition, children work for less money than adult labourers. This exploitation poses serious health problems to children. Children suffer from the harmful effects of pesticides commonly used in cotton production and work for more than 12 hours a day, often suffering from physical, verbal and sometimes sexual abuse.\textsuperscript{8} It is estimated that 3.09 million children up to 18 years of age work in cotton growing (cotton picking) in the states of Maharashtra, Gujarat, and Rajasthan.\textsuperscript{9} A study in 2004 estimated that 60 percent of children working in BT cottonseed production in Gujarat were girls. Seasonal migration and trafficking of children from Rajasthan to Gujarat to work in BT cotton fields are grave concerns. Interstate migration from the tribal belt of southern Rajasthan to Gujarat affects a particularly vulnerable population of tribal migrant workers. A large number of child laborers are from scheduled caste (SC), scheduled tribe (ST) and other marginalized communities.\textsuperscript{10}

### 1.3 Drivers of Child Labour

Child labour is a complex and multi-faceted issue. Widespread inter-generational poverty and social acceptance of child labour are the greatest drivers of child labour. It is widely believed that a child’s income is crucial for the child’s own survival and the household, but it is equally true that child labour induces poverty. Social and financial exclusion based on caste, ethnicity, economic status and religion are other contributory factors that perpetuate child labour. Majority children and families working in cotton fields live below the poverty line and belong to SC and ST communities.

Lack of access to education, and low perceived value of education among communities due to poor educational facilities, discrimination and corporal punishment are other crucial factors. It has been found that majority of children working in the cotton industry have either dropped out of school or have never been to school. A study commissioned by the IKEA Foundation reports that absenteeism during the cotton picking season (October- November) led to school drop-outs which was particularly prevalent among migrant children. Attitudes towards child labour also contribute towards its prevalence. In fact, child labour has gender dimensions as traditional views prevail that girls will be better prepared for adult life by sending them to work rather than to school.

The practice of child marriage is a human rights violation and children who are married are more vulnerable to being out of school. Inadequate legislation and enforcement to protect the rights of

---


\textsuperscript{6} Foundation for Agrarian studies India

\textsuperscript{7} Venkateswarlu, D. (2007). Recent Trends in Employment of Child Labour in Hybrid Cottonseed Production in India. Study jointly commissioned by OECD Watch, Deutsche Welthungerhilfe (DWHH), India Committee of the Netherlands (ICN), Eine Welt Netz NRW (EWN NRW), International Labor Rights Fund (ILRF).


\textsuperscript{9} Study commissioned by IKEA Foundation (2008)

Children only serve to foster an environment that breeds child labour.\textsuperscript{11} Children in cotton and cottonseed farms live and work in exploitative conditions since child labour in agriculture is not regulated under current Indian law and other relevant protective laws relating to trafficking, bonded labour and discrimination against SC and ST and implementation of these laws is also very poor. There is an inadequate protective net with CP structures in place to address issues of vulnerable children including child labour. Interventions that seek to address the issue of child labour must therefore address a multitude of factors.

1.4 Legal and Programmatic Safeguards

The issue of child labour in India is being addressed through key CP legislation including the Child Labour (Prohibition and Regulation) Act, 1986, Juvenile Justice Act (Care and Protection of Children) (2000; 2006; 2011), and the Prohibition of Child Marriage Act (2006). The National Child Labour Project (NCLP) implemented by the Ministry of Labour (MoL), seeks to rehabilitate child laborers withdrawn from employment. Under the aegis of the Ministry of Women and Child Development (MWCD), the Integrated Child Protection Scheme (ICPS) mandates establishment of specific CP structures to prevent and address CP issues including child labour.

1.5 Combating Child Labour in Cotton Areas

The Project “Promoting Protection and Education Rights of Children in Cotton Areas” aims to contribute to child labour reduction in the long term. The Project builds on previous and ongoing IKEA Foundation support to the UNICEF CP programme aimed at reducing child labour in the carpet belt in Eastern Uttar Pradesh, cottonseed production in Andhra Pradesh and Karnataka, and the metal ware industry in Moradabad. This Project aims at expanding the coverage and impact of interventions aimed at promoting children’s right to protection and education. UNICEF with the support of IKEA Foundation held national level consultations with Save the Children, an international agency working on child labour in India, to avoid duplication and delineate respective geographic target areas.\textsuperscript{13}

The overall objective of the Project is that “in cotton and cotton seed production areas, children in the age group of 6 to 14 years are not working and are in school”. The Project comprises four components focusing on four planned outcomes, each having a set of sub-outcomes that measures the success of the Project. The Project components and outcomes are:

Component 1: Creating and strengthening of CP structures to adequately protect children against exploitation and abuse.

Outcome 1: CP structures are in place addressing child labour issues.

Component 2: Improving the quality of education to increase enrolment and retention.

Outcome 2: Quality education available for all children aged 6-14 years.

Component 3: Raising awareness and empowering families and communities so that they take collective action against child labour.

Outcome 3: Families and communities take collective action for protection and development of children.


\textsuperscript{13} UNICEF, Revised Project proposal to IKEA, 2012.
Component 4: Addressing exclusion of vulnerable families to service provision and social protection schemes.

Outcome 4: Enhanced access to social protection schemes for vulnerable families (out of school children and children without parental care).

The four components under this Project are inter-linked and complement each other to create and strengthen the protective environment for children and provide them with education. The Project’s commencement in 2009 coincided with the introduction of ICPS, 2009 and the Right to Education Act (RTE), 2009 by the GoI (please see Annexure 1 and 2). The Project period (2009-13) is representative of the nascent stages of establishment of CP structures in line with ICPS and implementation of the RTE.

The Project approach focuses on strengthening of preventative measures by tackling a number of causal factors associated with child labour. This includes advocating for changes to legislation, creating a protective environment for children, strengthening institutional capacity and service delivery of quality education, changing community attitudes, and implementing strategies for poverty alleviation. The logical framework for the Project outlines the indicators for each outcome and sub-outcome along with baseline and target figures and the method of verification for each (please see Annexure 3).

1.6 Project Components

Component 1: Creating and strengthening of child protection (CP) structures to adequately protect children against exploitation and abuse

The component aims to ensure that CP structures are in place for addressing CP issues. The Project views the issue of child labour within the broader context of CP. The approach therefore endeavors to strengthen the legislative and institutional mechanisms that protect children from exploitation and abuse. In this way, the Project design is linked with government systems and seeks to strengthen the implementation of key CP related legislation and government schemes in India viz. JJA (2000; 2006; 2011) and ICPS; Prohibition of Child Marriage Act, 2006; and Child Labour (Prohibition and Regulation) Act, 1986 at the state, district, block and panchayat/village levels.

Outcome 1: CP structures are in place for addressing child labour issues.

The five sub-outcomes under component 1 of the Project are as follows:

1.1. CP structures under labour and ICPS/ JJ are in place and functioning at state, district, and panchayat and village level.

1.2. Monitoring systems to track and target children at risk have been established and maintained through village-level database

1.3. Civil society alliance has been established and non-governmental organizations are actively partnering with District Administration for planning and review of child labour interventions

1.4. State and district action plans against child labour have been developed and its implementation is being monitored

1.5. Advocacy platforms strengthened (district level meeting and recommendations provided) for amending child labour law to include prohibition of child labour in agriculture (Maharashtra only)

Component 2: Improving the quality of education to increase enrolment and retention

Component 2 of the Project seeks to deliver quality education available for all children aged 6-14 years. Child labour is a significant driver for children’s non-enrolment, delayed enrolment and early
exit from school. Simultaneously, children not attending school are at risk of engaging in labour.\textsuperscript{14} Lack of educational attainment is the most important non-economic factor which continues to entrench child labour within the vicious cycle of poverty, even in light of increasing economic well-being.\textsuperscript{15} To ensure access to education and school retention of children vulnerable to labour and former child labourers, education needs to become socially inclusive, of good quality, and involve a pedagogy which is child-centered. In addition, effective rehabilitation involves removing children from labour, ensuring access to adequate interim schooling and support to ensure that children catch up on missed years of schooling and reach the correct learning level for their school grade before they join formal schools. This component supports India’s target of Millennium Development Goal (MDG) 2 to achieve universal primary education by 2015. It also serves to strengthen the implementation of the RTE Act, 2009 and the GoI’s educational framework through Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan (SSA) and pre-school education as part of the Integrated Child Development Services (ICDS) (please see Annexure 2).

\textbf{Outcome 2: Quality education available for all children aged 6-14 years.}

The five sub-outcomes under component 2 of the Project are as follows:

2. Special Training Programme (STP)\textsuperscript{16} for child labourers and other out-of-school children up to 14 years in place for mainstreaming children into formal education.
3. School Management Committees (SMC)\textsuperscript{17} and Panchayati Raj Institutions (PRI) monitor and support attendance and infrastructure improvement of schools.
4. Models of School Readiness Programme (SRP) established for 03-05 year old children
5. Evidence-based advocacy for effective targeting and utilization of resources for education of excluded children.

\textbf{Component 3: Raising awareness and empowering families and communities so that they take collective action against child labour}

Component 3 of the Project endeavors that families and communities take collective action for protection and development of children. This component seeks to change the mindsets and attitudes of communities towards child labour. Key actors in society including children, parents, and communities have to be convinced that child labour is a problem and that educating their children will have long-term benefits. The belief that educating a girl is a poor investment as she will marry and leave home should be addressed. Parents who send their children to work and employers do not always recognize the harm caused, especially in the absence of an effective social or moral sanction against the practice. There is lack of information about the health effects of exposure to harmful pesticides in cotton fields, the benefits of education and the future opportunities that a working child will be denied.\textsuperscript{18,19} Hence, this component is linked with the other three Project components since changing community attitudes to send children to school requires parents and children to see the benefits of quality education (component 2); social protection schemes should provide an opportunity for families to seek ‘viable’ options to supplement family income (component 4); effective monitoring

\begin{footnotesize}
\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{15} National Commission Protection for Child Rights. (2008). Abolition of Child Labour and Making Education a Reality for Every Child as a Right.
\item \textsuperscript{16} Transitional programmes/bridge schooling has been replaced with Special Training Programmes in line with Right to Education terminology.
\item \textsuperscript{17} VECs and PTAs have been replaced with School Management Committees in line with Right to Education Act.
\item \textsuperscript{19} International Labour Organization. Retrieved 13 May 2014. URL: http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/europe/moscow/areas/ipec/causes.htm
\end{itemize}
\end{footnotesize}
and resolution of child labour cases at the community level is linked with appropriate legislation and institutional mechanisms.

**Outcome 3: Families and communities take collective action for protection and development of children.**

The three sub-components under component 3 of the Project are as follows:

- 3.1 Families aware of harm caused by sending children to work and instead send their children to school
- 3.2 Adolescents, especially girls and women networked and empowered to monitor and tackle child rights violations and protect children’s rights, especially the right to education and to protection
- 3.3 Community leaders, including PRIs take active role in monitoring child rights issues and take action for preventing child labour
- 3.4 Advocacy on child labour-free farming with farmers and through media

**Component 4: Addressing exclusion of vulnerable families to service provision and social protection schemes**

Component 4 of the Project seeks to enhance access to social protection schemes for vulnerable families. Households adopt livelihood strategies and coping mechanisms to deal with poverty risks and shocks. Both household vulnerabilities and their response mechanisms impact children. Social protection programmes for families in need will help prevent a relapse to child labour. Investment in social protection schemes is a cost-effective strategy to reduce child labour in the long term. The inclusion of social protection as a strategy to address child labour is also in line with the National Policy on Child Labour (1987) which stipulates “the need to cover child laborers and their families under various poverty alleviation and employment generation schemes”.

**Outcome 4: Enhanced access to social protection schemes for vulnerable families (out of school children and children without parental care).**

The three sub-components under component 4 of the Project are as follows:

- 4.1 Social protection schemes mapped, reviewed and recommended for revisions to explicitly target vulnerable families, including those having children engaged in child labour and migrants
- 4.2 Increased awareness among families on social protection schemes
- 4.3 Systems set up to monitor and link vulnerable families to social protection schemes

**1.7 Project Stakeholders and Convergence**

The Project was implemented with the support and partnerships of many stakeholders to further strengthen their capacities towards the collective objective of reducing child labour. The Project design promoted convergence through coordination and undertaking joint initiatives in addressing child labour issues.

The Project was supported by IKEA Foundation as the donor agency. It provided funding for the Project to UNICEF at a requested EUR 13.4 million. An additional EUR 1.5 million was raised through other sources amounting to a total budget in excess of EUR 14.9 million (please see Annexure 4 for Project budget and Gujarat State budget).

UNICEF implemented the Project in partnership with the state Governments of Gujarat, Maharashtra, and Rajasthan with implementation support from Civil Society Organisations (CSOs) and Non-

---

Government Organizations (NGOs). Community Based Organizations (CBOs) including adolescent groups and Panchayat Raj Institutions (PRIs) supported in community sensitization activities including information dissemination on the harmful effects of child labour, importance of education and information on social protection schemes.

UNICEF provided technical expertise and support in all four Project component areas. The UNICEF Chief of Field Office was the lead manager of the Project. Chiefs of CP, Education and Communication for Development (C4D) aided by the respective sector Specialists provided technical guidance to the Project. The UNICEF Country Office in Delhi was responsible for coordination with the relevant national level ministries for issues related to policy, advocacy and programmatic response. UNICEF State Offices coordinated with the relevant state level government departments and CSOs, community groups and local functionaries for issues related to Project implementation.

At the national level, the MoI, MWCD, Ministry of Human Resource Development (MHRD) and National Commission for Protection of Child Rights (NCPCR) were key stakeholders. At the state government level, functionaries under the Department of Labour (DoL), Department of Women and Child Development (DWCD), Department of Education (DoE), Department of Home (DoH) and Department of Social Justice and Empowerment (DSJE) were primary stakeholders. In addition, locally elected government representatives played a crucial role in implementing the Project. The Project also worked with media groups to raise social consciousness and influence public opinion. In addition, district level task forces chaired by District Collectors with membership of relevant line departments, NGO representatives, trade union leaders and UNICEF were formed to plan and monitor the Project as part of their remit of work.

1.8 Project Beneficiaries
Children as rights holders are direct beneficiaries under the Project. The Project targeted children aged 6-14 years in 11 districts across the three intervention states with expected coverage of 4.9 million at risk and vulnerable children including those out of school and in child labour, those working in cotton and cotton seed production as well as in other forms of labour. In addition, through strengthening of Early Childhood Education (ECE), the Project sought to benefit young children (age 0-5 years) for mainstreaming them into formal education and also create youth networks to empower adolescents.

The Project design also serves to benefit vulnerable households under component 4 by enhancing their access to service providers and social protection schemes. In addition, through capacity development under the Project design, functionaries under ICPS, education personnel including teachers and anganwadi workers (AWWs) and members of community based organizations are also considered beneficiaries.

1.9 Project Strategy
A common implementation strategy was adopted across all three intervention states viz. six districts of Gujarat (Kutch, Vadodara, Rajkot, Bhavnagar, Banaskantha and Patan), three districts of Maharashtra (Yavatmal, Jalna, and Wardha), and two districts of Rajasthan (Udaipur and Dungarpur). However, sub-outcomes were adapted to the state-specific context.

1.10 Project Scope
Areas of coverage selected were prone to child labour and with the Project’s equity focus comprised marginalized communities (ST/SC populations) particularly vulnerable to child labour. The Project primarily targeted children at risk of child labour and those engaged in child labour, those working in cotton and cotton seed production and other forms of labour. In addition, capacity of Project partners to effectively implement the Project was considered while determining Project areas. The Project...
design remains socially inclusive and seeks to create and strengthen a protective environment for all children irrespective of socio-economic background, gender or type of labour.

A limitation in the Project scope of component 2 is the target age group of children between 6-14 years of age as compared to the CRC which considers children up to 18 years of age. Therefore under Project component 2, service delivery of education for children in the age group 15-18 years of age is not addressed. However, the target age group of 6-14 years is aligned with the RTE. In other Project components, children in the age group of 0-18 years are included to strengthen implementation of JJA, which recognizes a child as an individual up to 18 years of age.

1.11 Building Sustainable Structures
The Project focuses on creation of sustainable structures with increased capacities of human resources under the mandate of the ICPS. At state, district and panchayat/village levels, various stakeholders at policy, programme and implementation, and community levels are involved. Capacity building and training of CP functionaries and key stakeholders at state, district, block and village levels is a key feature of the four Project component areas. In addition, the Project is aligned to strengthen implementation of legislation and government schemes and advocate for change in legislation in line with the CRC. By working closely with the government and ensuring its buy-in, sustainability beyond the Project period can be achieved with potential of scaling up to other districts and/or states in India.

1.12 Human Rights, Equity and Gender
The issue of child labour and promoting education for children is congruent with international human rights framework viz. CRC to which India is a signatory. The Project is closely aligned with a number of articles in the CRC (please see Annexure 5 for the pertinent articles in the CRC).

Equity has been briefly discussed in the Project scope. In addition to addressing the issues of child labour and out of school children, by targeting geographical regions of reportedly high incidence of child labour particularly among ST and SC communities, vulnerable children and families most at risk are covered. Specifically under component 4 of the Project, vulnerable families (with out of school children and children without parental care) are provided the benefits of social protection schemes.

The Project maintains a gender focus by linking with Women’s Self-help Groups (SHGs) and creating Adolescent Girls Groups (AGGs) to empower women and girls at the community-level to address issues of child labour and out of school children. These groups have been provided capacity development/training under component 3 of the Project.

1.13 Changes to the Project
The Project is implemented in the changing CP landscape in India viz. ICPS introduced in 2009 and the RTE Act of 2009, which came into force in April 2010. The Project sought a one-year no-cost extension in the first instance to dedicate sufficient time and resources for effective implementation of ICPS and RTE in light of a time lag for ICPS to gather momentum. In addition, any positive changes observed would require longer duration, to demonstrate results than originally envisaged, as evidence for replication. Project duration was therefore planned from January 2009 to December 2013 to deliver results in line with supporting sustainable government structures and systems. In the second instance, a two month no-cost extension was sought adjusting the Project period from January 2009 to February 2014 in order to complete Project implementation.

Outputs and indicators pertaining to a select few outcome areas were revised during the first no-cost extension period, to be more specific and measurable. Initial output under Project component 4 viz.
'Partnerships in place to link SHGs to economic and livelihood programmes', does not feature in the revised log frame since other outputs under this Project component are sufficient to adequately inform progress of the Project in this capacity (please see Annexure 3 for the revised log frame). It is considered that changes made to the Project log frame were appropriate to bring more focus to the Project.
Chapter 2: Research Design

2.1 Purpose and Objective of Evaluation
The evaluation purpose aimed to assess whether the Project, having reached the end of its implementation period, has achieved its objectives and the extent to which these were accomplished. It endeavours to provide an understanding of the challenges faced and highlight key innovations under the Project to inform recommendations for future programming. This includes replication of integrated models of working with children in other states and districts as well as with the government. The findings will be used by UNICEF to provide a Project report to the donor IKEA Foundation. The overall objective of the evaluation is to assess the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability of the Project and to derive recommendations accordingly.

2.2 Scope of Evaluation
The evaluation covers the entire Project period from 2009 to 2013 in all 11 Project districts of Gujarat, Maharashtra and Rajasthan. The evaluation focuses on addressing “how” and “why” questions related to assessment of achievements viz. the effectiveness and efficiency of the Project, sharing lessons learned, guiding recommendations and determining whether key strategies and activities are replicable and sustainable. The evaluation is qualitative and supplements the quantitative data obtained from prior fieldwork such as the midline survey, 2012 and other quantitative data obtained through the Project’s internal monitoring mechanisms (please see Annexure 3 - means of verification column in Project log-frame and Annexure 6 for the Project results matrix).

The evaluation sought to address the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency and sustainability of the Project by closely linking research questions on these domains to the four broad Project outcome areas and corresponding sub-outcomes as identified in the Project log-frame. The sub-outcome 3.4 related to advocacy on child labour free farming with farmers and through the media was however not addressed as part of the evaluation, in accordance with the ToR and due to logistical challenges of meeting these stakeholders within the proposed timeframe of the evaluation. Impact assessment as defined by Development Assistance Committee (DAC) criteria is also beyond the scope of the evaluation. While the evaluation addresses efficiency of the Project, a comprehensive cost-benefit analysis is beyond the remit of the evaluation due to constraints in time and resources. The evaluation is based on the revised log-frame, 2012 (please see Annexure 3).

2.3 Methodology of Evaluation

2.3.1 Respondents and Data Collection Tools
The evaluation draws on a mix of primary and secondary research activities. Desk review of relevant documents obtained from UNICEF and those collected through field work was conducted (please see Annexure 7 for the list of secondary documents). Since the evaluation aimed to probe beyond quantitative indicators, a participatory approach comprising in-depth interviews (IDIs) and Focus Group Discussions (FGDs) with key stakeholders was adopted. These techniques were selected to maintain flexibility and probe into areas of interest and were relatively cost-effective.

In line with the evaluation objective, a master list of research questions was developed to investigate the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, and sustainability of the Project. Given the rigorous Project log-frame, the master list was closely mapped to the outcomes, sub-outcomes, and indicators outlined in the log-frame. The master list was used to create state-wise three-tiered stakeholder specific (policy-level, programme-level and community-level) tools. In addition, a FGD tool for discussion with the
Project target group of children (6-14 years of age) was developed (please see Annexure 8 for list of research tools).

Purposive sampling was employed to ensure a representative sample of functionaries involved in implementation as well as that of Project beneficiaries.

### Table 1: Evaluation Respondents by Tool

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TOOL</th>
<th>LEVEL</th>
<th>RESPONDENT/GROUP</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In-Depth Interviews</td>
<td>State</td>
<td>State Govt. officials (DWCD, SJE, Education/SSA), UNICEF (staff and consultants), SJPU, SARA, Police</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>District</td>
<td>DWCD, Education officers, Police, NGOs, CWC, JIB, DIETs, DCPO, Consultants supporting implementation of the Project</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Sub District (Block)</td>
<td>Block development officers, Line department representatives, CDPO, Gram Panchayat head, NGO functionaries, CRC, BRC</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Village</td>
<td>PRI, SMC members, children, VCPC, AGN Leader, Sarpanch, Village Volunteer, AWW, Bal Mitra, community</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focus Group Discussions</td>
<td>District</td>
<td>Line Departments</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Block</td>
<td>NGOs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Village</td>
<td>VCPC, SMC, village volunteers, Adolescent groups/children’s clubs, SHG members, community members/parents, teachers, children (rescued or benefitting from the programme)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### 2.3.2 Gujarat Respondents

The research team met various stakeholders identified at the state, district, block and village levels to gain insights into the Project implementation and to understand the strategies that worked in achieving the overall Project results. IDIs and FGDs with policy-level government representatives at state and district level from the departments of WCD, Education/SSA, Gujarat State Commission for Protection of Child Rights (GSCPCR) and DCPU were held with UNICEF facilitation. Detailed discussions with UNICEF staff and consultants closely working on the Project was undertaken to inform the evaluation process. At the programme and implementation level, respondents included the partner NGO Project staff, and Block Education Officer.

Community-level respondents included CBO members, PRI members, AWWs, head teachers/teachers, SMCs, AGGs, SHG members, and parents. Children in the age group of 6-14 years were consulted in the evaluation, reflecting the age group of the Right to Education Act. The inclusion of children in the evaluation recognises that children are social actors with a unique perspective and insight into their own reality. This is in line with Article 12 of the CRC which states that all children who are capable of forming their own views have a right to express those views freely in all matters affecting them, with the view of the child being given due weight in accordance with their age and maturity. Further, a mixed profile of children including those who are in school benefiting from the Project and those children migrating and otherwise constituting a vulnerable group such as orphans or children from marginalised communities was formed where possible. In fact, by including respondents from SHGs/AGGs the evaluation maintained a gender perspective as well.

---

Stakeholders and beneficiaries were asked to share their experiences of the Project including the manner in which Project activities have strengthened the protective environment for children at various levels and addressed the issue of OOSC and the challenges faced over the Project period. The extent to which the Project has ensured sustainability particularly through capacity building efforts, scale-up, networking and convergence was probed. Stakeholders were consulted to provide recommendations that will help improve future Project cycles. UNICEF Delhi Office, with the support of the state offices, participated in each stage of the evaluation and also became information providers.

2.3.3 Geographical Sample
Geographical representation was ensured by including all eleven Project districts in the study. As a standard norm, two blocks per district were purposively selected based on capturing the Project’s diversity in terms of socio-economic profile of respondent groups and spatial spread of the Project interventions. The sample also reflected active Project areas to draw out successes and challenges faced throughout the Project. Similarly, five villages per district were selected based on representative diversity of stakeholders and Project activities. Table 2 below provides proposed and actual geographic primary sampling units for each state.

### Table 2: State-wise Proposed and Actual Geographic Sample Selection

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Primary Sampling Unit</th>
<th>Gujarat-IDs</th>
<th>Maharashtra</th>
<th>Rajasthan</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Proposed</td>
<td>Actual</td>
<td>Proposed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District 6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Block 12</td>
<td>12</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Village 24</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>27</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

2.3.4 Data Collection Units
The sample of data collection units (DCUs) in each state was developed in agreement with UNICEF. Using the standard norm of DCU/state (see below), the sample of total number of IDIs and FGDs per state was devised. A total of 85 IDIs and 47 FGDs were conducted against the proposed 75 IDIs and 30 FGDs in Gujarat in the evaluation design. The details and state-wise break up of IDIs and FGDs as conducted against planned sample is detailed out in Table 3 below.
Table 3: State-wise DCU sample

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>DCUs/State</th>
<th>Overall DCU Sample in 3 States</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Gujarat</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Proposed</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDI FGD</td>
<td>IDI FGD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State</td>
<td>3 0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District</td>
<td>4 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Block</td>
<td>2 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Village</td>
<td>2 3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td>11 5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

It is noted that purposive sampling may introduce an element of bias into the evaluation with respondents purposively identified for obtaining either favourable or unfavorable views about the Project. An alternative random sampling strategy would have limited the bias, however was not deemed appropriate since qualitative evaluation requires respondents to provide sufficient information on specific areas of enquiry not guaranteed by random sampling. Bias has been controlled through a representative sample. Further, both primary and secondary research serves to triangulate information and strengthen validity of the findings.

2.3.5 Ethical Considerations

Adopting best-practice in carrying out research and recognising the duty of care towards people involved in the research activities, the WHO Standards and Operational Guidance for Ethics Review of Health-Related Research with Human Participants were consulted to mitigate the possibility of any negative effects arising from the involvement of respondents.\(^2\) Specific ethical guidelines for conducting research with children and young people were additionally consulted viz. Guidelines for Research with Children and Young People - Research Centre, National Children’s Bureau. The research team was also trained to adhere to ethical standards.\(^2\)

All respondents were provided with informed consent and were informed of their right to withdraw from the evaluation and of data confidentiality. The research purpose and findings were further explained to respondents. After each session, respondents were provided an opportunity to ask researchers any question or contact the research team at their will. Community-level field work was facilitated by local Project partners. State, district and block level research was facilitated by UNICEF Rajasthan specialists, officers and consultants (please see Annexure 9 for a detailed list of Project partners).

The evaluation design considered the four well-known moral principles that constitute the basis for ethics in research (please see Annexure 10 for a detailed description of the principles):

1) **The Principle of Non-maleficence**: Research must not cause harm to the participants in particular and to people in general.

2) **The Principle of Beneficence**: Research should also make a positive contribution towards the welfare of people.


3) The Principle of Autonomy: Research must respect and protect the rights and dignity of participants.

4) The Principle of Justice: The benefits and risks of research should be fairly distributed among people.

2.3.6 Evaluation Criteria

Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development’s Development Assistance Committee (OECD - DAC) criteria for evaluations of development assistance were applied to frame questions and guide the design of the evaluation.24 The criteria was selected on the basis that it best supports the objective of the evaluation as well as its wide-use among major donor agencies and other development stakeholders.25 Specifically, the evaluation was based on the following research framework.


25 Alternative criteria such as DAC criteria in Evaluating Humanitarian Action was not deemed relevant for this evaluation.
## OECD-DAC Criteria and Research Framework

### Relevance
Relevance refers to the extent to which the aid activity is suited to the priorities and policies of the target group, recipient and donor. The evaluation seeks to address the following questions under relevance.

- To what extent was the Project design relevant to the Project objective of ensuring that children 6-14 years are not working and are in school?
- To what extent does the Project design contribute towards creating an enabling environment towards promoting child rights, child protection and elimination of child labour?
- Given the change in the external environment due to new legislations and schemes, were there any new opportunities or challenges?
- Did the Project complement the Government policies and strategies?

### Effectiveness
Effectiveness is a measure of the extent to which an aid activity attains its objectives. The evaluation seeks to address the following questions under effectiveness.

- Did the Project achieve the results in relation to the stated objectives and key performance indicators? How and why/why not? Were there any variations from the outcomes originally proposed? If so, why?
- What was the role of the key players and UNICEF and how did they contribute to achieving the results? If not, state reasons.
- Have the strategies used enabled the Project to meet its objectives? If not, what are the possible reasons?
- What have been the difficulties or constraints that the Project has experienced and how has it affected the results? What are the lessons learnt?

### Efficiency
Efficiency is a measure of the outputs, both qualitative and quantitative, in relation to the inputs. The evaluation seeks to address the following questions under efficiency.

- To what extent were the resources utilized efficiently? Were outputs delivered on time?
- To what extent was the Project able to leverage Government resources and partner with the Government to enhance the efficiency of the Project? As compared to the budget outlays was any review done to see how these were being utilized and were any changes made as per programmatic progress and linkages?
- To what extent did the activities cover the different population groups especially the marginalized communities?

### Sustainability
Sustainability is a measure of whether the benefits of an activity are likely to continue after donor funding has been withdrawn. The evaluation seeks to address the following questions under sustainability.

- To what extent can this model of change be replicable in other programme areas with similar needs?
- What were the interventions that have been replicated by Government or likely to be replicated?
- To what extent will the partnerships, developed with the Government and other partners during the course of the Project, contribute to long term sustainability? (including community engagement and ownership)
- How has the partnership with the Government helped in operational sing Project interventions?

As defined by DAC criteria, impact refers to the positive and negative changes produced by a development intervention, directly or indirectly, intended or unintended. As per the study ToR, the comprehensive assessment of impact was not a part of the remit of this evaluation and therefore this aspect was not focused upon in the evaluation design. The evaluation however did explore what could be done to make the Project more effective to inform recommendations.
2.3.7 Field Work in Gujarat

Data collection in six Project districts of Gujarat was undertaken by two teams under the supervision of a State Coordinator. Each team comprised a field supervisor and two field investigators. The seven members of the team underwent intensive training at the NCIS, Delhi office on the evaluation protocol, the Project background and all the evaluation tools. All team members could speak, read and write in Gujarati, which was crucial to elicit rich data and create a comfortable atmosphere.

Data collection was completed in six districts from May 5th - 26th. Two research teams were working during the same period in different districts. The research teams were accompanied by UNICEF partner CSOs in all the districts. UNICEF consultants of CP and Education were also interviewed by the research teams, at state and district level, who contributed in a dedicated manner to the Project.

2.3.7.1 Challenges and Limitations in Data Collection

- The team encountered several challenges in data collection arising due to elections in the state. The fieldwork was initiated in the first week of April, however, it was stopped after two days on Government’s direction to UNICEF, Gujarat due to enforcement of the model code of conduct in the state. The data collection resumed from May 5, 2014 when the elections were over on April 30, 2014.
- Due to transfer of Government Officials at the state, district and taluka level, the team could not collect much information from all the concerned officials.
- Due to vacation time in schools, the team could not get to interact with teachers and educational staff.
- There was a 5-6 months gap between end of the Project and evaluation time, owing to which the team could not find the CTS data at village/panchayat level. Difficulty was also encountered in conducting the interactions planned with the CSO members.
- The UNICEF CP and Education specialists provided information in brief as they were not associated since the Project inception, and hence were not able to provide all information related to the initial phase of the Project.
- Out of the six, data of five districts was collected as per the sample size. However in Kutch, the team was not able to collect data as per the sample size due to a limited response received at the District level.
Chapter 3: Findings

The findings are mainly based on the review of Project documents and qualitative data collected in response of IDIs and FGDs conducted at various levels viz. policy, programme implementation, community and children. The findings for each sub-outcome are presented as per the Project log-frame. In line with the objective of the evaluation, the relevance, effectiveness, efficiency, and sustainability for each of the four Project component areas are also addressed.

3.1 Project Component 1: Creating and strengthening CP structures to adequately protect children against exploitation and abuse

Outcome 1: CP Structures in Place Addressing Child Labour Issues.

State level processes were initiated in 2010 to establish the CP structures at various levels as mandated under ICPS. The State Government with UNICEF facilitation developed notifications and GRs and circulated them across the state. The Project provided support and facilitation to all stakeholders associated with CP at the state, district and village level. Orientation about the CP issue and the related legislation was the first step under the Project. The Project contributed immensely in creating awareness on child related issues and establishing a network across the state.

This section of the report focuses primarily on the evaluation findings under outcome 1 and their sub outcomes, based on interaction from various respondent categories.

Sub Outcome 1.1: CP structures under Labour and ICPS/JJ in place functioning at state, district and panchayat levels

Government notifications issued to establish CP structures

During the three years of Project implementation 28 notifications (against the targeted 3) were issued to establish CP structures at the state, district and panchayat levels. UNICEF played a significant role in advocating with the state government on child rights issues in line with the JJ Act and ICPS, which mandates the establishment of CP structures to create a protective environment for children. It contributed by providing technical support in drafting the notifications, orders and circulars aligned with the state policies in consultation with secretaries and directors of CP departments, GoG. Some of the key notifications include:

- Orders to implement child tracking system
- Prevention of children from sexual offences, 2012 with state rules
- Formation of Adoption Recommendation Committee (ARC)
- Formation of committee for recruitment at district level under ICPS, 2011
- Formation of State Adoption Resources Agency (SARA), 2010
- Preparation of district action plan for protection of child rights, 2011
- Patrolling by Police on the Gujarat border to keep a vigil on the migrant child labor coming in from the

"UNICEF’s presence and interaction with Government at various levels has ensured speedy actions towards establishment of child protection structures in many districts. Various notifications, orders, circulars have been issued from district and block offices for the establishment of CP structures in continuation of State notifications and orders in a time bound manner, which is appreciable. Without the support of UNICEF it was a very time consuming and long procedure.

(Mr. Kanak Sinh Zala, SDO, Rajkot)
other side of the state, 2012.

**Challenges in issuing notifications**

- The IDIs with Government departments indicated that issuing of notifications pertaining to child rights required team work and coordination between departments and willingness to work on the same platform, which was a challenge. UNICEF held individual interactions with the chief functionaries of these departments to mobilise departmental support.
- Defining the roles and responsibilities for the concerned department and staff was also a challenging task which was overcome through various state level meeting facilitated by UNICEF.

**Establishment and functioning of CP structures**

Under the Project CP structures were established and strengthened at the state, district and village levels with UNICEF support. While some of the CP structures established were as mandated under the Project some of them were beyond Project scope. The responses received during the evaluation indicate that the Project succeeded in creating an enabling environment helped in establishment of these unplanned structures.

The Project faced initial challenges such as lack of CP trained staff, orientation of staff on CP issues and absence of Project management strategy and HR management issues at state and district level. The Project provided support and addressed all these issues through establishment of CP structures and facilitated their training, enabling them to perform their roles and responsibility efficiently. During the evaluation, a Project officer shared that UNICEF provided support at all levels and assisted in putting in place a child protective system at state and district level, which was non-existent earlier.

The various FGDs and IDIs with respondents indicated that:
- At district level, effective implementation of orders and notifications has been ensured by involving the District Collector for deciding the roles and responsibilities of various stakeholders and their review on monthly basis.
- ICPS implementation at various levels was ensured through development of material on ICPS and guidelines for VCPC functioning in the local language. All the booklets and material were disseminated for community use in the intervention districts.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Child Protection Structure</th>
<th>Target</th>
<th>Achieved</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>State-level</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State-level Child Labour Task Force</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State Child Protection Society</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1 (established in 2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State Commission for Protection of Child Rights</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1 (established in 2011)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>District-level</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District-level Child Labour Task Force</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District Child Protection Unit</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Child Welfare Committee notified and appointed</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>26 (established between 2011-13)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Juvenile Justice Board notified and appointed</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>26 (established between 2011-13)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Special Juvenile Police Units notified at district level</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Village-level</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Village Child Protection Committee</td>
<td>3450</td>
<td>3450 (established between 2011-13)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**State level CP structures established**

At the state level, the State Child Protection Society (SCPS) and the State Child Labour Task Force (SCLTF) were successfully established in 2011 as per Project plan. The GSCPCR established in 2011 was not planned under the Project but was the result of UNICEF advocacy in line with the Project objectives. Its establishment was made possible because of UNICEF’s active involvement with state
government on CP issues in terms of drafting the State Rules for the Commission for Protection of Child Rights Act, 2005.

SCLTF was constituted under GSCPS chair to review and monitor the implementation of existing state and district action plans against child labour. State-level review meetings of DCLTFs were held, protocol and system were developed to plan and monitor elimination of child labour including rescue, rehabilitation and mainstreaming of children in schools.

The State Adoption Resource Agency (SARA) was established in 2010 to focus on family-based non-institutional care such as foster care, sponsorship and adoption. The GSCPCR was established in 2011 with limited and untrained staff. UNICEF trained all the staff on ICPS and also oriented them about their roles and responsibilities.

**District level CP structures established**

District level CP structures have been demonstrated through their establishment in six Project districts26. The effectiveness of these structures in preventing child labour motivated the state government to replicate most of the structures in the remaining 26 districts.

To set up and facilitate SJPUs and DCPUs in 26 districts and DLTFs in six project districts, UNICEF provided technical support and necessary capacity building of all state and district officers under ICPS.

In partnership with Gujarat Judicial Academy, 76 district magistrates were also trained on JJ Act and CP.

By 2012, DCPUs, CWC, JJB and SJPUs were established and UNICEF developed necessary modules for their capacity building. CWCs and JJBs were successfully established under ICPS in six intervention districts initially, which was replicated in the remaining 26 districts in the year 2011-12. As a result of UNICEF’s effective advocacy with DSJE, it is proposed that these statutory bodies be reconstituted as their term is now over.

**Establishment and functioning of VCPC**

The Project facilitated establishment of VCPCs in 2011, each having 7-11 members including the president and member secretary. The partner CSOs,27 have contributed in effective management and functioning of the VCPCs. The Project achieved the target of establishing 3450 VCPCs by the end of 2013.

CSOs have played a supportive role to empower the community as well orient them on CP issues. They have organised various activities such as awareness camps and other related activities in all the villages with special focus on intervention districts (Bansaknatha and Patan) to change the general mindset about child labour.

26 Six Districts (Vadodara, Banskanatha, Rajkot, Patan, Kutch and Bhavnagar)

27 1)Baroda Citizen Council, 2)Mahiti Organization, 3)NRDA, Palanpur, 4)M.G.Patel Sarvoday Kendra- Amirgadh, 5)AWAG, 6)Navjivan Trust, 7)YMC
Interviews conducted in Rajkot informed that CSOs have been very supportive to the VCPCs in discharging their functions by providing regular handholding in database formation and consolidation, monitoring the OSSC and drop-out children, convergence at community level on child related issues. However, it is important to note that there are issues with the functioning of VCPCs after December 2013, in absence of managerial support.

Response at some places indicated that few VCPCs were highly empowered during this project with CSO support. PRI members in some villages announced that families that send their children for child labour will not be provided benefits of social protection schemes. Though such positive discrimination messages aimed to deter families from sending children into child labour and were not executed in actual.

**Challenges faced by VCPCs**

Initially, the Project faced a number of challenges in establishment and functioning of the VCPCs.

- While interacting with PRI members the evaluation found that sometimes the default members of the VCPC were found to be inactive or not interested, as they had several other things to do on the personal, social and political front, hence the VCPCs did not receive a committed support from the community. The workshops to sensitise the community on CP, regular handholding and exposure with Government stakeholders helped in creating an enabling environment for CP and changed the behavior of in-active default and other members and now they are participating in each activity of VCPC with enthusiasm. CSO and VCPC members created one platform where all the stakeholders played a critical role in the CL issue in the village.

- During the evaluation it was indicated that majority VCPC meetings went poorly attended. After regular counseling and trainings by CSOs, the VCPC members are now demanding further orientation for in-depth understanding on the CP issue. There is willingness to work further for children among the members and they feel that there is need to increase the training duration.

- Responses in Kutch and Banaskantha indicated that PRI members were unaware of ICPS hence did not agree to work on child protection. VCPC members responded that communities were not able to change their mindsets about child labour. With the help of partner NGOs, awareness about ICPS was created through various events like, FGDs, rallies, posters. Other stakeholders such as AGGs, ASHAs, teachers, PRI members, VVs, parents also participated in all village level activities including the VCPC members.

**Capacity building of CP structure members**

UNICEF supported an induction program for CP members organised at the State and district levels on ICPS and CP issues, followed by a plethora of initiatives for training and capacity building of the concerned committees and other entities.

Under the Project, 526 master trainers were trained at Gandhinagar who were drawn from various government departments and CP structures. In 2011, UNICEF was able to cover 22 districts, 800 police officers, 486 CWOs and other ICPS staff members whereas in 2012, 26 districts were covered along with 800 police officers, 1075 CWOs and other CP functionaries. Please see table 5 for details on capacity building initiatives.
DCPU members received training at state and district level on child labour, JJA, life skills, guidelines for children’s safety, dealing with children in conflict with the law, victims of abuse and on levels of threat to children from employers, such as long working hours in cotton farms and inadequate food provided to children.

Table 5: Capacity Building Initiatives (Organised by UNICEF)

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Details of Programme</th>
<th>No. of Trainings</th>
<th>No. of Participants</th>
<th>Participants</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>National Seminar on “Making Child Rights a Reality”</td>
<td>01</td>
<td>360</td>
<td>NCPCR, SCPCR, Academicians, NGOs, officials from child related Departments, Judicial, State police officers, ICPS functionaries, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State Orientation Programme on Adoption</td>
<td>03</td>
<td>147</td>
<td>DCPU &amp; Specialized Adoption Agency’s (SAA) Staff (Superintendent and Probation Officer) and Child Welfare Committee Chairperson</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training of Judiciary on Juvenile Justice System and POCSO</td>
<td>03</td>
<td>160</td>
<td>Chief Judicial Magistrates of 26 districts holding chairpersonship of Juvenile Justice Boards</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training of Police Officers on Child Friendly Policing under JJ System</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>1,489</td>
<td>Senior Police officers at District level, Pls, PSls, designated Child Welfare Officers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>District-wise Training of Senior Police Officers on POCSO Act and JJ System</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>968</td>
<td>SP, Dy. SPs, Pls, PSls and designated Child Welfare Officers at district level</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capacity Building on ICPS And JJ Act 2000 and its Amendment of 2006 and JJ system</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>703</td>
<td>GSCPS, DCPU staff, CCI Superintendent, Probation Officers, SDOs, Govt. Labour Officers, DPEOs, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training on Child Tracking System</td>
<td>05</td>
<td>183</td>
<td>State Team, CCI Superintendent, Probation Officers, SJPU, Protection Officers (IC), Data Analyst, Computer Operator</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Training of Monitoring Tools for Standards of Care in CCIs</td>
<td>02</td>
<td>52</td>
<td>DCPU (Protection Officer (Institutional Care), Counsellors)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Life Skill Training</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>257</td>
<td>CCI staff (Superintendent, Probation officer, house mother/ father/ care taker, DCPU, etc.)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

UNICEF in close coordination with the GoG, developed a set of guidelines, training material and reference material on child labour, OOSC, dropouts, CP structures functioning, discharge of powers, and rescue of children, procedure followed by CP structures under ICPS, JJ Act and Child Labour Act.

**Challenges faced in establishing CP structures**

- There was a lack of CP experts in the State at Project inception. UNICEF trained district functionaries and CSO members as master trainers and adopted a cascade mode for training grassroots level CP functionaries. This resulted in creating CP experts at all levels in the State. In addition, UNICEF has developed all the training material in the local language.
- Networking with all the concerned departments on CP subject as well as changing the mindset of the authorities at all levels was a significant challenge faced by the Project. This difficulty was addressed by organizing a series of sensitisation workshops, interface with government authorities and timely issue of several notifications.
I am a handicapped girl, my parents did not allow me to go out for further studies but after this project, they are convinced about my education. Right now, I am doing my graduation, and at present, I am the AGG leader. I was awarded for being the best performer in the AGG. After receiving training, I worked effectively in my village on OOSC.

- Uttamba, AGG leader, Banaskantha

Initially, our judicial staff was not aware about sensitivity needed while dealing with child-related cases; Through UNICEF, we were able to change the attitude of our staff towards child labour issues.

- High Court Judge, Gujarat

The Project faced difficulty in obtaining support from the grassroots functionaries such as sarpanch and PRI members in the village. At the Project initiation stage the issue of CP and considering working children as illegal was very new to the community and the society as a whole. Children working in home/ agriculture have always been considered as helping hand to the family and are counted as unpaid work. Such thoughts created challenges in establishing CP structures in the village. Alcoholism among fathers of child labour in tribal areas was one of the major reasons for sending children into work. Such population was against accepting CP as an issue.

The existence of many non-functional committees in the village infused negative community perceptions about the VCPC being yet another committee that would not function properly.

These challenges underscore the vital need for community support in addressing village level CP issues. This misconception was removed with the help of community leaders and the Teachers, VV and CSOs through community sensitization to increase their buy-in of Project objectives.

UNICEF, in partnership with the local CSOs made a significant contribution in setting up and functioning of the CP structures. The existence of some of the CSOs in the intervention village or nearby village, enabled easy access and smooth entry in to the village and helped in conducting awareness building activities within the community to ensure people’s participation and to inculcate a sense of ownership towards child rights. A street Play ‘Jagruti’ was enacted in all the villages by CSOs. The community responses confirmed that active participation of VCPC and SMC members had a great impact in knowledge building within the community.

Sub Outcome 1.2: Establishment and sustenance of monitoring systems to track and target children at risk

Creation of village data-base to reduce child labour

During the initial Project phase for preparing the database on working children, partner NGOs and VCPCs conducted door-to-door visits/survey and mapping of all children between 0-14 years. To obtain correct information, data was verified by credible people in the village. The AGGs and children’s groups played a significant role in gathering data on child labour and in building awareness in the community. In Banaskantha, AGG members collected data of vulnerable families whose children were engaged in child labour.

School attendance registers, CTS data of SSA, anganwadi data, and survey data (collected by VV/ CRP) were all used to prepare the final OOSC database also known as “child tracking register”. FGDs with communities and individual interaction with families helped in preparation of the final database at faliya, ward and village levels. The database was then shared with PRI members, teachers, SMC, VCPC and community members.

Colour-coded registers were developed by UNICEF during the initial Project phase in intervention villages of Bhavnagar district. Later, these were replicated in the entire State with the joint effort of...
Based on vulnerable children’s data, individual parental counseling on child labour was undertaken by the VV/CRP, community leaders, and PRI members resulting in children being brought into the mainstream education. Counseling was mainly provided on the importance of education and harmful outcomes of child labour and child marriage.

Gujarat has been selected to pilot an MIS (child tracking system) on CP in the country to ensure appropriate tracking of all children in need of care and protection and children in conflict with law.

Registration of children in village-level databases helped in monitoring, restoration and rehabilitation activities that created an enabling environment for children.

All listed OOSC children have been mainstreamed and are being tracked regularly for their attendance by SMCs and VCPCs with monitoring support of partner NGOs. If any child was found absent for more than ten days, stakeholders visited the child’s home to determine the reason.

In 2012-13, the child-tracking system of Gujarat received E-Governance Award in the “Award of Appreciation” category by the Computer Society of India.

Challenges encountered in developing village level database
The data-base creation faced several challenges which were overcome through seeking wider community participation and sustained efforts of the VCPC, SMC and other key functionaries at the village level.

- People were not available at home as most of the time people were engaged in daily wage labour or doing work in neighboring cities or their farms. They would work from early morning till evening and return home late, hence, they were not aware about whether their children were going to school or not. Sensitising such parents became a major challenge. Thus, sensitisation and counseling were done at nights to overcome this challenge.
- Sometimes people provided wrong information as they were not convinced about sending their children to school instead of labour as it was a clear monetary loss. People also felt that the database would be sent to the district level and the school principal would face trouble. Sometimes, parents were not aware of the exact age of their children, as a result some children were found to be above age and were omitted from the database. Regular follow-ups and large scale sensitisation activities through various tools such as door to door visits, bhavai show and constant sensitisation by VVs helped to overcome such challenges. The information has been cross checked by neighbours, fellow workers or school friends of OOSC.
- With limited UNICEF support in Kutch (since the Project started here later than other districts), the systems are in place but still have gaps.
• As almost 40 villages were handled by one CRP, conducting door-to-door survey was a challenge and certain project districts were quite large (Bhavnagar, Banaskantha).
• Though the list has been prepared, the biggest challenge now remains of regular update of the data in the absence of a defined procedure. The child tracking system of SSA is not regularly maintained and not reflecting the actual status of children. Also the data available is not easily accessible to everyone. Sometimes to protect the school's reputation the school principal also avoids showing the actual data regarding OOSC.
• Moreover, getting these children back into the mainstream system is a big challenge and seeks continuous and committed efforts.
• Limited resources with the DCPU is the major issue, which affects the Project activity. E.g. for patrolling and trafficking they are dependent on other departments for the vehicle facilities.

Sustainability of village-level databases on working children
Challenges existed but slowly the Project has changed the mindset of the community. Through engagement and commitment of several stakeholders such as SMC, school teachers, AWWs, and VVs and extensive support provided by partner NGOs, now 80 to 90 percent children are in schools and benefitting under RTE.

The monitoring and tracking system to address any CP issue is strengthened and in place. The database developed through support from local structures and stakeholders are being updated by the VCPC members even after December 2013 on a monthly basis. The VCPCs in close coordination with SMCs are using databases to track each drop-out child. The community and even children are now reporting child labour cases and OOSC to the VCPC. VVs in close coordination with the SMCs track each drop-out child. All this has been made possible as a result of awareness activities conducted by the NGOs.

Community, AGGs and children's group report child labour and out-of-school cases to VCPCs through suggestion boxes (kept in schools/ panchayat ghars/ anganwadis). These successes have been possible through awareness activities by NGOs.

VCPC and SMC members plan to continue spreading awareness and monitoring in their area after project completion. Head masters and SMC members are willing to work for child protection and development having received training and sensitisation during the project and continue their monthly meetings.

VV in Baroda, Kutch, Bhavnagar and Patan shared that they have their own plan after project completion to develop AGGs, update the databases and reduce child labour and child marriage.

Sub Outcome 1.3: Civil society alliance established and actively partnering government efforts for reducing CL

CSO partnership strengthen CP initiative
In the six intervention districts, seven CSOs were selected by UNICEF and trained in CP, development of implementation plan and action plan and in field work. The CSOs played a supportive role to strengthen the panchayat-level structures and community level structures and also interacted with bal mitra.

The CSOs organised several activities in the field which created a secure society for children. They organised several campaigns, meetings, and IEC activities in the village to reduce CL and also integrate vulnerable families with SPS. The efforts of CSOs have been extremely effective in project areas. Child labour in many villages has been reduced.
Under ICPS, the partnership was necessary but with only those CSOs who have expertise in the field of child rights, however, under the Project several CSOs got trained on the issue. UNICEF provided support from identification of CSOs to monitoring their activities.

**Challenge faced by District Administration with CSOs**

One of the grey areas of the Project is that it has to partner NGOs who are very new to the subject.

**Sub Outcome 1.4: State and district action plans against CL developed**

**Development of child labour action plans**

UNICEF supported the Government both at the State and District level to develop a more comprehensive and realistic plan that could be achieved in a timely manner. A comprehensive and realistic plan developed with the help of stakeholders, that could be achieved in a timely fashion has been developed with UNICEF support to the government, both at State and District levels.

Child Labour Action Plans were developed in all six districts. In two districts of Kutch and Banaskantha, plans have been developed and are under the process for approval from the district and state authorities, in the other four districts, plans have been approved and implemented.

District-level review meetings were organised in 2012. UNICEF supported the administration in developing the action plans. By 2013, they were approved by district level authorities and submitted to the GSCPS.

Convergence of various departments (Labour, Home (Police), Health, WCD, Social Welfare, Education) and institutions (CWC, JJB, SJPU) was brought about for successful execution of DCLAPs facilitated by UNICEF and approved at the district level.

The action plan which is an integral part of the Child Labour Prohibition and Regulation Act, 1896 is reviewed by the District Collector on a monthly/quarterly basis, indicating its sustainability. In Rajkot the plan is reviewed on the third Saturday of each month.

**DAC Analysis for Outcome 1**

**Relevance**

The Project under outcome 1 facilitated the activities to establish various ICPS related CP structures at the State, district and village level28 and provided technical assistance to remove child labour from society.

UNICEF provided technical support to establish the CP structures.

For establishment and operationalisation of various CP structures, 28 resolutions were issued at the state and district level. Roles and responsibilities were assigned and staff was appointed at state and district unit with the technical support of UNICEF. UNICEF’s partnership with Government at various levels enabled the establishment of CP structures in 2011. By 2012 most of the CP structures mandated under the Project were established in intervention districts and in later phase was replicated in the entire state.

28Village child protection committee (VCPC), Child Welfare Committee (CWC), Juvenile Justice Board (JJB), Special Juvenile Police Unit (SJPU), District Child Protection Unit (DCPU), District Child Labour Task Force (DCLTF), Gujarat State Commission for Protection of Child Rights (GSCPCR) and Directorate of Child Rights (DCR), State Child Protection Society (SCPS), State Child Labour Task Force (SCLTF)
The Project supported the capacity building of members of CP structures for strengthened implementation of CP legislation and structures. All the Government functionaries of CP structures under ICPS, JJA and Child labour Act have been trained under the Project at various levels, which is relevant to the Project objective. The Project joined hands with local CSOs to impart trainings at village and panchayat level since they were not easily manageable at state or district level due to the huge number of VCPCs. Cascade method of training was adopted for capacity building on issues related to child labour, OOSC and drop-out children, roles and responsibilities of CP functionaries at various levels, procedures of rescue, rehabilitation and mainstreaming of children in need of care and protection and children in conflict with law, legislative framework of Child Labour Act, RTE Act and Child Marriage Act. These trainings were eye opening on child labour issues and clarified the duties of the concerned officials.

The database prepared by CSOs with help of door to door survey and CTS record proved very relevant to address the issues of child labour in the 3450 intervention villages. Most of the children have been identified and mainstreamed in schools. The family members of the children were counseled by the CSO, VV, and VCPC. As a result, several villages have been declared child labour free by the district administration during the Project period.

In the six districts, CSOs provided good support to strengthen the community level structures. They also developed networking with District Administration for programme implementation as well as community outreach. The presence and support of CSOs helped develop a strong community ownership and sustainability of community structures.

The Project facilitated and advocated the development of a more comprehensive and realistic child labour action plan both at the state as well as the district level that could be easily followed and was capable of achieving the goal.

The Project facilitated convergence and networking among the various departments and stakeholders for issuing the notification and in the establishment and functioning of CP structures, which is a significant achievement.

**Effectiveness**

As per the Project target, all CP structures were established and capacities of their functionaries were strengthened through various training sessions held with UNICEF support. In a short period UNICEF facilitated the establishment of the CP structures and made them capable of working on CL issue.

The Project brought about a significant attitudinal change towards children among officials of police and legal departments, which again is a big achievement for the Project. Each police station now possess a child-friendly environment and they are providing special attention to this issue. These achievements are indicative of the Project’s effectiveness in meeting its objectives.

**Efficiency**

The Project builds capacities of CP structure members on CP and Education related issues. Customised trainings were designed for various government departments for orientation as well as Project implementation and subject experts were identified for the training. By the end of the Project capacity of CP members had been strengthened to execute their roles and responsibilities.

The extensive awareness campaign that “Jagruti” held under the Project and by partner CSOs of the Project in their respective intervention areas, created an enabling environment for CP in the state as well as supported the functioning of CP structures.
Sustainability
All the CP structures established under this Project are functioning and are self-sustained to work on child labour issues. They are contributing towards the goal of ‘a nation without child labour’. The Project began the intervention of establishing CP structures in six districts but slowly these were replicated across all the districts which demonstrates that the Project has sustained.

Timely development of GRs and notifications and their dissemination at various levels played a crucial role in the establishment of CP structures. This process has now become part of the government system. Capacity building and trainings have made the CP functionaries capable of working independently on the CP issues. The convergence between the departments on issues related to children has proved very fruitful and the functionaries are using it to deal with child related matters through consensus with various departments. Thus it can be said that the system of convergence has been adopted by the government and will sustain in the long run.

The training modules, guidelines, SOPs, various formats (village level database format) have been adopted and published by the Government, thus indicating their sustainability.

A stark difference can be seen between the intervention and the non-intervention villages in terms of establishment and functioning of ‘VCPC’. All the structures are now capable of planning, monitoring and executing the Project interventions initiated to remove child labour. The Government focus on the issue of save the girl child and removing child marriage and child labour from the society has increased, which indicates sustainability of Project interventions.

Conclusions

Sub Outcome 1.1: CP structures under Labour and ICPS/JJ in place, functioning at State, District and Panchayat levels

- UNICEF played a crucial role in achieving the targets of Project outcome 1 through coordination with various stakeholders. The challenges in departmental convergence and in creation of a common platform were overcome by UNICEF by holding a series of interactions with the state level authorities and designating specific roles and responsibilities of various departments. UNICEF provided technical support in drafting the notifications relating to CP and education and facilitated their circulation in various government departments.
- The CP structures at state and district level have been established and were functional at the end of the Project. District level structures have been replicated in remaining districts after effective demonstration in six intervention districts. By 2013, more than 3,450 VCPCs were established, trained and made functional covering all the Project villages.
- Capacity building modules were developed as per the target audience and their requirement. During the Project period many direct and indirect stakeholders were trained on issues such as child labour, CP, Child marriage and JJA. Around 1075 CP functionaries including members of CWC, JJB, SJIPU, and all DCPU members, 76 District Magistrates, 800 police staff were trained in cascade mode.
- SOPs and guidelines have been developed which resulted in clear roles and responsibilities of different stakeholders under the CP structures.
- Capacity building of CP functionaries at district level and partner NGOs were facilitated by UNICEF at division level. Further trainings and handholding of VCPCs have been done by NGOs.

Sub Outcome 1.2: Monitoring systems to track and target children at risk established and maintained

- Children engaged in child labour are exploited at home and work place and are denied access to their basic rights of childhood, education, healthcare, nutrition, care and security. Through this
Project, a system was established for tracking children involved in child labour with the ultimate Project objective of mainstreaming children into schools and linking their families with SPs.

- CTS was developed in all the villages with the help of stakeholders and the data shared by SSA staff, AWWs and PRI members.
- Through various activities the Project was able to raise awareness about the dangers of child labour and the value of education. IEC was carried out through street plays, door-to-door canvassing, folk songs, dances, posters, mobile van and video shows. Such campaigns, helped in reaching children between the age of six and 14 years, especially girls in remote areas, who were encouraged to attend the alternative learning centers after work as the first step in formal education.
- VCPC, VV and SMC members were trained and empowered to monitor children at risk of child labour.

Sub Outcome 1.3: Civil society alliance established and actively partnering government efforts for reducing child labour

- Considering UNICEF and Government limitations in community outreach, the Project established partnership with NGOs to reduce child labour in the state of Gujarat. The partnership was a key in raising community’s awareness level on child protection issue which was very low before the Project initiation four years back. Earlier child labour was counted as support to the family. This mindset was changed with NGO efforts and various other stakeholders and village institutions.
- The NGOs have actively contributed in developing CTS, skill development, formation of village level institutions, individual counseling and mainstreaming OOSC in school.
- They have played a supportive role in dissemination of ICPS information at the grass root level and have developed strong network and sustainable structure to reduce child labour and promote education in society.

Sub Outcome 1.4: State and District action plans against child labour developed

- State and district level action plans for intervention districts have been developed through UNICEF’s close coordinated efforts with GSCPS and DCPU.
- State level task force was formed under the chair of GSCPS to review and monitor the elimination of child labour through rescue, rehabilitation and admitting children back into school.
- Out of the six district action plans, four were approved at the district level. And at the district level, action plans were developed to bring all line departments together under the leadership of the District Administration to address the issue of child labour.
- UNICEF supported in defining roles and responsibilities of various department at the state and district level and facilitated linkages and networking to enable them to work from one platform.

Lessons Learned

Sub Outcome 1.1: CP structures under Labour and ICPS/JJ in place, functioning at State, District and Panchayat levels

- UNICEF has played a crucial role in facilitating the state level meetings and developing linkages with all the concerned departments, developed their roles and responsibilities and also made space in the state and district agenda on ICPS related issues. Though convergence among several departments remains an issue, UNICEF succeeded in achieving most of the target under outcome 1 primarily due to its prior engagement with the State Government.
- ICPS was introduced by the GoI in 2010, but it could be implemented very quickly in the state through technical support and tiring efforts of UNICEF.
- Block level structures are still missing in the child protection government system which needs to be focused during future planning process.
All the notifications are in English which created several issues at village/block level impacting its execution. And often notifications did not always reach the village or block level on time.
The project faced difficulties with Legal and Government Departments, which are still not ready to come on to one platform.
Community participation through village institutions was a good strategy to involve people as it created community ownership towards their development and better functioning.
Involvement of the panchayat is a must for effectiveness and sustainability of the Project impact at grass-root level.

Sub Outcome 1.2: Monitoring systems to track and target children at risk established and maintained
At the initial level it was a tough task to train the people on CTS since it was a new initiative taken up by SSA and UNICEF. Gradually, they were convinced to develop CTS for the village.
Often families did not have a birth certificate of their children or were not aware of the age of the children, especially in tribal area.
Difficulties were faced with school authorities initially as they were not willing to share their data, which created problems in developing the database. However, a letter from the DDO was very helpful in the smooth development of the database.

Sub Outcome 1.3: Civil society alliance established and actively partnering government efforts for reducing child labour
A series of capacity building programmes have made the community much more aware and sensitised regarding the issues of child labour, child marriage and importance of education. Every NGO played a supportive role to make them capable of addressing the child labour issue on their own.
NGOs possess expertise in community mobilisation and have direct contact with the villages. Hence partnership with NGOs is important for the government, especially for executing programmes like the children rights project, which requires establishment of village level structures.

Project Component 2: Improving the quality of education to increase enrolment and retention
Outcome 2: Quality education available for all children aged 6-14 years
UNICEF has been partnering with the GoG in improving the school education system in Gujarat for the past decade. UNICEF furthered this partnership to achieve outcome 2 target of child-friendly education to increase school enrollment. UNICEF has played the facilitator’s role and provided technical support for quality education in schools through drafting of notifications and development of education materials.

The RTE Act emphasises CFS concept for improving access to education. CFS framework and education material were developed by an expert team of UNICEF. Instead of developing new system to disseminate CFS modules, UNICEF utilised the Government’s education delivery mechanism to achieve its objective. The Project interventions for achieving outcome 2 were implemented with state level partnership of DIET, SSA, and UNICEF.

The findings under outcome 2 are based on the IDIs and FGDs conducted with parents, SMC members, BRC, school principals and children.
Sub Outcome 2.1: All elementary schools in the Project areas providing quality, child friendly education

Informing teaching personnel on CFS
The Project succeeded in training 47,367 teachers/head teachers by the end of the Project. The Project adopted cascade approach which enabled training of large number of teachers. Training was also provided to all the DIET teachers, apart from head masters, on CFS to create a set of expert trainers on motivational aspects to convince participants on the importance of CFS. At the village level, teachers, children, and bal mitras were sensitised on CFS indicators.

In all six intervention districts teachers were trained on aspects of CFS and ECE components, making classroom processes more engaging and monitoring the transformation in each child. Trainings were conducted in DIET and nodal schools on activity-based learning (ABL), in which various teaching techniques were explained. Life skills education and bal mela introduced in standards 6-8 helped in bridging the gap between teachers and students.

Training by DIET and SSA with UNICEF’s technical support proved very effective in transforming teacher mindsets on CFS. Initially, teachers were resistant to adopt CFS methods. However, after orientation teachers understood the importance and necessity of CFS components. They accepted CFS as an innovative approach that promoted child-friendly processes and interaction between teachers and students. As a result, attendance has increased (especially in Banaskantha, Patan and Bhavnagar). Teacher training in PRAGNA (ABL programme) enabled increase in confidence levels and interest levels and developing mental exercises amongst children.

Supportive supervision was done through the BRC and SMC, which helped in better schooling and quality education facilities. BRCs and bal mitras who are part of the school planning committees were trained for informal monitoring. They visited schools and checked teachers’ attendance and school cleanliness.

Convergence meetings of various departments were organised by DIET with UNICEF facilitation for extensive programme monitoring. CFS was discussed in monthly meetings with the District Collector. Gradually CFS became a special agenda in the monthly meetings of the DoE and the SSA.

According to the CDPOs observation during the visit to Banaskantha earlier, Devipujak caste children were not allowed to sit on the first bench, but after introduction of CFS, they were treated as equals. This change promoted more attendance of Devipujak children.

CFS standards and guidelines for quality and child-friendly education
Various guidelines, SOPs, training modules, IEC materials, teaching-learning aids and activity-based learning techniques were developed by UNICEF and printed by DIET to support the programme. These activities created a conducive environment for child-friendly schooling in the six intervention districts.

CFS standards and guidelines were developed under the Project in partnership with SSA and DIET. UNICEF’s CFS guideline was customised with special reference to local needs, cultural backgrounds and environmental aspects. UNICEF translated the English guideline in local language which was appreciated by stakeholders. Interviews with DIET and VVs confirmed that the guidelines were easy to
understand. Various materials were also developed such as posters, wall hangings, teaching learning aids and charts.

CFS created a friendly and enabling environment for children at the school. Its implementation has been monitored by the SMC at the school level. CFS changed the attitude of parents towards education and contributed in increased enrollment. The evaluation team found that children were very happy with CFS teaching methods which contributed in increasing their confidence and self-expression. They did not fear teachers anymore, since corporal punishment was not being practiced in schools. Interaction with children at village level revealed that changes had happened in the last few years at the school level, which included introduction of a friendly environment between teachers and students, display of students’ details on chart paper in the class room, activity-based learning, availability of basic amenities and separate toilets for boys and girls. CFS components effectively engaged every child in various learning and development activities that improved the overall quality of their education. CFS has been replicated in all the districts and now it has become part of the education system which has to be followed by each school.

CFS provided a gender-sensitive platform for children to express themselves through children’s groups, which promoted inclusive growth and child-friendly environment in the school. Child cabinets “Meena Manch” (for girls) and “Raju Manch” (for boys) were formed during the initial project phase and later converted to Bal Juths. In this way, CFS increased classroom participation of children to share their views and ideas.

**Child-friendly elements in schools**

At the time of fieldwork, the schools were closed due to summer vacation hence the research team could not meet the planned number of teachers and principals. However, during the FGD, children shared about the CFS benefits and its effectiveness. During the evaluation process the research team could not meet the planned number of teachers and principals. However, during the FGD, children also confirmed the evidence and shared their views and ideas. During the evaluation process the research team also visited the school buildings to corroborate the CFS activities. Based on the evidence the team confirmed that the CFS components are now visible in the schools in the form of student’s project work, student’s introduction chart, suggestion boxes, prarthana sabha, exposure visits, poster making, bal natok, library, and group work. Schools were now displaying a series of activities in the school on a daily basis.

The ultimate and very important result of CFS is that education quality has improved immensely. The CFS indicators were included in the annual plan of SSA in the intervention districts. The Government plans to replicate it to all districts of the State.

**Challenges faced**

- At the initial stage bringing about a behaviour change among teachers towards CFS acceptance was a challenge because of the notion that it would over burden their work schedule. There was no positive response from teachers in the beginning, however, after frequent training sessions the Project succeeded in changing the mindsets of teachers. Also since RTE emphasised CFS, teachers were bound to follow the CFS guidelines. Long trainings at district level also posed a problem for the teachers. According to the respondents, increased workloads did not allow BRCs to conduct monitoring visits in all schools. Limited BRC staff also created difficulty in conducting monitoring activities, which affects sustainability, since at community and school level constant support, facilitation and monitoring is required.
- According to interviews with UNICEF, Gujarat convergence and networking with Government Departments was a challenge at the Project initiation stage. Interactions with departments through UNICEF facilitation established strong network among the departments.

"This project definitely supported in implementing and developing CFS materials which helped to break the barriers between teachers and students."

- Jaagruti Bhatt, District Officer, DIET, Bhavnagar
• Child participation and SMC member’s involvement was limited at village level. To overcome this, CSOs have played an important and supportive role to explain CFS and also motivate them to monitor the school activities.
• Finance is one of the issues that each school faced in establishing all infrastructure as per CFS guideline. Slowly the State is providing necessary structure support such as playground and toilets in schools.

Sub Outcome 2.2: STP for CL and other OOSC up to 14 years in place for mainstreaming children into formal education

STP to facilitate mainstreaming of OOSC and child labourers
STP was designed and developed by UNICEF and DIET especially to mainstream OOSC and children withdrawn from child labour in school.
It comprised a condensed course (CC) with easy learning methods such as visual elements and illustrative examples for class 1 to 8 which could be covered in six month period. STP was essentially developed keeping in mind the age and huge learning gap that matched the mental and knowledge level of such children.

Interviews and discussions held at block and village level informed that depending on the demand, school teachers were organizing the STP classes. OOSC data from tracking registers were used. Two types of STP sessions were designed, residential for batches of 15 and non-residential for batches of less than 15 students as extra classes after school hours. STP camps for children up to 12 years of age were organised for three months, six months and nine months as per the students’ requirement. For STP class size and location, SSA officials took decisions as per the need, for instance in some cases STP was organised for 4-5 students.

The SMCs and partner CSOs of UNICEF have played a crucial role in mainstreaming these children in to school after several rounds of parent counselling.

UNICEF also advocated with the government to initiate ‘Seasonal Hostels’ in areas with high migrant population, and to provide transport facilities to ensure regular attendance by children especially in tribal and desert areas.

A resource pool of teachers and bal mitras that is 12th pass candidates appointed by SSA were trained as master trainers for STP through a six day orientation workshop by SSA. UNICEF partners provided training, support and facilitation to bal mitras. Bal mitras are providing education to children enrolled in STP.

Through the project, 3,300 children were trained in six districts during the project period. STP classes were organised near industrial sites so that children could attend while their parents were busy at work in brick kilns, salt pan areas and construction sites.

Effective sensitisation and advocacy were done during the project with vulnerable families and families with migrant children. The research team observed tent schools, a new STP model in Vadodara, Kutch, Bhavnagar, Rajkot and Patan in which community initiatives were taken to provide education and mainstream children from migrated families. According to Mahiti NGO, Patan, a core team from...
Odisha and West Bengal explored and understood the concept of tent schools for promotion in their state.

Response from SSA team informed that extensive advocacy for STP has been done by UNICEF and NGO partners through various efforts at the state level like translation of materials from Hindi to Gujarati. The STP books were developed in Gujarati for entire Gujarat, but in Kutch on community demand they were developed in Hindi.

For sustainability of the STP programme in districts such as Kutch, Bhavnagar, Rajkot and Banaskantha, hostel facilities were developed for children of migrating families. This facility was developed with an aim to reduce the drop-out rate due to seasonal employment. In fact, in tribal areas, children often get into habits of smoking and drinking local alcohol. The residential schools for these children were helpful in eliminating such habits.

**Challenges in STP implementation**

- In tribal areas like Banaskantha and desert areas of Kutch, scattered population was a problem for the limited SSA staff for whom reaching each and every village and providing support to bal mitra for STP was a challenge. However, the SMC, NGO, VV, bal mitras and PRI members identified OOSC with support from CSO for the STP.
- Major challenge was to find a bal mitra who could teach children for a long period on the same incentive decided by SSA and the school.
- Engaging children in STP was a big challenge, which the bal mitra alone could not manage. The CSOs worked in parallel to counsel the parents for education of their child.
- Seasonal child labour in farming is still ongoing in Banaskantha where children are working in their farms. No system has been developed to declare them as child labour. Contractual BT cotton seed farming is being practiced in the areas of Patan, Banaskanatha and in Rajkot, which needs to be addressed immediately.
- The STP initiative has been very successful in stopping large scale trafficking and child labour specially in Banaskantha. There are areas where many children are coming from Rajasthan however the GoG has been unable to take action. There is need to find out immediate solution to address this challenge at the state and national level.

**Sub Outcome 2.3: SMCs and PRIs monitor and support attendance and infrastructure improvement of schools**

**School development plan**

The Project contributed by facilitating the strengthening of the village level institutions in monitoring school attendance and infrastructure. The Partner CSOs developed the capacities of the SMCs, VPCPs and VVs in preparation of the school annual plan, role and responsibilities of the village institutions, monitoring of school activities, promoting of quality education and sensitising members about the RTE.

As per RTE norms, UNICEF supported the GoG to sensitize and build capacities of SMC members. An SDP training module was developed by the Gujarat Primary Education Board with UNICEF’s technical assistance containing in-depth information on SMC functions and roles and responsibilities; monitoring school activities, time tables and key SDP elements. The SMC members were trained in nodal schools which covered 4-5 schools of the area. In addition other aspects were also discussed viz. importance of the village level institutions, ownership, education importance, CTS for identifying...
OOSC and drop outs, priority setting, CFS and innovations and model development. A booklet designed and developed by UNICEF on roles and responsibilities of the village level institutions was also distributed during the orientation to SMC and VCPC members. Through this Project, more than 9800 SMCs were successfully established in all project districts.

The SDP focused on school building maintenance, repair work, cleanliness, and establishment of library. If school required more money for development related work, the SMC mobilised it from the village well-wishers. As an acknowledgement they displayed the donor’s name in school. Through this Project CSOs and other stakeholders also developed linkages with the donors.

Earlier Vali Education Committees were in place, but parents’ roles were not defined. But now, due to 75 percent representation of parents in SMC committees, effective and relevant SDPs are being prepared. They also focus on the quality of education being imparted to children. Moreover, empowerment of SMC members through various trainings helped them to understand their roles and responsibilities. Now the SMC along with the VCPC members are visiting and monitoring the school activities and testing the mid-day meal food. Thus, through training, monitoring process of children’s attendance became more effective and helped in OOSC and drop out reduction.

Thus, the active participation of SMC members helped in creating an enabling environment for children. SMCs are the best examples of ownership and transparency at the village level.

**Challenges faced by SMC**

- Some of the SMC members also belong to other village level institutions or to some political parties due to which they could not attend all the trainings or could not participate in all the activities. Members of the SMCs are overloaded with several other government schemes and tasks. So they were not able to perform the SMC tasks.
- The CSOs and other stakeholders visited their homes at a time that was suitable to the SMC members to share the plan and the activities.
- The Project faced difficulties in transforming the SMCs for actively monitoring the school activities. Several issues influenced its functioning for instance maintaining cordial relations between school and the SMC.
- Majority of the SMC members being either illiterate or having low education level posed a challenge at the village level as they could not be convinced about new ideas and strategies.

In spite of all the challenges the project brought about behavior change in the past few years through UNICEF’s intervention towards better schooling and protective environment for children. SMCs are now trained and sensitised in their work.

**Sub Outcome 2.4 Models of SRP established for 3-5 years children**

**SRP developed with UNICEF support**

At the initial stage a survey was done at the village level to identify vulnerable children for SRP. These children were educated with various models of PRAGNA, ABL programme involving songs, stories and education tools for educating children.

“Earlier the anganwadi was considered as a food servicing place, children just came to collect their food. But they are now coming at regular basis and enjoying educational activities.”

-YMC, PC Kutch
UNICEF held advocacy with the State Government to ensure teaching learning processes were happening in the AWGs. UNICEF has used Project funds only for providing technical support through its staff in development of strategy paper and advocacy. Initially the SRP was introduced in 11,727 centers in intervention districts which enabled 400,000 children to access the ECE programme across the State. Supervisors of ICDS\(^{29}\) concerned with AWC intervention have been trained by UNICEF master trainers for this Project.

The GSCERT with support from UNICEF has developed an SRP manual. The partner CSOs have played a crucial role in disseminating the modules at the village level. GCERT and ICDS have also developed a tool kit of SRP material, which is solely funded by ICDS.

The CSOs conduct demonstrations and motivation exercises using educational kits and training modules with UNICEF support. This provides constant support and encouragement to the AWWs.

**SRP strengthens learning in AWC and improves enrollment**

Enrolment has increased in the anganwadi and children are coming for long hours and doing various activities. Compared to the past, now children are more interested in coming to the anganwadi, which is a positive result of the Project.

The AWGs are creating a homely and friendly atmosphere through various activities. Through playful activities they are imparting knowledge to children and developing their interest towards education. Large pictures, charts, puppets, songs are now common in all AWGs. They have adopted this model for teaching young children.

Every year in the month of June, the AWC provides a list of children to the school who have crossed five years of age. All these children get direct admission under the GoG initiative of ‘Praveshotsav’ programme.

SRP has proved very useful in children’s formal education. In fact, children under the SRP are performing better than other non-SRP children.

**Challenges in SRP implementation**

- Changing the behaviour of the AWW was a big challenge. Introduction of SRP increased their responsibilities, however, with continuous interaction and motivation from CSO and other stakeholders, the Project succeeded in convincing them for implementing SRP. Earlier the AWW did not have any planned activity for teaching or conducting activities including mental exercises with children. Now children are spending three to four hours in the school.

- Distance was one of the challenges, at the village level. In some villages’ children were not going to the AWGs since they were far away from the habitation. In these villages VCPC members played the role of “Tedagar”

- The partner CSOs convinced the community about SRP, a pre-education programme which enables children to perform better than other non-SRP children when they take admission in class one. Now people are willingly sending children to AWGs for 3-4 hours.

- Capacities of AWWs were also a challenge in implementation of SRP. The Project team had to put more efforts to make things happen in terms of advocating with supervisors to organise repetitive trainings and supervision of AWWs.

\(^{29}\) ICDS-Integrated child development services.
DAC Analysis for Outcome 2

Relevance
The Project outcome 2 focused on various activities, which ensured quality education for all children in the age group of 6-14 years. It is relevant to the Project objective of ensuring all children are in schools and not in labour. In order to make it successful in terms of child retention in schools, the Project adopted various strategies including CFS, STP, SRP and empowering SMCs, which is in line with the Project objectives of improving quality education and enabling its improved access to marginalised children. Besides this the GoG introduced ‘Praveshotsav’ to ensure admission of children in class 1. Every year this event was planned in the month of June. It received good response from government officials who visited the village for promoting enrollment and education.

CFS created a friendly relationship between teacher and student and ensured development of the child through creation of an enabling environment, which was opposed to the earlier school environment without space for such healthy relation. Children are now coming to school without any fear and spending their time in a friendly school environment that encourages them to engage in various school activities joyfully.

STP also known as CC has provisions to bridge the learning gap in children occurring due to prolonged duration of being out of school or being dropped-out. It inculcated an interest for learning among children and contributed in easy facilitation of their mainstreaming process.

Designing of STP at several places in local context, flexibility to reach any number of needy children and place selection and the concept of tent schools and onsite classes made STP a successful and innovative intervention. The tent school promoted by the State was especially relevant for the extremely underprivileged migrant child labourers and children lacking access to school facilities.

The learning level of children who have attended SRP is higher than the normally enrolled child in class 1 as reported by the primary school teachers to the evaluation team.

Strengthening the SMCs, VCPC, VV and PRIs on monitoring of school and development of SDP impacted positively in school development. The attendance of students and teachers has also been monitored by the SMCs. The system of community monitoring recommended by the National Advisory Council on RTE proved a significant tool for improving school level in the country. Hence the intervention is relevant to the Project objective.

Effectiveness
All the targets under outcome 2 have been achieved. By 2012, a total of 10,930 schools were covered under the Project. However in 2013, the number of schools in the six districts decreased to 9,889 as the State took a decision to merge schools with less enrolment with neighbouring schools. The coverage area, however, remains the same.

Cascade mode training proved to be a model system that was adopted by the State government for training teachers on CFS in the entire state.

All the 9,889 schools are demonstrating some elements of CFS. Efforts were also made to promote learning through activities, provision of appropriate TLM as well as peer support. The field observations have shown that creative use of TLM, reading corners and display of children’s work in schools have made significant changes in the enhanced engagement of children and making learning joyful.
In 2013, 63,000 teachers and head teachers were oriented on quality enhancement. Thus, since the Project initiation a total of 77,423 teachers and head teachers in 10,930 schools were made aware of quality education. The ABL approach in six districts has been scaled up to 2,040 schools implemented by 8,031 teachers. Based on this experience, the State government scaled up ABL and is implementing it in 7,504 schools, leveraging EUR 3.0 million by March 2013.

In 2013 a total of 21,694 OOSC were identified in the six Project districts. Of these 15,186 children that is around 70 percent children have been covered under STP and 5,496 children from STPs have been mainstreamed into schools. From the total 83,523 identified OOSC, 61,261 children or 73 percent have been covered through the STPs of which 25,506 have been mainstreamed into regular school.

As targeted 9,851 functional SMCs are monitoring school attendance and infrastructure of 9,851 government primary schools which have developed SDPs. In addition, there are 37 Kasturba Gandhi Balika Vidhyalayas (KGBVs) in six districts and one school managed by DoE with no SMCs. The SMCs established under the Project in the neighbouring primary school oversee the functioning of KGBVs and the school, making a total of 9,889 schools covered by the SMCs.

For a couple of indicators, there has been an over achievement. Against the targeted 35,000 teachers, 47,567 teachers and head teachers were empowered, which is 106 percent. The AWCs equipped with ECE kit are more than 13,734 which are implementing the SRP benefiting more than 400,000 children. With UNICEF support, activity books and curriculum have been developed for the Project districts. The curriculum has been shared with all the AWCs in the state and the government has leveraged EUR 529,000 in dissemination of activity books.

At the village level Project’s effectiveness is reflected in the AWCs, AWW’s attitude and reflected mainly in children. It can be seen that they are so happy with free school, ABL modules and friendly environment in the school. In fact, with all the efforts we could reach 100% enrollment and eliminate child labour from society.

**Efficiency**

The budget for training of school staff, SMC members and AWWs on various components under outcome 2 viz. CFS, STP, SRP and SDP have been solely borne by the Project. The Project components were introduced in the intervention districts initially but after successful demonstration were slowly replicated by the Government in the entire state.

**Sustainability**

Protocols and guidelines for classroom processes, teacher’s capacities and monitoring tools developed through this Project, have now become part of the quality initiatives undertaken by the government.

All the modules have been disseminated through the Government System and now are part of the curriculum thus they have become sustainable.

The cluster and block training approach proved very effective hence the DIETs of six intervention districts have adopted the same for their trainings.

GSCERT and ICDS have also developed a SRP tool kit funded by ICDS and SSA. This kit is being distributed in all districts.

The SMCs and VCPCs are capable to sustain these Project activities at planning, monitoring and evaluation level.
Conclusions

Sub Outcome 2.1: All elementary schools in the Project areas providing quality, child friendly education

- Development of CFS elements and their dissemination at the school level was the main achievement of the Project. Under SSA, CFS was implemented at the state level. Important and relevant notifications, trainings, monitoring and evaluation, have been put in place through this Project. UNICEF organised trainings for teachers and principals in partnership with UNICEF, DIET and SSA.
- Within the Project period, all the 9,889 schools in the Project have been demonstrating CFS elements. Innovations such as cluster and block level trainings of staff members and sharing of their expertise contributed in quality learning environment for all children. Initially, the process was very challenging, especially changing the mindset of the educational staff, however, multiple partnerships resolved this challenge and convinced all the education staff for CFS implementation.
- Under the Project, 47,567 school staffs were trained covering 70 percent schools by December, 2013. The State has incorporated most of the CFS indicators in the regular monitoring tool for monitoring the school performance. Based on successful demonstration, CFS was implemented in the entire State.

Sub Outcome 2.2: Special training programme for child labourers and other out-of school children upto 14 years in place for mainstreaming children into formal education

- With technical support of UNICEF, STP was developed by the State and disseminated in all schools. UNICEF also facilitated participation of NCERT and SCERT to review and guide the STP development. In 2013, the partnership between SSA, CSOs and UNICEF facilitated the identification of 83,253 OOSC in the six Project districts and 70 percent have been covered under STP and 30 percent were mainstreamed into education. UNICEF advocated with the government to initiate ‘seasonal hostels’ in migration prone areas.
- RTE orientation amongst the community was one of the major objectives and through various channels all the intervention villages were covered.

Sub Outcome 2.3: SMCs and PRIs monitor and support attendance and infrastructure improvement of schools

- For monitoring the STP, series of trainings were organised at the state, district and village level through cascade method for various stakeholders. Till the Project end 32,734 SMCs have been established and around 9000 SMCs were trained under intervention districts.
- All SMCs in the Project area have developed SDP and most are tracking regularity of children in school on a monthly basis and ensuring that all the out of school children attend school. SDPs have been developed and disseminated. PRI members and SMC members were also trained to make this activity sustainable.

Sub-outcome 2.4: Models of SRP established for 3-5 years children

- Under the Project UNICEF maximised its advocacy efforts at the state, district and village level to create a safe environment for children. Education system made several changes in their routine functioning and attempted to provide quality education to children. A chapter has been added in the GSCERT course on SRP. Best practices of ECE were documented and disseminated to the service providers.
UNICEF facilitated the development of state specific kit on SRP. The ECE kit was disseminated in 11,727 AWCs of the intervention districts. More than 40,000 children now have access to quality education. The ECE activity promoted children to attend the AWCs.

Through this Project all children received benefits of CFS, STP, and access to quality education.

**Lessons Learned**

**Sub Outcome 2.1: All elementary schools in the Project areas providing quality, child friendly education**

- Dealing with the mindset of education staff was the biggest challenge to implement CFS, since it came with a huge list of activities and paper work for the teachers. As a result the Project had to deal with initial resistance from teachers towards acceptance of the CFS concept.
- After sensitisation efforts the teachers accepted its usefulness and implemented it. Through CFS, an environment free from fear has been created and the gap between the student and teachers have been reduced, which shows its positive impact on the overall development of children.

**Sub Outcome 2.2: STP for child laborers and other OOSC upto 14 years in place for mainstreaming children into formal education**

- Scattered population is a big problem as it always creates problem of schooling in terms of transportation. It was a challenge to find a VV and bal mitra who were educated enough to take up STP classes. Obtaining the actual age of children during door to door survey also was a challenge, since parents were often not aware of the age of their children. Several children of 14 years and above got included in the list who were beyond the Project’s scope, hence the new search had to be taken up for identifying such children.
- Remuneration of the bal mitra is an issue and needs to be looked into since majority of the STP activities are carried by them.

**Sub Outcome 2.3: SMCs and PRIs monitor and support attendance and infrastructure improvement of schools**

- VCPC and SMC members are not literate, busy with many activities and also do not attend meeting and training. To solve this issue, need to develop alternative strategy for the same.
- Without support of the CSO activities have slowed down after the Project end.
- Trainings of SMC members have been done in large groups which created difficulty in developing the required understanding.
- Sometimes the budget was not enough to take up an activity. To mobilize additional financial support SMCs identified well-wisher for their village called “Data” (Donor).

**Sub Outcome 2.4: Models of School Readiness Programme established for 3-5 years children**

- A capacity of AWW needs to be improved to a certain level to conduct the SRP techniques. To implement the school readiness programme, the supervisors of ICDS have been trained as master trainers who were expected to extend further trainings to AWWs.
- ECE kit and ABL models provided are found to be very effective and ratio of attendance of children in anganwadi has increased.
Project Component 3: Raising awareness and empowering families and communities so that they take collective action against child labour

Outcome 3: Families and communities take collective action for protection and development of children

The primary objective of Project component 3 was to spread child labour awareness amongst the community and change their mindset on the issue. Responses obtained during community FGDs during the evaluation revealed that the focus of the community awareness activities was on child labour and its harmful effects on the society, government programmes focusing on child labour, strengthening the village level CP system and community involvement in dealing with child labour, importance of village level institutions and skills development and harmful effects of child marriage. The vital role played by the diverse group of stakeholders, viz. village level institutions, VVs, AGs, youth groups and their engagement in awareness activities has empowered the community in child labour elimination.

Sub Outcome 3.1: Families aware of harm caused by sending children to work and instead send their children to school

Community sensitisation for school enrollment and making villages child labour free

Through sensitisation activities the Project succeeded in changing the community attitude in rural and tribal areas on child labour issues. According to the Project partners it took sometime but gradually the community agreed that child labour was harmful for children and negatively impacted the overall development of society and the nation. All the village level CP structures were established, however, sensitisation of the members for furthering Project activities towards curbing child labour was the most significant step. The CSOs conducted activities such as IEC, training, workshops, and meetings to empower the CP structures on child rights. Sensitisation activities were conducted through various media such as dramas, posters, CDs, IEC vans (rath), street plays, bhavai, slogans, rallies and door-to-door visits. Messages on negative outcome of child labour spread in the local language by VCPCs, SMCs, PRIs, SHGs and volunteers were successful in changing community mindsets on child labour.

Among the several IEC campaigns and approaches adopted by the Project, ‘jagruti’ and ‘bhavai show’ performed by children were very successful events at the village level. The campaign design focused specifically on two areas. The first one was to minimise child labour by fixing roles and responsibilities of the

IEC dissemination at village level
1. IEC Mobile Van
2. Oath-taking by community
3. Door-to-door information dissemination
4. Training module - Bal Natya Shala
5. Children’s rallies
6. Handbook – Child labour
7. Poster
8. Leaflet
9. Banner

Sensitization Areas
- Child labour
- Importance of education
- Child marriage
- Alternative options for livelihood

7 child marriages stopped in Morbi
We are not able to achieve 100 percent in community behavior, since it is a long term process and demands dedicated efforts. But definitely changes have started to show”.

- Mr. Jagdishbhai, Project Coordinator-BCC, Vadodara

We are not able to achieve 100 percent in community behavior, since it is a long term process and demands dedicated efforts. But definitely changes have started to show”.

- Mr. Jagdishbhai, Project Coordinator-BCC, Vadodara

Government officials, PRIs, NGOs, community and parents. The second aimed at mainstreaming the rescued and other OOSC and drop-out children into education.

Information on social protection schemes was also one of the agenda of the campaign. Based on vulnerable index, the CSOs identified the families and assisted them in the administration formalities in accessing these benefits. Such activities were carried out in all six intervention districts during the Project period. Thus the vulnerable families received financial help from the various schemes and they stopped sending their children in to labour.

Bhavai show, street plays, rath, and documentary movie on specific subjects related to the Project were held extensively. All the NGOs have helped in developing individual awareness dissemination tools according to their areas of work in the local language.

The evaluation found that the project adopted suitable approaches for efficient community outreach. For efficient sensitisation of community and the CP structures at the village level, meetings, gram sabhas, dramas, bhavai and documentary screenings were held at late nights and other convenient times. CBOs also organised campaigns that were adapted to their geographic locations to better sensitise community structures. For example, in Kutch, leaflets made by YMC organisations were more pictorial as the literacy level in Kutch was low. In Banaskantha, songs in the local dialect were used to sensitise greater numbers of tribal people.

More than 185,000 cotton farmers across intervention villages have been sensitised on child labour and have been asked to support in ending child labour.

UNICEF’s support has been critical in community sensitisation which took initiative to develop folk groups in partnership with DSIE and SSA. In all 13 folk groups comprising 65 artists were extensively trained in theatre programmes. A series of programmes were developed focusing on child labour prevention, promoting education to all children, and ensuring prohibition of child marriages. UNICEF provided technical support in holding of these programmes.

In collaboration with 21 CSOs, 350 most challenging villages were covered through the folk theatre programme, thus reaching out to an audience of 38,000 people. To supplement these efforts, more than 1.45 million community members across 3,450 villages were sensitised on the harmful effects of child labour, importance of schooling and adverse effects of child marriage through audio-visual campaigns, community-based meetings and interpersonal communication. The extensive campaigning has created awareness amongst community on child labour. A visible change was noticed on child labour issue while interacting with the community during the evaluation process.

Community sensitisation and awareness programmes were held on national holidays such as 26th January, 15th August, and 2nd October (Gandhi Jayanti) including Children’s day (Bal Divas) to elicit maximum community participation.
Case Study: Radhanpur, Patan

While meeting all the OOSCs during an activity, the partner CSO came across a 12 year old boy named Suresh Ramabhai Thakor. Suresh has not gone to school since last 12 months. He had studied till Class 4 but did not appear in the final exam.

Suresh stayed in a small house located outside the village with his father Ramabhai Thakor, mother Shardaben Thakor and 7 siblings (5 brothers and 2 sisters). Suresh is the youngest, and all his other siblings are married. The CSO met his parents, and discussed about future of Suresh.

When the volunteer and CSO met Suresh and tried to convince him for schooling, he was not ready to listen to anyone on this issue. At the time of celebration of CRC week all OOSCs were invited and many activities were organised to motivate children towards education and to mainstream them. Suresh was one the participants in the group. Initially he refused to participate in any activity, but slowly he came forward to make some drawings. His drawings were appreciated and this turned out to be an important step towards his future. Through this activity stakeholders developed a good rapport with Suresh. Following which they held several meetings in continuation with Suresh and his parents to change his attitude. In course of the discussion one day he shared that once his teacher had beaten him very badly and this incidence created fear for school and he carried a very dark and negative picture in his mind about the school, teacher and education.

Knowing the facts it was much easier for the CSO members to convince Suresh towards attending school. They took Suresh to the school where he was surprised to see the changed attitude of the school teachers. He showed his interest to study and agreed to attend school.
The Project has been successful in creating community awareness and in most of the villages it is in sustainable mode as now many people from the village are calling the VCPC, SMC, DCPU and the police and are informing about child labour and child marriage cases. Because of effective sensitisation activities, the community has also started investigating the bride and groom’s age on every wedding invitation card they receive.

The capacities of 16,000 community-based structures (CPCs, SMCs, and VVs and PRI members) were enhanced to identify, track and follow up incidents of child rights violations, particularly OOSC, child labour and potential victims of child marriage. These community based structures, which play a critical role in both addressing child rights violations as well as preventing potential violations, were also trained in 2013 on using the CPC handbook. The CPC handbook has illustrations on legislations and proactive mechanisms for children. It also contains case vignettes that provide an insight into situations where CPC members can act in the best interest of children.

The District Collectors are also taking up the CP issues in their monthly progress meeting.

**Challenges in Information dissemination to community members**

- Time was a major concern as majority of the vulnerable families were engaged in labour work hence the entire day they were not available in the house. Hence to meet them or to disseminate any information amongst this group was a tough task. To cover such families the CSOs arranged meetings in the evening and nights.

- Wide geographical area and scattered populations were also major challenge for CSOs to conduct awareness generation activities in Banaskantha, Kutch and Patan. Scattered population was a big challenge in children’s school education that has been addressed by arranging ‘tent schools’ for students or by establishing pick up and dropping facilities for children.

- Prior to the Project community awareness on CP and child rights was completely lacking and they did consider these as important issues. After extensive campaign on child rights awareness, parents have come to know about the importance of education in changing the lives of their children.

- Village institutions were established but to strengthen them and make them functional was a problem. The CSOs made multiple efforts to develop their skill to execute their roles and responsibilities. Behavior change is a long term process, which demands dedicated efforts. The Project period was short but the dedicated efforts generated positive results like some of the village institutions became sustainable to carry out the institutional activities without any support.

- However, even after all the efforts, seasonal child labour is the biggest challenge for the state. With the setting up of trafficking booths, trafficking of child labour was stopped to some extent, but now the State is facing another emerging challenge, wherein now children are doing labour in their own farm, which is not considered as child labour.

- With limited staff, it was difficult for government structures to work like CSOs. Absence of technical support is also a major issue for sustainability of the activities initiated after Project completion.

- All DCPU staffs were on contractual basis, hence frequent changes at the district level staff structure affected Project implementation.
"After sensitisation activities, when we came to know from a 13-year old girl’s grandmother that the girl was going to be married and we received the invitation card, the VCPC and community members went to her house and informed her parents about the child marriage law. Due to this, even the girl refused to marry and her parents cancelled the wedding."

- Rukhiben, Village Volunteer, Bhadiya village, Patan

Sub Outcome 3.2: Adolescents especially girls and women networked and empowered to monitor and tackle child rights violations and protect children’s rights, especially the right to education and protection.

Adolescent girls group (AGGs) formed and trained on adolescent safety and voicing concerns and issues. Under the Project, 3,450 adolescent networks, one in each Project village were formed with 38,000 members, for extensive reach to each family of the community by 2013. The Project covered all 3,450 villages in the six Project districts with 21 CSOs as active partners responsible for community mobilisation and engagement.

The AGGs were federated at cluster and block level, leading to 87 cluster level and 32 block level networks, children’s group also have been formed in all 3,450 villages and oriented on child rights and protection. The CPCs have a representation of one member each from the AGGs and the children’s group who together with the CPCs, track child rights violations in their communities.

In 2012, to ensure further empowerment of adolescents, a unique activity-based capacity building module on life skills enhancement was rolled out. These trainings were provided to about 6,900 adolescent girls across all Project districts.

In Rajkot, Patan and Vadodara, AGGs also prepared suggestion boxes for drawing suggestions across various community segments. The AGGs opened the boxes in the presence of VCPC and SMC members, thus, there was effective participation from these groups on issues of child labour, child marriage and OOSC.

AGG training were held at district, block and village levels. District level workshops were held in Gandhinagar in 2011. Topics covered were advocacy on child rights, child labour, OOSC, child marriage, life skills and emotions. Girls who attended district level workshops shared the information with their peers in the village. AGG members were also taken on exposure visits to Delhi and to Science City in Ahmedabad. The AGG members who had previously never travelled outside their villages felt happy and motivated to work further on the Project activities.

More than 38,000 members of the AGGs were trained on the issues pertaining to child rights violations, particularly of the harmful effects related to not enrolling children in school, school absenteeism, dropping out of school, child labour and child marriage. These groups have been facilitated to track child rights violations particularly OOSC and child labour, followed by counseling their families to bring children back to school and to stop child marriages.

Adolescents were trained in child rights, CP and life skills to empower them based on a unique activity-centric approach that overcame the barriers of illiteracy.

**Challenges in networking and capacity building of AGGs and SHGs**

- Discussion with Project partners during evaluation made it clear that in the beginning, girls were too shy to associate with the groups. To overcome this difficulty partners held ice-breaking sessions including cooking, sewing and crafts in all the Project districts.
In one of the cases experienced by the village Sarpanch, he found that four girls were enrolled in the school but after some time he was informed that all the four girls had left school and were going for domestic work. The Sarpanch visited the homes of the girls and linked their families with various schemes for their survival so that the girls could continue their studies.

-Community FGD, Sodvadra, Bhavnagar

Challenges

- The Project also faced gender discrimination challenges during formation of the AGGs due to conservative attitude of PRI members and community leaders. Several members were of the opinion that girls should sit at home rather go out (Chokaro su kari lese, e loko e ghare besvanu ne radhvanu, Bhanvanu emnu kaam nathi”). Hence, many parents and adolescent girls were unwilling to join the adolescent groups. However, constant efforts in line with the awareness campaign helped in tackling this problem. Caste issues were also overcome through sensitisation and demonstration during the Project.

- Challenges encountered such as overnight stay during training sessions at training place were overcome by allowing community leaders, SHG members, VVs, ASHAs to accompany the girls to the training sessions. After receiving the life skills training the non-availability of livelihood Project created difficulty in their placement. AGGs demanded that forward and backward linkages be established.

Sub-outcome 3.3: Community leaders, including PRIs take active role in monitoring child rights issues and take action for preventing child labour

Community leaders have respectable image amongst the community and are in powerful position due to which people follow their views. To fight against child labour, it was very necessary that community leaders, PRI members take lead in this social transformation.

The partner NGOs had several interactions with community leaders and the PRI members and oriented them on child labour issues. After rapport development and orientation they were trained on various issues such as child labour and its harmful; effects, necessity of education, SPSs, roles and responsibilities of PLCPC, SMC, CWC, JJB, and Childline. Various sensitisation activities helped in changing attitudes of PRI members and community leaders. They started holding gram sabha discussions on children’s rights and issues. Regular monitoring is done by PRIs in schools. Though this is not a planned activity but one PRI member visits the school anytime and checks school activities. PRIs provided necessary financial aid through panchayat funds and public donations for improving school infrastructure.

The community leaders and PRIs have a great acceptance within the community which helped in mobilising community support for CP. The PRI members actively helped CBOs under the project. It was reported by the respondents that because of Project initiation and active involvement of leaders, the cases related to rapes, child deaths, child labour, child trafficking and child marriage have decreased significantly. Children’s issues were discussed in general meetings held on monthly basis in the community. PRIs took initiative and issued directions for ensuring marriage at an appropriate age in the villages.

Challenges

- Initially, sensitisation of PRI members and making them understand the child labour issues was a significant problem. Constant efforts were made by NGOs, VVs and CRPs to resolve this issue through advocacy with the community on issues like child labour, child marriage and OOSC.
Social customs and restrictions for girls in society were also challenges that were overcome through various trainings given by AGGs and parents were counseled by VVs.

Effective notification for orientation on child rights was a challenging task. Engaging community leaders in any group activity at the community level was an issue. Due to several other engagements, PRIs were unable to take out time and participate in block and district level meetings. This challenge was overcome through sensitisation provided at the village level.

DAC Analysis for Outcome 3

Relevance
The sensitisation activities proved extremely relevant in creating awareness among the community on child labour and mainstreaming all children in schools. The sensitisation activities conducted through various media such as dramas, posters, CDs, IEC vans (rath), street plays, bhavai, slogans, rallies and door-to-door visits were successful methods in reaching out to the community. Messages on negative outcome of child labour spread in the local language by VCPCs, SMCs, PRIs, SHGs and volunteers which succeeded in changing the community mindsets on child labour.

To expand the community outreach the Project engaged the AGGs and SHGs. Involving the community leaders and PRIs was a relevant approach adopted towards achieving the Project objective since they could influence the communities in several ways to prevent child labour and link them with mainstream education.

Effectiveness
Under outcome 3, majority targets were achieved as defined in the Project log frame. All the 3,450 villages targeted were reached through sensitisation activities with messages on harmful effects of child labour, importance of education and age of school enrolment.

A total of 7,000 adolescent girls were trained which was over more than the target of 6,900. The number of community leaders including PRI members informed on child rights issues and need for prevention of child labour and OOCS was 40,000 which was way above the target of 17,500. Around 250 Gram Sabha meetings were held against the target of 240 meetings to discuss issues related to child labour and education. On similar count a total of 35 cases were documented instead of the planned 20. All these overachievements are indicative of the Project’s effectiveness.

The Project saw active participation of farmers wherein 42 meetings were found to be held instead of 12, which shows that the Project was very effective.

Efficiency
The Project supported the ICPS functioning by creating awareness within the community which made an enabling environment for protection and educational rights of children throughout the State. The budget on awareness generation in the two intervention districts was solely borne to the project. The Project was able to leverage monetary support from various community segments such as PRIs and farmers.

Engaging partner CSOs under the project for awareness building served the purpose of quality information dissemination in a short span of time. At the end of the project, the community was taking active interest in stopping children from getting into child labour and mainstreaming them. The communities including children were aware on harmful effects of child labour and the need of education in one’s life.
Sustainability
The awareness created on CP issues and various case studies reporting child labour and subsequent action indicate that the sensitisation activities has sustained. It also points that an enabling environment for sustained child rights interventions has been created.

Conclusions
Sub Outcome 3.1: Families aware of harm caused by sending children to work and instead send and their children to school

- Traditional mindset prevailed among the community members that considered child labour as a support to the family, which could not be harmful to the child in anyway. The Project was initiated by UNICEF in 2010 to deal with such community thinking.
- Through various campaigns, 3,450 villages were covered and around 1.5 million communities reached through support of NGOs and technical support of UNICEF.
- The project built capacities of 16,000 community based structures to work on the CP issues. After training they were capable to track OOSC, ensure school enrollment, counseling and develop linkages with government schemes. CPC handbook was developed and disseminated during training, which had illustrations on legislation and protective mechanisms for children.

Sub Outcome 3.2: Adolescents, especially girls and women networked and empowered to monitor and tackle child rights violations and protect children’s rights, especially the right to education and protection

- The project involved AGGs and SHGs to expand the community outreach for achieving overall Project activities. Under the Project 3450 groups with 38,000 members were formed and oriented on child rights issue. From this group 87 cluster and 32 block level networks have been developed. Child groups were also formed to identify the OOSC.
- Life skill module was developed by UNICEF and disseminated through NGOs it has been disseminated among the AGGs. From intervention districts, 7000 members were part of the capacity building programme of child labour. The trained members provided support to the community as well as provided help to the VVs, VCPC and SMC in identifying OOSC and in counseling and enrollment.

Lessons Learned
Sub Outcome 3.1: Families aware of harm caused by sending children to work and send their children to school

- The Project dealt with community attitude which was against accepting the importance of CP issues. Through various IEC activities designed to suit the geographical region and stakeholder support, the community started understanding the importance of CP and education issues. The project realised that changing community behaviour is a long-term process and demands continuous and dedicated efforts.
- Awareness building in an area of labourers was a tough task as they all went to work early morning and came back late in the evening. Engaging them through day time activities was not suitable hence the Project team organised sensitisation activities during late nights to overcome this challenge.
- State wide campaigning is core to create an enabling environment to establish good practices in communities. ‘Jagruti’ and ‘bhavai show’ has been very successful in establishing the CP environment in the intervention area.
Sub Outcome 3.2: Adolescents, especially girls and women networked and empowered to monitor and tackle child rights violations and protect children’s rights, especially the right to education and protection

- Involving adolescent girl groups and women’s networks is crucial for the success of any intervention at the community level.
- Major challenges were faced at the initial stage while mobilising adolescent girls from different castes in to one group. Differences and discrimination visible at the village level were tried to overcome by making them understand and motivating them about the CP work. During the training many a difficulties were faced in taking the girls to the training place and staying for two three days as people did not allow girls to stay outside. The Project partners had to earn the community confidence in taking the girls for training.

Sub Outcome 3.3: Community leaders, including PRIs take active role in monitoring child rights issues and take action for preventing child labour

- Sensitisation activities were effective in changing the mindsets of the people, but involvement of the community leaders and other key stakeholders delivered even better results and contributed to the Project outcome. With their support CSOs were able to perform their role effectively.
- There are several reasons for the community to send their children into labour. The Project tried to solve several of these reasons, for instance the families were linked to SPS to deal with the poor economic situation of the family and improve the family income.
- Changing the mindsets of the community was a difficult task. After several levels of sensitisation, people agreed not to send their children in to labour. Messages from community leaders enabled creation of a child protective environment to an extent but linkage with SPSs and community pressure proved effective methods in mainstreaming of children in schools.

Project Component 4: Addressing exclusion of vulnerable families to service provision and social protection schemes

Outcome 4: Enhanced access to social protection schemes for vulnerable families (OOSC and children without parental care)

Sub Outcome 4.1: SPSs mapped, reviewed and recommended for revisions to explicitly target vulnerable families (OOSC and children without parental care) including those having children engaged in child labour and migrants

Door-to-door surveys and village mapping were conducted by VVs, SHGs, AWWs, ASHAs, VCPC and SMC members in coordination with PRIs to create databases with detailed information on vulnerable families. These helped in gaining significant information about vulnerable families which further helped in linking families with relevant SPSs. The CBOs contributed in mapping and identification of beneficiaries. They also provided support to families in paperwork to get benefits of the scheme at later stage. Some of the SPSs mapped included the Vidhva Sahay, Talim Yojana and Palak Mata Pita Yojana. A book was also developed by UNICEF called “Vividhlaksi Talim Yojana”.

Survey by VV, Banaskantha
**Challenges in ensuring mapping, review and recommendations on SPSs**

- A major challenge is in continuing the process initiated under the Project. The communities should be able to take the work forward and VVs should be involved in all activities. But without any incentive and in the absence of monitoring by any agency viz. NGO or Government the project activities have been affected.
- Government structures have limitations in reaching the community level due to their engagement in many other works and also availability of limited staff. Compared to the NGOs they have less accessibility at community level.
- At the initial level when NGOs started the mapping activity, the community did not have much trust on them due to their past experiences wherein promises of community development were not fulfilled. The partners had to struggle a lot to deal with this issue. However, through UNICEF’s strategy and guidance the NGOs resolved this issue. They involved PRI members and key community stakeholder for this project thus enabling the community to agree and support the project.

**Sub Outcome 4.2: Increased awareness among families on social protection schemes**

Information about the central and state level SPSs was consolidated into a compendium of 600 schemes and shared with various village level CP structures like VCPC members and VVs for use during community interactions and meetings.

The compendium was distributed in 3500 project villages under the project. It was prepared by Ministry of Panchayati Raj, Gujarat in consultation with UNICEF. Panchayati Raj of the State provided the idea of consolidating all SPSs under one umbrella to create awareness among people on access points for benefits of schemes.

Information dissemination was mainly done by CBOs with the help of VVs, PRIs, ASHAs, AWWs and SHGs in local dialects which proved to be effective for providing necessary information to vulnerable families and the rest of the community.

Since 2010, the Village Information Centres (VICs) were set up under the project for information dissemination on SPSs. During the project, VICs were established in more than 1,800 villages under “Aapdo Taluko, Vibrant Taluko (ATVT)” an initiative of GoG. These VICs were manned between 2-4pm by VVs in Vadodara, Rajkot and Bhavnagar.

IEC materials including wall paintings, posters, booklets and handbooks containing information on SPSs were circulated and displayed in public places with details of schemes including benefits and eligibility criteria.

Meetings and gram sabhas were also held at convenient time for community members where information on SPS was shared and discussed.

Government officials like the Taluka Development Officer (TDO) and Medical Officer (MO) were called to gram sabhas. CBOs did this in all project districts.

During the Project, DCPU officials were invited for general meetings held by the community, in which they also provided useful inputs on SPSs as the SPSs were under DCPU. Such meetings were possible with the help of NGOs.

---

"With this survey, a large number of families have been listed. From the project’s viewpoint, filtration was done to prioritise work. Hence, during the second phase of the project, the definition of vulnerable families was changed to “only those families whose children are OOSC and in child labour should be considered as vulnerable families”, and accordingly those families were provided the benefits of SPSs.”

- Dinesh Pandya, Project Coordinator, Mahiti Organisation
Challenges in disseminating information on SPSs in the community

- Initially government departments did not support CBOs. But after receiving notifications from the District Collector, they offered proper support to CBOs in Rajkot, Bhavnagar and Banaskantha.
- ASHAs and AWWs were not adequately aware about the SPSs.
- Large geographical area and scattered populations were major challenges for CBOs in conducting awareness activities in Banaskantha, Kutch and Patan.
- Many times it happened that children removed posters displayed due to lack of knowledge on CP.

Sub Outcome 4.3: Systems set up to monitor and link vulnerable families to social protection schemes

The database was prepared through door-to-door surveys and village mapping undertaken by NGOs to collect information about vulnerable families. During the project, 4,15,000 vulnerable families were linked with SPSs through Garib Kalyan Melas.

As a result of information dissemination, people became aware of their rights and the government's commitment to social protection. People directly visit the panchayat office or block office to find out about SPS.

Most community-level stakeholders expressed that they continue to share information and link vulnerable families to SPS as it helps others. District-level policy stakeholders accepted the relevance of the database to reach and link vulnerable families.

During the project, all middlemen were removed to provide direct benefits to vulnerable families. Moreover, many vulnerable families directly received benefits of SPSs.

Village volunteers were trained effectively to submit SPS forms to government officials and describe the survey methods and registration process.

Databases were able to link vulnerable families with support from RSETI (training institute established under mission Mangalam scheme), to provide vocational training courses of beautician, mobile repair and embroidery.

RSETI vocational training has been organised by banks such as SBI, Dena Bank, Bank of Baroda, Bank of India and Punjab National Bank. After training, necessary loans are provided to beneficiaries since after the life skills project AGG members demanded livelihood projects. Considering this, NGOs networked and drew linkages between AGGs and government programs such as mangalam mission, SHG programme of rural department and the banks.

Vocational training helps in developing skill sets among vulnerable families and provides them with livelihood options. Hence, families do not have financial constraints and can send their children to school regularly.

Various awareness activities have been done to disseminate the information and link the vulnerable families with SPSs. Garib Kalyan Mela was a good initiative started in the state, in which each BPL family received benefits of the SPSs.
On the basis of door to door survey and village mapping done by CSOs for collecting information of vulnerable families, a database was prepared. All vulnerable families have been linked to relevant SPSs according to the database. During the project, 4,15,000 vulnerable families were linked with SPSs through Garib Kalyan Melas.

Vulnerable families have been surveyed and information and handholding support provided to ensure enrolment and subsequent follow up for getting the benefits. Benefits to these vulnerable families were provided under Palak Mataa Pita Yojana, Virudi Pension Scheme, Vidva Pension Schemes, NRLM, RSBY, Siksha Virtu (Scholarship Schemes), Awas Yojana, Pandit Deendayal Anyodaya Yojana, Chiranjeevi Yojana, and other 600 schemes of GoG.

DAC Analysis for Outcome 4

Relevance
- The intervention succeeded in creating a database of vulnerable families as well as the compendium of SPSs, hence it has been relevant in achieving the project objective. The SPSs information has been disseminated adequately as a result of which, people are aware of their rights and the government’s commitment to social protection. District-level policy stakeholders accepted the relevance of the database to reach and link vulnerable families.

Effectiveness and Efficiency
The Project was effective in strengthening a child protective environment in several ways. It was able to identify more than 600 SPSs and compile them into a compendium and distribute it in all the Project villages. Now people are directly visiting the panchayat office or block office to enquire about SPS, which indicates the Project’s effectiveness. It also proved helpful in mobilising support and participation of government officials such as TDO and MO, who were invited to the gram sabha meetings. The project was effective since it enabled the setting up of VICs by GoG, during the intervention which strengthened the information dissemination process on SPSs. This also indicates Project’s efficiency in leveraging government support to achieve the Project objective. During the project, all middlemen were removed to provide direct benefits to vulnerable families. Moreover, many vulnerable families directly received benefits of SPSs thus indicating its efficiency.

Sustainability
Information about existing schemes has already been disseminated sufficiently within the community as they now enquire about the schemes to access the benefits. The recommendations adopted by the government regarding SPSs have been sustained in the system. Databases were able to link vulnerable families with RSETI support, to provide vocational training courses of beautician, mobile repair and embroidery. Thus the intervention appears to be sustained.

Lessons Learned

Sub Outcome 4.1: SPSs mapped, reviewed and recommended for revisions to explicitly target vulnerable families (OOSC and children without parental care) including those having children engaged in child labour and migrants
- This Project has developed new definition of vulnerable families. From the BPL list, child labour vulnerable families were identified and provided maximum focus to address their economical issues as a result child labour has been decreased in the community.
• Involvement of NGOs is crucial for community level intervention due to their easy accessibility and credibility within the community. Getting support and involvement of PRI members and key community stakeholders for this project enabled community buy-in for supporting the Project.
Chapter 4: Recommendations

The interaction at various levels and data analysis has drawn some new focus areas for future interventions. Certain recommendations have been made based on the lessons arising in course of the Project implementation. These recommendations will serve to optimise the model design of CP interventions in future and can also be reviewed in the context of scaling up and replication of the Project.

Project Component 1: Creating and strengthening CP structures to adequately protect children against exploitation and abuse

Sub Outcome 1.1: CP structures under Labour and ICPS/JJ in place, functioning at state, district and panchayat levels

- **Strengthen the DCPU** – Lack of manpower and untrained staff were major issues in all the six districts. For instance the DCPU staff were on contractual basis and had limited resources hence were unable to perform. There is a need to appoint permanent DCPU staff with provision of transport facility and other support services for better outcome.
- **Recurrent government notifications** – The government must issue orders and circulars in line with the notifications issued during the Project intervention pertaining to establishment and functioning of CP structures to ensure their functionality. Notifications could be issued regarding any relevant change quarterly in local language.
- **Involvement of PRIs** – State level involvement of Panchayati Raj Department should be made mandatory. The PRI members are being trained under many schemes, therefore child protection and child labour topic should be included in the training module.
- **Fostering CB initiatives** – The VCPCs should be strengthened to deal with child rights issue. Frequent trainings, motivation and monitoring mechanisms should be in place. After handing over this structure to the Government, these bodies are not getting relevant support or no one is coming to provide technical support and monitoring. All the VCPC members are not taking active role, hence they should be motivated to take up the work forward. There is need to link the VCPC with SSA in order to establish a routine mechanism to deal with education issues. Involvement of the panchayat is a must for effectiveness and sustainability of the Project impact at grass-root level.

Sub Outcome 1.2: Monitoring systems to track and target children at risk established and maintained

- **CTS up gradation** – The data has been developed during the Project period, but after end of this Project it is not maintained at regular basis.
- **Support mechanism** – There is a need to develop a support and monitoring mechanism to track at risk children. Many a times the VV, VCPC, SMC and the government staff do not have time to cover each and every village. It would be important to make available the data at the village level.

Sub Outcome 1.3: Civil society alliance established and actively partnering government efforts for reducing child labour

- **Furthering partnership** – The total Project duration was less to change the behavior of people towards CP issues and also to deal with sensitive issues of child protection. The Project has not been continuing after December 2013, as a result several staff left their job and new
New Concept Information Systems Pvt. Ltd.

inexperienced persons joined the partner NGO. It would be prudent to concretise the partnership with the NGOs for future CP interventions and utilise the gained expertise.

- Networking – NGOs were only looking after the CP issues. They have limited knowledge of education and other related activities. At district level they should work as a nodal agency for child protection.

**Sub Outcome 1.4: State and District action plans against child labour developed**

- Six district plans have been developed, out of that four plans were approved at the district and state level. These plans should be shared with all the concerned departments. Apart from this, a detailed action plan should be developed and monitored as very often, action plans are developed but not followed.

**Project Component 2: Improving the quality of education to increase enrolment and retention**

**Sub Outcome 2.1: All elementary schools in the Project areas providing quality, child friendly education**

- Strengthening regulations – Below mentioned points should be taken in consideration for better implementation of outcome 2.
  - Financial support should be provided to VVs in the same way as provided to the AWW and the ASHA.
  - STP should not remain the responsibility of Bal Mitra but should be expanded to other school functionaries
  - Before end of the Project a strong exit strategy should be developed
- Capacity building – Cascade manner training was effective. However, district level resource pool should be developed and information should be circulated to the stakeholders so that as per the requirement they can directly deal with them. Refresher training plan should be developed at state and district level.
- Monitoring and evaluation and MIS – There is need to strengthen the monitoring and evaluation system since sustainability of this issue was found to be lacking amongst the SMC, VCPC and other members.
- Plan development – SMC needs more training to develop micro plan needs to define priorities. Active participation is also a missing area at the village level which needs to be addressed.

**Sub Outcome 2.2: Special training programme for child labourers and other out-of school children up to 14 years in place for mainstreaming children into formal education**

- Capacity building of Bal Mitra on STP – Remuneration of Bal Mitra needs relook. Capacities of teaching personnel also have to be built up more effectively as teachers find it difficult to teach using STP.
- Emerging child labour issues – The Project with government and CSO partnership was implemented only in six districts and now this should be expanded in other villages. By the project end child labour has been reduced but farming patterns have also changed. The trends in child labour are now changing as companies are handing over seeds to tribal families. These families are growing cotton in their own farms and engage children, but children are not counted as labour. This issue was mainly found in Banaskantha and Patan region.
- Infux of children from other states and inadequate child care homes is a major issue faced by the state.

Commented [LS2]: Could add point about ‘hostel schools’ for migrant population children
In all six districts, many children are engaged in domestic work, small scale or home-based industries which need urgent focus.

Limited BRC staff was an issue in covering all the villages, hence there is need to develop some public private partnership model.

Sub Outcome 2.3: SMCs and PRIs monitor and support attendance and infrastructure improvement of schools

- Refresher Trainings – Frequent trainings of SMC members should be organized at various levels and time span should made shorter and need-based training should be provided.
- Sustainability – Monitoring of children’s attendance and school infrastructure worked well with the support of the CSOs. However, after end of the Project these activities have been affected. Thus there is need to develop motivation strategy for PRI members.
- Support mechanism – Duration of three to four years is a very limited time period for any social change and to make the Project sustainable. It should be extended by another two years especially in areas like Patan and Kutch, which require special attention.

Sub Outcome 2.4: Models of School Readiness Programme established for 3-5 year old children

- Showcase of good activities – Under this Project the State has demonstrated exemplary support and action, which should be documented and disseminated in local language through social media.

Project Component 3: Raising awareness and empowering families and communities so that they take collective action against child labour

Sub Outcome 3.1 Raising awareness and empowering families and communities so that they take collective against child labour

- Mapping exercise – In some areas child labour has taken new shape for instance it is growing in tribal areas in cotton farm and also some other businesses. Therefore, there is need to do mapping of all villages.
- Convergence – This issue has been linked with all Government departments but it should also be made an integral part of training. One child labour orientation kit should be developed and disseminated through various source like State Institute of Rural Development, Sardar Patel Institute of Public Administration and Panchayat Department.

Sub Outcome 3.2: Adolescents, especially girls and women networked and empowered to monitor and tackle child rights violations and protect children’s rights, especially the right to education and protection

- Linkages with income generation programme – The AAG members have been empowered through their skills development under the Project. But they do not want to limit themselves with the skill and wanted to invest their skill in some income generation programmes.
- Gender discrimination and caste discrimination needs to be addressed and require greater focus.
- Family orientation for girls’ education needs to be focused.

Sub Outcome 3.3: Community leaders, including PRIs take active role in monitoring child rights issues and take action for preventing child labour

- Engaging community leaders – PRI members and community leaders are busy with many activities. In that case alternative support should be provided at the village level.
- **Appreciation of good work** – The Government should develop a system to monitor the activities of PRIs and provide some award to the best performer to motivate them for their enhanced participation. A rotational system of handling responsibilities by PRI members should be developed and implemented. Some local punishment policy should be developed for the families who send children into child labour.

- **Social customs** – Mass campaign should be planned at state level against female feticide and to promote girl child education.

**Project Component 4: Enhanced Access to Social Protection Schemes for Vulnerable Families**

**Sub Outcome 4.1: SPSs mapped, reviewed and recommended for revisions to explicitly target vulnerable families (OOSC and children without parental care) including those having children engaged in child labour and migrants**

- **CP scheme** – Lack of child care and CP scheme awareness is a major issue which necessitates the requirement of developing and awareness strategy. The strategy should be area specific and covering all the local problems.

- **Administration support** – Requirement of several documents was the major issue, to access the SPSs. A single window approach should be developed at all three levels of Panchayat for improved SPS access.

- **Assistance in filling forms** – Retired person and graduate unemployed youth from the village may be engaged on an honorarium by Government at each panchayat for assisting the vulnerable families in filling forms and help in getting relevant documents. They can serve as a link between community and taluka level officials.

**Sub Outcome 4.3: Systems set up to monitor and link vulnerable families to SPSs**

- **Scheme information** – Large poster or hoarding with information on schemes should be made available at the village panchayat. They should be in local language with pictorial messaging

- **Updating database** – Every year, database of vulnerable families and children should be updated after conducting a survey by making visits to the GPs.

- **Expand Project Period** – This scheme is very much useful and appreciable which has provided benefits to those people who are not capable enough to educate their children. These kind of Projects should be given more importance by the government.

- **Minimum government and maximum governance** – This strategy should be implemented at all level, which can enable system of good governance.

- **Missing children** – Missing children data should be disseminated with help of VCPCs and DCPUs.