UNICEF's Education Response to Emergencies in Four African Countries

By Geert Edelenbosch
Consultancy Report for UNICEF ESARO

May 2000

The views expressed in this report are those of the author and do not necessarily reflect the policies or the views of UNICEF.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I SYNTHESIS: TOWARDS AN EFFECTIVE UNICEF RESPONSE TO EDUCATION IN EMERGENCY SITUATIONS</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.1 Introduction</td>
<td>8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.2 Historical Perspective</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.3 Rationale for Special Policy Development</td>
<td>12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.4 Emergency Preparedness</td>
<td>13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.5 Situation Assessment</td>
<td>14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.6 Strategies</td>
<td>15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.7 Strategic and Implementation Issues</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.8 Recommendations from the Assessment</td>
<td>22</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II EDUCATION IN EMERGENCY SITUATIONS: RWANDA</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.1 Introduction</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.2 Present Situation of Education in Rwanda</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.3 Situation of Education in the Areas Visited</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.4 UNICEF's Education Response to the Emergency Situation in Northwest Rwanda</td>
<td>38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.5 Conclusions</td>
<td>41</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.6 Recommendations</td>
<td>42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III EDUCATION IN EMERGENCY SITUATIONS: SOMALIA</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.1 Introduction</td>
<td>44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Section</td>
<td>Page</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>------------------</td>
<td>------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.5 Conclusions</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5.6 Recommendations</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annex 1</td>
<td>106</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Abbreviations

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Abbreviation</th>
<th>Full Form</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ACORD</td>
<td>Agency for Co-operation and Research Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ADF</td>
<td>Allied Democratic Forces</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AET</td>
<td>African Educational Trust</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>AFSI</td>
<td>International Service Volunteer Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>BECCAD</td>
<td>Basic Education Child Care and Adolescent Development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CAP</td>
<td>Consolidated appeal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CDC</td>
<td>Curriculum Development Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEC</td>
<td>Community Education Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CEDC</td>
<td>Children in Especially Difficult Circumstances</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CO</td>
<td>Country Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CPAR</td>
<td>Canadian Physician for Aid and Relief</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DEO</td>
<td>District Education Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>DRC</td>
<td>Democratic Republic of Congo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>EC</td>
<td>European Commission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ECC</td>
<td>Education Co-ordination Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESARO</td>
<td>Eastern and Southern Africa Regional Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ESC</td>
<td>Education Sectoral Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FRRA</td>
<td>Farshoda Relief and Rehabilitation Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GoU</td>
<td>Government of Uganda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GoR</td>
<td>Government of Rwanda</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GoS</td>
<td>Government of Sudan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>GUSCO</td>
<td>Gulu Save the Children Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HQ</td>
<td>Head Quarter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IDP</td>
<td>Internally Displaced People</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ITEK</td>
<td>Institute of Teacher Training Kyambogo</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INGO</td>
<td>Indigenous Non Governmental Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MINEDUC</td>
<td>Ministry of Education and Culture</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MOES</td>
<td>Ministry of Education and Sports</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MPO</td>
<td>Master Plan of Operation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NAPE</td>
<td>National Assessment of Education Progress</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NCDC</td>
<td>National Curriculum Development Centre</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NER</td>
<td>Net Enrolment Rate</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NGO</td>
<td>Non Governmental Organisation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>NID</td>
<td>National Immunisation Day</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OCHA</td>
<td>Office for the Co-ordination of Humanitarian Affairs</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OLS</td>
<td>Organisation lifeline Sudan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PC</td>
<td>Parent Committee</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PEER</td>
<td>Programme for Education for Emergency Reconstruction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PFO</td>
<td>Programme Funds Office</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTA</td>
<td>Parent teacher Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTC</td>
<td>Primary Teacher College</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PTDS</td>
<td>Post Traumatic Stress Disorder</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Acronym</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------</td>
<td>------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RASS</td>
<td>Relief Association South Sudan</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RPA</td>
<td>Rwandan People's Army</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SACB</td>
<td>Somalia Aid Co-ordination Body</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Somulu</td>
<td>Somalia Open learning Unit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SLC</td>
<td>Sentinel Community Surveillance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPLA</td>
<td>Sudan's People Liberation Movement</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SPLA/A</td>
<td>Sudan's People Liberation Movement Army</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SRRA</td>
<td>Sudan Relief and Rehabilitation Association</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>SSIM</td>
<td>South Sudan Independence Movement</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Summary

This study was commissioned by the UNICEF Eastern and Southern Africa Regional Office to achieve greater clarity on UNICEF’s support to education in emergency situations. It was undertaken in four countries in the region, viz., Rwanda, Somalia, Southern Sudan and Uganda.

The current emergencies in all four countries are human-made, caused by civil war and insurgency. These emergencies have had a very negative impact on education in these countries although the size of the affected areas and the duration of the crisis in each vary considerably. The education system in Uganda and Rwanda is well established and still functioning in the areas affected by the emergencies. This is in contrast to Southern Sudan and Somalia where the education system has collapsed entirely. The education system in the latter two countries was, prior to the emergency, at the initial stage of development and mainly functioning in urban areas. The effects of war and insurgency on the educational situation therefore differ from country to country and from area to area even within the same country.

The study found that each UNICEF country office paid specific attention to education in emergency areas and had its specific implementation strategy. Important factors determining the different strategies are the educational situation prior to the start of emergency, the characteristics of the emergency, and the current functioning of the education system. The key argument in all four countries for advocating specific attention to the basic education for children in emergency areas is that it contributes, although with different potential, to addressing the crisis situation and subsequent rehabilitation and/or development.

UNICEF’s assistance to basic education during an emergency situation is often only given in the 'second phase of the emergency' along the same patterns as the immediate emergency response. The education emergency response of UNICEF Rwanda and Uganda is mainly focusing on short term 'traditional' activities such as the provision of materials for shelter and education supplies. In Southern Sudan, and initially also in Somalia, the focus of the education emergency programme is on shelter, supplies and teacher training.

The UNICEF Somalia programme was reviewed in 1997. This resulted in a new country programme with a more structural approach focussing on issues of system development. Except for Somalia, the programmes are not guided by a well-defined programme strategy, based on a participatory assessment of the situation of education in the different emergency areas in the specific country. Generally monitoring of delivery of supplies is weak. The provision of emergency supplies is only effective if there is a functioning management and monitoring system in place to deliver the appropriate supplies timely.

10

UNICEF's Education Response to Emergencies in four African Countries, 2000
The percentage of untrained teachers in Somalia and Southern Sudan is substantially higher as compared to Rwanda and Uganda. Teachers in Sudan and Somalia do not receive a salary due to the lack of functioning systems. Most of the teachers who were trained in the past have fled the country or found a better paid job in the aid sector. The role of the trained teaching cadres in emergency situations with regard to local leadership is often very crucial.

The role of NGOs in education in emergency situations, particularly in Rwanda and Uganda is limited. In Somalia and Southern Sudan there are a sizeable number of active NGOs addressing the educational needs. There are however only a few NGOs with a strong profile on education in all countries.

The problems and solutions of children resulting from civil strife and war vary greatly between countries. In areas where communities and families stayed together during the emergencies, children had better opportunities to deal with the effects of the civil strife. A large group of children have minor physical and/or mental disabilities and need special attention. If not detected in time these children have a higher risk of dropping out. There are no substantive government nor agency/NGO policies and/or funds to support specialised and individualised counselling, treatment, or other type of assistance to children with (minor) special needs. UNICEF and other organisations do however support a variety of special support activities, varying from school gardens to psychosocial care activities. While the assistance provided is appreciated by the receiving target group it has a relatively small impact on the total number of children in need of special care in school. Solutions should be developed which can be integrated in the mainstream of education. UNICEF should support governments and other agencies/NGOs to enhance a more 'caring school environment' where teachers are equipped to work and play with children, to observe and listen better to them and where children have more possibilities for playing and expression.

Parents and community involvement in education in the four countries varies. In Rwanda and Uganda a system for parents and community involvement is in place but is weakened as a result of destruction and displacement. In Southern Sudan and Somalia there has never been a system nor conducive environment for local community and parental involvement in primary education. In emergency situations where the position of local authorities has been weakened or is no longer existing, community involvement and responsibility has become essential for the running and further development of the school. Their involvement in the management and further development of the school is often still limited to the contribution of school fees and participation in the annual parents meeting. The potential of further involvement of parents, e.g. in monitoring of enrolment and resource mobilisation, is hardly exploited, with the exception of Somalia. Through systematic training of members of Community Education Committees, teachers and administrators UNICEF Somalia has made community participation a main programme strategy.
There are various reasons for the weaknesses in monitoring, such as long distances, lack of accessibility of areas, lack of communication infrastructure, insecurities, other tasks and priorities which prevents UNICEF staff from leaving the office etc. However monitoring in the field remains crucial for an ongoing effective response to often quickly changing emergency situations.

A key problem for all UNICEF’s response to an emergency situation is the availability of funds. Mostly the funding has to come from supplementary resources which have to be raised.

The timely raising of funds is always in contradiction with the emergency character of the situation. If emergency education is seen as very important for children to return as quick as possible to a 'normal life' situation, funding through general resources and/or as part of appeals for funding for emergencies has to be provided on an urgent basis as well.
General recommendations

Recommendation 1
A clear understanding of the development of the education system, its potential before the emergency and how the current emergency situation is affecting the system, should continuously guide UNICEF's immediate and longer term response to education in emergency situations.

Recommendation 2
The UNICEF education staff in emergency countries should be involved in the assessment of the emergency situation and in strategizing for an effective education response from the earliest stage.

Recommendation 3
UNICEF's response should feed into development of special policy and instruments for education in emergency and well coordinated support with a view to contribute to stable and progressive recovery from an emergency situation.

Recommendation 4
UNICEF should advocate the introduction of a more caring and supportive learning environment. This will create a child-friendly environment in the school that will be in particularly beneficial for war-traumatised children.

Recommendation 5
UNICEF ESARO should assess the need for capacity building of UNICEF staff on the assessment of the education situation and in enhancing community and parent's involvement and responsibility in emergency education.

Recommendation 6
UNICEF should contribute to the capacity building of communities and parents for increased involvement and responsibility as an important strategy for strong community support for education (in emergencies).

Recommendation 7
UNICEF should develop a more integrated, systematic and efficient approach for the selection, procurement, distribution and monitoring of supplies.

Recommendation 8
UNICEF should avoid haphazard supply related decisions and select, order and distribute supplies in accordance to a set strategy.

Recommendation 9
UNICEF should strengthen its supply and financial procedures to facilitate flexible and
fast delivery of emergency supplies for education.

**Recommendation 10**
UNICEF to consider setting minimum standards for monitoring education activities in emergency situations, linked to strategies and policies.

**Recommendation 11**
UNICEF human resources sections, particularly at HQ level, to ensure timely nomination and replacement of education staff in emergency countries and ensure adequate education and experience with emergencies of staff members.

**Recommendation 12**
UNICEF Country Offices to ensure adequate expert input, particularly for situation assessment and strategy and system development, where necessary through short term consultancy input.

**Recommendation 13**
UNICEF Country offices dealing with emergency education to appoint a specific Education Programme Assistant or consultant to assist with monitoring of programme implementation on the ground for the period of the emergency.

**Recommendation 14**
UNICEF Education Cluster, assisted by the Division of Communication and PFO, should strongly advocate to donors the importance of support for education in emergency situations as an integral part of the response to emergencies.
I SYNTHESIS: TOWARDS AN EFFECTIVE UNICEF RESPONSE TO EDUCATION IN EMERGENCY SITUATIONS

1.1 Introduction

In September 1998 UNICEF held a consultation on the agency’s capacity to respond to situations of crisis and instability in a predictable and efficient manner in Martigny, Switzerland. As a follow up to the Martigny consultation, the Education Section of UNICEF Eastern and Southern Africa Regional Office (ESARO), took the initiative of undertaking an assessment of UNICEF’s education response to such situations in four African countries viz. Rwanda, Somalia, Sudan and Uganda. Six areas situated in the four countries were visited (see arrows on the map below).

The long-term goal of the assessment was to achieve greater understanding and effectiveness for ESARO in its role of assisting education in emergency programmes in the region. A consultant was assigned to undertake an analysis of current UNICEF programmes at country level and to develop a set of concrete recommendations regarding emergency education programmes for the future. UNICEF seeks more information and understanding of the type of programmes it is supporting, the processes involved and the outcomes of these programmes. The specific purpose of the consultancy was to provide an analysis of current UNICEF programmes and a set of concrete and country specific recommendations for action. The Terms of Reference for the consultancy are attached to the report.1

Basic education has a significant role to play in every emergency programme according

---

1 Annex 1

UNICEF’s Education Response to Emergencies in four African Countries, 2000
to UNICEF's strategic guidelines for education in emergencies. Educational activities in
emergency situations are to be consistent with UNICEF's overall policy on basic
education and should be tailored to the specifics of the particular emergency. UNICEF's
policy follows from a rights-based approach.

The guiding principle of this approach is that the right to education is every child's right,
regardless of the circumstances into which she or he is thrust. Universal Primary
Education (UPE) is the key goal. Emergencies are viewed broadly to include natural and
human made disasters such as civil strife and war, the latter also called complex
emergencies. An assessment of the situation of primary education in the context of the
ongoing emergency on the ground is needed to understand the complexity of the
(emergency) situation in light of the broad UNICEF policy and strategic considerations.

The methodology developed for the assignment was based on:

- meetings and discussions with many stakeholders with an interest in primary
  education in emergency situations in the selected countries/areas within the given
time. The focus was on UNICEF staff, education authorities concerned, education
cadres, international and local NGOs. To facilitate meetings a checklist was
prepared on the basis of the Terms of Reference (TOR) for the assessment. This
checklist was used as a guide for meetings and discussions;
- field visits to schools in the target areas. To facilitate school and class
  observations the checklist for school visits prepared by UNICEF Somalia was
  used.4
- study of relevant literature.

The findings are presented as follows:

- a separate chapter on the situation of primary education for each of the countries,
  providing a description of the emergency and education situation, UNICEF's
  education response, conclusions and concrete recommendations for future action;
- the country chapters are preceded by a synthesis chapter in which the situations and
  UNICEF's education responses in the four countries are compared and analysed.
  General recommendations for future UNICEF policy, responses and actions are
given at the end of this chapter.

The assessment was complicated as many aspects and issues had to be addressed while

2 Mary Joy Pigozzi, 1997, Education in Emergencies and for Reconstruction, Strategic Guidelines with a
developmental approach
3 The Convention on the Rights of the Child, Article 28 describes the right to Education as follows: Right
to Education: 1. States parties recognise the right of the child to education, and with a view to achieving
this right progressively and on the basis of equal opportunity, they shall in particular: (a) Make primary
education compulsory and available free to all;... and (c) Take measures to encourage regular attendance at
schools and the reduction of the drop-out rates.
4 UNICEF Somalia, 1998, Checklist for school visits,

UNICEF's Education Response to Emergencies in four African Countries, 2000
communications and logistics were often time-consuming and time available was short. A great deal of time was spent on travelling as at least two different sites in each of the countries had to be visited. The availability of information and data in the different countries about emergency education was not uniform and as a result there were varying gaps in the information accessible on the four countries. This further complicated analyses and comparison between the countries. Unfortunately there was limited time to discuss conclusions and recommendations with major stakeholders and include their perspectives.

The consultant hopes that in spite of these constraints and limitations the report does justice to the education programmes in the four countries and the meetings held during the study. Hopefully the recommendations will prove to be useful for further strengthening of existing emergency education programmes and future development of effective responses to education in emergency situations.

The consultant wishes to thank all UNICEF staff for their support to this assessment study.

1.2 Historical Perspective

The assessment of the effectiveness of UNICEF in situations of emergency in the four selected countries shows that the following factors are important for UNICEF's response in these countries:

- the education situation before the emergency;
- characteristics of the emergency;
- the current functioning of the education system.

The Education Situation before the Emergency

Rwanda and Uganda have both been colonised in the past, while most of Somalia and Southern Sudan have never been fully colonised. Colonisation has influenced the development and the functioning of the education system in the different countries. A well established three tiered education system (of primary, secondary and higher education levels) was established in both Rwanda and Uganda long before the current emergency situation started. At the time when the civil war started in Somalia and Southern Sudan the primary education system was established and functioning in and around the urban areas only. As a result, the enrolment rate in the four countries/sites before the emergency started varies considerably. For instance, in the late 1980s, prior to the civil war in Somalia approximately 150,000 children were enrolled in primary school. The gross enrolment rate was less than 20 per cent. The national gross enrolment rate in the two Rwandese préfectures or provinces affected by civil strife, prior to the events of
1998/1999, was 79 and 83 per cent, respectively. This implies that the destruction of the education system as a result of the war in Rwanda affected the life of the majority of Rwandese children while in Somalia it affected a small minority of children.
Characteristics of the Emergency

The current emergencies in all four countries are human made, caused by civil war, strife or insurgency. However, the size of the affected areas in the countries varies considerably. In Rwanda the current emergency is situated in two préfectures or districts in the north-eastern; in Uganda, in five districts in the northern and western parts. In Somalia, they are to be found in the central and southern part of the country, including the capital Mogadishu, while some regions of the country are in the process of recovery. In Southern Sudan large portions of the territory are involved in the conflict.

Another difference between countries is the duration of the crisis. In North East Rwanda, the crisis started in 1998; in Somalia it started around 1988 in the North West, as did the current civil strife in the northern and western Uganda; in Southern Sudan, in the current cycle of conflict, life was disrupted as early as 1983. All emergency situations or prolonged emergency situations in the four countries studied have had a serious negative impact on the situation of education in the area concerned. Children have been displaced, schools destroyed, school supplies looted and human resources such as teachers, inspectors and other educational authorities, have been killed or displaced.

Current Functioning of the Education System

In Uganda and Rwanda the education system at primary, secondary and tertiary levels is relatively well established. These national systems have a defined curriculum and the majority of the teachers are trained. In spite of the crises in the affected areas the overall education system is still functioning. In almost every village there is a primary school, the majority of the teachers are regularly paid and there is an established – if not a fully functioning - administration and inspection at all levels. The main effects of the civil strife were destruction of some school buildings, loss of furniture and learning materials, and displacement of school children. In addition, for various reasons, the number of untrained teachers has increased.

As mentioned earlier, the education system prior the emergency, in both Southern Sudan and Somalia, was only at an initial stage of development and functioned mainly in and around the towns. The national education system then collapsed entirely due to continuing civil strife and to the lack of a central education authority. As a result, the majority of school-age children are still out of school and access to education is heavily dependent on multilateral and NGO support.

The size of the area affected, the duration of the conflict and the extent of destruction of the system, are important factors affecting the post-crisis functioning of the education system in countries affected by civil strife. However, the strength of an education system after a period of emergency appears to be mainly determined by the previous level of development of an education system. The weaker and the less developed the system, the more difficult it is to reactivate and to rehabilitate after an emergency. This is evidenced...
by the cases of Somalia and Southern Sudan.
1.3 Rationale for Special Policy Development

The effects of strife and war on the situation of education differ from area to area and are relative when compared with other areas. If education indicators such as the number of schools operating, the number of trained teachers, the student/teacher ratio of an emergency area/country, are compared with other areas in the same country, or with the education indicators of another country, the situation may appear to be still average or even above average. Even in Uganda and Rwanda there have always been educationally disadvantaged areas such as Moroto and Kibungo. Education indicators in the emergency provinces of Ruhengeri and Gisenyi in Rwanda and Gulu in Uganda are, despite the loss of school buildings, school supplies and human resources, more positive than in Kibungo District in Rwanda and in Moroto District in Uganda. But the figures on paper do not translate into the devastation and fear of the areas affected by insurgency. It would be questionable to develop a specific education-in-emergency programme based on the status of education indicators. However despite the above, all four countries have given specific attention to education for children in emergency areas. The main reason being that education contributes very positively, although with different potential, to addressing the needs of children in a crisis situation and subsequently in the rehabilitation and/or development of these children by:

- reducing uncertainty and providing a sense of normalcy to children;
- immediately contributing to the rehabilitation and/or development focus of the communities involved; and
- reducing frustration and social unrest among local authorities and politicians and anxiety within communities, and therefore contributing to national and/or regional stability and development.

From this rationale logically follows the importance of developing specific policies and instruments for education in emergency situations and of co-ordinated support in the different countries with a view to effectively contributing to well-balanced and progressive recovery from the emergency situation.

This rationale has implications for UNICEF's conceptual framework for education in emergency situations. The main focus of assistance should therefore be to provide schooling as a means to help address the needs of children and communities in emergency situations. Possibilities for education in emergency programmes to contribute to achieving UPE appear to be limited. However, in the phase after the emergency, especially when whole countries are involved, and when systems are re-established or rehabilitated there are opportunities for system reform and for introducing innovations. Examples are the ongoing curriculum reform, textbook development and other structural exercises in Somalia. Even the emergency areas of Uganda and Rwanda are benefiting from ongoing national reforms in education: the introduction of UPE and decentralisation in Uganda and the gradual reform of the education system in Rwanda.
1.4 Emergency Preparedness

UNICEF Rwanda and Uganda have not developed a specific country policy or strategy for assisting education in emergency situations. UNICEF's response is emergency oriented but the special education needs of the areas in conflict are addressed as an integral part of the ongoing country programme. When called into an emergency situation, UNICEF's education staff generally seem to be overwhelmed and/or lack the time to thoroughly address the situation. Dealing with an emergency is for many (UNICEF) education staff a new experience. In general, the immediate response of UNICEF is focused on meeting the basic needs for health, nutrition and sanitation. Assistance in the field of education is often only given during a 'second phase' along the same pattern as the immediate response. During the first months of UNICEF's involvement in an emergency situation, while addressing the immediate needs, the education staff is normally not involved in relief operations. As a result, the education staff is often not fully aware of the role they can play in the emergency.

Based on information received from non-educationists, government sources and spot checks, assistance is mostly provided to schools or to displaced schools rather than to rehabilitating education systems in an affected area. This has been the case in UNICEF's support to affected provinces in North West Rwanda and to districts in North East Uganda and was until recently the case in Somalia and Southern Sudan. As a result of the lack of an in-depth assessment and of a well defined programme strategy, the education emergency response of Uganda and Rwanda is mainly focusing on short term classic assistance to emergencies such as the provision of materials for shelter and education supplies such as kits and basic school supplies. With the exception of UNICEF Somalia few efforts have been made to develop specific strategies to deal with the particular emergency situation.

During the last three years UNICEF Headquarters, UNICEF ESARO and other agencies have undertaken several exercises to provide programmatic guidance on how to address education in emergencies, involving field staff in post at the time in the team production of policies and guidelines. This has resulted in a number of reports and other publications, some produced by field staff at regional meetings. It was however noticed that in most cases the UNICEF staff members, including those involved in the direct implementation of education in emergencies, were not up to date with these documents. Though most of them had direct access and were aware of the existence of these documents they had not read them or re-read them recently. This is no doubt due to the continuous heavy workload, and especially to the office environment which, being an operational and not an academic workplace, is not well suited for studying documents longer than a few pages. Although in-house training and keeping up-to-date with new developments are often a part of the job description, the constant interruption by unexpected visitors, the telephone calls, e-mail alarms and unscheduled small inter-staff
meetings, do not make the working environment conducive for studying lengthy documents. As a result, valuable information specifically developed for staff members is not effectively used.

1.5 Situation Assessment

As mentioned in the above section on emergency preparedness, UNICEF Rwanda and UNICEF Uganda had not developed a specific programme for education in emergency areas as part of the country programme based on an assessment of the situation in these areas.

In Southern Sudan and initially also in Somalia the focus of the education emergency programme was on the provision of school supplies and teacher training. Due to lack of functioning education systems on the ground and supporting information collection systems, these inputs were not effective. In 1997 the UNICEF Somalia programme was reviewed based on a survey and a qualitative assessment of the situation of primary education. As a result, a more structural approach addressing issues of system development and sustainability has been developed and is currently being implemented in Somalia. The education programme for Southern Sudan is currently being reviewed. This exercise will be followed by the development of new strategies and programme activities to support education system development.

With the exception of Somalia where a second school survey was carried out in 1998/1999, the other countries are supporting activities based on data that have not been verified by sampled spot checks. It was found that in some cases data provided by educational authorities were inflated. None of the countries have set up an information management system that is relevant to the fast changing emergency situation.

An essential and logical first precondition in determining any programme strategy, including a programme strategy for education in emergency situations, is the assessment of the situation. To undertake such an assessment is not an easy task. It is a specialised exercise that requires the input of specialists. In countries where an emergency situation occurs the UNICEF Education Section should in principle support the Government or competent local body in undertaking such an exercise. If education authorities are not functioning UNICEF may take the responsibility of carrying out such an exercise. A special task force should be established to develop and organise the assessment. This group should consist of potential counterparts, educational authorities and representatives of national and international organisations and local teachers involved in emergency activities in the area. When implemented at the beginning of an emergency the assessment could be a part of a larger integrated (health, nutrition, water and sanitation) overall assessment of the emergency situation. The assessment could be undertaken with the guidance of experts by teachers or other national educationists or even with the


UNICEF’s Education Response to Emergencies in four African Countries, 2000
assistance of secondary or university students.

Based on an early assessment of education in emergency situations, a response strategy can be developed with stakeholders and implemented accordingly. A regional inter-agency/body of NGOs, not necessarily ESARO, could be strengthened to assist countries in conducting a rapid education assessment.

1.6 Strategies

Rwanda and Uganda both have a central government, though the effective authority of the government varies across the respective countries. Both governments, however, accept responsibility and are committed by their education policies to providing primary education, including education for emergency areas but no specific policies or strategies are developed for new emergency situations.

In Southern Sudan and Central and Southern Somalia, there is prevailing insecurity resulting in limited access and lack of communication in large parts of the countries. Neither country has a central government, a central ministry of education, nor a functioning national education system. These countries have fallen apart, into a number of administrative entities or, in some areas, do not have administrative entities at all. Also, the two pre-war education systems had a very short history, were never well developed and did not exist or function in many parts of the country, especially the rural areas. After the destruction of civil wars the already weak administrative and support system totally collapsed and left the countries with no education system at all. The weaknesses of the past and the prolonged emergency situation have resulted in a almost total lack of system thinking among leaders and educationists in the countries. As a result of the absence of a structural education system, the distribution of books and other school supplies often failed to reach the vast majority of the schools and the inservice training of teachers has not been effective.

During the consultancy it was found that the role of NGOs in education in emergency situations, particularly in Rwanda and Uganda was limited. In Somalia and Southern Sudan there are a sizeable number of NGOs but few organisations with a strong track record or expertise in education. The few NGOs that have a specific education profile generally do not contribute effectively to the strengthening of the education system as a whole. This is partially due to the different policies of their donors. In Rwanda and Uganda in particular they tend to implement isolated activities which depend on external funding.

Four types of emergency situations emerge from consultancy observations:

A. Countries/areas recovering from an emergency and where the national education system remains in place and is functioning at central level (Rwanda and Uganda).

UNICEF's Education Response to Emergencies in Four African Countries, 2000
B. Countries/areas recovering from a prolonged emergency which have not had a functioning overall administrative system in place for at least a decade nor a tradition of modern education across the territory (North East and North West Somalia and islands of peace in Central and Southern Somalia and Southern Sudan).

C. Areas which are very vulnerable and where there is continuing insecurity but with a functioning education system (Rwanda and Uganda)

D. Areas which are very vulnerable and where there is continuing insecurity and where there is no functioning overall education system (certain areas in Southern Sudan and Central and Southern Somalia).

The above four situations can be clustered under the umbrella of ‘education in emergency situations but each situation is very different and therefore also requires a different and appropriate response. It is important to assess and analyse each are in need, even within the same country or within a certain area carefully. As described above, the main determinants for a response are the level of vulnerability and the degree of functionality of the education system. UNICEF should dare to introduce a different response to target very different outcomes for each of the situations. Some responses need to be ad hoc in nature and school based. Other responses should be structural and system based. UNICEF should consider the following responses:

1. (Situation A) UNICEF to contribute to proved and agreed strategies such as assistance to teacher training, curriculum development or renewal, or technical support for textbook development planning/implementation. In both Rwanda and Uganda some bilateral donors and/or the World Bank provide assistance to the rehabilitation and/or the renewal of the education system. UNICEF may consider focusing particularly on schooling of the still unreached primary aged children.

2. (Situation B) UNICEF to focus initially on support to the re-establishment of education systems, to school-based reforms, decentralised school management, partnership with NGOs; greater involvement and increased management by parents and communities through zoned clustering of schools which can later develop into an ever-extending system, linking zones, districts, regions, under a national system.

3. (Situation C) UNICEF to assist the local authorities (Uganda and Rwanda) in supporting the educational needs of children in emergency situations.

4. (Situation D) UNICEF to provide directly support to schools or to local organisations. In both cases support should be in the form of an integrated and community based support package which combines crash teacher training, teacher guides, textbooks for teachers, basic learning materials for learners - provided the latter will have a direct impact on schooling – and support to school construction.
1.7 Strategic and Implementation Issues

Human Resources

As in the case of other social sector cadres, teachers have been affected, personally and professionally, by the emergencies. In the past, the trained teachers of Southern Sudan and Somalia generally belonged to a small elite group of educated professionals. Many teachers have left the teaching profession as a result of the long period of insecurity. They have fled the country or found another profession in the aid sector. As a result the current majority of the teachers in Somalia and Southern Sudan are untrained.

In Rwanda and Uganda the percentage of trained teachers has decreased although the majority of the teachers in the emergency areas is trained (Rugengeri, Rwanda 59 per cent; Gulu, Uganda about 85 per cent)\(^\text{10}\). The teacher/pupil ratio has increased and is in some cases excessive. Contrary to Rwanda and Uganda, and with the exception of a limited number of unregistered schools in Uganda, the teachers in Southern Sudan and Somalia do not receive a formal salary due to the lack of functioning education systems. They depend on assistance from NGOs and parents.

UNICEF pays substantial attention to teacher training in Sudan and Somalia. In both countries the retention of trained teachers is very low. Weak selection procedures, the salary issue and the fact that the existing in-service course is split into different courses contribute to the low retention of trained teachers.

Some initiatives have been taken to build the capacity of teaching cadres to address issues related to the emergency in all countries visited. Mostly the focus of the training was to specifically support children with special needs but without relating the support to the changed educational situation.

In all four countries the role of trained education cadres (education authorities, head teachers, teachers) is central in emergency situations since they potentially play an important role in local leadership, particularly when systems are under stress.

Special Support Activities

Findings in the four countries show that, except for Somalia, UNICEF supports a variety of special support activities, varying from school gardens to psycho social care activities. Though there is a need to address the specific problems of children with special needs related to the emergency situation, there is a tendency within UNICEF Education


UNICEF's Education Response to Emergencies in four African Countries, 2000
Sections to pay too much attention to such 'side' activities. Activities, such as the development of posters, psychosocial modules, special days/events and supplementary projects such as school gardens, tailoring and carpentry projects are undertaken. Yet there is no clear impact and no guarantee that these activities will be integrated into the main education system activities in future, into the curriculum, into teacher training courses and/or into the administrative-supervisory system. Often such activities are time consuming, ineffective and not sustainable. Though new activities may be challenging and motivating, it is important to remain focused on the main programme objectives.

**Children with Special Needs**

Many discussions were held with head teachers and teachers during the field visits to schools on the subject of children affected by the atrocities of the war. In all countries a number of teachers has been trained to recognise symptoms of children in need of special support due to civil strife. The problems for children resulting from war and the solutions vary greatly between the countries. From the limited available data studied and the discussions held, it seems that the number of school age children affected by the instability in North East Rwanda and in Somalia is less than in the other two countries. The following factors were considered to be significant by the respondents:

- the prevalence of atrocities
- the age of the abducted children during the atrocities; the time factor, when did the atrocities happen? In e.g. Somalia most of the violence happened between 1989 and 1993 and as a result most of the present school age children are too young to remember the violence;
- separation from family or community; and last but not least
- the incidence of other more recent non-war dramatic events such as the loss of parents due to AIDS.

There is reason to assume that where communities and families stayed together during the events, the children had better opportunities to deal with the effects of violence.

Without wishing to downplay the importance of assistance to children in need of special support, the number of abducted and highly traumatised children remains a small minority of the total number of children living in affected areas. The capacity or ability of ordinary teachers and under-trained teachers, after a few days training, to address the needs of traumatised children in a better way than the traditional community and family support used to do is questionable.

In the past the definition of special education was understood to be the education of children with a clear and visible disability such as deafness and blindness. Now-a-days there is a growing realisation that there is a much larger group of learners in need of some special kind of attention. Most of these children are enrolled in the main stream of
primary education but, if their needs are not detected in time, they are at high risk of dropping out of school. In the countries visited it was noted that due to the effects of civil strife and to war-related insecurity there was a much higher prevalence of children with special learning needs, for example, children with minor physical and/or mental disabilities than in non-emergency countries.

In all countries visited, there are no substantive government nor agency/NGO policies nor funds to support specialised and individualised counselling, treatment, or other type of assistance to children with special needs. At the same time many organisations do something in this field, usually a small localised activity. While the assistance provided is appreciated by the receiving target group it has a relatively small impact on the total number of children in need of special care in school. In light of the limited funds available, solutions should be developed which can be integrated in the mainstream of education. Basic skills and relevant information should be integrated into a new curricula for primary schools as well as into all teacher training curricula, skills and information on, for example, children in need of special support to overcome traumatic war experiences, sight or hearing impairment or the loss of a close relative due to AIDS. Multiple approaches firmly embedded in the mainstream of education, are therefore needed. The practice of these new basic skills for teachers will result in a more caring school environment where teachers will be better equipped to detect minor impairments, to observe and stimulate children, to better listen to children and where children have more opportunities for play and for self-expression.

Community Involvement and Responsibility for Primary Education

The extent of parental and community involvement in the four countries vary. In Rwanda and Uganda a system for parental and community involvement is in place. This greatly contributes to the functioning of schools in these countries. This tradition has been weakened in the emergency areas as a result of destruction and displacement. In Southern Sudan and Somalia primary education was almost entirely financed by the central government in pre-war days, resulting in limited involvement of local community and parents in primary education. As a result of their non-involvement in primary school affairs most parents are unaware of educational problems and neither monitor nor support the pupils, their own children. The already high repetition and drop-out rate is further aggravated by parents who are not involved in 'school business' as a member of the Parent/Teacher Association (PTA), for example, or the Community Education Committee (CEC) or who never talk with their children about school life. If parents have never been to school themselves it may very well further contribute to their apathy towards school activities.

In emergency situations where the position of local authorities has been weakened or no longer exists, community involvement and responsibility for education becomes key for the good functioning of a school. During the establishment or 'resurrection' of schools,
experience has shown that there is in general a willingness of parents to assist. After opening the new school their involvement in the further development of the school is often limited to the visit of the annual evening for parents where issues like school discipline, school fees and pedagogical issues are discussed. No other defined duties and responsibilities are shared between the school and parents. The establishment process however provides an immense opportunity for teachers and head teachers of primary schools, if trained, to advocate for, to motivate and to organise community/parents involvement. The establishment and training of a ‘school committee’ should therefore go parallel with the re-establishment of a school. With the assistance of local government and other agencies/NGOs, parents can be a major force in the construction, rehabilitation and management of schools, especially in an emergency situation.

UNICEF education programmes generally stress the importance of strengthening community or parent committees by, for example, defining the limits of authority and accountability, guaranteeing adequate finances and building capacity in performing new roles. However, with the exception of the UNICEF Somalia Office which actively supports the training of Community Education Committees, no efforts have been made to seriously develop such a strategy for emergency areas. This could indicate a lack of knowledge and experience in this field.

Procurement, Delivery and Monitoring of Supplies

The main pillar of support given by the UNICEF Education Sections in Rwanda and Uganda is the provision of supplies. In the other two countries provision of supplies has been reduced considerably during recent years for different reasons. Most of the supplies were ordered from abroad. Some supplies were purchased in-country. Supplies such as rubber balls, were already in store. In Rwanda and Uganda schools were mainly provided with plastic sheeting, blackboards, chalk, slates, exercise books, pencils etc. Some of these items such as blackboards, chalk and slates immediately contribute to the functioning of schools and are therefore considered to be more important than items such as pencil sharpeners, erasers and exercise books. The provision of some items such as tents and rubber balls were considered not to be suitable and/or too expensive for temporary classrooms. Besides these supplies are reducing the opportunity for the community to become more involved in school-related activities. The plastic sheeting in combination with local construction materials has been used effectively for the construction of temporary classrooms.

The procurement of emergency supplies is only effective, if they are appropriate to the learning context and if delivered in a timely manner. In the past there have been a number of cases where poor quality locally procured supplies were delivered. Procurement and delivery of emergency supplies often took more time than expected. Despite efforts to make UNICEF’s supply system ‘more emergency friendly’, there were still quite some ‘lost in the pipeline cases’ registered. Inappropriate, poor quality and delayed supplies
negatively affect the implementation of the overall programme and the working relations with counterparts.

In addition to timely delivery of appropriate supplies, effective distribution of the emergency supplies in circumstances characterised by insecurity, lack of functioning systems, lack of communication, etc., is crucial. Distribution of supplies requires considerable amount of staff time to ensure systematic inspection, proper storage, distribution and monitoring of supplies.

While Rwanda and Operation Lifeline Sudan education sections have recruited an assistant for supplies, not all countries had a well functioning supply management system with adequately defined and assigned responsibilities.

All offices are involved in provision of various supplies, all with their own intrinsic issues, their own difficulties, their own solutions. Too many activities supported by too many different supplies spread over a vast geographic area without having a good management and monitoring system in place have contributed to loss and inefficient use of school supplies, especially text books and exercise books.

Monitoring

Hardly any systematic monitoring of activities and supplies takes place. Even in countries where comprehensive monitoring plans have been developed there was no up-to-date and information system available to review. Good initiatives to integrate monitoring of all emergency activities as part of field trips of UNICEF staff were taken in Rwanda and Uganda. However these initiatives were not integrated into a functioning system. There are various reasons for the weaknesses in monitoring, such as long distances, lack of accessibility of areas, lack of communication infrastructure, insecurity, and other tasks and priorities which prevent UNICEF staff from leaving the office, etc. However monitoring in the field remains crucial for an effective ongoing response to often quickly changing emergency situations. Monitoring of emergency education should include inspection of supplies and monitoring of distribution of supplies, as well as special activities in light of changing situations. Such monitoring requires not only registration skills but also the analytical skills of the relevant UNICEF staff.

Staff Issues

It was noticed that in three of the four countries, the Chief of the Education Section does not have an education background. Very few staff members, either international or national, involved in the implementation of UNICEF emergency education programmes can be considered to be educationists 'pur sang'. The term educationist refers to a person with a combination of knowledge about and experience in education systems, education planning, in change processes, research and teaching. For most of the international staff
members it was their first international posting with UNICEF. Most of the staff thus lacks both international/UNICEF and emergency experience. Within UNICEF there seems to be a tendency to post new international staff to emergency countries rather than using more experienced education staff to serve in these posts.

It was further noticed that filling vacancies tended to take a long time and that during long leave periods such as maternity leave, staff members are not replaced. This is a clear omission for an organisation which is focused on children and their mothers and may cause unnecessary set backs or delays in programme development and implementation and stress for staff members.

Funding

A key problem for all UNICEF Country Offices in addressing emergency situations is funding. For many years the UNICEF Somalia and UNICEF OLS Offices have not had a country programme agreed with a government. Their programmes are emergency based. Both the UNICEF Rwanda and Uganda offices have a country programme with the national government, and dealing with emergencies was not a new phenomenon for them. As a result there were some old, not totally exhausted 'emergency PPAs' and/or supplies in store available to satisfy the first and immediate needs. The initial budgets have been stretched to the maximum extent to meet the most urgent needs. Little funding now remains.

During the last years all four offices launched special interagency appeals for emergency funds: OLS Sudan and Somalia to meet the needs of flood and drought victims; Rwanda and Uganda to be able to deal with the emergencies caused by insurgency. With the exception of the 1999 appeal for Uganda, none of the programmes targeted primary education. This implies that education in emergency is not yet perceived by either UNICEF or authorities concerned, as an integral part of emergency assistance for the first phase and even for later phases of a new emergency. However, as has been stated earlier, timely mobilisation of funds is key for an effective education response in an emergency situation.

It is very important for children in emergency situations to return from the very first moment possible to a 'normal life' situation. Education serves a critical role in normalising the life of children who used to go to school. Though education is seldom included in an initial emergency response, the continuation of primary school learning - characterised by the re-opening of primary schools, the re-establishing of school routines, and by the provision of basic educational materials to pupils and teachers - will decrease psychosocial stress and will directly contribute to strengthening rehabilitation and post-emergency development. Resumption of schooling should therefore take place as soon as the pre-conditions concerning the safety of learners are assured, and preferably within the schooling context known. Despite the above compelling arguments, it is difficult for
UNICEF - and for other organisations - to mobilise funds for education in emergency situations. Donors in general, are responding to emergency situations by supporting the immediate food and health needs. They should be made aware of the importance of addressing the educational needs of children in emergency or crisis situations.

1.8 Recommendations from the Assessment

Assessment

Recommendation 1: A clear understanding of the development of the education system, its potential before the emergency and how the current emergency situation is affecting the system, should continuously guide UNICEF's immediate and longer term response to education in emergency situations.

Recommendation 2: The UNICEF education staff in emergency countries should be involved in the assessment of the situation of education and in strategizing for an effective education response from the earliest stage of the emergency.

Development/reconstruction of an education system

Recommendation 3: UNICEF's response should feed into development of special policy and instruments for education in emergency and well co-ordinated support with a view to contribute to stable and progressive recovery from an emergency situation.

Recommendation 4: UNICEF should contribute to the development and or strengthening of an emergency management information system.

Teacher training

Recommendation 5: UNICEF should advocate the introduction of a more caring and supportive learning environment to create a child-friendly environment in the school which will be in particular beneficial for war-traumatised children.

Recommendation 6: UNICEF should advocate at national level to train teachers during regular pre- and in-service teacher training in dealing with unforeseen (emergency) situations.

Recommendation 7: UNICEF should become more aware about the importance to develop more efficient selection mechanisms for pre- and in service teacher training.

Recommendations 8 (for Rwanda and Uganda): UNICEF to advocate the development of a teacher training course for trained and untrained teachers to address the specific
educational needs in emergency areas.

Recommendation 9 (for Rwanda and Uganda): UNICEF should contribute to capacity building of management cadres (district education officers, advisors/inspectors, head teachers, etc.) in emergency areas to address education in emergency issues and manage education in emergency situations through developing a short specific course.

Recommendation 10 (for Southern Sudan and Somalia): UNICEF to advocate the development of an in-service school-based teacher training which is an integral part of a community-based school improvement programme.

Parents/community

Recommendation 11: UNICEF should contribute to the further capacity development of community and parents capacity for increased involvement and responsibility as an important strategy for building strong support for education (education in emergencies).

Supply/finance

Recommendation 12: UNICEF should develop a more integrated, systematic and efficient approach to the selection, distribution and monitoring of supplies.

Recommendation 13: UNICEF should avoid haphazard supply related decisions and select, order and distribute supplies in accordance to a set strategy.

Recommendation 14: UNICEF should strengthen supply and financial procedures to facilitate flexible and fast delivery of emergency supplies for education.

Recommendation 15: UNICEF should further examine the need for capacity building for supply management.

Monitoring

Recommendation 16: UNICEF to consider setting minimum standards for monitoring education programmes in emergency situations, linked to strategies and policies.

UNICEF staffing

Recommendation 17: UNICEF human resources sections, particularly by HQ level, to ensure timely nomination and replacement of Education Section staff and ensure adequate education and emergency background of staff members in emergency countries.

Recommendation 18: UNICEF Country Offices to ensure the adequate expertise particularly for situation assessment and strategy and system development, where
necessary through the input of short term consultants.

**Recommendation 19:** *All UNICEF Country offices dealing with emergency education to appoint a specific Education Programme Assistant or consultant to assist with monitoring of programme implementation on the ground for the period of the emergency.*

**UNICEF training needs**

**Recommendation 20:** All UNICEF education staff members should be trained in assessment and management of education in emergency situations. ‘Education in emergency situation’ should be included in the standard training package for new UNICEF education staff.

**Recommendation 21:** UNICEF ESARO should assess the need for capacity building UNICEF staff on assessment skills and in enhancing community and parents’ involvement and responsibility for education in emergency situations.

**Recommendation 22:** UNICEF ESARO should continue to organise (regional) training workshops for education staff to internalise programme guidelines documents, to discuss the documents and exchange experience between UNICEF offices.

**Recommendation 23:** UNICEF ESARO to further assess the need for capacity building in monitoring for ensuring effective monitoring.

**Donors**

**Recommendation 24:** UNICEF Education Cluster, assisted by the Division of Communication and PFO, should strongly advocate to donors about the importance of support for education in emergency as an integral part of the response to emergencies.

*UNICEF’s Education Response to Emergencies in four African Countries, 2000*
II EDUCATION IN EMERGENCY SITUATIONS: RWANDA

2.1 Introduction

This present chapter on Rwanda consists of five sections preceded by an introduction. Section 2.2 summarises the recent history of Rwanda, the destruction and reconstruction of the education system and describes the present system since 1994. This is detailed to highlight the enormous efforts and progress made since the destruction of the system in 1994. Section 2.3 summarises the observations made and the information acquired during the field visit to Ruhengeri. Section 2.4 describes UNICEF's response to the most recent emergency. Section 2.5 notes the conclusions and the specific recommendations for Rwanda are given in Section 2.6.

Organisation of the Visit to Rwanda

The consultant visited Rwanda from 9 to 15 May 1999. The Deputy Representative of UNICEF and the National Officer for Basic Education held a short briefing meeting at the UNICEF Office. The post of International Education Officer had been vacant since October 1998. Thereafter a series of meetings were organised to meet government officials, UNICEF staff members, UN security and staff members of other UN agencies and NGOs. Considerable time was spending in searching for and studying relevant literature. A field trip to Ruhengeri and Gisenyi was scheduled to take place from 11 to 14 May. However upon arrival in Ruhengeri we were informed that Goma, the Zairian town cross border of Gisenyi, was bombed by Zairian Government planes, resulting in the cancellation of the Gisenyi leg of the field trip. During the field trip and some of the meetings the UNICEF National Programme Officer accompanied the consultant. The field trip to Ruhengeri had its limitations due to the need to travel to Ruhengeri town in a scheduled WFP food convoy and the need to be escorted by motorised security guards within Ruhengeri Province. Since the latter were not available we had to travel with food convoys when available, which restricted opportunities to visit schools.

2.2 Present Situation of Education in Rwanda

Background

During the massive return to Rwanda in late 1996 of those who had fled across the border after the 1994 genocide to the Democratic Republic of the Congo (DRC), many hostile elements (interhamwe militia and ex-soldiers) infiltrated the hundreds of thousands of returnees. Until early 1997, incidents of insecurity were sporadic. From the middle to late 1997, however, there were indiscriminate attacks by the bacengezi or infiltrators on settlements, schools and public transport, and more targeted attacks on communal prisons.
and refugee camps in the provinces of Ruhengeri and Gisenyi. These violent acts – which were carried out with total disregard for the ethnic identity of the victims - caused the death of more than 1,500 people. The violence caused by the infiltrators increasingly hindered the return of rural dwellers to their farms and, due to the lack of existing village structures in the rural areas, the population began to seek refuge in the areas protected by the Government, using them as safe havens for their families. By October 1998 nearly 600,000 people were displaced and by the end of 1998 this number had grown to over 650,000 people. Most of the displaced were seeking refuge in areas near commune or district offices protected by Rwandan People’s Army (RPA) troops. The 17 makeshift camps housed over 446,000 persons while 205,000 displaced persons were living with friends, relatives or in public buildings. A new emergency was born.

**Destroyed Infrastructure**

The genocide that was engineered in Rwanda during spring 1994 resulted in the death of an estimated 800,000 of its citizens and the subsequent flight of more than 2,100,000 Rwandans. After four months of massacres all over the country Kigali was liberated by the troops of the RPA in July 1994. The government of national unity, which was constituted in the same month, affirmed its commitment to the Arusha Peace Accords of 1993. Rwandese who left the country as early as 1959 started to return from neighbouring countries and from countries all over the world. At the end of 1996, within 2 months, more than 1,100,000 refugees returned from Zaire and Tanzania to Rwanda. As a consequence of two resettlement operations, the population of the 12 Rwandan provinces increased considerably, ranging from 10 % up to 85 %.

The two main problems the country faced after the genocide, were the destroyed infrastructure, and the loss of skilled personnel at all levels. At the national level of the education system, the MINEDUC or Ministry of Education, the National Printing Press, and other educational institutions were severely damaged. In the provinces, school buildings were damaged, and school furniture and equipment, school supplies and records, were destroyed or stolen.

**The Emergency Response of 1994-1995**

As early as July 1994, under UNESCO with its regional Programme for Emergency Education and Reconstruction (PEER), UNHCR and UNICEF, joined efforts in setting-up a rapid educational response in the first phase of the emergency. The main strategy was to create a bridge between the absence of schooling and the resumption of regular schooling by the distribution of 9,000 Teacher Emergency Packages or TEPs to establish 'mobile classrooms'.11 In 1994-1995 more than 11,000 teachers and parateachers were

---

11 TEP is a kit containing a self-sufficient “classroom”. UNESCO developed the kit in 1994 as a quick response to address many of the immediate education priorities confronting emergency affected populations. UNICEF's *Education Response to Emergencies in four African Countries*, 2000
rapidly inserviced. As a result the direct educational needs of 720,000 children were met. Subsequently, the rebuilding and rehabilitation of classrooms started. Now, in 1999, Rwanda has almost finalised its rehabilitation and is making substantial progress in the development of the country. However, the remaining political and socio-economic problems to be addressed are numerous, not the least to say the fragile peace line.

The Administrative System

Rwanda is made up of 12 provinces, headed by a préfet or provincial commissioner, 154 districts or communes, each of which is governed by a bourgemestre or district commissioner; approximately 1,500 secteurs or sub-districts are run by councillors, and more than 8,600 cellules or locations. The smallest unit is the njumbakumi (clusters of 10 homesteads). The district or commune is the smallest functioning administrative unit. The sub-districts, locations and njumbakumi have no legal status. This decentralised structure is nonetheless rather hierarchical as individuals and local communities are not really part of this organisation. Except for two provinces, Gisenyi and Ruhengeri in the western part of the country, Rwanda has moved from an emergency into a developmental stage.

Education is expected to play a key role in three macro policies: poverty eradication, economic growth, and national reconciliation and national unity.

The Education System

Below the primary school system Rwanda has a pre-school system. The main role of the government is to facilitate the establishment of pre-schools by the private and NGO sector, implying that the Ministry of Education does not operate pre-schools themselves. There are at present only 138 centres functioning as compared with 530 centres before 1994. The pre-school system is embryonic, limited to the towns and remains without a systematic development policy.

Less than one percent of 3 to 6-year-olds are attending pre-school establishments. To support the establishment of pre-schools, the Ministry of Education runs an Experimental Centre for Pre-School Activities which is mainly responsible for training of pre-school teachers, designing and producing of pre-school materials.

The primary school system has two cycles of three years: Grades 1-3 include the lower primary cycle and Grades 4-6 include the upper primary cycle. The official entry age for primary school is seven years, which will be changed to six years in the near future. Primary schooling is compulsory for all school age children. Grade 6 pupils sit for the certificat d'école primaire or primary school certificate. Since 1996, the language of instruction in lower primary is the national language, Kinyarwanda, while French (for the majority) or English are the media of instruction in upper primary. In order to respond to communities in Rwanda, translating the TEP used in Somalia into Kinyarwanda.

37

UNICEF's Education Response to Emergencies in four African Countries, 2000
demand, a double shift system functions, mainly in Grades 1-3.

There are two types of secondary schools: junior secondary schools of four years and full high schools of six years. Since 1995, the six years’ course has been comprised of two three-year-cycles with a general course in the first and the second leading to the certificat d'école national or A-level, with three elective streams: (a) academic secondary education for university preparation, (b) technical/vocational education and (c) teacher training. The medium of instruction is French or English.

School Management and Administration

After the tragic events of April-July 1994 the authorities managed to bring normalcy quickly back to the post-war situation by re-opening primary schools as soon as possible, starting in September 1994. The school year was completed by December. The following school year ran from January to September 1995. The next school year started in October 1995 and managed to run almost at par with the traditional September-June schedule. This was seen to be a major achievement since no school years were lost.

In 1997 the two main ministries involved in education merged to form a single ministry, the Ministry of Education, responsible for the management of education at all levels. At the provincial level there are the Inspecteurs d'Arrondissement or Chief Inspectors (12), who are assisted by Assistant Inspectors of Schools. They are responsible for the overall supervision, for monitoring of the curricula and for the smooth running of primary schools. However, in practice their support to schools and to individual teachers is minimal, owing to their lack of training in professional skills and inadequate material (transport) resources. At district level the Inspecteurs de Secteur or sub-district inspectors (153) are responsible for the supervision of teachers and for data collection. A total number of 675 head teachers are appointed to manage 1,991 primary schools, implying that a single head manages two or more schools.

Curriculum

The primary curriculum covers 12 subjects. The first two grades of primary school have 10 subjects. In Grades 4 to 6 there are 12 subjects. The core subjects are language (Kinyarwanda/French) and mathematics. Important subjects like science and technology are only minimally included under the subject Hygiene.

The National Centre for Curriculum Development is in charge of the development of curricula for all levels of education. In 1996 an exercise to review the curriculum was undertaken to assess contemporary needs and the needs of the future. A new primary school curriculum was developed. This was necessary to harmonise the existing curriculum in line with the various curricula followed by Rwandans while in exile. No
main changes were made for the core subjects. The number of subjects, subject content and curriculum relevance for development were not considered.

Further reform of the syllabi, especially the reinforcement of science and technology and the printing of teacher guides for the core subjects mathematics, French and English, are envisaged in the Plan of Action for Education in Rwanda 1998-2000.
Coverage and Enrolment

**Pre-primary schooling:** During the 1997/1998 school year a total number of 138 preschools, all private, 1,991 primary schools and 255 secondary schools (of which 123 are private), were functioning. There are three primary schools for special education, two for the deaf and one for the blind.

**Primary schooling:** In 1998 there were 1,438,776 primary school age children, 776,939 girls or 54 per cent of the total age group; and 661,837 boys or 46 per cent of the total age group. This substantial difference between the absolute number of boys and girls may be explained by the fact that the *interhamwe* militias targeted (Tutsi) boys and may have killed more boys than girls across the nation. However, the number of boys (636,678) enrolled at primary school in 1998 is almost equal to the number of girls (636,729). This indicates an important difference between the overall gross enrolment ratio in primary education between boys and girls, 96 per cent boys compared with 82 per cent girls, a 14 percentage point gender difference. Due to the high numbers of overage children entering primary schools after the genocide, gross enrolment ratio increased from 85 per cent in 1996 to 89 per cent in 1998. The net enrolment ratio did not follow this pattern. It decreased from 70 per cent in 1996 to 65 per cent in 1998, 69 per cent for boys and 61 per cent for girls (an eight percentage point gender difference). This may be explained by the arrival of the returnees, many of who had been out of school for a number of years during their exile. Comparing the overall GER with NER, there is an indication of considerable overage enrolment in the system since the NER is 24 percentage points below the GER.

**Performance: Repetition and Dropout**

Statistics show that less than a third (30.79%) of the children are reaching Grade 6 without repeating any class (percentage of children reaching Grade 6 as compared to the percentage of children enrolled in Grade 1 six years earlier). The actual number of students, which completed primary school in 1996, was 68,442. There is good reason to believe that the events of 1994 and the aftermath contributed in a major way to the low completion rate but at the same time it is a cause of concern and an indicator of low quality of schooling. There is no significant gender difference in the dropout rates. A number of vulnerable groups have very low participation in education: children of the poorest income groups, especially girl-headed ‘households’, that is, children looked after by their older sister; the children of female-headed households; and children with disabilities. Though there is a substantial enrolment of poor children in Grades 1-3, their number drops in the higher grades. This is mainly due to increasing direct costs such as

---

12 Rwanda's statistics should, but do not always, take account of the population changes resulting from the genocide and the huge movements, which took place after the genocide. The numbers being educated outside Rwanda are not recognised in the statistics.


*UNICEF's Education Response to Emergencies in four African Countries, 2000*
school uniforms, regular fees for examinations, stationery fees, mathematics and science sets, that were not required in lower primary and the opportunity costs of foregoing children’s labour input in the home.\textsuperscript{14}

In 1991-92 the average dropout rate was 19 per cent. The national dropout rate for Grade 1 is currently 28.7 per cent as compared to 24.8 per cent for Grade 6. The average dropout rate is 25.5 per cent per grade. This indicates that dropout rates are similar through primary grades. The proportion of dropouts has increased during the last years of the decade, due to the number of children killed and traumatised by the events of 1994. A second factor is arrival of returnees, which may have affected the dropout rate. Late entrants into the system may be dropping out earlier than other children. According to the teachers interviewed there is little evidence of traumatised children in primary school.

**Learning Assessment and Exams**

Pupils achieving 50 per cent marks at the end of the year are promoted to the next class. Teachers make the final decision on promotion. The teacher is required to test pupils on their learning achievement at the end of each term. Marks given for homework, and the term and annual examination marks, determine the promotion rates of pupils. None of these tests are standardised. They are set by the (qualified or unqualified) class teacher or by a group of teachers.

Another indicator of the low quality of primary schooling is the pass rate in the primary school leaving examination. At the end of Grade 6 children sit for the public primary school certificate, in Kinyarwanda/French and mathematics.\textsuperscript{15} This exam is used mainly as a selection instrument for secondary education. In 1998 just over 60,000 pupils completed primary school with a certificate, of a total of more than 253,000 who entered the cohort six years before. The completion rate (24 per cent) indicated gender parity in achievement.

The number of places available at secondary school is limited. Passing the primary examination does not guarantee a place in secondary school. This probably has a negative impact on the motivation of primary pupil (and parents) and is likely to affect drop-out rates in upper primary classes.

**Teachers and Teacher Training**

By 1996 the numbers of teachers in school were roughly equal to those before the war. However, the war had a significant impact on the proportion of unqualified teachers in the profession. In 1997 it was estimated that about 51 per cent of the teachers were

\textsuperscript{14} Cost and Financing of Primary Education, Abagi & Owino, 1998, MINEDUC/UNICEF, Rwanda
\textsuperscript{15} Children and Women of Rwanda, UNICEF, 1997, Rwanda

UNICEF's Education Response to Emergencies in four African Countries, 2000
untrained as compared with 40 per cent in 1993. This rate is one of the highest rates of untrained teachers in Africa. Untrained teachers include drop-outs from the secondary system and primary school leavers and those who failed for their final primary school examination. Qualified teachers are those who completed the teacher training option at senior secondary school or who have been trained outside Rwanda. Though there were no statistics available, there are indications that about 60 per cent of the teachers are female. This indicates that Rwanda should train more male teachers in future.

At primary level a total of 22,638 primary school teachers were teaching more than 1,273,000 pupils. During the 1997/1998 school year the overall teacher/pupil ratio was 1:53. One year later, in 1998/1999, it was 1:55. It is expected to remain at this level up to the year 2005. In Ruhengeri 59 per cent of the teachers are trained, which is higher than the national average.

The teacher/pupil ratio varies substantially from class to class within districts and from district to district. For example, in Kigali Rural the Grade 1 – 6 teacher/pupil ratio varies between 1:90 in Grade 1 and 1:38 in Grade 6 and between Kigali Town District and Umutara District it varies from 1:71 to 1:91.16

Until recently, primary teacher training was carried out in the upper grades of the 70 senior secondary schools. Only 25 per cent of the curriculum of these schools was devoted to teacher training and 75 per cent was given to general subjects – and the trainees/pupils are very young. More than 7,800 students are currently enrolled in teacher training in secondary schools. UNICEF is currently involved in establishing an in-service training for unqualified teachers with a secondary school certificate.

The Government has realised the unsatisfactory nature of current teacher training provision and is accelerating the introduction of a new system for pre-service teacher training by establishing 12 Teacher Training Colleges, one in each province, by the year 2001.

Teaching/Learning Materials

After the war UNICEF provided thousands of TEPs to schools. But these supplies dried up long ago. During recent years teaching/learning materials and aids have been distributed by the Government and by different agencies - but supplies remain inadequate. Still lacking in most schools are: minimal support mechanisms for teachers, such as teaching guides and textbooks, print materials, and teaching aids for mathematics classes, such as blackboard rulers, globes, maps and learners' materials for geography, science and technology. The quality and quantity of the teaching and learning materials available in primary school is insufficient. The materials available are not up-to-date and supporting equipment is often not around at all. On average, the teachers have only 30 per

---

16 Study of the Education Sector, MINEDUC/UNICEF, 1997, Kigali, Rwanda
42

UNICEF's Education Response to Emergencies in four African Countries, 2000
cent of the necessary reference materials and pupils have only 25 per cent of the basic learning materials such as textbooks and stationery. This situation is even more acute for orphans and disabled children, for children who head households and for children from low-income families. As a result of the current poverty levels, many of these children attend primary schools without having the essential writing materials, such as slates/exercise books and slate pencils, chalk or pencils. This must affect their learning considerably. The situation is made worse when these (poor) children attend poor schools without the basic learning facilities and equipment, and schools without classrooms or desks.

Community Support and Parent Committees

All schools have a parents’ committee, le conseil du centre scolaire pour l'enseignement. Besides the organisation of the annual evening for parents, this committee is responsible for:

- mobilising resources to finance school supplies, and for maintenance materials for the school and, if needed, additional school construction
- advising the teachers on student and teacher discipline
- checking and approving the financial and annual reports of the head

The main direct support of parents to the school is the payment of school fees and assistance in school (re) construction.

At each level of the administrative system, there are education advisory committees. A Comité d'Éducation or Education Committee functions at every level. It is composed of various members of the community, including the local education authorities, teachers and parents. The education committee at district (commune) level is the most powerful. This is mainly due to the tax-raising powers at district level for the support of the establishment and the management of the basic education infrastructure, including the building of schools.

School Buildings and Shelter

In the course of the 1994 events, 60 percent of primary school classrooms were destroyed or damaged. With the support of the World Bank, UNICEF, UNDP and NGOs, almost 5,000 classrooms have been constructed and rehabilitated, bringing the total to more than 23,000 classrooms. However, the infrastructure remains inadequate and besides the awaited rehabilitation and construction of more than 9,400 classrooms, many more have to be constructed.17 Based on the 1998 average number of pupils in a classroom, about

17 Sectoral Consultation, Education, 1998, Government of Rwanda
43

UNICEF's Education Response to Emergencies in four African Countries, 2000
36,850 classrooms, an increase of about 60 per cent is required to achieve the goals set for the year 2005. Recent plans foresee the construction of more than 5,000 additional classrooms leaving thus a considerable gap, a gap of more than 27,000 classrooms are still to build.18

There is no recent data on the sanitation facilities available and functioning in the schools. However, in light of the recent construction and rehabilitation of classrooms it is estimated that a little over 20 per cent of the schools have an adequate number of functioning sanitation facilities.

2.3 Situation of Education in the Areas Visited

General Situation

In view of continuing insurgency and subsequent displacement of people, WFP started in April 1998 to provide emergency food aid to the massive numbers of internally displaced people in the province of Gisenyi and later to Ruhengeri. In 1998 in both Gisenyi and Ruhengeri provinces the insurgents increasingly targeted schools. As a result many schools were left in shambles, property was destroyed, and some of the students were traumatised. In Ruhengeri particularly primary education was disrupted by the massive displacement of the population, teachers and students alike. This led to the closure of most primary schools by November 1998.

In late October 1998, in response to the growing emergency in the Northwest, the Government formed a multi-ministerial committee to co-ordinate the response to the crisis and called for UN and NGO support in areas of water and sanitation, shelter and education. As a result of the ministerial efforts a joint humanitarian assistance group was established under the leadership of OCHA in November 1998, including UN agencies and NGOs operating in the Northwest. UNICEF is an active member in the humanitarian assistance group. The focus of the assistance has been and still is mainly food, health and shelter.

To alleviate unhealthy living conditions in the overpopulated camps for displaced people, the Government of Rwanda started to implement umudugu or planned group settlements. This is a kind of continuation of a policy that was implemented earlier in Rwanda to resettle displaced people. These camps were established by the government to protect the vast growing number of displaced people during the summer and increasingly during the fall of 1998. As early as December 1998 the MoE reopened schools in displacement and relocation sites. In support of the reopening of the schools, UNICEF transported previously donated educational materials to schools in Gisenyi and, from April 1999 onwards, to Ruhengeri. Although the international community agreed to assist the


UNICEF's Education Response to Emergencies in four African Countries, 2000
Government with the resettlement, it also requested two types of pledges from Government: the benign intent of the Government's policy on "villagisation"; and the passing of land tenure laws which would allow for secure possession of land.

Management and Administration of Emergency Education

In December 1998 the educational authorities of Gisenyi started to re-open schools in the displacement and relocation sites. The schools which were not affected by attacks and which have not been moved, are functioning to some extent, and the teachers, heads and inspectors are at work. The schools operating in the affected provinces, in Ruhengeri and Gisenyi, are all functioning under the Rwandan national school system. The Inspecteurs d'Arrondissement, assisted by their Assistant Inspectors of Schools, have their offices in Gisenyi and Ruhengeri towns, which have not been affected by the conflict. Though they are responsible for overall supervision, monitoring of the curricula in use and the functioning of the schools, their assistance to affected communities is limited by their lack of resources. A Donor Alert and a UN Joint Appeal did not result in funds for primary education. Except for some UNICEF support to the Government and some minor assistance by NGOs such as Caritas and Concern, no special support is being provided to the affected school communities or to the local education authorities.

Special Support

In classrooms a variety of pedagogical practices can be observed. While some teachers are aware of and pay attention to the special needs of some pupils, most teachers use classical plenary class teaching methods. Unfortunately, teachers do not challenge the individual pupil, do not pay attention to individual pupils and do not support special needs. During the field visit there was no mention of developing special strategies teaching to cope with past negative experiences. It was surprising that when asked, none of the teachers, headmasters or inspectors acknowledged the incidence of children traumatised by the events of the recent emergency. This could be explained, according to them, by the fact that families moved together with their communities, as a group, from place to place, from settlement to imudugudu. Children were not separated from their parents nor isolated from their peer group, except in cases of violence. There have been isolated violent incidents, but no mass killings.

To further strengthen the situation of primary education the Government organised education campaigns in the form of solidarity camps to enhance a spirit of peace and patriotism of the returnees in displaced communities.19

19 Programme for the relief and the reintegration of the Northwest internally displaced people, Vincent Karega, 1999, Republic of Rwanda

UNICEF’s Education Response to Emergencies in four African Countries, 2000
Coverage

At the beginning of the 1997/1998 school year 95,531 children were enrolled in the schools of Ruhengeri and Gisenyi Provinces. Due to the regular attacks on schools during the same school year in both provinces most school programmes were suspended. In Ruhengeri Province particularly, schooling was further disrupted by the displacement of the population due to insecurity later in the school year. The result was that at the end of 1998 only 30,848 pupils were enrolled. Meaning that more than 67 percent of the children enrolled at the beginning of the school year dropped out of school due to continuing insecurity. However with the establishment of the Umudugudu Camps the number of students increased again. Reports from two districts, Nyarutovu and Nyamugali, note that 29 of the 31 schools are open again.20

Performance

In 1998 the activities of insurgents caused serious population displacement. No information has yet been collected on the effects of the displacement on the performance of pupils. However, there is reason to believe that the learning of children has been negatively affected due to:

- reduction of teaching time - as a result of double shifts, especially in the lower classes, using the same teachers;
- increased number of untrained teachers;
- lack of textbooks;
- very limited teaching and learning aids;
- emotional effects of the insurgency on communities and teachers.

Teaching and Learning

Most teachers have low or outdated qualifications. Yet they do not benefit from

20 Education Report, Ruhengeri Prefecture, Concern, 1999, Kigali Rwanda
46

UNICEF's Education Response to Emergencies in four African Countries, 2000
satisfactory supervision or support from advisors. The school environment (state of the buildings, shortage of teacher materials), the heavy workload in the overcrowded classrooms and low salaries, provide little motivation. And, teachers are also parents, and have had their share of recent misery and tragedy, with the resulting personal problems.

Though reports indicate that classes are overcrowded this could not be confirmed during the visits made to schools in Ruhengeri Province.

During the field visits it was observed that most of the classrooms was teacher centred. The instruction was classical, with class dictation and a great deal of rote learning. When there were blackboard exercises for individual students there was no feed-back to other pupils. This type of teaching does not motivate pupils to become involved in the learning process and results not only in very passive students but also in pupils who are excluded from the learning process. No evidence was found of analytical or creative skill development among pupils. The approach of the teachers was, however, without exception, gentle and supportive of pupils. No insults, offensive or abusive language, or (corporal) punishment were observed. In spite of the rather dull teaching methodology, the children were remarkably joyful and creative outside the classroom when playing, singing and dancing.

There was no evidence of any testing except for spelling tests on slates, which were remarkably well organised with the children sitting separately, outside on the grass. The teachers monitored the test well. In the upper classes, handwriting in the exercise books was neat and in every exercise book there was evidence of the teachers’ marks and comments.

Teaching and Learning Materials

Since the end of 1994 until now, UNICEF assisted the Government of Rwanda in reprinting of more than 1,400,000 Grades 1-3 textbooks, mainly in Kinyarwanda and Arithmetic. It is expected that by the end of the 1998/1999 school year there will be one textbook per two children for these subjects. In Ruhengeri and Gisenyi this target will not be met as a result of the recent violence and the destruction caused by rebels, the subsequent displacement and the arrival of returnees.

Teaching and learning conditions have deteriorated to such an extent that most of the teachers have virtually no teaching materials to support them. The number of textbooks is very limited in the country. Though the pre-war situation was already far from positive, the conflict left most schools without any pedagogical materials. Most of the schools have been re-opened by now but the distribution of school supplies has been limited and is insufficient to cover the needs.