

# REACHING THE MDGS IN SOUTH ASIA: AN INVENTORY OF PUBLIC POLICIES TO OVERCOME SOCIAL EXCLUSION

WORKING PAPER



REGIONAL OFFICE  
FOR SOUTH ASIA  
JANUARY 2008

unite for  
children

unicef 



**REACHING THE MDGS IN SOUTH ASIA:  
AN INVENTORY OF PUBLIC POLICIES  
TO OVERCOME SOCIAL EXCLUSION**

Gabriele Köhler  
Regional Advisor on Social Policy  
Regional Office for South Asia (ROSA)  
UNICEF

Mariana Stirbu  
Project Officer, Social Policy  
Regional Office for South Asia (ROSA)  
UNICEF

**Reaching the MDGs in South Asia: An Inventory of Public Policies to Overcome Social Exclusion**

© United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF), New York, 2008

**UNICEF Regional Office for South Asia (ROSA)**

**PO Box 5815**

**Lekhnath Marg**

**Kathmandu**

**Nepal**

**January 2008**

**This is a working document. It has been prepared to facilitate the exchange of knowledge and to stimulate discussion.**

**The findings, interpretations and conclusions expressed in this paper are those of the author(s) and do not necessarily reflect the policies or views of UNICEF**

**The text has not been edited to official publication standards and UNICEF accepts no responsibility for errors.**

**The designations in this publication do not imply an opinion on legal status of any country or territory, or of its authorities, or the delimitation of frontiers.**

## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

As part of our work on social policy in South Asia, we shared or presented earlier versions of this overview to colleagues, government policy makers and academics at various training courses, workshops and symposia. We also presented an earlier version to the team of regional advisors and other experts at UNICEF ROSA. Many of these experts vetted the approach and provided information and amendments. We thank in particular Suleiman Braimoh, Jean Drèze, Susan Durston, Gaspar Fajth, William Fellows, Elizabeth Gibbons, Jas Kaminski, David Parker, Frances Turner and Adriana Zarrelli for helpful comments and observations. Marie-Caroline Dodé and Jennifer Keane provided excellent research support.

AusAID provided a generous grant to UNICEF ROSA that has enabled this work.



# Table of Contents

	<u>Page</u>
Executive Summary .....	i
Resumen Ejecutivo .....	iii
Résumé Analytique.....	v
1. Reaching the MDGs in South Asia: An inventory of Public Policies to Overcome Social Exclusion.....	1
1.1. Background and rationale .....	1
1.2 Selection criteria for interventions.....	4
1.3 Purpose of the “inventory” and preliminary findings and observations.....	5
2. Interventions for Social Inclusion via the Political Domain.....	19
2.1. National Area-Based Development Programme (NABDP), Afghanistan, phase II (2006-2008) .....	19
2.2. Freedom of Information Act, India (2002- Present) .....	21
2.3. Representational Quotas for Women Councillors in Mumbai, India (1992-Present)....	22
2.4. Affirmative Action (Youth and Women), Nepal .....	23
2.5. Child Clubs, Nepal (Children’s and Youth’s participation) .....	24
2.6. Para-Legal Committees, Nepal (1999– present).....	25
2.7. National Gender Reform Action Plan (Grap), Pakistan (2005-present) .....	27
3. Interventions for Social Inclusion via the Economic Domain.....	29
3.1. Employment Schemes.....	29
3.2 Welfare Schemes/ Social Assistance .....	43
4. Interventions for Social Inclusion via the Social Domain .....	55
4.1. Education .....	55
4.2. Healthcare .....	64
4.3. Housing and Basic Social Services.....	70
4.4. Protection and Cross-Cutting areas (Including for migrants, IDPS, homeless, street children, etc.) .....	72
5. Intervention for Social Inclusion via the Fiscal Domain and Vulnerability Assessment Tools	77
5.1. National Livelihoods Based Food Security and Nutritional Surveillance System (NSS), Afghanistan (2003-present) .....	77
5.2. 20/20 Initiative for Basic Social Services, Bhutan .....	78
5.3. Gender Responsive Budgeting (GRB), India (2000- present).....	79
5.4. Participatory Budget Analysis in Gujarat, India and Performance Monitoring – Citizen Report Card, Bangalore, India .....	80
5.5. 20/20 Initiative for Basic Social Services, Nepal (1996-present).....	82
5.6. Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiative (GRBI), Pakistan (2005- present).....	83
6. Interventions for Social Inclusion in Post-Conflict and Fragile States.....	85
6.1. Food For Work, Part of Protracted Relief and Recovery Operation, Afghanistan (2003-present).....	85
6.2. Action Plan for Children Affected by War, Sri Lanka (2003-present).....	86
7. Bibliography .....	88



## Executive Summary

Social policy is concerned with social services, income distribution, social protection and social justice, and encompasses government interventions to support economic and social development. Social policy takes on different forms, shaped by history, institutions and culture, but in general presents government-led and -financed systems aimed at providing social services – public goods in education, health and other areas – , social security and social protection, and other measures to ensure social integration – all aimed at achieving high human development *as an end in itself* but also *as a means* to ensure stable macroeconomic and fiscal environments. That is why, in some countries, active employment strategies and technological innovation have also become part of social policy, as have the policies for economic development and poverty alleviation or eradication. In developing countries, social security tends to be under-developed, while social assistance or “safety nets” are taking on a greater role as a means to address acute poverty.

In South Asia, social policy has a long tradition, and the countries in the region are laboratories of government interventions of a social policy nature and design, offering a rich repository of experience for policy transfer within and outside the region. With such a strong social development tradition, it is no surprise that all eight countries in South Asia have committed to achieving the Millennium Declaration and the Millennium Development Goals. Despite this, there is a perceived disconnect between social policy aspirations and programmes on the one hand, and the consistently low performance in many parts of South Asia. Measured by the MDG indicators, South Asia is the poorest performing sub-region of Asia, and one of the poorest performing regions globally.

Only a few countries are on track to achieve all the MDG targets, and this is only at the aggregate level – sub-nationally and disaggregated by gender, ethnicity, or location, even the better performing countries continue to show wide disparities. The recent MDG progress reports predict that most countries will not achieve the goals and targets they had adopted at the Millennium Summit in the year 2000.

This “paradox” or disconnect of welfare states offering intricate social policy interventions but not succeeding in delivering corresponding socio-economic outcomes, seeks an explanation. Research by development organisations and some government counterparts shows that a key driver of this disconnect throughout South Asia appears to lie in processes of social exclusion, which undermine the effectiveness of social policy or MDG achievement. Social exclusion plays itself out on many levels and in many ways, including in the economic, the political and the social domains. Although less visible, social exclusion plays a role in budget allocation decisions, which indirectly affects development outcomes and most importantly: social exclusion is often exacerbated in emergency situations where the already vulnerable become even more marginalised and disadvantaged.

Social policy therefore needs to be designed and delivered in such a way that it fulfils the rights-based principle of universal coverage with at least basic social services, as enshrined in the international declarations and conventions, and national policy, and reconfirmed in the Millennium Declaration, and in addition, offers approaches to *enable* social inclusion. These would be different

forms of special measures for social inclusion – conceived to empower the socially excluded in these societies to claim their rights.

The inventory in this paper presents social policy interventions which seek to address one or several of five domains of social exclusion:

- 1) The political domain - such as affirmative action or measures to ensure accountability of governments - which might empower the socially excluded to claim their rights and entitlements;
- 2) The economic domain, which, if properly designed and implemented, provide the socially excluded with access to decent work, diversified livelihoods, income and assets. Examples include employment guarantee schemes, micro-financing, cash transfers to vulnerable families, and social transfers;
- 3) The social domain, such as through measures to ensure access to inclusive social services and benefits, for marginalised groups, including for migrants, refugees, internally displaced persons, and other groups not attended to in conventional mainstream social policy. This is because access to health, education and protection is a basic right, and also as a prerequisite to be productive members of society.
- 4) The fiscal domain which looks at the responsiveness of fiscal budgets to the rights of women, children and other socially excluded groups.
- 5) Interventions in post-conflict and fragile states, which address the rights of groups made vulnerable as a result of emergency and those whose vulnerability has increased further as a result of emergency or political conflicts, such as children, including children engaged in hazardous labour, street children, child soldiers and children affected by armed conflict.

The objective of the inventory is to come to a better understanding of the scope and design of current interventions, explore their potential impact on the situation of children, and eventually generate evidence-based policy advice for social inclusion, including for potential policy transfer within the South Asia region. The inventory also can serve to identify entry points for UNICEF – and other UN agencies – to scale up programmes for MDG achievement and child protection, by integrating with and mainstreaming into larger social policy interventions in the country concerned.

The selection is not exhaustive, but rather a work in progress and does not constitute an evaluation of the programmes presented.

## Resumen Ejecutivo

La política social se preocupa de los servicios sociales, la distribución de ingresos, la protección social y la justicia social, y abarca las intervenciones gubernamentales en apoyo al desarrollo económico y social. La política social asume formas diferentes, influida por la historia, las instituciones y la cultura, pero en general presenta sistemas dirigidos y financiados por el gobierno y destinados a proporcionar servicios sociales –bienes públicos en educación, salud y otras esferas–, seguridad social y protección social, así como otras medidas dirigidas a garantizar la integración social, todas ellas destinadas a lograr un desarrollo humano elevado *como un fin en sí mismo* pero también *como un medio* para garantizar entornos macroeconómicos y tributarios estables. Ésta es la razón por la que, en algunos países, las estrategias dinámicas de empleo y la innovación tecnológica se han convertido también en parte de la política social, al igual que las políticas para el desarrollo económico y el alivio o la erradicación de la pobreza. En los países en desarrollo, la seguridad social suele estar infradesarrollada, mientras que la asistencia social o las “estructuras de seguridad” asumen un mayor papel a la hora de abordar la pobreza aguda.

En Asia meridional, la política social tiene una larga tradición, y los países de la región son laboratorios de intervenciones gubernamentales de políticas sociales en su naturaleza y diseño, y ofrecen una reserva abundante de experiencias para la transferencia de políticas dentro y fuera de la región. Con una tradición de desarrollo social tan fuerte, no es una sorpresa el que los ocho países de Asia meridional se hayan comprometido a lograr la Declaración del Milenio y los Objetivos de Desarrollo del Milenio. A pesar de esto, se percibe una falta de conexión entre las aspiraciones y los programas en materia de política social, por una parte, y el bajo rendimiento constante que se produce en muchas partes de Asia meridional. Según los indicadores de los ODM, Asia meridional es la subregión de Asia donde el rendimiento es más débil, y una de las regiones del mundo con un rendimiento más débil.

Solamente unos cuantos países están bien encaminados para lograr todas las metas de los ODM, y esto ocurre solamente a escala agregada, ya que cuando se realizan desgloses subnacionales y por género, origen étnico o ubicación, incluso los países con mejor rendimiento siguen mostrando amplias disparidades. Los recientes informes sobre los progresos hacia los ODM predicen que la mayoría de los países no lograrán las metas y los objetivos que aprobaron en la Cumbre del Milenio en el año 2000.

Esta “paradoja” o desconexión en unos estados de bienestar que ofrecen intervenciones complejas de política social pero que no tienen éxito en lograr los resultados socioeconómicos correspondientes exige una explicación. Las investigaciones de las organizaciones dedicadas al desarrollo y algunos homólogos gubernamentales muestran que un elemento clave en esta desconexión en toda Asia meridional parece radicar en los procesos de exclusión social, que menoscaban la eficacia de la política social o los logros hacia los ODM. La exclusión social se produce a muchos niveles y de muchas maneras, como por ejemplo en los dominios económico, político y social. Aunque menos visible, la exclusión social desempeña un papel en las decisiones sobre asignaciones presupuestarias, que afectan indirectamente los resultados en materia de desarrollo y, lo que es más importante, las situaciones de emergencia agravan la exclusión social cuando las personas que ya son vulnerables caen en una situación de mayor marginación y desventaja.

Por tanto, es preciso diseñar y aplicar las políticas sociales de tal manera que satisfagan el principio basado en los derechos de cobertura universal con por lo menos servicios sociales básicos, como está consagrado en las declaraciones y convenciones internacionales y en las políticas nacionales, y se volvió a confirmar en la Declaración del Milenio, y, además, que ofrezcan enfoques para *facilitar* la inclusión social. Éstas serían modalidades diferentes de medidas especiales para la inclusión social, concebidas para dotar de autonomía a los excluidos sociales en estas sociedades, para que reclamen sus derechos.

El inventario en este documento presenta intervenciones de política social que tratan de abordar una o varias esferas de exclusión social, de un total de cinco:

- 1) La esfera de las políticas –como la acción afirmativa o las medidas para garantizar la responsabilidad de los gobiernos– que pueden dotar de autonomía a los excluidos sociales para reclamar sus derechos y garantías;
- 2) La esfera económica, que, si se concibe y se ejecuta apropiadamente, ofrece a los excluidos sociales acceso a un trabajo decente, a medios diversificados de ganarse la vida, a ingresos y a bienes. Entre los ejemplos cabe citar esquemas para garantizar el empleo, microfinanciación, transferencias de efectivo a familias vulnerables y transferencias sociales;
- 3) La esfera social, como por ejemplo las medidas para garantizar acceso a servicios y beneficios sociales incluyentes para los grupos marginados, entre ellos los emigrantes, los refugiados, las personas internamente desplazadas y otros grupos que no se benefician de las políticas sociales convencionales. Esto se debe a que el acceso a la salud, la educación y la protección es un derecho básico y es también una condición previa para convertirse en un miembro productivo de la sociedad.
- 4) La esfera tributaria, que examina la capacidad de respuesta de los presupuestos fiscales a los derechos de la mujer, los niños y otros grupos socialmente excluidos.
- 5) En los estados que han vivido un conflicto y que son frágiles, intervenciones que aborden los derechos de los grupos vulnerables como resultado de una situación de emergencia y de aquellos cuya vulnerabilidad haya aumentado más aún como resultado de la situación de emergencia o de conflictos políticos, como los niños, entre ellos los que realizan trabajos peligrosos, los niños que viven en la calle, los niños soldados y los niños afectados por los conflictos armados.

El objetivo del inventario es producir una mejor comprensión sobre el alcance y el diseño de las intervenciones actuales, explorar sus repercusiones potenciales sobre la situación de la infancia y eventualmente generar una orientación de políticas basada en pruebas para la inclusión social, incluso para una posible transferencia de políticas dentro de la región de Asia meridional. El inventario puede servir también para determinar cuáles son los puntos de entrada de UNICEF –y de otros organismos de las Naciones Unidas– a fin de ampliar la escala de los programas para el logro de los ODM y la protección de la infancia, mediante la integración y la incorporación en intervenciones más amplias de política social en el país afectado.

La selección no es exhaustiva, sino más bien una labor en marcha y no constituye una evaluación de los programas presentados.

## Résumé Analytique

Les politiques sociales embrassent les services sociaux, la répartition des revenus, la protection et la justice sociales, et elles englobent les interventions gouvernementales visant à soutenir le développement économique et social. Les politiques sociales prennent des formes différentes en fonction de l'histoire, des institutions et de la culture, mais en général il s'agit de systèmes administrés et financés par le gouvernement ayant pour but de fournir des services sociaux – des biens collectifs dans les secteurs de l'éducation, de la santé et dans d'autres secteurs – une sécurité et une protection sociales, et d'autres mesures favorables à l'intégration sociale – toutes dans le but d'aboutir à un développement humain de haut niveau, ce qui est *une fin en soi* mais aussi *un moyen* de stabiliser les milieux macroéconomiques et budgétaires. C'est pourquoi, dans certains pays, des stratégies visant à stimuler l'emploi et les innovations technologiques ont aussi été intégrées dans les politiques sociales, à l'instar des politiques de développement économique et des politiques de soulagement et d'éradication de la pauvreté. Dans les pays en développement, la sécurité sociale a tendance à être sous-développée, tandis que l'aide sociale ou les mesures de protection sociale jouent un plus grand rôle dans la lutte contre la pauvreté profonde.

En Asie du Sud, la politique sociale est une tradition, et les pays de la région sont des laboratoires d'interventions gouvernementales de nature et de conception sociales, offrant un patrimoine de données d'expérience utilisable pour le transfert de politiques au sein d'une région ou à l'extérieur. Forte d'une tradition aussi forte, il n'est pas surprenant que les huit pays d'Asie du Sud se soient engagés à appliquer la Déclaration du Millénaire et à réaliser les Objectifs du Millénaire pour le développement. Cependant, force est de constater qu'il existe un décalage entre les aspirations et les programmes sociaux d'une part, et les résultats systématiquement médiocres affichés par de nombreuses régions d'Asie du Sud d'autre part. En termes d'indicateurs des OMD, l'Asie du Sud est à la traîne du reste de l'Asie et c'est l'une des régions du monde qui affichent le bilan le plus faible.

Seuls quelques pays sont sur la bonne voie pour réaliser les cibles des OMD et cela uniquement dans une perspective globale – au niveau infranational et lorsque les données sont ventilées par sexe, groupe ethnique et situation géographique, même les pays les plus performants affichent de profondes disparités. Selon les rapports les plus récents sur les progrès accomplis vers la réalisation des OMD, la majorité des pays n'atteindront pas les cibles et les objectifs adoptés lors du Sommet du Millénaire en 2000.

Cette situation paradoxale ou le décalage entre des États providence offrant des interventions sociales complexes sans toutefois obtenir les résultats socio-économiques escomptés, mérite une explication. Les études réalisées par des organismes de développement et leurs homologues gouvernementaux permettent de penser que le décalage constaté dans l'ensemble de la région de l'Asie du Sud est partiellement le résultat de l'exclusion sociale qui limite l'efficacité des politiques sociales ou les succès en faveur des OMD. L'exclusion sociale se manifeste à plusieurs niveaux et de diverses manières, notamment dans les secteurs économique, politique et social. Bien que cet aspect soit moins visible, l'exclusion joue aussi un rôle dans les décisions relatives aux allocations budgétaires qui affectent indirectement les résultats du développement. Mais surtout, l'exclusion sociale est souvent exacerbée lors des situations d'urgence lorsque la condition des populations vulnérables empire et qu'elles sont marginalisées et désavantagées.

Les politiques sociales doivent donc être conçues et mises en œuvre de façon à respecter le principe d'une couverture universelle par les services sociaux de base fondé sur le respect des droits, conformément aux déclarations et conventions internationales, aux politiques nationales, et par la suite à la Déclaration du Millénaire, et elles doivent comprendre des mesures *en faveur* de l'intégration sociale. Il s'agira d'adopter des mesures spéciales d'un genre différent en faveur de l'intégration sociale dans le but de donner aux exclus de ces sociétés des moyens de revendiquer leurs droits.

Ce document présente une liste d'interventions sociales applicables dans un ou plusieurs des cinq domaines d'exclusion sociale :

- 1) Le domaine politique – comme l'action palliative envers les groupes désavantagés ou les mesures garantissant la responsabilisation des gouvernements – susceptible de donner aux exclus sociaux les moyens de faire respecter leurs droits et les prestations auxquelles ils peuvent prétendre;
- 2) Le domaine économique, qui, si les mesures sont conçues et appliquées correctement, offre aux exclus sociaux l'accès à un travail décent, à des moyens d'existence, des revenus et des actifs diversifiés. On peut citer en exemple les programmes garantissant l'emploi, le microcrédit, les transferts d'argent aux familles vulnérables et les transferts sociaux;
- 3) Le domaine social, par exemple les mesures garantissant l'accès des groupes marginalisés (migrants, réfugiés, personnes déplacées et autres groupes non couverts par les politiques sociales conventionnelles) à des services et avantages sociaux favorisant l'intégration. En effet, l'accès à la santé, à l'éducation et à la protection est un droit fondamental et aussi une condition indispensable pour devenir un membre productif de la société.
- 4) Le domaine budgétaire qui s'assure que les budgets sont adoptés dans le respect des droits des femmes, des enfants et d'autres groupes sociaux exclus.
- 5) Les interventions dans les États qui se relèvent d'un conflit et les États fragiles. Elles garantissent les droits des groupes affaiblis par une situation d'urgence ou ceux qui étaient déjà vulnérables et dont la situation a empiré à cause d'une situation d'urgence ou d'un conflit politique, comme les enfants, et plus particulièrement les enfants qui font un travail dangereux pour leur santé, les enfants des rues, les enfants soldats et les enfants touchés par un conflit armé.

Cette liste a pour objectif de mieux comprendre la portée et la conception des interventions actuelles, d'explorer leur impact possible sur la situation des enfants et, partant, de donner des conseils pour l'adoption de politiques reposant sur des données probantes en faveur de l'intégration sociale et du transfert éventuel de politiques au sein de la région de l'Asie du Sud. Ce document peut aussi servir de référence pour l'UNICEF – et d'autres institutions de l'ONU – désireux d'élargir les programmes en faveur des OMD et de la protection de l'enfant en les intégrant dans des interventions sociales plus globales dans le pays concerné.

Cette liste n'est pas exhaustive, elle demande à être enrichie et elle ne constitue pas une évaluation des

# **1. Reaching the MDGs in South Asia: An inventory of Public Policies to Overcome Social Exclusion**

## **1.1. Background and rationale**

Social policy is concerned with social services, income distribution, social protection and social justice.<sup>1</sup> Cast broadly, it includes government interventions aimed at enhancing social capacities for development, and interventions in economy and society to ensure a decent standard of living.<sup>2</sup> In this sense, social policy interventions are instruments applied by governments to deliver public goods and to address market failures. Recent discourse is increasingly reading social policy in the context of human development, and situating it in a rights-based framework as prescribed by international human rights instruments or domestic legislation. International normative instruments on human rights, gender equality and rights of the child are increasingly used to define social policy objectives. The principle of universalism - the right to and actual quality coverage with, at a minimum, basic livelihoods and basic social services – of every citizen<sup>3</sup> is used to underpin social policy.

In developed countries, social policy takes on different forms, shaped by history and culture, but in general presents government-led and -financed sophisticated systems aimed at ensuring stable macroeconomic and fiscal environments, providing social services – public goods in education, health and other areas – , and offering social security and social protection. In some countries, active employment strategies and technological innovation have also become part of social policy.

In developing countries, social policy often includes policies aimed at economic development and poverty alleviation or eradication. Both for reasons of design and of resources, social security tends to be under-developed, while social assistance or “safety nets” are taking on a larger role in recent years as a means to address acute poverty.<sup>4</sup>

With respect to South Asia, the question then is to explore how social policy is organised and delivered in this region. This is firstly because the region has a long tradition of welfare states, reaching back into colonial public administration and subsequent welfare state organisation since early independence.<sup>5</sup> The countries in the region are laboratories as well as repositories of government interventions of a social policy nature and design, and can offer rich experience.

---

<sup>1</sup> Isabel Ortiz, Social Policy Guidance Note, 2006. New York: UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs (DESA), p. 5, [www.undesa.org](http://www.undesa.org).

<sup>2</sup> Thandika Mkandaware, Social Policy in a Development Context, 2005, Geneva: UNRISD, p.1

<sup>3</sup> In light of increasing migration within and across countries, broadening the notion of citizenship is another issue to be addressed in social policy discourse.

<sup>4</sup> Thandika Mkandaware, *ibid*; Isabel Ortiz, Social Policy Guidance Note, 2006. New York: UN-DESA, [www.undesa.org](http://www.undesa.org).

<sup>5</sup> See Gabriele Köhler, “Paradox of the South Asian Welfare State”, *Himal South Asian*, Volume 19, No. 6, September 2006. [www.himalmag.com](http://www.himalmag.com)

The second driver of our enquiry is in the context of the Millennium agenda. All eight countries in South Asia have committed to achieving the Millennium Declaration and the Millennium Development Goals, so it will be of interest to explore whether and how social policy includes specific and effective strategies and interventions to meet those commitments.

The third and most important reason, however, for an examination of social policy in South Asia, is the disconnect between social policy aspirations and programmes on the one hand, and their consistently low performance in many regions of South Asia: measured in the indicators offered by the MDGs, South Asia is the poorest performing sub-region of Asia,<sup>6</sup> and one of the poorest performing regions globally.

For example, levels of child malnutrition are the world's highest. 46% of all children in South Asia are underweight, with almost half of them (73 million) living in three countries – India, Bangladesh and Pakistan, despite accounting for just 29% of the developing world's under-five population. In 1998, 90% of children in Nepal were suffering from some form of malnutrition. Roughly 47% of India's under-five children are underweight. Though child malnutrition in Sri Lanka has been declining, still some 29% of children are underweight. Afghanistan has made significant progress, but malnutrition still affects almost half of the country's children. Child mortality and maternal mortality levels in South Asia are among the highest globally. Although the region has experienced a gradual decline in under-five and infant mortality, the regional child mortality rates are exceeded only by those in Sub-Saharan Africa. One out of every three child deaths occurs in South Asia, and almost one child in ten dies before his/her fifth birthday. South Asia lags behind most other regions in primary school enrolment and attendance, with a net primary school enrolment/attendance ratio of 74%, with some of the countries barely exceeding 50%, such as Afghanistan and Pakistan. While net enrolment rates have increased on average in most of the countries, access to education for children from low-income and socially marginalised groups remains a challenge and contributes to the high proportion of children in South Asia who are out of school.

There are only a few countries which are on track to achieve all the MDG targets, and this is only at the aggregate level – sub-nationally and disaggregated by gender, ethnicity, location, even the more performing countries continue to show wide disparities. Most countries will not achieve the goals and targets they had set before themselves at the Millennium Summit in the year 2000.

The “paradox” or disconnect of welfare states offering intricate social policy interventions and then not delivering corresponding socio-economic outcomes, seeks an explanation: a key driver of this disconnect throughout South Asia appears to lie in processes of social exclusion, which undermines the effectiveness of social policy or MDG achievement.

---

<sup>6</sup> See UNICEF ROSA, *The Millennium Development Goals: Progress and Challenges in South Asia 2006*, Kathmandu; UNICEF ROSA, *South Asia Booklet on Child-relevant Socioeconomic Indicators*, July 2006. Both at [www.unicef.rosa.org](http://www.unicef.rosa.org); UN ESCAP, *Fact Sheets on MDGs in South Asia*, October 2006 and UN ESCAP, *A Future Within Reach: Reshaping institutions in a region of disparities to meet the Millennium Development Goals in Asia and the Pacific*, 2005. United Nations publication Both at [www.unescap.org](http://www.unescap.org); SAARC, *Regional Poverty Profile 2005: Poverty Reduction in South Asia through Productive Employment*, SAARC Secretariat, Kathmandu, August 2006

Individuals and communities face persistent discrimination and are socially excluded from sources of livelihood, political voice and participation, and from social services. Exclusion is based on vectors which differ by society, culture and region, but tend to include caste, ethnicity, occupation, language, religious or political affiliation, geographical location, or physical or mental ability. Usually, income poverty reinforces and exacerbates social exclusion and groups who are socially excluded tend to face poverty as a result of their exclusion in the economic and public domains, as well as from education and health services. Gender inequality and exclusion pervades all vectors of social exclusion, and compounds and exacerbates each of them. As a consequence, people's rights to a basic income and nutrition, to quality education, health, water and sanitation, and gender equality, as posited in the MDGs, are not fulfilled.<sup>7</sup>

And: social policy is not performing its functions well. Arguably, in light of social exclusion in the economic, political and social domains, social policy needs to be designed and delivered in such a way that it fulfils the principle of universal coverage with at least basic social services, as enshrined in the Millennium Declaration and numerous international declarations and conventions, and national policy. To do so, social policy operating in a context of exclusionary practices, needs to offer approaches to facilitate social inclusion. These would be different forms of special measures for social inclusion – conceived to enable the socially excluded in these societies to claim their rights.<sup>8</sup>

The inventory in this paper<sup>9</sup> compiles five types of social policy interventions which address social exclusion<sup>10</sup> via:

- 1) The political domain - such as affirmative action or measures to ensure accountability of governments - which might empower the socially excluded to claim their rights and entitlements;<sup>11</sup>
- 2) The economic domain, which, if properly designed and implemented, provide the socially excluded with access to decent work, diversified livelihoods, income and assets. Examples

---

<sup>7</sup> Gabriele Köhler, Jennifer Keane, „Analytical Report. Social Policy in South Asia: Towards Universal Coverage and Transformation for Achieving the Millennium Development Goals”. UNICEF/UNRISD, Social Policy in South Asia: Towards Universal Coverage and Transformation for Achieving the Millennium Development Goals, CD, Kathmandu, May 2006; Gabriele Köhler, Concept note on social policy, November 2006, [www.unicef.rosa.org](http://www.unicef.rosa.org)

<sup>8</sup> Gabriele Köhler, Jennifer Keane, „Analytical Report. Social Policy in South Asia: Towards Universal Coverage and Transformation for Achieving the Millennium Development Goals”. UNICEF/UNRISD, Social Policy in South Asia: Towards Universal Coverage and Transformation for Achieving the Millennium Development Goals, CD, Kathmandu, May 2006

<sup>9</sup> The ROSA social policy cluster focuses its attention on interventions aimed at achieving greater economic or political inclusion. Social inclusion via access to social services is in the work programme of other ROSA clusters. In each area of intervention - the economic and the political – the particular lens is that of the impact of government interventions on children's wellbeing, either directly or indirectly through changes in the livelihoods of families.

<sup>10</sup> See in this vein UNICEF, State of the World's Children 2007, Global Report, New York 2006, [www.unicef.org](http://www.unicef.org), and South Asia Report, Kathmandu 2006, at [www.unicef.rosa.org](http://www.unicef.rosa.org) which discuss gender equality at the household, economic and political level.

<sup>11</sup> The measures of political inclusion need to be examined with caution, because some might inadvertently advance exclusion within the group or the benefits proposed under the interventions abused or captured by elites (e.g. under affirmative action measures where the upper strata of the same caste/group/etc. might take the power over and act or make political decisions to the detriment of their own caste/group/etc.).

include employment guarantee schemes, micro-financing, cash transfers to vulnerable families, and social transfers;<sup>12</sup>

3) The social domain, such as through measures to ensure access to inclusive social services and benefits, for marginalised groups, including for migrants, refugees, IDPs and other groups not attended in mainstream social policy; this is because access to health, education and protection is a basic right, but also as a prerequisite to enable them to be productive members of society.

4) The fiscal domain, which looks at the responsiveness of fiscal budgets to the rights of women, children and other socially excluded groups.

5) Interventions in post-conflict and fragile states, which address the rights of groups made vulnerable as the result of the emergency and those whose vulnerability has increased further as the result of the emergency or political conflicts, such as children, including children engaged in hazardous labour, street children, child soldiers and children affected by armed conflict.

## **1.2 Selection criteria for interventions**

The compilation is based on desk research, much of it from secondary sources. The selection is not exhaustive, but rather a work in progress. The interventions have been selected based on a set of criteria:

They are primarily government-initiated and -financed (donor and NGO support is supplementary in nature).

They specifically address at least one domain of social exclusion.

They address particular excluded groups or communities in order to advance progress toward universal access to social services, in the form of special measures of inclusion.

They suggest good potential for advancing progress toward achievement of the MDGs and the international human rights instruments, including inter alia the Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) or the Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women (CEDAW).

They have the potential to be transformative in nature, i.e. rights-based, empowering, and leading to lasting structural and social change.

They appear to be politically and financially sustainable and generate long-lasting benefits for the excluded group or community

---

<sup>12</sup> The measures of economic inclusion need to be examined with caution, because some might inadvertently re-inforce processes of exclusion. One example comes from public works schemes in the form of infrastructure development projects, in which women may not engage because of the demanding physical labour requirements, or because proper child care is not delivered as part of the intervention, or because the scheme adds to their other responsibly in household and childcare.

They can be evaluated and documented (i.e. they spell out clear objectives; types of beneficiaries addressed; form of assistance or services provided; coverage; clarity on responsible actors; available benchmark data at inception of the intervention; and/or include other relevant data in relation to the design and implementation of the programme). This paper, however, does not include any assessment or evaluation of the interventions presented, but exclusively focuses on documenting them in the sense of a knowledge and information management tool.<sup>13</sup>

They could be used for evidence-based policy discussion and transmission and rights-based policy advocacy.

### **1.3 Purpose of the “inventory” and preliminary findings and observations**

The objective of the inventory is to come to a better understanding of the design of current interventions, explore their potential impact on the situation of children, and eventually generate evidence-based policy advice for social inclusion, including for potential policy transfer within the South Asia region.

Many of the interventions – or their precursors - pre-date the Millennium Declaration or the World Summit for Children and its World Fit for Children Declaration and its ensuing proposals for a rights-based environment for children. However, the inventory of government interventions in South Asia can help to situate and analyse them in a new perspective, because it enables reading them through a MDG lens and in a child protective environment framework. They could then be seen as entry points to scale up MDG and child-relevant projects, and weave them into larger and sustained government policy and programming, and help tap into the concomitant fiscal budget resources.

Some commonalities across the intervention programmes are striking.

Firstly, there is the sheer number of social policy interventions: this inventory contains almost 50 large-scale, government-based programmes. It is random rather than exhaustive, which suggests that there are likely to be many other such interventions in place.

Secondly is the commonality in issues which they address. Although MDGs were not necessarily in place at the inception of many of these intervention programmes, or not a point of reference for national policy-making, it is easy to see the relationship in policy agendas. The majority of interventions in this inventory address poverty alleviation and gender equality, as well as education and health, and by virtue of addressing vulnerability, they would – if well-implemented – also have an impact for social inclusion. This could be seen to “validate” both the MDG agenda and the social policy interventions in place as efforts to address the pressing human development issues. **Table 1** provides a comparative overview of government interventions and how they can be associated with MDG targets. It facilitates comparing interventions underway in different countries in light of a specific goal and target, and could prompt policy imagination and cross-fertilisation.

---

<sup>13</sup> For conceptual, analytical and empirical reasons, many of these interventions would merit further research, notably a comparative cost-benefit analysis, and impact analysis.

The juxtaposition of child protection objectives and social policy interventions is equally interesting, since the concept of a child protective environment or framework is recent, and is unlikely to have influenced social policy on a macro level. **Table 2** classifies the social policy work of governments through a child protection prism by listing selected multi-dimensional interventions according to the framework laid out in the Convention of the Rights of the Child.

By distinguishing between programmes that exclusively focus on child protection and those that are secondarily implicated in child protection, these comparisons illustrate how some of the existing government interventions were put in place expressly to address well-known child protection issues such as child labour. For others, it suggest how they could be “instrumentalised” to strategically integrate more complex issues in child protection such as violence and abuse into programmes, make child protection integral to them, and scale them up in terms of level, sustainability and resources.

Despite the commonalities, the overview also reveals how for both areas – MDG targets and child protection objectives – policy mechanisms responding to a particular goal are driven by institutional contexts and realities on the ground, and hence do vary across countries. For example, for MDG target 3 on achieving universal primary education, a variety of approaches are in place. In Afghanistan, the programme is community-based, whereas in Bangladesh’s well-documented scheme for primary education, the focus is on stimulating the demand side from the household level.

**Table 1. Selective interventions, organised by MDG Objectives**

GOAL 1 : ERADICATE EXTREME POVERTY AND HUNGER			
TARGETS / OBJECTIVES	COUNTRY	INTERVENTIONS	INSTRUMENTS
<b>TARGET 1 : REDUCE POVERTY BY HALF</b>	AFGHANISTAN	MICROFINANCE INVESTMENT SUPPORT FACILITY FOR AFGHANISTAN (MISFA)	CASH TRANSFER
		RURAL SOCIAL SERVICE PROGRAMME (RSS) <b>FOOD FOR WORK PROGRAMME (FFW)</b>	CASH TRANSFER <b>FOOD TRANSFER</b>
	BANGLADESH	<b>FOOD-BASED SOCIAL SAFETY NET PROGRAMME</b>	<b>FOOD TRANSFER</b>
		<b>LGED'S RURAL INFRASTRUCTURE DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME</b>	<b>FOOD TRANSFER</b>
	INDIA	NATIONAL RURAL EMPLOYMENT GUARANTEE SCHEMES	CASH TRANSFER
		SAMPOORNA GRAMEEN ROZGAR YOJANA (SGRY)	CASH TRANSFER
		SWARNA JAYANTI SHAHARI ROJGAR YOJANA (SJSRY)	CASH TRANSFER
	NEPAL	INTEGRATED PROGRAMME FOR STREET CHILDREN	SOCIAL SERVICES
		RURAL COMMUNITY INFRASTRUCTURE WORKS (RCIW)	HYBRID TRANSFER
	PAKISTAN	KHUSHAL PAKISTAN PROGRAMME	CASH TRANSFER
		PAKISTAN BAIT-UL-MAL (PBM) PROGRAMME	CASH TRANSFER/ SCHOOL FACILITIES
		ZAKAT PROGRAMME	CASH TRANSFER
		PALLI KARMA SAHAYAK FOUNDATION (PKSF) PROGRAMME	CASH TRANSFER
SRI LANKA	<b>ORANJI PILOT PROJECT</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER</b>	
	SAMURDHI PROGRAMME	CASH TRANSFER	
	ACTION PLAN FOR CHILDREN AFFECTED BY WAR	CASH TRANSFER/ SOCIAL SERVICES	

**TARGET 2: REDUCE  
HUNGER BY HALF**

AFGHANISTAN	NATIONAL LIVELIHOODS BASED FOOD SECURITY AND NATIONAL SURVEILLANCE SYSTEM (NSS)	MONITORING SYSTEM
	FOOD FOR WORK (PART OF PROTRACTED RELIEF AND RECOVERY OPERATION)	FOOD TRANSFER
	FOOD FOR WORK PROGRAMME (FFW)	FOOD TRANSFER
	FOOD-BASED SOCIAL SAFETY NET PROGRAMME	FOOD TRANSFER
BANGLADESH	LGED'S RURAL INFRASTRUCTURE DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME	FOOD TRANSFER
	VULNERABLE GROUP DEVELOPMENT	FOOD TRANSFER
	<b>INTEGRATED PROGRAMME FOR STREET CHILDREN</b>	<b>SOCIAL SERVICES</b>
INDIA	NUTRITIONAL SUPPORT FOR PRIMARY EDUCATION (MIDDAY MEALS SCHEME)	FOOD TRANSFER
	<b>SAMPOORNA GRAMEEN ROZGAR YOJANA (SGRY)</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER</b>
PAKISTAN	<b>PAKISTAN BAIT-UL-MAL (PBM) PROGRAMME</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER/ SCHOOL FACILITIES</b>
SRI LANKA	<b>SAMURDHI PROGRAMME</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER</b>

**GOAL 2: ACHIEVE UNIVERSAL PRIMARY EDUCATION**

TARGETS /OBJECTIVES	COUNTRY	INTERVENTIONS	INSTRUMENTS
<b>TARGET 3: ACHIEVE PRIMARY SCHOOL ENROLMENT AND ATTENDANCE</b>	AFGHANISTAN	COMMUNITY-BASED EDUCATION	SCHOOL FACILITIES
	BANGLADESH	PRIMARY EDUCATION STIPEND PROJECT	CASH TRANSFER
		BASIC EDUCATION FOR HARD TO REACH URBAN WORKING CHILDREN	SCHOOL PROGRAMME
	INDIA	RESIDENTIAL CARE CENTRES FOR MIGRANT FAMILIES' CHILDREN	FOOD TRANSFER/ SOCIAL SERVICES

		<b>INTEGRATED PROGRAMME FOR STREET CHILDREN NUTRITIONAL SUPPORT FOR PRIMARY EDUCATION (MIDDAY MEALS SCHEME) BALIKA SAMRIDHI YOJANA SCHEME</b>	<b>SOCIAL SERVICES FOOD TRANSFER CASH TRANSFER</b>
NEPAL		WELCOME TO SCHOOL CAMPAIGN	CAMPAIGN
PAKISTAN		<b>PAKISTAN BAIT-UL-MAL (PBM) PROGRAMME</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER/ SCHOOL FACILITIES</b>
		<b>NATIONAL TIME-BOUND PROGRAMME TO ELIMINATE CHILD LABOUR</b>	<b>IDENTIFICATION SYSTEM</b>
		<b>ZAKAT PROGRAMME</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER</b>
SRI LANKA		<b>ACTION PLAN FOR CHILDREN AFFECTED BY WAR</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER/ SOCIAL SERVICES</b>

### GOAL 3: PROMOTE GENDER EQUALITY AND EMPOWER WOMEN

TARGETS / OBJECTIVES	COUNTRY	INTERVENTIONS	INSTRUMENTS
<b>TARGET 4: ELIMINATE GENDER DISPARITY IN PRIMARY AND SECONDARY EDUCATION  OTHER INTERVENTIONS</b>	AFGHANISTAN	<b>COMMUNITY-BASED EDUCATION</b>	<b>SCHOOL FACILITIES</b>
	BANGLADESH	FEMALE SECONDARY STIPEND PROGRAMME	CASH TRANSFER
		<b>PRIMARY EDUCATION STIPEND PROJECT</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER</b>
		<b>BASIC EDUCATION FOR HARD TO REACH URBAN WORKING CHILDREN</b>	<b>SCHOOL PROGRAMME</b>
	NEPAL	WELCOME TO SCHOOL CAMPAIGN	CAMPAIGN
	PAKISTAN	<b>PAKISTAN BAIT-UL-MAL (PBM) PROGRAMME</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER/ SCHOOL FACILITIES</b>
		<b>ZAKAT PROGRAMME</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER</b>
	AFGHANISTAN	NATIONAL AREA-BASED DEVELOPMENT PROGRAMME	INSTITUTION REFORM
		NATIONAL SOLIDARITY PROGRAMME (NSP)	CASH TRANSFER
	BANGLADESH	<b>VULNERABLE GROUP DEVELOPMENT</b>	<b>FOOD TRANSFER</b>

<b>FOR WOMEN'S EMPOWERMENT</b>	INDIA	REPRESENTATIONAL QUOTAS FOR WOMEN COUNCILLORS BALIKA SAMRIDHI YOJANA SCHEME GENDER RESPONSIVE BUDGETING (GRB)	LEGAL REFORM  CASH TRANSFER BUDGET REFORM
	NEPAL	AFFIRMATIVE ACTION (YOUTH AND WOMEN) PARA-LEGAL COMMITTEES <b>CHILD CLUBS</b>	INSTITUTIONAL REFORM MONITORING SYSTEM <b>TRAINING/ CAMPAIGN</b>
	PAKISTAN	NATIONAL GENDER REFORM ACTION PLAN (GRAP) GENDER RESPONSIVE BUDGETING INITIATIVE (GRBI)	CASH TRANSFER BUDGET REFORM

#### GOAL 4: REDUCE CHILD MORTALITY

TARGETS / OBJECTIVES	COUNTRY	INTERVENTIONS	INSTRUMENTS
<b>TARGET 5: REDUCE UNDER-FIVE MORTALITY BY 2/3</b>	INDIA	INTEGRATED CHILD DEVELOPMENT SERVICES SCHEMES (ICDS) <b>BALIKA SAMRIDHI YOJANA SCHEME</b>	SOCIAL SERVICES  <b>CASH TRANSFER</b>
	MALDIVES	EARLY CHILD DEVELOPMENT	CAMPAIGN
	PAKISTAN	<b>LADY HEALTH WORKERS PROGRAMME (LHWP)</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER/SCHOOL PROGRAMME</b>
		<b>ORANJI PILOT PROJECT</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER</b>
	SRI LANKA	<b>SAMURDHI PROGRAMME</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER</b>

**GOAL 5: IMPROVE MATERNAL HEALTH**

TARGETS / OBJECTIVES	COUNTRY	INTERVENTIONS	INSTRUMENTS
<b>TARGET 6: REDUCE MATERNAL MORTALITY BY 3/4</b>	INDIA	<b>BALIKA SAMRIDHI YOJANA SCHEME</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER</b>
		<b>INTEGRATED CHILD DEVELOPMENT SERVICES SCHEMES (ICDS)</b>	<b>SOCIAL SERVICES</b>
	PAKISTAN	<b>LADY HEALTH WORKERS PROGRAMME (LHWP)</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER/SCHOOL PROGRAMME</b>
		<b>ORANJI PILOT PROJECT</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER</b>

**GOAL 6: COMBAT HIV/AIDS, MALARIA AND OTHERS DISEASES**

TARGETS / OBJECTIVES	COUNTRY	INTERVENTIONS	INSTRUMENTS
<b>TARGET 7: HALT AND BEGIN TO REVERSE THE SPREAD OF HIV / AIDS</b>	INDIA	<b>RESIDENTIAL CARE CENTRES FOR MIGRANT FAMILIES' CHILDREN</b>	<b>FOOD TRANSFER/ SOCIAL SERVICES</b>
		<b>INTEGRATED CHILD DEVELOPMENT SERVICES SCHEMES (ICDS)</b>	<b>SOCIAL SERVICES</b>
	PAKISTAN	<b>LADY HEALTH WORKERS PROGRAMME (LHWP)</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER/SCHOOL PROGRAMME</b>
		<b>ORANJI PILOT PROJECT</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER</b>
<b>TARGET 8: HALT AND BEGIN TO REVERSE THE INCIDENCE OF MALARIA AND OTHER MAJOR DISEASES</b>		<b>NATIONAL TIME-BOUND PROGRAMME TO ELIMINATE CHILD LABOUR</b>	<b>IDENTIFICATION SYSTEM</b>
		<b>PAKISTAN BAIT-UL-MAL (PBM) PROGRAMME</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER/ SCHOOL FACILITIES</b>
		<b>ZAKAT PROGRAMME</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER</b>
	SRI LANKA	<b>PROGRAMME FOR VULNERABLE POPULATIONS INCLUDED IN THE MASTER HEALTH PLAN (2007-2016)</b>	<b>HEALTHCARE PROGRAMME</b>
		<b>ACTION PLAN FOR CHILDREN AFFECTED BY WAR</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER/ SOCIAL SERVICES</b>

**GOAL 7: ENSURE ENVIRONMENTAL SUSTAINABILITY**

TARGETS / OBJECTIVES	COUNTRY	INTERVENTIONS	INSTRUMENTS
<b>TARGET 10: HALVE THE PROPORTION OF PEOPLE WITHOUT SUSTAINABLE ACCESS TO SAFE DRINKING WATER AND BASIC SANITATION</b>	AFGHANISTAN	<b>NATIONAL SOLIDARITY PROGRAMME (NSP)</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER</b>
	INDIA	<b>NATIONAL RURAL EMPLOYMENT GUARANTEE ACT SCHEMES (NREGAS)</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER</b>
		<b>INTEGRATED PROGRAMME FOR STREET CHILDREN</b>	<b>SOCIAL SERVICES</b>
		PAKISTAN	<b>KHUSHAL PAKISTAN PROGRAMME</b>
		<b>ORANJI PILOT PROJECT</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER</b>
	<b>TARGET 11: IMPROVE SLUM DWELLERS' LIVES</b>	INDIA	<b>SWARNA JAYANTI SHAHARI ROJGAR YOJANA (SJSRY)</b>
	PAKISTAN	<b>ORANJI PILOT PROJECT</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER</b>

**GOAL 8: DEVELOP A GLOBAL PARTNERSHIP FOR DEVELOPMENT**

TARGETS / OBJECTIVES	COUNTRY	INTERVENTIONS	INSTRUMENTS
<b>TARGET 16: IMPLEMENT STRATEGIES FOR DECENT AND PRODUCTIVE</b>	BANGLADESH	<b>BASIC EDUCATION FOR HARD TO REACH URBAN WORKING CHILDREN</b>	<b>SCHOOL PROGRAMME</b>
	INDIA	<b>INTEGRATED PROGRAMME FOR STREET CHILDREN</b>	<b>SOCIAL SERVICES</b>
		<b>SAMPOORNA GRAMEEN ROZGAR YOJANA (SGRY)</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER</b>
	NEPAL	<b>ASSISTED ECONOMIC MIGRATION</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER</b>
	PAKISTAN	<b>NATIONAL TIME-BOUND PROGRAMME TO ELIMINATE</b>	<b>IDENTIFICATION SYSTEM</b>

**WORK FOR YOUTH**

SRI LANKA

CHILD LABOUR

**ACTION PLAN FOR CHILDREN AFFECTED BY WAR****CASH TRANSFER/ SOCIAL SERVICES****TARGET 18:**

BHUTAN

20/20 FOR BASIC SOCIAL SERVICE

BUDGET REFORM

**IMPROVE ACCESS**

MDG NEEDS ASSESSMENT &amp; COSTING

BUDGET REFORM

**TO INFORMATION**

INDIA

FREEDOM OF INFORMATION ACT

LAW REFORM

**AND**

PARTICIPATORY BUDGETING AND PERFORMANCE

BUDGET REFORM

**COMMUNICATION**

NEPAL

CHILD CLUBS

TRAINING/ CAMPAIGN

MALDIVES

20/20 INITIATIVE FOR BASIC SOCIAL SERVICE

BUDGET REFORM

**EARLY CHILD DEVELOPMENT****MEDIA CAMPAIGN**

Legend: Programmes are listed in several sections because most of them have multi objectives. Those written in bold are related to the target as a primary objective while the others are related to targets only as a secondary objective.

Source: UNICEF ROSA, August 2007

**Table 2. Selective interventions related to Child Protection based on the Convention on the Rights of the Child**

OBJECTIVES	COUNTRY	INTERVENTIONS	INSTRUMENTS
<b>BIRTH REGISTRATION</b>			
<b>CHILDREN AND JUSTICE</b>			
	NEPAL	PARA-LEGAL COMMITTEES	MONITORING SYSTEM/ CAMPAIGN
<b>CHILDREN AND EMERGENCIES</b>			
	SRI LANKA	ACTION PLAN FOR CHILDREN AFFECTED BY WAR	CASH TRANSFER/ SOCIAL SERVICES
		PROGRAMME FOR DISASTER-AFFECTED PEOPLE INCLUDED IN THE MASTER HEALTH PLAN (2007-2016)	HEALTHCARE PROGRAMME
<b>CHILD LABOUR</b>			
	BANGLADESH	BASIC EDUCATION FOR HARD TO REACH URBAN WORKING CHILDREN	SCHOOL PROGRAMME
	INDIA	<b>SAMPOORNA GRAMEEN ROZGAR YOJANA (SGRY)</b> INTEGRATED PROGRAMME FOR STREET CHILDREN	<b>CASH TRANSFER</b> SOCIAL SERVICES
	PAKISTAN	NATIONAL TIME-BOUND PROGRAMME TO ELIMINATE CHILD LABOUR <b>PAKISTAN BAIT-UL-MAL (PBM) PROGRAMME</b>	IDENTIFICATION SYSTEM <b>CASH TRANSFER/ SCHOOL FACILITIES</b>
	SRI LANKA	ACTION PLAN FOR CHILDREN AFFECTED BY WAR	CASH TRANSFER/ SOCIAL SERVICES
<b>CHILD TRAFFICKING</b>			
	INDIA	INTEGRATED PROGRAMME FOR STREET CHILDREN	SOCIAL SERVICES
	PAKISTAN	NATIONAL TIME-BOUND PROGRAMME TO ELIMINATE CHILD LABOUR	IDENTIFICATION SYSTEM
<b>CHILD WITH DISABILITIES</b>			
	INDIA	<b>SAMPOORNA GRAMEEN ROZGAR YOJANA (SGRY)</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER</b>
	MALDIVES	EARLY CHILD DEVELOPMENT	CAMPAIGN
	NEPAL	AFFIRMATIVE ACTION (YOUTH AND WOMEN) CHILD CLUBS (CHILDREN'S AND YOUTH'S PARTICIPATION)	INSTITUTIONAL REFORM TRAINING/ CAMPAIGN
	PAKISTAN	<b>PAKISTAN BAIT-UL-MAL (PBM) PROGRAMME</b>  <b>ZAKAT PROGRAMME</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER/ SCHOOL FACILITIES</b>  <b>CASH TRANSFER</b>
	SRI LANKA	PROGRAMME FOR DISABLED CHILDREN INCLUDED IN THE MASTER HEALTH PLAN (2007-2016)	HEALTHCARE PROGRAMME

<b>CHILDREN WITHOUT PARENTAL CARES</b>		
INDIA	INTEGRATED PROGRAMME FOR STREET CHILDREN	SOCIAL SERVICES
PAKISTAN	<b>PAKISTAN BAIT-UL-MAL (PBM) PROGRAMME</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER/ SCHOOL FACILITIES</b>
	<b>ZAKAT PROGRAMME</b>	<b>CASH TRANSFER</b>
SRI LANKA	ACTION PLAN FOR CHILDREN AFFECTED BY WAR	CASH TRANSFER/ SOCIAL SERVICES
<b>DISCRIMINATION</b>		
INDIA	BALIKA SAMRIDHI YOJANA SCHEME	CASH TRANSFER
	INTEGRATED PROGRAMME FOR STREET CHILDREN	SOCIAL SERVICES
MALDIVES	EARLY CHILD DEVELOPMENT	CAMPAIGN
NEPAL	CHILD CLUBS (CHILDREN'S AND YOUTH'S PARTICIPATION)	TRAINING/ CAMPAIGN
<b>FEMALE GENITAL MUTILATION/CUTTING</b>		
<b>SEXUAL EXPLOITATION OF CHILDREN</b>		
INDIA	INTEGRATED PROGRAMME FOR STREET CHILDREN	SOCIAL SERVICES
NEPAL	PARA-LEGAL COMMITTEES	MONITORING SYSTEM/ CAMPAIGN
PAKISTAN	NATIONAL TIME-BOUND PROGRAMME TO ELIMINATE CHILD LABOUR	IDENTIFICATION SYSTEM
<b>VIOLENCE AGAINST CHILDREN</b>		
INDIA	BALIKA SAMRIDHI YOJANA SCHEME	CASH TRANSFER
	INTEGRATED PROGRAMME FOR STREET CHILDREN	SOCIAL SERVICES
NEPAL	PARA-LEGAL COMMITTEES	MONITORING SYSTEM/ CAMPAIGN

Legend: Programmes written in bold are related to child protection as a primary objective, the others are related to it as a secondary objective.

Source: UNICEF ROSA, August 2007

The third commonality emerging from the interventions comparisons lies in the choice of social policy instruments. A majority of programmes in the inventory are using either cash or food transfers. This suggests that policy interventions across a broad spectrum of countries, sectors and policy goals are operating with the same box of tools. Legal or institutional reforms feature less frequently. This finding has implications for the broader discussion on social transfers, which is often reduced to a discussion of cash versus in-kind, disregards services delivery or child protection services proper, and overemphasises the tools as opposed to the objectives and policies.

Finally, within a comparison of the instruments or tools used, the inventory sheds some light on their evolution in South Asia. With respect to cash transfers, a trajectory is often observed, moving over time from food to cash as the preferred instrument. For instance, regarding MDG target 2 on reduction of hunger by half, most of those programmes which focus primarily on this objective have been using food transfers; and some then shifted into the cash modality. Thus, Nepal's food for work programme has been redesigned as a Rural Community Infrastructure Works (RCIW) and become a cash for work programme.

In assessing the delivery mechanisms and tools, there is a need to introduce the principle of rights. A "hierarchy" of instruments could be deduced, looking at the degree to which a particular programme is universal and unconditional. Within the interventions using cash or food as tools, some programmes apply conditionalities, while others are categorical or geographical only, i.e. beneficiaries are selected based on objective characteristics – gender or age – or location – all persons in a particular geographical location, or any mixture of the two.<sup>14</sup> One could make the argument that basic income transfers to all individuals or households without any conditions to be met, or those that are categorical, are completely in tune with a rights-based approach and the principle of universalism, while those that require behaviour change or labour inputs may reflect a patronising, top-down approach, and in the process re-produce social exclusion. Figure 1 attempts to illustrate this point in a simple schema.

Conversely, behavioural conditionalities could be seen as rights-based, if they can serve as special efforts to enable individuals or groups to access their entitlements. Depending on intra-household power relations, for example, a grant conditional to school attendance might empower girl children to go to school, both in terms of providing the financial resources needed to cover real and opportunity costs, and in terms of providing the girl with a "bargaining chip" vis-à-vis her elders.

Public work schemes also can be seen in this double light. The condition to work as a requirement to receive the "benefit" – namely a wage - can exclude those possibly most in need of income - remote households or those with poor health or women-headed households with no time and means to access the worksite. In that sense, it is not rights based. Conversely, the condition of work can be interpreted as corresponding – albeit in a rudimentary form – to the right to work. In this context, it is of interest to note that the Indian Government's National Rural Employment Guarantee Act is cast as rights-based, by introducing a right to work, since every household in the rural areas of India is guaranteed 100 days of paid employment (see **Box 1**).

---

<sup>14</sup> For a detailed discussion see Michael Samson, Ingrid van Niekerk, Kenneth Mac Quene, Designing and Implementing Social Transfer Programmes. EPRI Press. Capetown. [www.epri.org.za/socialtransfers](http://www.epri.org.za/socialtransfers)

Figure 1. Transfers in cash (CTS) or in kind: An attempted typology

Rights-based	From non-conditional to conditional
Rights based	<b>Basic income transfers</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• to all individuals or to all households</li> <li>• to all households with children (universal child benefits)</li> </ul>
	<b>Food transfers</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• to all individuals or to all households in economic need</li> </ul>
Entitlement based situative	<b>Conditional on situation</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Insurance schemes for sickness, accident, unemployment</li> <li>• Provision for old age</li> </ul>
Behavioural conditionality	<b>Conditional sectoral cash transfers</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Education transfer / scholarships for socially excluded groups/vouchers</li> <li>• Family grants with view to behaviour change</li> <li>• Maternal health-related grants</li> <li>• etc</li> </ul>
Harsh conditions	<b>Conditional employment schemes</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Food for work</li> <li>• Cash for work</li> </ul>

Source: Gabriele Köhler, 2007

### **Box 1. Interventions in the economic domain towards greater social inclusion: an example from India**

The National Rural Employment Scheme under the National Rural Employment Guarantee Act (NREGA) of India, adopted in 2005, aims to facilitate economic inclusion by tackling extreme poverty and landlessness. It offers guaranteed wage employment, and is self-targeting so as to benefit the socially excluded, most vulnerable and economically weakest groups.

ROSA and UNICEF India recently organised a workshop to explore the potential of NREGA schemes. The workshop identified the various elements that might work towards an economic transformation of the rural economy, by generating local employment opportunities and improving family income, by organising for better infrastructure, and thereby reducing distress migration. It allows both poor men and women to take up gainful employment; enhancing female work participation opportunities and thereby their empowerment, particularly where equal wages are paid directly to them.

Several issues in particular were raised in relation to understanding, monitoring and strengthening the programme's impacts on children:

Enhancing the delivery of support services meant to be an integral component of the scheme, notably child care services on-site. Considerable strengthening of the childcare provisions under NREGA would be useful, and this could build mutually beneficial linkages between ICDS and NREGA, and advocating for increased allocations on this item

Expanding the definition and purpose of public works to include the infrastructure for 'child-friendly communities' – i.e. ensuring that public works include building or maintaining school infrastructure, developing recreational sites and sports infrastructure for children, for example. This may involve building linkages between NREGA and the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan at national, state and local levels.

Generating "decent work" - using NREGA funds to generate additional employment in the care economy which would offer employment opportunities for women, and men, in social services and simultaneously help to universalise ICDS, school meal, health and other services.

⇒ Focusing on understanding the links between migration and child well-being, particularly where distress migration is evident, so that NREGA can be used proactively to protect vulnerable families.

Source: UNICEF India Country Office and UNICEF ROSA, Note 'NREGA and its current and potential impacts on women and children', submitted for publication to the *Migration Hub*, February 2007, and UNICEF ROSA and ICO Meeting Report, February 2007

## 2. Interventions for Social Inclusion via the Political Domain

Turning to the interventions in South Asia, the inventory pulls together some 50 programmes. They meet all or most of the criteria lay out above. Within the five domains, they are presented in country alphabetical order. For each intervention, the paper includes some preliminary findings and research observations which should however not be mistaken for assessments or evaluations, but rather as suggestions for follow-up at the country level.

### 2.1. National Area-Based Development Programme (NABDP), Afghanistan, phase II (2006-2008)<sup>15</sup>

**Focus of special effort:** Community empowerment especially of rural women.

**Objectives:** NABDP aims to contribute to the sustainable reduction of poverty and improvement of livelihoods in rural Afghanistan, by empowering communities to give voice to their needs and priorities, and by enabling the government to support rural rehabilitation and development in an integrated, people-focused, inclusive and participatory manner.

**Funding modality:** The Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development (MRRD) is the lead executing agency. UNDP provides direct support through financing the core programme management team.

**Current donors**<sup>16</sup>: UNDP, CIDA, Belgium, Japan, Italy, UNHCR, USA, UK, Norway and Netherlands

Target Budget: US\$ 182 million  
Received Budget: US\$ 112 million  
Shortfall: US\$ 70 million

**Description:** In compliance with the "Principles of Cooperation" in the Afghanistan Compact, which recognises in all policies and programmes that men and women have equal rights and responsibilities, gender is a cross-cutting area of intervention for NABDP. Each unit includes a focus on projects and activities that will specifically address rural women in Afghanistan, and the impact on their social and economic situation.

NABSP includes four strategic units: community empowerment, economic regeneration, institutional development and implementation support

1) Community empowerment: Supporting the creation of District Development Assemblies (DDAs), District Development Plans (DDPs), and Provincial Development Plans (PDPs), as well coordinating and facilitating the provincial consultations process aimed at developing the Interim

---

<sup>15</sup> Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development, Afghanistan, <http://www.mrrd.gov.af/nabdp/> accessed on 09-07-2007.

<sup>16</sup> UNDP Afghanistan, [http://www.undp.org.af/about\\_us/overview\\_undp\\_afg/psl/prj\\_nabdp.htm..](http://www.undp.org.af/about_us/overview_undp_afg/psl/prj_nabdp.htm..)

Afghanistan National Development Strategy (I-ANDS). The goal of NABDP is that, by the end of 2008, all of rural Afghanistan will have active, sustainable District Development Assemblies. Participatory and consultative mechanisms will further be established at district and provincial level to ensure grassroots engagement in integrated rural development planning and implementation processes.

2) Economic Regeneration: Building the capacity of MRRD to formulate and regularly update regional economic regeneration policies and strategies, identify viable interventions for economic investment, poverty reduction and improving livelihoods and provide frameworks for comprehensive rural development planning at regional, provincial and district levels.

3) Institutional Development: Strengthening MRRD institutional capacity and technical capabilities to enable it to effectively fulfill its mandate of promoting rural regeneration and livelihoods at all levels.

4) Implementation Support: Strengthening MRRD's implementation capacity to mobilise its own resources, as well as public and private resources, to effectively coordinate and implement economic regeneration and rural development projects.

One of NABDP's areas of work is to support the creation of community decision-making structures at the district and provincial levels through the process of Community Empowerment.

While MRRD's National Solidarity Programme (NSP) supports the establishment of Community Development Councils (CDCs), NABDP builds on this work to establish District Development Assemblies (DDAs). These DDAs are made up entirely of community members themselves, including a growing number of women.

The formation of the DDA follows several exercises:

- Each CDC nominates its chairperson and vice-chairperson as representatives for a DDA formation workshop. If there is no CDC in the village, members of traditional *shuras*<sup>17</sup> participate in the DDA formation workshop.
- If there is too large a number of representatives from CDC and non-CDC areas, the communities are split into clusters; each cluster elects two representatives for membership in the DDA (maximum DDA membership is not more than 30).
- A representative elected from the CDC will have the status of a full-fledged (permanent) member, while a representative elected from non-CDC area will have the status of interim (temporary) member in the DDA until a CDC is established and a permanent member is chosen.
- The DDA members elect an executive body comprising a chairperson, vice-chairperson, secretary, and treasurer of the DDA.

Through DDAs, community members reflect on the development goals and proposed projects of CDCs and create district-level development priorities regarding education, health, economic

---

<sup>17</sup> Local shuras are an equivalent of village-level councils, <http://hrw.org/press/2002/04/qna-loyagirga.pdf>

regeneration, irrigation and infrastructure. These resulting goals and projects are used in the development of District Development Plans (DDPs). These plans consist of community profiles, a needs-assessment, and a list of critically-needed projects, all explored and identified by DDA members. These plans are communicated to MRRD and various other development agencies serving the specific geographic area.

Community members provide at least some of the labour to the realisation of their identified projects, as well as in-kind resources and even financial support. MRRD, other government agencies, non-governmental organisations (NGOs), provincial redevelopment teams (PRTs), international donors and others are encouraged to support these projects, just as community members themselves are investing their time and resources in such.

In addition to helping to identify community projects, DDAs also build the capacities of community members in a variety of local governance activities:

Participating in development activities and community discussions,

Planning and decision-making,

Leadership responsibilities, and

Abstract issues related to project development, project planning, budgets, savings schemes, etc.

**Preliminary findings:** Regarding the community empowerment unit, 36% of Afghanistan is represented by DDAs. As of mid-2007, 167 DDAs had been established in 18 of Afghanistan's 34 provinces.

**Research observations:** Through the community mapping and needs assessment elements, as well as representation, the community empowerment component could serve as a powerful conduit for the empowerment of the marginalised and excluded. Yet, several questions remain, including whether the conditions for membership and representation on DDA include an element of proportional representation based on criteria of minority, caste, remoteness from the community meeting places, gender, age etc. The question of whether the programme is not making the mistake of not taking into account the different competing roles of women (production, reproduction and community participation) and whether it is accommodating to these multiple roles is needed. Linked to this is the question of whether the programme has envisaged creating safe spaces for community participation particularly for women to encourage consultation and participation. This would be especially relevant in a context where gender and power relations are set or dictated by custom, tradition or religious beliefs.

## **2.2. Freedom of Information Act, India (2002- Present)**

**Focus of special effort:** all citizens of India

**Objective:** To provide to every citizen the freedom 'to secure access to information under the control of public authorities, consistent with public interest, in order to promote openness,

transparency and accountability in administration’<sup>18</sup> and thus facilitate access to public information to all citizens of India

**Funding modality:** n/a

**Description:** n/a

**Preliminary findings:** n/a

**Research observations:** Research efforts could focus on whether socially excluded groups have succeeded in better accessing social services and other benefits due to the implementation of the Freedom of Information Act, and what it entails for children. The movement for the right to information has a long history in India, and freedom to information is a right which enables people to exercise audits of public authorities. The Freedom of Information Act can be used to identify problems in the way public authorities exercise their duties, identify and scrutinise relevant documents to ensure accountability, probity and performance of public authorities (such as muster roll under NREGA or other public works programmes designed to benefit the poor and socially excluded), audit of information for grievance redress, jan sunwais or public hearings etc.<sup>19</sup>

### **2.3. Representational Quotas for Women Councillors in Mumbai, India (1992-Present)<sup>20</sup>**

**Focus of special effort:** To empower women to participate in local governance, the decentralisation legislation of 1992 introduced a clause to the effect that women are to occupy 33% of seats in all local bodies, both rural and urban municipal councils and the ward committees of large cities.

**Objectives:** This measure aims to empower women to overcome inequalities anchored in tradition and culture; discrimination against women in highly patriarchal societies, and other factors that reinforce women’s lower status. This initiative also aims to support the efforts of women who practice transformative leadership, which is defined as a framework within which power is used to create change and develop people and communities, which is described as non-hierarchical and participatory, and giving priority to the poor and marginalised.

**Description:** Roughly 30% of the Mumbai Municipal Councillors are women, which conform to the 74th CCA legislation (dealing with the creation and empowerment of elected municipal bodies and the creation of ward committees in cities with more than 300,000 inhabitants). Its

---

<sup>18</sup> Government of India, Freedom of Information Act, 2002, <http://persmin.nic.in/actrules1.html>

<sup>19</sup> Harsh Mander and Abha Joshi, The Movement for the Right to Information in India: People’s Power for the Control of Corruption, <http://www.humanrightsinitiative.org/programs/ai/rti/india/articles/The%20Movement%20for%20RTI%20in%20India.pdf>

<sup>20</sup> Bridget M. Holzner & Joop de Wit, Supporting Decentralised urban Governance: Training Women Municipal Councilors in Mumbai, India, ISS Working Paper no. 386, November 2003

objectives are interpreted as ‘giving power to the people’, to create appropriate institutional mechanisms for planning and development at local level and imparting greater balance in the state-local and fiscal relations.

**Preliminary findings:** The reservation provision led to a considerable increase in the number of seats held by women. Most women work on the education, health and other social committees where they represent 50-100% of members. Women make up almost 100% membership on the Committee on Women and Child Welfare.

However, very few women are represented on the Financial Standing Committee, which is the principal committee for apportionment of public finance. Also, many women experience difficulties in getting adapted and being accepted into the gendered (male-biased) work space and be viewed as equal partners.

**Research observations:** This initiative presents opportunities for women to influence decision-making especially at the level of technical children’s, women’s, health, education and protection committees in terms of public social policy approach and framework.

This initiative does not entirely guarantee that women will become more influential in decision-making, given their alleged lack of skills and expertise and difficulties in effectively entering the gendered work space presented by the municipal councils. They are less represented on the financial committees where decisions about public finance distribution and redistribution are formulated. Unless these exclusionary practices are addressed, women’s empowerment through positive discrimination will not have a significant impact on social services and development, which require balanced and equitable allocation of public finances to support social programmes.

## **2.4. Affirmative Action (Youth and Women), Nepal<sup>21</sup>**

**Focus of special effort:** Youth, women, traditionally disadvantaged caste-ethnic groups, people with disabilities

**Objective:** To ensure equity of participation in decision-making and in access to opportunities

**Funding modality:** government funding

**Description:** The Local Self-Governance Act (1999) request that 20% of the seats in local government bodies at the Ward and VDC levels be reserved for women. There are quotas for women at the District Development Committee and the municipal levels.

The Civil Service (First Amendment) Act, 1998, includes privileges for women, such as a lowering of the maximum age restriction for joining the Civil Service (a 50% shorter probation period than for men and a shorter minimum service period for promotions). The act also removes the age limit for first and second class officers’ posts in universities and government enterprises.

---

<sup>21</sup> K. Ahmed et al., Social Protection Index for Committed Poverty Reduction, Asian Development Bank, 2006, pp.243-245

The Administrative Reform Committee also recently approved that 20% of seats be reserved for a period of 5 years.

The Ministry of Women, Children and Social Welfare also has special coaching classes for women preparing for the Civil Service examinations.

Quotas are also approved for disadvantaged caste/ethnic groups and people with disabilities. The Administrative Reform Committee approved quotas for disadvantaged groups, with 10% of Civil Service seats reserved for Dalits and 5% for ethnic minorities. The Government has also established the Dalit Development Committee and the National Foundation for the Development of Indigenous Nationalities to assist these disadvantaged groups.

For people with disabilities, the Special Education Council made provisions for 2,000 trained teachers and special classes for 10,000 children with disabilities.

**Preliminary findings:** Over 40,000 women elected to local bodies have benefited from the affirmative action provisions.

**Research observations:** Affirmative action programmes have potential to empower the traditionally marginalised to claim their rights, including to basic social services. As long as the larger social and economic environment is not enabling enough and cannot by itself guarantee access to decent employment, educational and other opportunities, positive discrimination measures for participation in decision-making is a prerequisite for achieving social justice.

## **2.5. Child Clubs, Nepal (Children's and Youth's participation)<sup>22</sup>**

**Focus of special effort:** Child clubs as one form of child participation that is either initiated by adults or children themselves.

**Objective:** The objective of child clubs is to create space for children and youth to exercise their right to association and participation in decision-making, as well as help children deprived of their rights (such as education, protection etc.) with opportunities to exercise them or personal development.

**Funding modality:** This programme is funded by donors, INGO, local NGO support, or in-kind support from the local government, such as meeting space etc.

**Description:** Most child clubs operating in Nepal started with financial, facilitation and logistical support either from donors, international NGOs or local NGOs. Most child clubs undertake activities such as training (e.g. in child rights), information and awareness campaigns, debates, contests, publications etc. to encourage child participation.

---

<sup>22</sup> UNICEF, Learning from Good Practices in Children's and Young People's Participation: Child Club Case Studies, Volume III, UNICEF, December 2004. This proposal is in square brackets because it fails one important criterion of being at least partially funded by the state.

One child club in Bhaktapur focuses on children with disabilities and helps them by providing them with rehabilitation services as well as raising their awareness about the rights of disabled children and encourage the interface between disabled and non-disabled children.

**Preliminary findings:** Child clubs have provided children with public space to debate issues, such as the relationship between education and work, and bring the problem of child labour to the fore; the relationship between education, work and marriage and raise awareness about the consequence of early marriage; etc. Some have also succeeded in helping children enrol and stay in school, as well as helped older child labourers who have missed their schooling years achieve professional and personal development through non-formal educational activities. Some also provide counselling services to children.

The growth of child clubs has recently resulted in the Ministry of Local Development having issued written instructions for a minimum amount of annual village development grants to be used to support children's activities.

**Research observations:** Child clubs come across as a powerful mechanism for achieving child participation and raising awareness of children's rights and relevant issues such as child labour, for instance. What needs to be researched in more depth is the extent to which marginalised and excluded children (such as Dalits etc.) are encouraged to participate and how membership is divided along the usual discrimination and social exclusion criteria, and what mechanisms are in place for preventing child clubs to reinforce social exclusion in their communities by accepting only particular children. Another important aspect is the extent to which child clubs can actually influence local-decision making in children's issues (including education, healthcare, protection etc.)

Research on child clubs undertaken by UNICEF and other organisations show that although membership is normally not restricted on ethnicity or other grounds, most child club members self-select themselves along ethnic or caste criteria and little interface between the castes is actually promoted. Unless the issue of how to empower the socially excluded children and break the wall between the castes is addressed, there is a risk that child clubs might become another means of social segregation and discrimination.

## 2.6. Para-Legal Committees, Nepal (1999– present)<sup>23</sup>

**Focus of special effort:** women and children exposed to violence, abuse and exploitation in local communities

**Objectives:** to create a protective environment for children and women against violence, exploitation, abuse, neglect and discrimination by facilitating their access to justice at the local level

**Description:** The project is meant to address the lacunae in the existing legal framework, which is still limited in protecting children and women from violence, abuse and exploitation. It proposes that community-based organisations and groups' interventions can become effective

---

<sup>23</sup> This description is based on UNICEF, Para-legal Committees in Nepal: Information Kit, Kathmandu, 2006.

protection mechanisms in a context where enforcement of imperfect legal frameworks cannot guarantee protection. It consists of prevention, early detection, case follow-up, and monitoring/reporting.

UNICEF supports a decentralised approach to para-legal committees through the Decentralised Action for Children and Women with the committees having been repositioned over the years as an integral part of the District Protection system, linking them with support services, government agencies and non-government organisations at the district level, and also away from just an anti-trafficking initiative to a comprehensive protection campaign. Thus, para-legal committees facilitate access to services and mediate disputes.

Currently, 301 VDC para-legal committees, counting over 4000 members, are supported by UNICEF in 15 districts in all the five development regions.

**Funding modality:** UNICEF funding in partnership with NGOs and local government

**Preliminary findings:** Para-legal committees have had a high rate of cases solved at the local level, of 78% on average in 2005, with most exceeding 90%.<sup>24</sup> They also successfully monitor the day to day situation of children and women in their communities.

**Research observations:** This programme has a strong focus on social inclusion as it aims to expand its membership of historically disadvantaged groups and ethnic minorities. Exploring whether these groups are not marginalised by the other members on the para-legal committees seems to be an area worth exploring, to see whether social exclusion is not being replicated in this form.

Also, since para-legal committees monitor the situation of children and women, they can be assumed to be in the best position to know the factors that contribute to their social exclusion. Such a research effort could have positive spill-over effects by contributing some evidence in support of the hypothesis that social exclusion is behind the low MDG achievement in Nepal.

This research effort could also contribute evidence about the linkages between social protection, medical care and education at the local level and how effective they are in ensuring the rights of children. Besides, it could contribute to identifying the weaknesses in the state social protection system and propose ways to strengthen it.

These programmes seem to not have been analysed or evaluated sufficiently. Most data and information come from UNICEF documents and reports. Also, this programme is being implemented nationwide, which might present challenges for research within a tight timeframe.

---

<sup>24</sup> The calculations are based on data from seven districts, UNICEF, Para-legal Committees in Nepal: Information Kit, Kathmandu, 2006, Sheet 4, Table 2.

## 2.7. National Gender Reform Action Plan (Grap), Pakistan (2005-present)<sup>25</sup>

**Focus of special effort:** Women

**Objectives:** The promote women's access to the economic, political and social empowerment, at the national, provincial and district level. The main objective of the GRAP is to develop and implement a coherent gender reform agenda, to align policies, structure, and procedures, for enabling the government to implement its national and international commitments on gender and equality issues. The GRAP seeks gender equality in four key areas: Political; administrative and institutional; in public sector employment; policy and fiscal. More specifically, the programme aims to:

To help improve the status of women.

To promote processes that lead towards equal participation of women at all levels of governance, laying the foundation for long-term permanent gender equality in the society.

To ensure effective implementation of gender equality with respect to international conventions, such as the Convention on Elimination of all forms of Discrimination against Women (CEDAW).

To enhance participation of women across the governance sphere at the federal, provincial and district levels.

To ensure that all stakeholders contribute positively towards the goal of gender mainstreaming and equality.

**Eligibility:** Adult women

**Funding modality:** The Federal Cabinet approved the National GRAP on 25 May, 2005, as a coherent gender reform agenda for phased implementation with particular focus on gender mainstreaming.

	NON-RECURRING COST (PAK RS)	RECURRING COST (PAK RS)	TOTAL COST (PAK RS)
<b>TOTAL COST</b>	471,561,855	148,065,011	619,626,866

The plan is to be funded exclusively by the federal government and no foreign exchange component is involved in its implementation.

**Description:** GRAP envisages reforms in the following key areas:

- Political Participation by Women
- Institutional Restructuring

---

<sup>25</sup> Ministry of Women development, Pakistan, accessed on 09-07-2007  
[http://www.pakistan.gov.pk/ministries/ContentInfo.jsp?MinID=17&cPath=182\\_413&ContentID=5056](http://www.pakistan.gov.pk/ministries/ContentInfo.jsp?MinID=17&cPath=182_413&ContentID=5056)

- Women Employment in the Public Sector
- Policy, Budgeting and Public Expenditure Mechanism (Gender Responsiveness)
- Related Capacity Building Interventions.

The component of Gender Development Grants (GDGs) includes Incentive Grants for Local Government and Specific Purpose Grants for Targeting Women (Jointly called GDGs) are the key interventions under GRAP. An amount of Rs 250 million has been released to all the Districts of Pakistan through respective provinces. Each district has been given Rs 2.25 Million. This amount can be spent by districts on the following women specific activities:

- Skill Development
- Training
- Legal aid to women
- Support of maternal and child healthcare
- Female literacy
- Facilities for women councilors
- District /Gender Resource Centre
- Establishment modification and / or improvement of basic facilities for women; like specific space, day care, toilets, restroom, etc.
- Improvement for girls education
- Any other activity / project suggested / recommended by majority of the women councilors within the functions assigned to district Government.

**Preliminary findings:** The success of any reform intervention is subject to a number of constraints, limitations, pre-requisites and political variables. Given that the position and status of women in the society is a function of socio-economic factors, including historical, religious and cultural perceptions, (or misperceptions), there are likely to be many cross currents. No dramatic changes, therefore, can be expected over the short term.<sup>26</sup>

**Research observations:** The success of the Incentives Grants for Local Government seems to lie in the degree of participation and decision-making power that is granted to women. It is important to research whether women have participated in their own needs assessment or whether decisions have been dictated to them by the dominant male group, within the household or the larger community. There are numerous correlates between female literacy and children's education; female literacy and access to healthcare services; skill development and female employment, income and thus bargaining power within the household. Whether this programme has had spill-over effects on the situation of children through the empowerment of women would be of special interest.

---

<sup>26</sup> Ministry of Women development, Pakistan, accessed on 09-07-2007  
[http://www.pakistan.gov.pk/ministries/ContentInfo.jsp?MinID=17&cPath=182\\_413&ContentID=5056](http://www.pakistan.gov.pk/ministries/ContentInfo.jsp?MinID=17&cPath=182_413&ContentID=5056)

## 3. Interventions for Social Inclusion via the Economic Domain

### 3.1. Employment Schemes

#### 3.1.1. Food For Work Programme (FFW) (1975-present), Bangladesh

**Focus of special effort:** The poor and extremely poor households in rural areas

**Objectives:** initially, to provide relief to the poor facing severe food insecurity, subsequently to provide employment to the rural poor during lean periods<sup>27</sup> and thus:

to improve the performance of the agriculture sector through the construction and maintenance of infrastructure for production and marketing;

to reduce physical damage and loss of human life due to floods and other natural disasters through appropriate protective structures; and

To generate productive seasonal employment for the rural poor<sup>28</sup>.

**Funding modality:** The FFW projects are administered by the World Food Programme (WFP) and CARE. The WFP acts as both a conduit and an administrator for multilateral and bilateral food aid for the programme. Major donors include Australia, Canada, the European Union, and the United Kingdom. CARE operates on behalf of the U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID) and administers projects using wheat supplied by the United States.

**Description:** FFW is one of the programmes that falls under the non-monetised channels of the Public Food Distribution System of Bangladesh.

FFW plays a dual developmental role: it provides employment to food-insecure households and individuals, and it creates community assets for which private resources are difficult to mobilise. It involves a number of employment-generating activities, primarily earthwork construction of rural roads and embankments. The programme aims to primarily generate employment for landless and marginal farmers during the slack season when demand for labour in crop production is low<sup>29</sup>.

**Eligibility:** Poor and extremely poor households in rural areas.<sup>30</sup>

**Preliminary findings:** In 2002 and 2003, the Ministry of Food and Disaster Management spent 271.3 million Tk and 165.5 million Tk respectively on the programme.<sup>31</sup> The programme benefited 60,300 people in 2002-2003.

---

<sup>27</sup> K. Ahmed et al, Social Protection Index for Committed Poverty Reduction, Asian Development Bank, 2006, p.34

<sup>28</sup> [www.ifpri.org/pubs/books/vonBraun95/vonBraun95ch03.pdf](http://www.ifpri.org/pubs/books/vonBraun95/vonBraun95ch03.pdf)

<sup>29</sup> Akhter U. Ahmed et al., Bangladesh's Food-for-Work Programme and Alternatives to Improve Food Security, [www.ifpri.org/pubs/books/vonBraun95/vonBraun95ch03.pdf](http://www.ifpri.org/pubs/books/vonBraun95/vonBraun95ch03.pdf)

<sup>30</sup> K. Ahmed et al, Social Protection Index for Committed Poverty Reduction, Asian Development Bank, 2006, p.34

In terms of employment generation, FFW programme does not create additional employment; it largely represents a shift from self-employment and to a smaller extent from other forms of wage-employment.<sup>32</sup>

It is observed that the programme has long-term effects on the local economy. For example, infrastructure development activities carried out under FFW have had a positive effect on output prices and on the adoption of improved technology. These effects have contributed to the generation of new employment.<sup>33</sup>

Among the negative effects, it has been noted that the implementation period of FFW projects conflicts with crop production activities. Also, shortfalls in the utilisation of wheat in several areas were caused by labour shortages in those areas. Over 80% of surveyed labourers (1991 survey) had alternative employment opportunities in agriculture. Another negative effective is that FFW fails to address the problem of slack-season unemployment; rather, with the advancement of dry-season crops, FFW increasingly competes with agricultural activities.<sup>34</sup>

There are mixed results on the effects on wages, because it is believed that most labour shifts from other competing activities; therefore, it would be distorting wages on the market.

Among the other effects observed on agricultural production and income are the accelerated growth in agricultural production occurring with the increased use of improved technological inputs, accompanied by the commercialisation of production. Use of these inputs has been facilitated by irrigation, flood protection, drainage, and other measures provided by FFW programmes over the last two decades in Bangladesh. The programme has also had positive effects on food security and nutrition through improved food security and nutrition primarily due to the increases in real income and the participation of low-income households in these improvements.

**Research observations:** Findings from the 2000 household income and expenditure survey suggest that these programmes are well-targeted towards the poor. However, most of the pro-poor targeting is due to targeting the poor within communities rather than through central actions to target poor areas.<sup>35</sup>

Survey findings also suggest that a large share of the total resources devoted to these programmes disappear before reaching their intended beneficiaries. If these ‘unaccounted-for’

---

<sup>31</sup> K. Ahmed et al, Social Protection Index for Committed Poverty Reduction, Asian Development Bank, 2006, p.34

<sup>32</sup> Akhter U. Ahmed et al., Bangladesh’s Food-for-Work Programme and Alternatives to Improve Food Security, [www.ifpri.org/pubs/books/vonBraun95/vonBraun95ch03.pdf](http://www.ifpri.org/pubs/books/vonBraun95/vonBraun95ch03.pdf)

<sup>33</sup> Akhter U. Ahmed et al., Bangladesh’s Food-for-Work Programme and Alternatives to Improve Food Security, [www.ifpri.org/pubs/books/vonBraun95/vonBraun95ch03.pdf](http://www.ifpri.org/pubs/books/vonBraun95/vonBraun95ch03.pdf)

<sup>34</sup> Akhter U. Ahmed et al., Bangladesh’s Food-for-Work Programme and Alternatives to Improve Food Security, [www.ifpri.org/pubs/books/vonBraun95/vonBraun95ch03.pdf](http://www.ifpri.org/pubs/books/vonBraun95/vonBraun95ch03.pdf)

<sup>35</sup> Rinku Murgai and Salman Zaidi, Effectiveness of Food Assistance Programmes in Bangladesh, abstract, <http://jds.sagepub.com/cgi/content/abstract/21/1-2/121?ck=nck>

benefits are in fact appropriated by the non-poor, the incidence of spending on these programmes could turn out to be pro-rich<sup>36</sup>.

### **3.1.2. Food-For-Work (Employment creation through LGED'S Rural Infrastructure Development Programme), Bangladesh<sup>37</sup>**

**Focus of special effort:** The rural poor

**Objectives:** To reduce food insecurity by employing rural poor to work on construction of infrastructure development works

**Funding modality:** Government funding, supported additionally by the WFP

**Description:** The programme is based on geographic combined with self-targeting to low-income beneficiaries. It is primarily targeted at men. The programme provides 100 million workdays of employment per year, directly benefiting about 4 million rural beneficiaries, equivalent to at least 17 days of additional employment for every landless worker in the construction phase alone.

**Eligibility:** Rural labour eligible and willing to work in labour-intensive public works (through combined geographic and self-targeting)

**Preliminary findings:** The programme provided wages in kind (wheat) to rural labour for working on public works (water, roads, forestry, and fishery) during the slack season. The programme has been successful in creating income for the landless or the near landless. Leakage rates have varied between 30 and 35%. The programme is quite costly, with costs of \$2.1 for the transfer of \$1. The programme has created irrigation and other assets which have reduced the slack season in many covered areas. In 2003, the programme provided 94.8 million person-days of employment for the poor. Expenditures – 389.6 million Tk annually.<sup>38</sup>

During the peak season, food grain distribution covers 20% of total national wheat consumption.

Evaluations reported that the programme has resulted in large increases in food consumption and calorie intake at the household level, and improvements in nutrition of the population in the areas covered by the programme, but no noticeable improvements in the nutritional status of pre-school children.

The programme also reported improvements in agricultural production (through irrigation, shifts to high-yielding crops, and to increases in labour and fertiliser use per unit of land), with smaller effects for the smaller farmers.

---

<sup>36</sup> Rinku Murgai and Salman Zaidi, Effectiveness of Food Assistance Programmes in Bangladesh, abstract, <http://jds.sagepub.com/cgi/content/abstract/21/1-2/121?ck=nck>

<sup>37</sup> Armando Barrientos and Rebecca Holmes, Social Assistance in Developing Countries Database, IDS, University of Sussex, DFID, p.13

<sup>38</sup> K. Ahmed et al, Social Protection Index for Committed Poverty Reduction, Asian Development Bank, 2006, p.35

**Research observations:** The programme has positive effects on food consumption and calorie intake at the household level. It also has positive effects on the rural economy through investments into infrastructure, which can provide further employment and income-generating opportunities.

The programme has not shown positive effects on the nutritional status of pre-school children. This could be an outcome of the fact that by primarily targeting the men, the programme does not offer opportunities to women, who are known to generally prioritise children's education, healthcare and protection.

### **3.1.3. Rural Social Service Programme (Rss) For By-Passed Groups Through Income-Generation Activities, Bangladesh<sup>39</sup>**

**Focus of special effort:** Rural landless or homeless

**Objectives:** To improve the socio-economic conditions of the disadvantaged poor households in rural Bangladesh

**Funding modality:** Government revolving fund

**Description:** The Ministry of Social Welfare distributes a revolving fund to the poor households for self-employment

**Eligibility:** Extremely poor households who are landless and the ones affected by riverbank erosion.

**Preliminary findings:** In 2003, 57,277 households benefited from the programme with the cost of 202,3 million Tk.

**Research observations:** The programme seems to have benefited a large number of households, although the extent of leakage to the non-poor has not been well researched. It could be a good example of a special measure for particular disadvantaged groups because it targets especially the poor who have limited or no assets to capitalise on, such as the landless or homeless (or who have lost their homes).

There might be few independent analyses of the distributional effects of these programmes, and especially their effects on the well-being of children and women.

### **3.1.4. National Rural Employment Guarantee Act, India (Aug. 2005 - Present)<sup>40</sup>**

**Focus of special measures:** This intervention is open to any household that chooses to participate but it is expected that due to the low skills requirements and difficult work conditions, only very poor households in need of basic income will choose to participate. It is thus considered "self-targeting".

---

<sup>39</sup> K. Ahmed et al, Social Protection Index for Committed Poverty Reduction, Asian Development Bank, 2006, pp. 33-34

<sup>40</sup> Ministry of Rural Development, India, NREGA, <http://nrega.nic.in/>

**Objective:** NREGA aims to prevent rural to urban migration.

**Description:** Implemented since February 2006, the National Rural Employment Guarantee Act is aimed at 60 million households and promises 100 days of wage labour to one adult member in every rural household who volunteers for unskilled work in the public sector. Employment must be given within 15 days of application for work. If employment is not provided within 15 days, daily unemployment allowance has to be paid by state government. At least 1/3 beneficiaries have to be women. Drinking water, emergency health care, crèches, and a minder (preferably women) will be at work sites. Gram Panchayats will execute at least 50% of works. Transparency, public accountability, social audit will be ensured through institutional mechanism at central level. Participatory planning exists at all levels. Works undertaken by the scheme include:

- Water conservation and water harvesting
- Drought proofing
- Irrigation canals
- Irrigation facility to the land owned by SC and ST or beneficiaries of land reforms and that of beneficiaries of Indhira Awaas Yojana
- Renovation of traditional water bodies
- Land development
- Flood control works
- Rural connectivity to provide all weather access

**Eligibility:** This programme is limited to households/persons domiciled in the area in which work is sought. Under the programme, migrant families are not entitled to benefit.

**Funding modality:** 90% of funds come from central government and 10% from state (and state pays unemployment allowance).

The National Rural Employment Guarantee Act will cost about Rs 40,000 crore (Rs 400 billion) annually. According to another estimate, however, it could cost about Rs 50,000 crore (Rs 500 billion) annually, or about slightly less than 2 per cent of GDP.

Finance Minister P Chidambaram says that the government will meet the requirement for the job guarantee scheme by:

- Normal increase in budgetary support;
- Savings from existing employment schemes; and
- Additional allocation in gross budgetary support to states.<sup>41</sup>

### **Preliminary findings:**

According to recent NREGA database statistics (data reflect the situation as of the end of November 2006)<sup>42</sup>:

---

<sup>41</sup> *All About India's Rural Job Guarantee Scheme*, <http://www.rediff.com/money/2005/aug/22spec1.htm>

- 33 million households have been issued job cards. Of these, almost 8 million to SCs, over 6 million to STs, and 15 million to others. Most SC and ST households are from the poorest states.
  - The largest numbers of SC household beneficiaries are from such states as Uttar Pradesh, Bihar, Andhra Pradesh, and Rajasthan but also West Bengal.
  - The largest numbers of ST household beneficiaries are from Madhya Pradesh, Rajasthan, Andhra Pradesh, Orissa, but also Chattisgarh.
- In absolute numbers, the largest number of demands for wage employment were registered in the poorest states, with fewer than expected demands from the most densely populated and poor states of Bihar and Andhra Pradesh:
  - Madhya Pradesh – 2.3 million households
  - Uttar Pradesh – 1.9 million households
  - Andhra Pradesh – 1.2 million households
  - Orissa – 1.1 million households
  - Rajasthan – 941 thousand households
  - Bihar – 589 thousand households
  - Assam – 218 thousand households

Followed by large numbers in states with rapidly declining social and economic conditions, such as

- West Bengal – 1.7 million households
- The largest number of person days worked are also registered in the poorest states of Madhya Pradesh, Rajasthan, Uttar Pradesh, followed closely by Orissa and Andhra Pradesh.
- The share of women in total workdays in the poorest states varies from 16.2% in Bihar, to 24.1% in Assam, 34.3% in Orissa, 41% in Madhya Pradesh, 46.6% in Andhra Pradesh, 60.2% in Rajasthan. Some of the states that have been experiencing improvement in terms of economic and social development indicators, such as Tamil Nadu and Karnataka, and some of the richest states, such as Gujarat and Kerala, have very high rates of female participation, with 55.6% in Tamil Nadu and 56.1% in Karnataka, and 61.5% in Gujarat and 65.5% in Kerala.

NREGA has received mixed assessments.<sup>43</sup> Concerns have been raised about the empowerment factor of the intervention – the labour required and the tool with which it is performed is thought to be demeaning by some observers. Also, it is not clear what training, if any, the workers receive before beginning the work, and whether there are professional support services of engineers and rural planners to guide the construction schemes.

Concerns have also been raised about the stigmatisation effects of public works programmes and their potential to realistically alleviate poverty given the low level of wages (basically below the minimum) which determines the success of self-targeting.

---

<sup>42</sup> Ministry of Rural Development, India, NREGA website, <http://nrega.nic.in/conf.asp>

<sup>43</sup> See various articles on NREGA published by The Hindu, <http://www.hinduonnet.com>

Another common concern is that there may be leakages to the non-poor through intermediaries and mismanagement.<sup>44</sup>

**Research observations:** This seems to be an innovative programme, as it is self-selecting, has involved participatory planning, requires a certain percentage of female participants, has mechanisms for transparency, accountability, and social audit, and could result in improvement of infrastructure which would yield additional social and economic benefits. It could be highly transformative, if sustainable, since it could change the nature of the rural economy.

Because this scheme was only recently implemented, it may be difficult to collect reliable information about its effects. Several institutes are currently involved in researching different aspects of NREGA, such as assessing the impact of NREGA on employment trends, wages, asset holdings etc. Most focus on aspects of implementation. Few focus on women's access to employment under NREGA, and the studies of impacts on children's well-being are scarce.

NREGA is a large-scale scheme and may present challenges for research efforts that have a relatively tight timeframe. One option might therefore be to conduct research only in a geographically limited area, or to concentrate on a particular aspect, e.g. impacts of NREGA on the access of beneficiaries (women)' children to healthcare or education within a more comprehensive study of child poverty (as a multi-dimensional phenomenon).

From the gender perspective, given the nature of the public works (road, irrigation etc.), women might feel disadvantaged and not take up work even when they need it and seek informal alternatives. Statistics shows that not in all poor states do women represent a large part of workdays, despite the fact that, in absolute terms, women's workdays in poor states are larger than in the other states.

### 3.1.5. Sampoorna Grameen Rozgar Yojana (Sgry), India (2002-Present)<sup>45</sup>

**Focus of special effort:** The poor, with preference given to agricultural wage earners, non-agricultural unskilled wage earners, marginal farmers, women, members of Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes and parents of child labour withdrawn from hazardous occupations, parents of children living with disabilities or adult children of disabled parents who desire to work for wage employment

**Objectives:** The primary objective is to provide additional wage employment in all rural areas and thus provide food security and improve nutritional levels. The secondary objective is to create durable community assets, social and economic assets and infrastructural development projects in the rural areas.

**Funding modality:** Government funding, with 5% of funds retained in the Ministry for utilisation in the areas of acute distress arising out of natural disaster or for preventative measures in the chronically drought or flood affected rural areas; a certain percentage reserved for the Special Component to meet exigencies arising out of natural calamities; and the

---

<sup>44</sup> Jayati Ghosh, *Making the Employment Guarantee Work*, [www.macroscan.org](http://www.macroscan.org)

<sup>45</sup> Sampoorna Grameen Rozgar Yojana (SGRY) Guidelines, <http://rural.nic.in/SGRY%20Guidelines%20-%20Final.htm>

remaining funds and food grains available in two streams from the Department of Rural Development, with the first stream implemented at the district and intermediate Panchayat levels (50% of funds and food grains available for the first stream and distributed between the Zilla Parishad and the Intermediate Panchayats in the ratio of 40-60; the second stream implemented in the Village Panchayat level, and 50% of funds and food grains earmarked for the Village Panchayat and distributed among them through the DRDAs/Zilla Parishads.

**Description:** Under the programme, wages are paid partly in food grains and partly in cash; with minimum wages fixed by the state authorities to be paid both for skilled and unskilled labour.

SGRY provides under the first stream that 22.5% of the annual allocation to the Zilla/DRDA and the intermediate level Panchayat must be spent on individual beneficiary schemes for SC/STs below the poverty line, such as:

- Development of allotted land
- Social forestry works
- Agric-horticulture, floriculture, horticulture plantation on the private lands belonging to SC/STs below poverty line
- Infrastructure works for any self-employment programme
- Open irrigation wells/ bore-wells for irrigation
- Pond excavation / re-excavation with primary support for pisciculture
- Other sustainable income-generating assets

Under the second stream, priority is given to the following public works:

- Infrastructure support to SGSY
- Infrastructure required for supporting agricultural activities in the village Panchayat
- Community infrastructure for education, health and internal as well as link roads (such as link the village road to the main road)
- Other socio-economic community assets.

The programme also provides opportunities for building assets for improving the quality of life, such as dwelling units, and sanitary latrines. Priority is given to providing economic assets to individual beneficiaries for sustainable employment.

The guidelines also provide for audit, including social audit, of works, to ensure transparency, accountability, and social control. They also provide for regular monitoring and reporting.

**Eligibility:** Eligibility is determined by self-targeting, with preference given to agricultural wage earners, non-agricultural unskilled wage earners, marginal farmers, women, members of Scheduled Castes/Scheduled Tribes and parents of child labour withdrawn from hazardous occupations, parents of disabled children or adult children of disabled parents

**Preliminary findings<sup>46</sup>:** In 2000-01, the programme recorded an expenditure rate of 83%, with a total of 218 million person-days, of which over 75 million for Scheduled Castes, 48 million for Scheduled Tribes, and 95 million for other groups of beneficiaries. Women accounted for almost 60 million of total person-days.

**Research observations:** This programme is the result of merger of several wage-employment programmes for the purpose of improving food security, providing additional wage-employment and building village infrastructure at the same time. Given its multiple purposes, the programme simultaneously provides temporary employment and creates the prerequisites for long-term employment opportunities and development through investments into rural infrastructure, which is especially relevant for ensuring long-term conditions for decent employment for adults.

The programme provides arrangements for facilities like crèches for children accompanying working mothers. More research is needed into the way these provisions impact on the situation of children, such as whether this has the unintended effect of turning children into child labourers by way of helping their mothers meet the requirements of works. Research could address: the number of adults (including women) actually benefiting from long-term employment as a result of infrastructure development in the rural areas; the number of families (including with children) who have preferred public works employment over migration; they have actually been better off as a result; impacts of the programme on the welfare of children.

### **3.1.6. Swarna Jayanti Shahari Rojgar Yojana (SJSRY) – An Employment Programme For Urban Poverty Alleviation, India (1997-Present)**

**Focus of special effort:** This measure falling under the umbrella programme of Swarna Jayanti Shahari Rojgar Yojana (SJSRY), targets the urban under-employed or unemployed, i.e. the urban poor, defined as those under the poverty line, with special attention given to women.

**Objective:** It seeks to provide gainful employment to the urban unemployed or underemployed through encouraging the setting up of self-employment ventures or provision of wage employment. This programme relies on creation of suitable community structures and delivery of inputs through the medium of urban local bodies and such community structures.

#### **Eligibility:**

- The programme is applicable to all urban towns in India.
- The programme is implemented on a whole town basis with special emphasis on urban poor clusters.
- The programme targets the urban poor, defined as those living below the urban poverty line, as defined from time to time.

---

<sup>46</sup> <http://rural.nic.in/book01-02/ch-2.pdf>

- Special attention is given to women, persons belonging to Scheduled Castes / Tribes and disabled persons and other such categories as may be indicated by the Government from time to time.
- There is no minimum educational qualification for beneficiaries under this programme. However, this scheme is not applied to beneficiaries educated beyond the IXth Standard.
- A house to house survey for identification of genuine beneficiaries is being done. Non-economic parameters will also be applied to the urban poor in addition to the economic criteria of the urban poverty line.
- All other conditions being equal, women beneficiaries belonging to women-headed household, viz. widows, divorcees, single women of even households where women are the sole earners and are ranked higher in priority.

**Funding modality:** The SJSRY is funded on a 75 % and 25 % basis between Centre and the States.

**Description:** The Swarna Jayanti Shahari Rojgar Yojana (SJSRY) consists of several special schemes, incl.: 1) the Urban Self Employment Programme (USEP) and 2) the Urban Wage Employment Programme (UWEP) has three components.

The Urban Self Employment Programme (USEP) includes:

1. Assistance to individual urban poor beneficiaries for setting up gainful self-employment ventures.
2. Assistance to groups of urban poor women for setting up gainful self-employment ventures. This sub-scheme has been titled as "The Scheme for Development of Women and Children in the Urban Areas (DWCUA)".
3. Training of beneficiaries, potential beneficiaries and other persons associated with the urban employment programme for upgradation and acquisition of vocational and entrepreneurial skills.

The component focusing on setting up micro-enterprises and skill development has a maximum unit cost of 50,000 Rs, with 15% of the project cost subsidised by the government to a maximum ceiling of 7,500 Rs, to which the beneficiary has to contribute 5%.

The component focusing on training and infrastructure support has a training cost per person of 2,000 RS, with a training period covering 2-6 months subject to a minimum 300 hours of training, and a toolkit worth 600 Rs.

The component of the programme focusing specially on women, called Development of Women and Children in Urban Areas (DWCUA), aims at helping groups of urban poor women in taking up self-employment ventures. The group may consist of at least 10 women. The ceiling of subsidy under the scheme is Rs. 125,000 or 50% of the cost of the project whichever is less. Where the group sets itself up as Thrift & Credit Society, in addition to its self employment

venture, it is eligible for an additional grant of Rs. 25,000 as revolving fund at the rate of Rs. 1,000 maximum per member. The fund is meant for purchases of raw materials and marketing, infrastructure support, one-time expense on child care activity, expenses up to Rs. 500 on travel cost of group members to bank, payment of insurance premium for self / spouse / child by maintaining savings for different periods by a member and any other expense allowed by the State in Group's interest. The revolving fund can be availed by a Group only after one year of its formation.

The Urban Wage Employment Programme (UWEP) has the following features:

- This programme seeks to provide wage employment to beneficiaries living below the poverty line within the jurisdiction of urban local bodies by utilising their labour for construction of socially and economically useful public assets.
- This programme applies to urban bodies, having population less than 500,000 as per the 1991 Census.
- The material labour ratio for works under this programme is to be maintained at 60:40. The prevailing minimum wage rate, as notified from time to time for each area, has to be paid to beneficiaries under this programme.
- The programme has to be dovetailed with other state schemes but is not designed to either replace or substitute them.

**Preliminary findings:** In the last three years, the total number of self-employment loans given under SJSRY has been just 952, which is less than one per cent of the below-poverty line families. The rate of repayment of loans has also been dismal at 20 per cent, discouraging banks from lending to those identified. Training and community structure components of the programme also lack linkages to employers and jobs.

A survey identified that almost 20 per cent of the recipients of loans under SJSRY admitted voluntarily that they were not from below-poverty line families. Several others who classified themselves as below-poverty line were unlikely to be so because of the quality of life indicators as they owned their own house, television, radio and tape recorder.

**Research observations:** These employment schemes, if administered properly (i.e. free of the error of including the non-poor), present potential for improving children's well-being given their strong focus on poor women, although the same caveats apply as in the case of other employment schemes, i.e. the negative externalities of girl children taking up more household work as a result of their mothers working and missing out on their educational opportunities increases.

These employment schemes have not been well researched/ evaluated especially in terms of their impact on children's well-being, so there is little preliminary information/findings to start with.

### 3.1.7. Assisted Economic Migration, Nepal<sup>47</sup>

**Focus of special effort:** Youth (with priority to conflict-affected people and women)

**Objectives:** To assist the youth with taking up employment opportunities abroad

**Funding modality:** Government subsidised loans

**Eligibility:** the youth taking up employment opportunities abroad

**Description:** Under the 10th plan, the government introduced loans, at subsidised interest rates, to assist the youth to travel abroad for employment opportunities. Loans of 100,000 NRs were made available under this programme to out-migrants.

**Preliminary findings:** The government has been criticised for not offering sufficient protection to the out-migrants from exploitation of foreign employers, profiteering local agents etc.

**Research observations:** This is an out-ward looking special measure for addressing youth un- or under-employment. However, this programme has narrow and short term approach, i.e. instead of focusing on creating employment opportunities inside the country or encouraging youth to contribute to the national economy through investing their remittances, the programme focuses on credit for finding employment opportunities abroad. In this case, migration and employment abroad is a short-term external opportunity that the government is responding to, and therefore, facilitated migration has limits in term of enhancing social exclusion or addressing the poverty MDGs, unless protection and social security issues are properly addressed.

### 3.1.8 Food For Work Programme, Nepal<sup>48</sup>

**Focus of special effort:** Poor households

**Objectives:** To provide direct employment to the poor

**Funding modality:** donor and government funding

**Description:** The programme provides cash and in-kind payments to the poor in return for work done in labour-intensive public works programmes. Recently the programme has been renamed Rural Community Infrastructure Works (RCIW), because of the shift in focus towards building rural infrastructure in communities, e.g. rural roads. The programme covers 30 districts.

The programme is administered by the Ministry of Local Development and the Ministry of Forest and Soil Conservation through the local level government bodies.

**Preliminary findings:** In 2002/03, an estimated 50,000 households (303,000 people) benefited from the programme by receiving food for work. The total annual budget in 2002/03 was 7.8

---

<sup>47</sup> K. Ahmed et al, Social Protection Index for Committed Poverty Reduction, Asian Development Bank, 2006, p.243

<sup>48</sup> K. Ahmed et al, Social Protection Index for Committed Poverty Reduction, Asian Development Bank, 2006, p.242

million USD, of which the government contributed 1.2 million USD. Of the total expenditures, 50% (4 million USD) were spent on wages paid in rice, while 18% (1.3 million USD) was spent on construction materials.

**Research observations:** It is a programme to which the government contributes roughly 15%. It is a self-targeting programme, exclusively addressing the needs of the poor. To date, the poor participants account for over 90% of beneficiaries. The poverty-targeting rate (which provides an indication of the distributional impacts of the programme, but not of the effectiveness of the programme) for this programme is 50%.<sup>49</sup>

The effects of the programme on children and women have not been well studied. Also, there is a recent trend of moving away from food-for-work towards cash-for-work programmes, given that it has been recognised that the poor can make reasonable spending choices (as they usually prioritise family food security, children's education and health).

### 3.1.9. Khushal Pakistan Programme (Kpp), Pakistan (2000-Present)<sup>50</sup>

**Focus of special effort:** To empower economically the poor people, especially the women of Pakistan.

**Objectives:** A social intervention aimed at generating economic activity through public works and temporary employment, and thus creating jobs and providing crucial infrastructure in rural and low-income areas.

**Funding modality:** Government funding: Funds are allocated under the Programme to the districts through provincial governments, the schemes under the programme are identified and selected at the district level through active community participation, and the projects are managed and implemented in partnership with the communities.<sup>51</sup>

**Description**<sup>52</sup>: The Khushal programme covers 17 sectors including farm-to-market roads, water supply, sanitation, waters sources etc. The major thrust of the programme has been in rural areas. The KPP schemes are implemented through the District Governments.

The programme is expected to result in adding an equivalent of 1% of GDP in social sector spending by establishing a Khushal Pakistan Fund. It is intended to support a holistic approach to improving livelihoods and reducing poverty. It is expected that the modalities and mechanisms put in place for implementing the programme will guarantee inclusive participation of all stakeholders including district and sub-district governments, local communities, and civil society.

---

<sup>49</sup> K. Ahmed et al, Social Protection Index for Committed Poverty Reduction, Asian Development Bank, 2006, p.275

<sup>50</sup> ILO [http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/gems/eeo/program/pakistan/t\\_mce.htm](http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/gems/eeo/program/pakistan/t_mce.htm)

<sup>51</sup> World Bank, Poverty in Pakistan in the 1990s: An Interim Assessment: Summary of the Report, Prepared by the World Bank for the Pakistan Human Development Forum (January 24-16, 2002), Islamabad, January 2002, <http://siteresources.worldbank.org/PAKISTANEXTN/Resources/pdf-Files-in-Events/Poverty+Paper.pdf>

<sup>52</sup> Closing Statement by M. Ali Shah, Country Director, Pakistan Resident Mission Asian Development Bank, at the Pakistan Development Forum Organised by Government of Pakistan in Islamabad, Islamabad, Pakistan, 25-26 April 2005, <http://www.adb.org/Documents/Speeches/2005/sp2005027.asp>

It is expected that the benefits of the programme are widespread and have a sustainable impact at the grassroots level. Its monitoring and evaluation system is expected to ensure that the programme reaches the intended beneficiaries, and that resources made available are utilised in an accountable, transparent, and cost-effective manner.

**Eligibility:** The urban and rural poor

**Preliminary findings**<sup>53</sup>: Since March 2000, the government has provided Rs 31.5 billion to finance 34,812 schemes selected through community participation. In 2005-06, Khushal Pakistan Programme KPP-I programme was provided Rs 4420.00 million<sup>54</sup>. In 2005 fewer schemes were approved compared to the same period in the previous year. Most schemes are for road construction, electrification, sanitation, with very few for the health and education infrastructure.

The programme has also resulted in construction of farm-to-market roads, rehabilitation of water supply schemes, small rural road, streets, drains, and storm channels in villages. Moreover, the programme has been supplemented with the schemes for lining of watercourses and laser land levelling, desalting canals, and provision of civil amenities in towns, municipal committees, and metropolitan corporations.<sup>55</sup>

By December 2003, the programme has generated 0.9 million temporary employment. The average length of employment was 40 days; assuming the prevailing unskilled labour rate of 100 PRs per day, the total expenditures on job-creation is estimated to be in the order of 323 million PRs.<sup>56</sup>

Some critical challenges identified include ensuring targeting efficiency, maximising employment and stabilisation benefits, and creating community infrastructure beneficial to the poor.<sup>57</sup>

**Research observations:** This is a promising programme, which besides providing employment, also creates assets.

Few evaluations of the programme are easily accessible to the public; therefore it is difficult to judge the extent to which women have benefited from the programme, either directly or through

---

<sup>53</sup> Government of Pakistan, Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper: Accelerating Economic Growth and Reducing Poverty: The Road Ahead, IMF Country Report No. 04/24, January 2004; PRSP Secretariat, Finance Division, Government of Pakistan, Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper Third Quarter Progress Report for the Year 2004-05, [http://www.moe.gov.pk/3rd%20Quarter%20Progress%20Report%20\(2004-05\).pdf](http://www.moe.gov.pk/3rd%20Quarter%20Progress%20Report%20(2004-05).pdf)

<sup>54</sup> Government of Pakistan, Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper: Accelerating Economic Growth and Reducing Poverty: The Road Ahead, IMF Country Report No. 04/24, January 2004; Government of Pakistan, [http://www.pakistan.gov.pk/ministries/planninganddevelopment-ministry/annual%20plans/2006-07/Chapter\\_6/Rural%20Development.pdf](http://www.pakistan.gov.pk/ministries/planninganddevelopment-ministry/annual%20plans/2006-07/Chapter_6/Rural%20Development.pdf)

<sup>55</sup> Ishrat Husein, Pakistan's economic turnaround: An Untold Story, Reproduced from the Pakistan Supplement Global Agenda, World Economic Forum Annual Meeting 2005 held at Davos in January, 2005, [http://www.sbp.org.pk/about/speech/economic\\_management\\_policies/2005/Pakistan\\_Economic\\_Turnaround.pdf](http://www.sbp.org.pk/about/speech/economic_management_policies/2005/Pakistan_Economic_Turnaround.pdf)

<sup>56</sup> K. Ahmed et al., Social Protection Index for Committed Poverty Reduction, Asian Development Bank, 2006, p. 307

<sup>57</sup> World Bank, Poverty in Pakistan in the 1990s: An Interim Assessment: Summary of the Report, Prepared by the World Bank for the Pakistan Human Development Forum (January 24-16, 2002), Islamabad, January 2002, <http://siteresources.worldbank.org/PAKISTANEXTN/Resources/pdf-Files-in-Events/Poverty+Paper.pdf>

the assets created in the communities. Given that most schemes require hand manual labour (road construction, electrification etc.), it could be assumed that few women feel encouraged to take these jobs.

## 3.2 Welfare Schemes/ Social Assistance

### 3.2.1. National Solidarity Programme (NSP), Afghanistan<sup>58</sup>

**Focus of special effort:** Aims to empower especially women in rural communities by requiring women's mandatory representation on the newly created Community Development Councils (CDCs).

**Objective:** To help rebuild communities, achieve sustainable rural livelihoods and community-based development.

**Eligibility:** Communities where a Community Development Council was set up where women are represented, and where the community is willing to contribute 10% in labour, materials or funds, for the project to be funded.

**Funding modality:** CIDA funding (part of the total of \$600 million provided by the Canadian Government since 9/11).

**Description:** The National Solidarity Programme (NSP) is the Government of Afghanistan's flagship programme for community development. It empowers the grassroots of Afghan society by facilitating the establishment of local governance bodies, Community Development Councils (CDCs), in villages. This is considered key to strengthening local governance and citizen participation, and to increasing the government's legitimacy and capacity.

The Government gives block grants in cash directly to these elected bodies, which should mandatory include women, in order to be eligible for the block grants. The block grants are used to help them build and restore rural infrastructure that communities choose through an inclusive decision-making process. To build ownership, the community contributes a minimum of 10% of the cost of each project through donations of cash, labour, or construction materials.

Preliminary findings: By November 30, 2006, over 15,000 CDCs had been elected and almost \$250 million in block grants had been disbursed to CDCs in 276 districts and all 34 provinces in the country.

Under NSP, more than half of the community projects involve productive infrastructure such as irrigation, roads, and village electrification, which thus promote productivity and stimulate local economies. A quarter involves safe drinking water and sanitation, which assures better health for the communities.

---

<sup>58</sup> Canadian Agency for International Development, <http://www.acdi-cida.gc.ca/CIDAWEB/acdicida.nsf/En/JUD-125141414-QKF#1>; Statement by Mr. Ahsan Akhtar Malik, Joint Secretary (LW) on Global Report Under the Follow Up to the ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principle and Rights at Work, Geneva, 9 June 2006, [http://missions.itu.int/~pakistan/2005\\_Statements/Labour\\_ILO/stakhtarmalik\\_9jun06.htm](http://missions.itu.int/~pakistan/2005_Statements/Labour_ILO/stakhtarmalik_9jun06.htm)

As of November 30, 2006, almost 20,000 projects had been initiated, of which over 9,000 have been completed so far. These include:

5,000 in water supply and sanitation - 25%;

4,000 in transport - 20%

- 3,500 in irrigation - 17.5%;
- 3,000 in power - 15%;
- 1,800 in livelihoods - 9%;
- 1,700 in education - 8.5%;
- 300 in rural development - 1.5%;
- 22 in health - 0.1%;
- 22 public buildings - 0.1%;
- 17 in agriculture - 0.09%; and
- 10 in emergency response - 0.05%;

**Research observations:** This initiative supports women's political participation and empowers so that they could exercise more leverage on prioritising programme for women's and children's development. The project contributes to transforming the rural economy by creating additional assets and employment. Community-based development also has positive spill-over effects on the wellbeing of women and children through the assets created by the projects, such as health centres, educational institutions, and water and sanitation facilities.

It is not clear the extent to which women's representation on the Community Development Councils guarantees that they are empowered in terms of knowledge and political leverage. Women's representation on technical committees, such as the budget committee or the welfare committees, needs to be researched in order to identify whether they have indeed been able to exercise their decision-making power, especially in communities where no behaviour change programmes have been implemented to change the perception of women and the understanding of their multiple roles, e.g. productive, reproductive and community life. One impediment to researching this programme might be the limited independent information available, including on evaluations, or the inaccessibility of the information.

### **3.2.2. Microfinance Investment Support Facility for Afghanistan (MISFA) (2003-present)**

**Focus of special effort on:** The poorest -mostly women- and vulnerable groups (women, disabled and working poor)

**Objectives:** The goal is to build an integrated financial sector, removing the barriers that separate the microfinance community from the broader financial system, and, ultimately, to provide access to financial services for all.

Beneficiaries are able to start new businesses; to buy a land, tools and/or farm animals; to make others investments that are improving their lives and those of their families.

**Funding modalities:** MISFA serves as a multi-donor wholesale financial intermediary for the microfinance sector.

As the largest donor, Canada contributed over \$40 million to MISFA. Norway, Switzerland, United Kingdom, United States, and the World Bank also support MISFA. The World Bank's Afghanistan Reconstruction Trust Fund administers Canada's contribution. The Trust Fund is structured to ensure transparency and accountability in the use of international aid.

MISFA's micro-credit activities are implemented through 13 microfinance institutions (MFIs). Beginning as a national or international NGO, MFIs break away from the parent organisation and eventually become a self-sustainable Afghan microfinance service provider.

**Description:** MISHA focuses on providing financial services to vulnerable groups by providing credit. Generally, loans range from \$100 to \$700 (5,000 – 35,000 Afs) from 3 and 12 months. The average size of the loan is \$200 (10,000 Afs).

#### **Preliminary findings:**

Summary of achievement to date:

- **MISHA as an autonomous entity:** MISHA was established within MRRD as a semi-independent wholesale financial intermediary for the microfinance sector. In March 2006, MISHA registered under Afghanistan Investment Support Agency (AISA) and became an independent entity with a board of directors comprised of representatives from the government and the private sector and micro finance experts representing donor agencies.
- **Geographical coverage of the sector:** To date, MISFA has signed contracts with 15 MFIs, and expects to have more MFIs in near future. As of December 2006, these MFIs have opened 206 branches in 98 rural districts and in 24 provincial centres.
- **Micro-credits and savings:** Microfinance is one of the most vibrant sectors and is an integral part of the total financial sector. To date, MFIs have 330,000 active clients (savings and borrowers) with an outstanding loan portfolio of US\$71,500,500. The cumulative repayment rate is nearly 99%.
- **Microfinance support for women:** At present, there are over 173,852 women client, which approximately 74% of the MISFA clients. MISFA has trained over 400 Afghan women in microfinance. Also, two thirds of more than 2800 microfinance staff is women.

**Research observations:** Financial services for the poor have proven to be a powerful instrument for poverty reduction that enables the poor to build assets, increase incomes, and reduce their vulnerability to economic stress.<sup>59</sup>

This programme launched by the Afghan government has shown interesting outcomes and, most significantly, in terms of gender equality. Almost three-quarters of the MISFA clients are women, which contributes to women's economic empowerment. Thanks to these income-generating activities, women are enabled to play a key role in terms of economic development. Furthermore, they are more likely to support and meet their children's needs.

### 3.2.3. Food-Based Social Safety Net Programme, Bangladesh

**Focus of special effort:** The poor

**Objectives:** To alleviate poverty

**Funding modality:** Government funding [possibly supplemented by WFP funding]

**Description:** There are several types of food-based social safety net programmes, including target food for education programmes (1993-2002)

The programme is administered by the Ministry of Food and Disaster Management.

**Preliminary findings:** In 2002-2003, it benefited 10 million people. Its expenditures totalled 18.0 billion Tk<sup>60</sup>.

Recent research identified that in Bangladesh, the provision of flood relief in the form of wheat led to an increase in the consumption of wheat and to a greater increase in the total number of calories consumed than would be achieved under a cash transfer of an equivalent value<sup>61</sup>.

Self-targeting food rations (sorghum) programmes in Bangladesh, recorded low levels of leakage to the non-poor, e.g. 10-20%<sup>62</sup>.

The targeted Food for Education programme, which provided a free ration of food for children enrolled in school, had the lowest level of leakage of 8-14 percent<sup>63</sup>. The Government of Bangladesh supported a food-for-education programme between 1993 and 2002. It provided a free monthly ration of food grains to poor families in rural areas if the children enrolled in

---

<sup>59</sup> Canadian International Development Agency, Micro finance programme in Afghanistan – National Programme, <http://www.acdi-cida.gc.ca/CIDAWEB/acdicida.nsf/En/JUD-1251644-SQ4>

<sup>60</sup> K. Ahmed et al, Social Protection Index for Committed Poverty Reduction, Asian Development Bank, 2006, p.43

<sup>61</sup> Harold Alderman, Subsidies as a Social Safety Net: Effectiveness and Challenges, No. 0224, September 2002, <http://siteresources.worldbank.org/SOCIALPROTECTION/Resources/SP-Discussion-papers/Safety-Nets-DP/0224.pdf>, p.12

<sup>62</sup> Harold Alderman, Subsidies as a Social Safety Net: Effectiveness and Challenges, No. 0224, September 2002, <http://siteresources.worldbank.org/SOCIALPROTECTION/Resources/SP-Discussion-papers/Safety-Nets-DP/0224.pdf>, p.22

<sup>63</sup> Suresh Chandra Babu, Social Safety Net for Poverty Reduction, Sri Lankan Journal of Agricultural Economics. Vol. 5, No. 1, 2003, <http://www.slageconr.net/sjae/sjae51f/sjae05101.pdf>

primary schools, and maintained an 85% attendance rate. The family could consume the grain, or sell it and use the cash to meet other expenses. Before the programme was terminated in 2002, the food-for-education covered 27% of all primary schools and enrolled about 1/3 of all primary school students. Food-for-education beneficiary students accounted for 13% of all students in primary schools in Bangladesh. The costs of the programme, including the value of food grains, was roughly 37\$/beneficiary student/year. Research shows that enrolment rates increased, particularly for girls, but this resulted in excessive classroom crowding<sup>64</sup>. The food-for-education programme was converted after 2002 into a cash for education programme.

**Research observations:** These programmes are shown to have very low levels of leakage to the non-poor; therefore they can be assumed to be effective poverty alleviation programmes. Some of the sub-programmes, such as the food-for-education showed mixed results; and therefore were terminated.

It could be interesting to have a comparative analysis of the benefits of the two programmes and what changes in terms of outcomes for families and children the two programmes have brought about, as well as the difference in additional contributing factors.

The food-based social safety programmes in Bangladesh are various in nature, e.g. food-for-work and food-for education, and thus could challenge the research efforts. The choice should be guided by criteria of availability of data and evaluation results of their poverty-impact and especially impact on children and women.

#### **3.2.4. Palli Karma Sahayak Foundation (PKSF) Programme, Bangladesh (1990-present)<sup>65</sup>**

**Focus of special effort:** The poor

**Objectives:** To alleviate poverty through household-based micro-credit

**Eligibility:** different categories of poor, including the hardcore poor

**Funding modality:** Palli Karma Sahayak Foundation funds

Description: Palli Karma Sahayak Foundation is the government apex micro-credit and capacity-building organisation (an umbrella organisation for 192 NGOs involved in micro-crediting). It provides loanable funds under different credit programmes:

- rural micro-credit
- urban micro-credit
- micro-enterprise credit
- micro-credit for the hardcore poor

---

<sup>64</sup> International Food Policy Research Institute, Do Crowded Classrooms Crowd Out Learning? Evidence From the Food for Education Programme in Bangladesh, <http://www.ifpri.org/themes/mp18/wfp/FFE.pdf>

<sup>65</sup> K. Ahmed et al, Social Protection Index for Committed Poverty Reduction, Asian Development Bank, 2006, p. 49

**Preliminary findings:** A total of 276.87 million USD has been disbursed among 4.55 million poor borrowers by the end of Feb 2004.

**Research observations:** Among its different programmes, micro-credit of the hardcore poor deserves special attention. Given that it has been implemented since 1990, independent reviews of the programmes and its impact on the poor are available.

It needs to be clarified what the share of government and private funding involved in the programme is and the kind of loans that are being extended to the hard-core poor, including the conditionality attached. The literature on micro-credit points out that micro-credit can bring the poor immediately under the poverty line above it, but cannot really alleviate hard-core poverty and expect that the poor invest in productive activities because they are more oriented to consumption rather than production.

### **3.2.5. Vulnerable Group Development, Bangladesh (1975-1987; 1987-present)<sup>66</sup>**

**Focus of special effort:** Destitute rural women

**Objectives:** To help destitute rural women to improve their economic and social condition

**Eligibility:** Based on geographic targeting and committee-based selection

**Funding modality:** Government funding through the Ministry of Women and Children's Affairs, with support from the WFP and other bilaterals

**Description:** The programme used geographic targeting, complemented by a selection of beneficiaries by local committees based on criteria of family composition, assets, and personal characteristics. The programme provides in-kind wheat transfers, as well as a complementary package of development services – including health and nutrition, education, literacy training, savings, and support to launch income-earning activities - to poor women to improve their economic and social condition. The monthly free wheat ration is 31.25 kg for a period of two years.

**Preliminary findings:** The programme has covered 575,000 households. As of 1994, 29% of VGD households received the full development package, while the others received the monthly wheat ration and savings component. The transfer was around 1/5 of average monthly expenditures and totalled roughly 41 Tks.

Research has shown that 30% of grain is sold rather than consumed. 15% of grain did not reach the beneficiaries. Quintile participation rates decrease from 8.5% in the poorest to 2.1% in the richest quintile.

---

<sup>66</sup> Armando Barrientos and Rebecca Holmes, Social Assistance in Developing Countries Database, version 2.0 March 2006, IDS, University of Sussex, DFID, p.12

The in-kind transfers increased wheat consumption by 70% for VGD households compared to 14% for in-cash based equivalent transfers. This is partially attributed to the lack of access of women to local markets to sell the grain. Thus the increase in the calorie intake was 16% for in-kind compared to 10% for cash transfers. The programme did not register noticeable improvements in the nutritional status of pre-school children.

At its peak the annual subsidy totalled 54 million USD.

**Research observations:** The development component of the programme is of a special interest, because it focuses on building the long-term capacity of the poor for mitigating poverty. Therefore, a comparative analysis of the impact on beneficiaries receiving both in-kind and development support and on those receiving only in-kind support could provide new insight, especially in terms of the long-term impacts on the social-economic conditions of the household.

Some primary research might be needed in order to thoroughly evaluate the programme, which seems to indicate that in-kind wheat transfers work better in Bangladesh than in-cash transfers, especially in terms of improving the calorie intake and nutritional status of households. If Bangladesh presents some facilitating cultural or contextual factors for the success of this programme, it might not be advisable to recommend it for replication on other contexts.

### 3.2.6. Pakistan Bait-ul-Mal (Pbm) Programme, Pakistan (1992-present)<sup>67</sup>

**Focus of special effort:** The poorest-of-the-poor, the destitute, widows, orphans, invalids, the disabled and other needy persons, as per eligible criteria approved by Bait-ul-Mal Board.

**Objectives:** To provide social protection to poor and marginalised segments of the society and thus contribute to poverty alleviation

**Eligibility:** The destitute, the needy, widows, orphans, invalid, infirm, and other needy people. 3% of beneficiaries are selected from minority groups. The beneficiaries are selected through the District Steering Committee headed by the District Nazim<sup>68</sup> or District Coordinating Officers (DCO) as the chairperson and consisting of chairperson of the District Zakat Committee, a notable citizen, a notable woman nominated by Bait-ul-Mal, a notable citizen representing the minorities, a lady councillor, and the district head of Bai-ul-Mal or its social mobiliser.

**Funding modality:** Government funding, managed by public servants

**Description:** Pakistan Bait-ul-Mal (PBM) is an autonomous body set up through the 1991 Act working under the umbrella of the Ministry of Social Welfare and Special Education. The programmes works through the following modalities:

---

<sup>67</sup> Government of Pakistan, Bait-ul-Mal, [http://www.pbm.gov.pk/new/Introduction\\_Links.html](http://www.pbm.gov.pk/new/Introduction_Links.html)

<sup>68</sup> The City District Government consists of Zila Nazim and District Administration. The City District Government shall be competent to acquire, hold or transfer any property, movable and immovable, to enter into contract and to sue or be sued in its name, through District Coordination Officer.

- Financial assistance to the destitute, widows, orphans, the disabled, other needy persons with emphasis on rehabilitation
- Educational assistance to needy orphans and stipends for outstanding, non-affording students for higher professional education
- Residential accommodation and necessary facilities for the poor
- Free medical treatment, free hospitals and rehabilitation centres for the poor
- Financial aid to charitable institutions including educational and vocational centres.
- Sponsorship and promotion of self-employment schemes.

Whereas Zakat provides assistance only to Muslims, Bait-ul-Mal provides assistance to non-Muslims as well.

Bait-ul-Mal's main programmes of assistance to individuals are:

- **Food Support Programme**, launched in 2000 (designed to meet the basic nutritional requirements of the poor and vulnerable sections of the population). The aim is to compensate low-income families for increases in wheat prices. The largest programme in terms of fund allocation and number of beneficiaries.
- **Individual Financial Assistance**, to people in need because of economic shock caused by loss of income (5,000-30,000 PRs to families), high cost of medical treatment (a maximum of 300,000 PRs), being a poor student (stipends of different rates), being disabled (in-kind support, e.g. tricycles, wheelchairs, crutches, artificial limbs etc.).
- **Prevention of Child Labour**. It funds 83 National Centres for the rehabilitation of child labour, which provide financial support to families and children to compensate for lost earnings and run non-formal educational institutions. The benefits include a monthly stipend of 300 PRs, free uniforms and school supplies, and daily pocket money of 10 PRs.
- **Tawana Pakistan (girls' school feeding programme)** in 29 districts. It is a primary school feeding programme for girls in 29 high poverty districts. The programme is implemented through NGOs. The purpose is to improve school attendance by girls, girl's health.
- **Vocational schools**
- **Funding for NGOs**
- **Support for small business**

2 provinces have established their own Bait-ul-Mal programmes (Punjab with 6 categories of assistance; focusing basically on vocational training and institutions for the destitute, women, children, and physically and mentally challenged).

**Preliminary findings:** Under the Food Support Programme, 1.12 million households received support in 2003. Each household receives a total of 2,000 PRs/annum.

Under the Child Labour Reduction Programme, in 2004, a total of 9,060 children benefited. The programme provides assistance for purchase of books and stationary of 4,100 PRs per year. The total cost of the programme in 2003-04 was 78.4 million PRs.

The total cost of the Tawana Pakistan Programme which ran until 2006 was 3.6 billion PRs, to which Bait-ul-Mal contributed 542 million PRs. In 2004, a total of 236,649 female students benefited from the programme.

Recent evaluations suggest that the programme has a high rate of leakage; applying for assistance is a time consuming procedure; transparency appears to be a problem in terms of the level of discretion exercised by functionaries in allocating the funds. The transfers have a limited impact on poverty<sup>69</sup>.

**Research observations:** It is a comprehensive programme, targeting over 1.13 million people which is funded by the government, with several important relevant components aimed at alleviating and preventing poverty. The food support and individual financial assistance components deserve special attention because they aim to help families mitigate hunger (food support to the destitute) or cope with poverty (income support to cope with economic shock resulting from loss of income etc.). The programme has over 3 million beneficiaries, both direct and indirect<sup>70</sup>, covering between 2.2 % (narrow coverage) and 6.9 % (wide coverage) of the population. Its poverty-targeting is 75%, corresponding to almost 850,000 net poor beneficiaries. It can be assumed that this programme has beneficial effects for children in the respective households.

It is a very large project; therefore, research efforts should focus on only one or two of its components which aim to provide direct assistance to children.

### **3.2.7. Zakat Programme, Pakistan (1980-present)<sup>71</sup>**

**Focus of special effort:** Poor people

**Objectives:** To provide social assistance to the neediest

**Eligibility:** Local Zakat committees (a total of 39,891, with the chairperson receiving a remuneration of 250 PRs per month) select eligible recipients among the eligible population – a person or household with income below the official poverty line of 748.56 PRs in prices of 2001.

**Funding modality:** It is funded through compulsory religious obligations, implemented through Local Zakat committees, while centrally administered by the Ministry of Religious Affairs, Zakat and Ushr

**Description:** The programme is funded based on compulsory collection of Zakat (levied at the rate of 2.5% on savings and profits exceeding roughly 5,000 PRs) and Ushr (levied on farm produce, representing 5-10% - depending on the form of irrigation - of income from all crops) from all Sunni Muslims.

---

<sup>69</sup> Armando Barrientos and Rebecca Holmes, Social Assistance in Developing Countries, version 2.0 March 2006, IDS, University of Sussex, DFID

<sup>70</sup> K. Ahmed et al, Social Protection Index for Committed Poverty Reduction, Asian Development Bank, 2006, p.351

<sup>71</sup> K. Ahmed et al, Social Protection Index for Committed Poverty Reduction, Asian Development Bank, 2006, p.314-16

Under the Zakat and Ushr Ordinance, Zakat is used as assistance to the needy, the indigent and the poor particularly orphans and widows, and the handicapped and the disabled, for their subsistence or rehabilitation, either directly or indirectly through deeni madaris (Islamic seminaries) or educational, vocational or social institutions, public hospitals, charitable institutions and other institutions providing healthcare; and also as assistance to the needy persons affected or rendered homeless due to natural disasters and for their rehabilitation; and for the administration of the Zakat and Ushr funds.

There are 6 categories of Zakat expenditures:

- Guzara allowance – stipend to poor households (60%). It is paid at the rate of 500 PRs per month to the neediest persons. Each local Zakat committee selects up to 10 such persons. In 2002, a total of 810,414 households received the subsistence allowance, with total expenditures of 2,623 million PRs. In 2003, there were 859,017 beneficiaries and total expenditures constituted 2.083 million PRs. The average amount per beneficiary in 2002 was 3,236 PRs and in 2003 2,425 PRs.
- Educational stipends for students in mainstream educational institutions (18%). Stipends are available from primary to university education. The monthly rates of stipends in 2003 were 50 PRs for primary school, 112 PRs for high school, 375 PRs for college, 750 PRs for postgraduate school, and 874 PRs for professional degree courses.
- Educational stipends for students in Deeni Madaris (8%). The stipends are especially for the poor and orphaned children. The stipend ranges between 500 and 750 PRs per month.
- Healthcare cash grants for poor patients (6%). Costs of medication and surgery are covered.
- Social welfare (4%). Stipend and a lump sum grant for vocational training of poor women and men.
- Marriage assistance (4%). A grant of 10,000 PRs for dowry or marriage expenses for marrying women.

Additionally, there is a rehabilitation scheme, which selects from among the Guzara recipients' persons who would initiate a business to earn a living. A grant of 5,000-50,000 PRs is provided per person. Also, the Guzara recipients are eligible to apply for the Eid grant, which is an additional monthly stipend on the occasion of Eid.

**Preliminary findings:** In 2003, over 600,000 people benefited from the Guzara allowance, almost 90,000 benefited from the rehabilitation grant; almost 70,000 from the healthcare grant and 13,000 from the social welfare stipend.

**Research observations:** This is a programme funded entirely by the state through ear-marked taxes. It is in principle targeted to the neediest, based on a community's own mapping of poor people.

The beneficiaries are selected by the community, which means that there is room for abuse of power by the community leadership. In fact, the Zakat programme poverty-targeting analysis

shows that only 49% of Zakat beneficiaries are poor<sup>72</sup>. The tax is a Muslim religious obligation (levied on Muslims and distributed among Muslims) and therefore context-specific.

### 3.2.8. SAMURDHI PROGRAMME, SRI LANKA<sup>73</sup>

**Focus of special effort:** the poor

**Objectives:**

- improve access and quality of care for the poorest groups;
- enhance the efficiency and impact of income transfer, public works and community development schemes;
- help the poor to more effectively manage catastrophic risk; and
- address the special poverty needs of socially excluded groups.

**Eligibility:** Poor individuals and households

**Funding modality:** Government funding, plus WB funding for the reform of the programme

**Description:** The Samurdhi Programme has four components:

- 1) Income transfer component
- 2) Community development through investments in economic and social infrastructure, agriculture, nutrition and small enterprise
- 3) Savings and financial markets component
- 4) Social Security Trust Fund

Under the first component, the Samurdhi programme provides cash grants to some 2.1 million families and separate cash grants to 82,000 families under the infant nutrition programme. It also operates a range of compulsory savings programmes, a Samurdhi bank society and national youth job creation and village development efforts.

Samurdhi Programme is the single largest welfare programme in the country, with total expenditures of 11.7 million Rs in 2000, or nearly 1% of GDP. With an inflation adjustment for cash transfers, costs increased by 22% in 2000. The number of Samurdhi beneficiaries has increased steadily from 1.5 million families in 1995 to 2 million families in 2002 and early 2002.

The government reduced funding for the programme by 25% between 2001 and 2002 for better targeting of limited financial resources.

---

<sup>72</sup> K. Ahmed et al, Social Protection Index for Committed Poverty Reduction, Asian Development Bank, 2006, p.354

<sup>73</sup> Government of Sri Lanka, Regaining Sri Lanka: Vision and Strategy for Accelerated Development, December 2002

Under the third component, the government has encouraged savings through some 70,000 Samurdhi household groups and more than 1,000 Samurdhi bank societies (SBS). There were 920 Samurdhi bank societies at the end of 2000, with some 1.5 million accounts opened. The total savings in the SBS reached Rs.1, 588 million and loans were granted to a value of Rs.2,745 million at the end of 2000. Repayment rates under Samurdhi credit programmes are quite high (due in part to the use of future welfare payments as quasi-collateral) and there is evidence that the Samurdhi banks are flexible enough to cater to the needs of the poor. These institutions also play an important role in providing emergency credit to the poor.

Under the fourth component, households contribute Rs. 25 per month against which they can claim insurance payments for death of a family member (Rs. 5,000), marriage of one child (Rs. 3,000), birth of a first child (Rs. 2,000) and illness (Rs. 50 per day hospitalisation up to Rs. 1,500 for a year). In its first three years of operation, some 11% of those covered have claimed benefits, and the programme has been able to build reserves. The Samurdhi Social Security Trust Fund plans to expand coverage to education insurance, old age pensions and a broader medical insurance.

The reform proposed, *inter alia*:

- One-off reduction of non-deserving beneficiaries
- Tightening of eligibility and financing only of those community development projects that are well designed and thoroughly endorsed by the local community, including a far greater measure of community cost-sharing
- Samurdhi Bank Societies will be placed under an autonomous apex body and will establish formal linkages with the commercial banking sector.
- Social insurance, both provided by Samurdhi and by NGOs and the private sector will be expanded—government will provide a regulatory environment and help partly defray premium costs for the poor.

**Preliminary findings:** While around 1.5 million households benefit from the cash transfer programme, recent research finds that the programme does not assist some 40% of the poorest income quintile. Therefore, recently the programme was proposed for revision. A new Social Welfare Benefit Law has been enacted in order to establish the legislative base for restructuring the ongoing Samurdhi Programme and for targeting social assistance to eligible persons without politicisation. Clear eligibility and exit criteria will be established to limit the programme to the truly needy. In the medium-term, all welfare schemes will be brought under the Welfare Benefit Law, effectively ensuring that social assistance is well targeted to the needy<sup>74</sup>.

Many of the Samurdhi capital and enterprise development projects are planned and executed in an ad-hoc manner, resulting in technically inferior investments and limited community involvement in maintaining assets.

**Research observations:** It is a large government programme covering over one third of the total population, which has a significant cash transfer component, and also encourages the

---

<sup>74</sup> Government of Sri Lanka, *Regaining Sri Lanka: Vision and Strategy for Accelerated Development*, December 2002

participation of the poor in the production processes through the community development component, which, it can be assumed, would contribute to building and maintaining the long-term asset base of the community.

Given that the programme is being revised, the research efforts might not yield the desired results. Also, it has been recognised that political considerations have tended to influence the regional (and location specific) allocation of public investment programmes, the selection of beneficiaries to participate in the programme; leakage to the non-poor might have undermined the effectiveness of the programme. The reform proposes to limit the beneficiaries to the deserving poor.

## **4. Interventions for Social Inclusion via the Social Domain**

### **4.1. Education**

#### **4.1.1. Community-Based Education, Afghanistan, (2006-present)<sup>75</sup>**

**Focus of special effort:** Aged school children living in rural and remote areas

**Objectives:** To provide access to good quality primary education to girls and boys in remote and marginalised rural areas where access to existing Ministry of Education facilities is impractical and/or there are high numbers of out of school age boys and girls who can not attend normal schools.

**Eligibility:** Student's enrolment

- Children (boys and girls) of school age (e.g. age 7-9 for grade one) are eligible for enrolment in community based outreach schools/classes.
- Children (boys and girls) of (10-15) years old are eligible for enrolment in community based accelerated learning classes.
- Students are transferred to formal schools using formal school transfer forms whenever appropriate.

**Funding modality:** Government and community co-funding

**Description:** Community-Based Schools (CBSs) are schools which are jointly established by government and communities, and facilitating partners in remote, rural and sparsely populated areas (villages) where schooling facilities for children do not exist, or the distance to functioning schools is too long, or there are no separate facilities for girls and boys or other reasons.

The government recognises two types of community-based schools:

---

<sup>75</sup> Islamic government of Afghanistan, Ministry of Education, Community-based education, August 2006

## 1- Community-based outreach schools/classes (CBOS)

CBOSs are considered where the primary schools in a community (cluster of villages) can not cover the students in remote or scattered villages. Community Based Outreach Schools/Classes are schools having classes from grade 1 to 3<sup>76</sup>. CBOSs are established in the villages with a population of at least 20 households (100 persons) and with a distance of more than 3 km from primary schools or where other factors prevent children from traveling to schools outside their village. For MOE administrative and management purposes, the CBOSs are linked to the nearest primary/secondary Hub-school in the community (cluster of villages) and function as outreach classes of the Hub-school. Initially the communities will have to provide some contribution<sup>77</sup> for establishment and running CBOSs. When the number of households in the village/community increases to more than 100 household (500 person) the CBOS may be upgraded to Primary School.

## 2- Community-based accelerated learning schools/classes.

CBALSs are interim schools having accelerated learning classes covering the primary curriculum (Grades 1 – 6) for out of school age children aged 10 to 15 years. The CBALSs are established in villages where more than 20 out of school age children (10-15) are willing to enrol and catch up on primary education and communities are supportive of such initiative. For MOE administrative and management purposes, the CBALCs function as alternative classes of the nearest primary/secondary Hub-schools for out of school age children. In the initial stages of the implementation of this policy, it is the MOE expectation that, through a process of negotiation and consultation, the communities will have to provide some contribution<sup>78</sup> for the establishment and running of CBALSs.

**Preliminary findings:** n/a

**Research observations:** This programme was introduced in 2006. Therefore, there are few preliminary results available to get a better understanding of the success of the programme. It would be useful if a baseline was established to monitor progress and impacts.

### 4.1.2. Primary Education Stipend Project (PESP), Bangladesh (2002-03 to 2006-07)<sup>79</sup>

**Focus of special effort:** Poor families.

**Objectives:**

- To increase the enrolment rate of all primary level school age children of poor families,
- To increase the attendance rate of the enrolled students of the primary schools,

---

<sup>76</sup> In case the government can not cover the villages by establishing new formal schools for continued education the CBOS can go through grade 6 if possible

<sup>77</sup> Learning space, part of teacher salary

<sup>78</sup> Learning space, part of teacher salary

<sup>79</sup> Government of the People's Republic of Bangladesh, Ministry of primary and mass education, directorate of primary education.

- To reduce the drop-out rate and to increase the primary cycle completion rate of the enrolled students,
- To established equity in the financial assistance to all primary school age children for poverty alleviation,
- To enhance the quality of primary education,
- To enhance women empowerment

**Eligibility:** Criteria include distressed female headed families (widows, separated from husband or divorced); day labourers; insolvent professionals (such as fishermen, weavers, potters, carpenters, cobblers and blacksmiths); landless persons or persons who have the ownership of land up to 0.50 acres.

**Funding modality:** This 5-year project is funded by the government of Bangladesh at a total cost of 33,123.12 million taka, and an annual cost of 6,624.62 million taka

**Description:** The monthly rate of stipend per family is TK 100.00 for sending one child to the school and TK. 125.00 for sending more than one child.

**Conditions:**

- Every beneficiary student must have 85 % class attendance per month.
- All enrolled beneficiary students must get 40% marks in the annual examination
- At least 10 % of the total students of class V of a school must appear in the primary scholarship examination.
- Every enlisted primary school must conduct class wise schedules examinations properly. Otherwise defaulter schools will not get stipend.
- If any beneficiary student fails to appear in scheduled examinations without reasonable grounds his/her stipend will be suspended.
- On an inspection day with fair weather if the total of students' attendance is 60% or bellow, the stipend for the school may be suspended. If attendance rate improves to the satisfactory level the suspension may be withdrawn.

**Preliminary findings:** This 5-year-programme has been successful in terms of increasing enrolment rates among primary level school age children and it will be run over for the next five years (2006-07 to 2011-12).

**Research observations:** The programme has been researched extensively, therefore any new research needs to adopt a new angle of analysis and bring value added. For example, the effect of the programme on elder children might provide new insight on the effects of the programme,

such as whether it has increased their domestic workload with the younger siblings going to school or whether it has served as an incentive for them to enrol in informal education programmes. Also, the indirect effects on women's and girl's empowerment need to be looked at more closely in this context.

#### **4.1.3. Bangladesh Female Secondary Stipend Programme (1994 – present):**

**Focus of special effort:** Secondary school female students

**Objectives:**

- To increase enrolment and continuance of female students at the secondary level
- To reduce population growth by encouraging girls to postpone marriage
- To increase women's involvement in socio economic development activities and women's self-employment
- To improve the status of women in society; and
- To strengthen the Directorate of Secondary and Higher Education through implementation support and capacity building

**Eligibility:** The girl must attend school for at least 85 percent of the school year, achieve at least 40 percent marks on annual examination, and must remain unmarried.

**Funding modality:**

FSSAP phase 1 (1994-2001) total cost \$85.8 million of which Bangladesh government contributed 26%, stipend component 77% of total cost. Phase 2 (June 2002 to Dec 2007) total cost \$144.62 of which Bangladesh government proposed share is 16%.

NORAD FESP phase 2 Jan 1997 to Dec 2000 total cost Tk. 600,000,000 or NOK 100 million entirely for stipends, no Bangladesh government share.

SESIP phase 2 Dec 1999 to April 2006 \$ 86 million (\$60 million net of taxes, duties and interest) Bangladesh government contributes 30%, stipend component \$17.458 million 20% of total costs and 34% of the cost component for equitable access to secondary education.

Government expenditure on the stipend programme is financed through the annual development programme (ADP) budget. In 1998-99 government expenditure for the stipend programme including donor supports accounted for 14.5 percent of total secondary education budget and 6 percent of total education budget. Of the total amount allocated for stipend and tuition in that year (Tk 2847.6 million) government funded FSSP accounted for 59 percent indicating the government's strong commitment to increasing girls' access to secondary education.

**Description:** Cash grant, book allowances, examination fee, and tuition fees for all girls in secondary schools.

This nation-wide programme is implemented through four different sectoral projects of the Ministry of Education (MoE), sharing the overall broad objective of developing and reforming the education sector. These are:

- the government financed Female Secondary School Project (FSSP) in 270 upazilas;
- the World Bank (IDA) assisted Female Secondary School Assistance Programme (FSSAP) from 1994 to 2000 in 118 upazilas,
- the Asian Development Bank (ADB) assisted Secondary Education Development Project (SEDP) from December 1993 to June 2000, followed by the Secondary Education Sector Improvement Project (SESIP) in 53 disadvantaged upazilas;
- NORAD assisted Female Secondary Education Stipend Project (FESP) in 19 upazilas, which has completed its second phase from January 1997 to March 2002.

**Preliminary findings:** GPI rose from 0.52 to 1.05 over the past decade; girls are now in the majority at the secondary level. There is a positive attitude among communities towards female secondary education. The payment of stipend directly into girls' bank accounts is empowering and minimises leakages. There is no selection of stipend awardees, so the intervention is easier to implement.

Despite the programme's positive impact on enrolment, completion rate for girls is still extremely low at 8%. In addition, the stipend meets only a part of the direct costs (direct costs include textbooks, supplies and equipment (notebooks, sketchbooks, pens and pencils), transportation, meals and school uniforms where these are required for school attendance) and is the same for all girls in each grade. Thus, there is unintended exclusion of the poorest girls because the amount of the stipend is too low to cover all costs of sending a girl to school, an effect that is contrary to the aim of the programme to increase universal access.

It has also failed to reach girls in underserved areas due to poor private investment in educational institutions in those areas. But apart from increasing the amount of the SSC fee to Tk. 500 (from the previous Tk. 250) donors are not considering the option of increasing the stipend amount for the very poor on the grounds of cost escalation and inadequacy of information about why some girls do not get enrolled. Conversely, donors are in favour of withdrawing universal stipends as currently provided and considering the justification for targeting stipends to the most needy because of the need for cost reduction and financial sustainability.<sup>80</sup>

**Research observations:** This programme has been regarded as very effective, and could be a very good example of a transformative social policy intervention. It has managed to change social norms (there is a positive attitude among communities regarding the education of girls)

---

<sup>80</sup> Simeen Mahmud, Bangladesh Institute of Development Studies, Female Secondary School Stipend Programme in Bangladesh: A critical assessment, July 2003, [http://72.14.235.104/search?q=cache:A6V4M2tIzMIJ:portal.unesco.org/education/en/file\\_download.php/6c1807a68c58613a407957a6adbd8cc7Female%2Bsecondary%2Bschool%2Bstipend%2Bprogramme%2Bin%2BBangladesh.doc+Female+Secondary+School+Stipend+Programme+in+Bangladesh&hl=en&ct=clnk&cd=1](http://72.14.235.104/search?q=cache:A6V4M2tIzMIJ:portal.unesco.org/education/en/file_download.php/6c1807a68c58613a407957a6adbd8cc7Female%2Bsecondary%2Bschool%2Bstipend%2Bprogramme%2Bin%2BBangladesh.doc+Female+Secondary+School+Stipend+Programme+in+Bangladesh&hl=en&ct=clnk&cd=1), accessed 19-6-2006

and it has also empowered girls, so could offer valuable lessons for other social policy interventions. Bangladesh is one of the few South Asian countries to have achieved gender parity in primary education by 2005.

The Female Secondary Stipend Programme has been identified as a “best practice” and has thus been the focus of many studies. Measures would have to be taken to ensure that this research is not duplicated. The programme is also implemented nation wide, which might present challenges for research efforts within a relatively tight timeframe.

#### **4.1.4. Basic Education for Hard-To-Reach Urban Working Children (BETRUC), Bangladesh (2004-present).<sup>81</sup>**

**Focus of special effort:** Urban working children

**Objective:**

- To provide quality non-formal, life-skills-based basic education to 200,000 urban working children and adolescents ages 10 to 14 years of which at least 60% will be girls;
- To provide 20,000 (out of 200,000) urban working children and adolescents (13+ age group) with livelihood skills training, and access to support systems to ensure optimal use of life-skills-based basic education to improve their life;
- Advocate at City and National levels for education, social and economic policies in favor of working children and their families and for protecting children from hazardous working environment;
- Increase awareness of all relevant stakeholders to act in favor of progressive elimination of child labour.

**Description:** The BETRUC Project focuses on an "earn and learn" strategy by creating learning centres. It tries to build on the strengths that the working children already possess, and further support child's self-esteem and self-confidence.

It aims to ensure access, equity and quality education to these working children. Quality non-formal education can help prepare working children for broader options available to them so that they can make their choices regarding their future - to access further education, to gain access to appropriate skill training and work or to negotiate for better conditions in their present work.

It also tries to provide a child-friendly environment where interactive learning takes place. By coming to learning centers, children get an opportunity to mix with their peers and get peer support, and meet teachers who are not punitive in their ways. These interactions help children to gain self-confidence.

---

<sup>81</sup> Bangladesh's Ministry of Women and Children affairs, [http://www.mopme.gov.bd/Basic%20Education%20to%20Hard%20to%20Reach%20\(06-07\).htm](http://www.mopme.gov.bd/Basic%20Education%20to%20Hard%20to%20Reach%20(06-07).htm), accessed 09-07-2007

**Preliminary findings:** It covers 351,000 working children, who are between the ages of 8-14 years, in 6 major cities of Bangladesh. It is a two-year course, two hours a day, six days a week. At the end of the course children achieve an equivalency of grade 3 and can be admitted to mainstream education. During the two hours, the child stays away from (hazardous) work and instead spends it in an enjoyable environment where they gain knowledge of life skills; health care; their rights; ways of identifying and coping with hazardous work situations; as well as other relevant issues. This two hour period is regarded as a first step in discouraging them from engaging full-time in hazardous and exploitative occupations and seeking safer alternatives.<sup>82</sup>.

Some of the positive aspects of the project observed so far include:

- The government is now committed to provide working children access to education and considers it to be a major tool to reduce child labour;
- For the first time a curriculum designed to meet the needs of working children has been developed;
- Views of working children are incorporated wherever possible to improve the performance of the project. These working children, who have been carrying out adult responsibilities and making important decisions everyday of their lives also have an idea of what is good for them.
- 50% of the learners are girls (Job opportunities for girls are generally very poor, among waste picking, domestic help, brick chipping, sex work, etc. Many girls, who work and attend school, end up working more hours than boys of their age. Girls are expected to do household chores as well, which leave them no time for rest or recreation) who are also given scope for recreation and play.<sup>83</sup>

### **Research observations:**

This programme seems to be based on the principle of respect for the rights of the child, including the right of the child to work, while ensuring fulfilment of the child's fundamental right to education. Providing non-formal education to working children allows the child to continue working and supplementing household income without significant damage to his/her education and without reducing the range of options of gainful and decent work that would be available to the children as an adult. Such an arrangement helps the child avoid poverty resulting from immediate income deprivation but also from other forms of deprivation, such as knowledge and information without which the child would be limited in options and would not be able to escape the cycle of poverty. What would be interesting to research in this case are the learning outcomes of the children as well as their changing behaviour and practices, and expectations in terms of attitude to knowledge and education, desired future profession and work environment. On a more macro-scale, it would be interesting to research how the ratio of working girls to working boys has changed throughout the cycle. One potential difficulty in this might be that the out-of-school programmes have to deal with constant fluctuations in the student contingent and

---

<sup>82</sup>UNICEF – Bangladesh, "Child Labour and the Globalising Economy: Lessons from Asia/Pacific Countries", Stanford University, California. <http://www.childlabour.org/symposium/noble.htm>

<sup>83</sup> Idem

that no explicit objective of measuring a child's learning progress over the time is set for the programme.

#### **4.1.5. Balika Samridhi Yojana Scheme, India (1997-present)<sup>84</sup>**

**Focus of special effort:** The girl child

**Objective:** The scheme was launched with the specific objective of changing communities' attitudes towards the girl child (and possibly also preventing female foeticide and infanticide, which is still common in many parts of the country, such as the state of Tamil Nadu), to improve enrolment and retention of girls, to raise the age of marriage, and to assist the girl to undertake income generating activities as a means of breaking the cycle of poverty, once she reaches maturity.

**Eligibility:** The benefit is restricted to only two girl children per family, irrespective of the number of children in the household.

**Funding modality:** Currently it is a Union government funded scheme, but a proposal was made to transfer it to the states.

**Description:** The scheme targets girls born on or before 15 Aug 1997 from families below the poverty line in rural and urban areas. The scheme was re-designed in 1999 to ensure that the benefits accrue to the girl child instead of to the family.

The assistance takes the form of a grant of 500 Rs, which is deposited in an interest-bearing account. Also, once the girl starts attending school, she automatically becomes eligible for annual scholarship, which can be used for books, uniforms or for paying premium on an insurance policy in the name of the girl etc (it can also be paid in kind at the request of the guardian). All accrued interest will be paid to the girl upon reaching maturity provided she can present proof of unmarried status. In case of the girl's death before the age of 18, accrued interest is withdrawn.

**Preliminary findings:** The programme has so far targeted 3.5 million children and incurred expenditure of 176,64 crore Rs (1.77 billion Rs).

**Research observations:** This scheme has potential for contributing to girl child survival and development because of its multiple objectives, incl. changing community attitudes towards the girl child. It is a special measure because it targets girl children from poor and disadvantaged families.

It is not a well-researched and evaluated programme because it is too early to assess it, as the first beneficiaries are only now entering their primary school. There might be some concern over the long-term consequences of the scheme, such as whether the amounts are indexed to inflation over time, to guarantee a sufficiently large amount of accrued interest to help the child break the inherited cycle of poverty.

---

<sup>84</sup> D.B. Gupta, Conditional Cash Transfers and Behaviour Change in India, first preliminary draft, 2006, -. 10-13

#### 4.1.6. Nutritional Support For Primary Education (Midday Meals Scheme), India<sup>85</sup>

**Focus of special effort:** Primary school children

**Objective:** The programme aimed at universalising education increasing enrolment, retention, and attendance and simultaneously improving the nutritional status of primary school children.

**Eligibility:** Primary school-age children

**Funding modality:** Government funding

**Description:** The programme was extended to children studying in the Learning Centres of Education Guarantee Schemes (EGS) and Alternatives Innovative Education (AIE) Centres Schemes. Under this scheme, the government provides free food grains, cost incurred in transportation of food grains and cooking costs.

**Preliminary findings:** The programme is almost universal in coverage. During 2006-07 expenditures for the midday meal scheme totalled 27 billion Rs, covering 120 million children. The programme varies in approach from state to state. In some, it provides dry rations, in others cooked meals.

**Research observations:** This programme has been extensively evaluated by researchers and government-sponsored agencies.

There is evidence to suggest that school meals do not necessarily improve the nutritional status of children.

#### 4.1.7. Welcome to School Campaign, Nepal (2004- present)

**Focus of special effort:** Girls and disadvantaged groups (with a focus on increasing their enrolment)

**Objective:** The Welcome to School campaign was launched to help achieve Millennium Development Goal number two: to ensure that all children, girls and boys alike, have access to primary school by 2015.

**Description:** Initiated by UNICEF and its partners in 2004, Welcome to School was first introduced in 1,600 primary schools in 13 pilot districts. The campaign was conducted in two phases. First there was an enrolment drive focusing on girls and disadvantaged groups. Then came a push to improve teaching and learning environments so that children could be retained long enough to complete primary school.

UNICEF worked to engage and coordinate partnerships between local governments, non-governmental organisations, other UN agencies and 6,400 community groups.

By 2005, the campaign was expanded to all of Nepal's 75 districts.

---

<sup>85</sup> D.B. Gupta, Conditional Cash Transfers and Behaviour Change in India, first preliminary draft for comments (no date), p. 13

**Preliminary findings:** The campaign greatly increased enrolment and literacy rates for girls and disadvantaged children. According to data from the Ministry of Education, more than 470,000 children – almost 270,000 girls and over 200,000 boys – have enrolled in primary schools nationwide since the campaign was introduced. This result by far exceeds the enrolment target of 160,000.

Throughout the country, schools, students, teachers and community organisations are rallying to ensure that no child of school age is left without access to education. In many schools, children receive notebooks and pencils as encouragement to come to classes. The Ministry of Education also has provided some 125,000 scholarships to first-time learners entering school, in addition to scholarships for girl students.

The Welcome to School initiative faces its share of challenges, however. Traditional customs, poverty and lack of school infrastructure and teaching staff combine to create impediments to school enrolment in Nepal, particularly for girls.

UNICEF and its partners are working to improve this situation in various ways. For example, pilot programmes are helping disadvantaged girls make the transition from primary to secondary school. Some of these efforts are already beginning to show positive effects.<sup>86</sup>

**Research observations:** This is a good example of a programme that is aiming at universal access (in this case, to education) by implementing “special efforts” to reach excluded groups (girls and disadvantaged). It has had a positive impact on enrolment and seems to have effectively engaged students, teachers, and communities.

Although the intervention was meant to focus on the disadvantaged, it has been argued that the campaign focuses on all children, rather than just on girls and the disadvantaged.<sup>87</sup> This is the case because the way the campaign is implemented is determined locally, which in itself is worth researching<sup>88</sup>. This campaign was also implemented nationwide, which might present challenges for research efforts with a relatively tight timeframe.

## 4.2. Healthcare

### 4.2.1. Integrated Child Development Services Schemes (ICDS), India (1975-present)<sup>89</sup>

**Focus of special effort:** Children up to the age of 6; pregnant women and nursing mothers

**Objectives:** To ensure a holistic development of children up to the age of 6 with a special focus on children up to the age of 2; expectant women and nursing mothers

---

<sup>86</sup> Sagun S. Lawoti, ‘Welcome to School: Rallying for Universal Access to Education in Nepal,’ 7 June 2006, <http://www.reliefweb.int/rw/RWB.NSF/db900SID/EGUA-6QKRP?OpenDocument>

<sup>87</sup> Communication from Susan Durston, Regional Education Adviser at UNICEF ROSA

<sup>88</sup> Communication from Eriko Onoda, Planning Officer, UNICEF Nepal Country Officer

<sup>89</sup> D.B. Gupta, Conditional Cash Transfers and Behaviour Change in India, first preliminary draft for comments (no date), p. 17

**Funding modality:** Government funding

**Description:** The programme provides a package of 6 services: health check-ups, immunisation, referral services, supplementary feeding, non-formal pre-school education and advice on health and nutrition.

**Preliminary findings:** ICDS had been implemented in 5,262 blocks by the end of the 10<sup>th</sup> plan, i.e. by the end of 2003-04, and benefited 34.4 million children and 78.1 million pregnant women and nursing mothers. A network of 649,000 children anganwadi centres.

The programme incurred expenditures during the 10<sup>th</sup> plan of 104 billion Rs. Every year the federal allocation for the programme has constantly increased. Starting in 2005-06, the ICDS allocations include central assistance to the states for supplementary nutrition to children and pregnant and lactating mothers who attend anganwadi centres in the proportion of 50% of the expenditures incurred by the state or 50% of the cost of norms, whichever is less.

**Research observations:** ICDS has positive effects on maternal and child health and conceivably contributes to the achievement of the MDGs on maternal and child health. Recent research and observations have shown that the child care component of rural employment guarantee schemes in India can be mainstreamed into ICDS. An efficient care economy can contribute to freeing up men and women to take up employment under NREGA and earn a living, as well as freeing up older children (especially girl children) from child care and household work and thus directly contributing to the MDGs on education and gender quality by creating an enabling environment for the children to attend and be retained in school.

#### **4.2.2. Early Child Development, Maldives (1999 –present)<sup>90</sup>**

**Focus of special effort:** Children up to 5 years of age

**Objectives:**

Help to meet the survival, development and protection needs of children 0 to 5 years in a positive, respectful, stimulating and fun environment for children and their families; and

To create a culture of media for and about children in which children are valued, can see themselves and have these expressions valued from infancy onwards.

**Eligibility:** Children from 0 up to 5 years of age

**Funding modality:** The approach to early child development now includes the Ministry of Health, and the Ministry of Education, the Ministry of Culture and Information, Ministry of Child Protection, the Ministry of Tourism and the Ministry of Atoll administration.<sup>91</sup>

**Description:** Some of the unique aspects and strategies of the EDC project include:

A focus on reaching directly to the household

---

<sup>90</sup>UNICEF, Programming experience in Early child protection (ECP), November 2006.

<sup>91</sup> This project was initiated by UNICEF Maldives in 1999.

A focus on building the self-confidence of caregivers as well as of children.

Creating special features for caregivers such as adolescents

Combining creative talents<sup>92</sup>

**Research findings:** A recent evaluation of Maldives 'First Steps' ECD Project<sup>93</sup> has reported greater impact than initially anticipated. The analysis confirmed that it upset many social marketing theories in terms of impact on the behaviour. Even within a period of two years, changes in attitude and behaviour could be directly linked to this campaign.

The evaluation noted that its communication not only "...touched people's lives in Maldives as nothing had done before...", but it brought about a "...paradigm shift with regard to increased sensitivity and awareness of child development and childcares practices.' The evaluation looked at recognition, recall, difficulties and, most importantly, the impact it had on the behaviour. Some of the messages with the greatest impact stressed the importance of:

How much older children contribute to the lives of younger siblings.

The father in the life of a child (how even fathers who worked away from home could bond with and contribute to the development of their children)

Skin-to-skin contact with newborns

Listening to children and taking to them

How much older children contribute to the lives of younger siblings

'Learning through play'

Not discriminating between girls and boys

Caring for and not discriminating against children who are disabled.

The Maldives ECD approach proved that ECD is adaptable to local conditions and contexts, while some key ingredients remain the same.

**Research observations:** There are multiple correlates between ECD and education and protection. On the one hand, ECD takes off the burden of child care by older siblings in poor households and thus prevents drop-out and increases retention and learning outcomes for them. On the other hand, ECD is important for preparing the child for school. Recent research into the impacts of ECD shows that children with ECD normally have higher learning outcomes than those without. At the same time, ECD centres are also child-friendly centres where children feel

---

<sup>92</sup> Groups of stakeholders from various sectors were brought together to work, learn from, and excite one another to promote Early Child Development. UNICEF, Programming experience in Early child protection (ECP), November 2006

<sup>93</sup> Acharya S, and Bhargava V, First Steps...Maldives...A giant Leap for Humankind: An evaluation of the ECCD Campaign, UNICEF Maldives, 2004.

safe and protected. This sense of protection and security is especially relevant for the healthy development of the child.

Research is needed into the distributional aspects of access to ECD by household type – single mother; male-headed, female-headed; income quintile; and other criteria of exclusion such as geographic location etc. This would help understand what special measures would be needed to make it more inclusive and responsive to the particular needs of families, such as for instance, special transport and income assistance to help families from remote islands or atolls access the ECD services, or whether these should be more decentralised to reach the remote and disadvantaged, through programmes of training the unemployed youth in ECD and placing them in remote ECD centres for internships etc. along with adult supervisors.

#### **4.2.3. Lady Health Workers Programme (LHWP), Pakistan (1990s – present)**

**Focus of special effort:** All rural and poor urban households in Pakistan.

**Objectives:** The programme was designed in the early 1990s with the objective of providing basic community services to all rural and to poor urban areas in Pakistan. It intends to cover the un-served population at the primary level, ensuring family planning and primary healthcare services at the doorstep of the population through an integrated community-based approach.<sup>94</sup>

**Funding modality:** Funding provided by the Government of Pakistan, with training support provided by INGOs/donors.

**Description:** Each Lady Health Worker registers approximately 200 households or 1,000 individuals in her community to whom she offers a range of preventive and promoting services and creates awareness of mother-child welfare practices, supplementing the immunisation coverage and outreach programmes.<sup>95</sup> LHWs treat minor ailments and injuries, and is trained to identify and refer more serious cases. Their family planning responsibilities include motivating women to practice family planning, providing pills and condoms, and referring for injections, intrauterine device (IUD) insertion and care, and sterilisation.<sup>96</sup> They provide door to door services and also work from home, where they are required to designate one room as a “health house.” They also provide assistance in areas affected by natural disasters (floods, droughts, earthquakes, cyclones).

Each LHW receives a monthly stipend of Rs. 1800. They tend to be married women who are permanent residents of the area for which they have been recruited. They have a minimum of 8 years of education and receive 15 months of training.<sup>97</sup> The present health system accords great importance to the LHWP; the Government aims to increase the number of LHWs from 70,000 to 100,000 to cater to a population of 100 million, while expanding and improving the effectiveness

---

<sup>94</sup> Government of Pakistan, National Health Policy 2001

<sup>95</sup> GoP, Pakistan MDG Report 2005, p.37, <http://www.un.org.pk/undp/publication/PMDGR05.pdf>

<sup>96</sup> <http://www.comminit.com/healthcomm/case-studies.php?showdetails=290>

<sup>97</sup> <http://www.comminit.com/healthcomm/case-studies.php?showdetails=290>

of health facilities. The LHWP is one of the programmes monitored regularly in the PRSP quarterly reports.<sup>98</sup>

Lady Health Workers are recruited with following criteria<sup>99</sup>:

- Local Resident
- Middle School Pass
- Preferably Married
- Minimum Age 18 years
- Recommended by / acceptable to the Community

**Preliminary findings:** Lady Health Workers provide basic health care to nearly 70% of the country's population and have led to improved community health, substantial increases in childhood vaccination rates, child growth monitoring, use of contraception and antenatal services, and provision of iron tablets to pregnant women and lowered rates of childhood diarrhoea.<sup>100</sup> The LHWP has also proved extremely effective in increasing contraceptive use in rural Pakistan and LHWs acted as ad hoc nurses in the aftermath of the earthquake in northern Pakistan in 2005.

A study done by the Asian Development Bank concludes that the LHWP appears not to have reached all of Pakistan's remote and poor rural areas. These areas are those least likely to have a functional health facility and where recruiting suitable educated women to work as LHWs is probably the most difficult. The study recommends that the LHWP should develop a target-based expansion strategy for rural areas to ensure that it serves the rural poor at least as well as it serves the rest of the rural population. It states that LHWP could be expanded by targeting those locations where (i) there is a high people-to-LHW ratio; and (ii) the poor are more heavily concentrated, such as in rural Sindh and southern Punjab. This implies location targeting at the district level, something that is not commonly practiced in Pakistan, but has recently begun to gain ground (see Tawana Pakistan programme).<sup>101</sup>

Another study by Oxford Policy Management (2002) produces considerable evidence that within their communities, LHWs appear either to be pro-poor or neutral in relation to poverty, i.e., no income group appears to benefit more than any other. Better-off households are more likely to prefer clinic-based service delivery over the preventive services provided by LHWs; to some extent therefore, the programme self-targets lower-income households and individuals. However, the study found that the LHWP tends to slightly over-serve advantaged areas at the expense of disadvantaged areas. This occurs for several reasons. First, areas in which LHWs are stationed tend to be those already equipped with a functional health facility. Second, the program's original emphasis was on overall coverage rather than being poverty-focused. Third, recruitment criteria

---

<sup>98</sup> [http://www.adb.org/documents/PRM/Working\\_Papers/wp-04.pdf](http://www.adb.org/documents/PRM/Working_Papers/wp-04.pdf)

<sup>99</sup> <http://www.phc.gov.pk/template.php?id=30>

<sup>100</sup> Relief Web (taken from World Health Report 2006, WHO), <http://reliefweb.int/rw/RWB.NSF/db900SID/KHIL-6PG3X4?OpenDocument>

<sup>101</sup> [http://www.adb.org/documents/PRM/Working\\_Papers/wp-04.pdf](http://www.adb.org/documents/PRM/Working_Papers/wp-04.pdf)

demand relatively educated women who are more likely to come from better-off areas, and thus serve households who are more advantaged. Finally the study found that the LHWP certainly appears to be cost-effective. Salaries as well as supervision costs are low, although more resources are required for provision of drugs to persons in need.<sup>102</sup>

**Research observations:** This programme has been implemented for about 15 years, so a great deal of information should be available to aid research.

Lady Health Workers cover 70% of the Pakistan's population, so the programme's nature as a "special effort" lies in its rural and pro-poor focus, rather than in overcoming gender or social exclusion. The extensive coverage of the programme might present obstacles for conducting research within a tight timeframe.

#### **4.2.4. Programme for vulnerable populations included in the Master Health Plan, Sri Lanka (2007- 2016)**

**Focus of special effort:** Vulnerable populations such as people in remote and disaster-affected areas, those affected by conflict and workers in the estate sector, the elderly, the disabled, the mentally challenged, working women, children of migrant workers and adolescents.

**Objectives:** To improve health status of vulnerable populations. One of the government health policy components is to focus on services for vulnerable groups and community needs that require special attention such as care for the elderly, disabled and mentally ill.

**Funding modality:** National funding

**Description:** State health services will give particular attention to the poor and vulnerable groups by:

- Expanding preventive and other state health care programmes, with great emphasis on health promotion. A special effort will be made to influence the young and to prevent and treat nutritional problems.

-Expanding access to curative health care services through selective upgrading of facilities in order to make these services more accessible to the rural poor.

Programme for vulnerable populations is composed as follows:

Estate health (people living and working in tea estate)

Health of elders

Disabled health

Adolescent health

---

<sup>102</sup> [http://www.adb.org/documents/PRM/Working\\_Papers/wp-04.pdf](http://www.adb.org/documents/PRM/Working_Papers/wp-04.pdf)

- Occupational health
- Improving the health of people in urban slums
- School health
- Health in North, East and Adjoining provinces:
  - - Strengthening health services for people in conflict-affected areas and displaced populations.
  - - Development of human resources for health in North and East provinces.

**Preliminary findings:** n/a

**Research observations:** This sub-programme of the Master Health Plan was introduced in 2007. It would be useful if a baseline was established to monitor progress and impacts.

### 4.3. Housing and Basic Social Services

#### 4.3.1. Oranji Pilot Project, Pakistan<sup>103</sup>

**Focus of special effort:** The over 12 million people (60% of the urban population of Karachi) living in slum dwellers (known as *Katchi Abadis* – the informal sector).

**Objectives:** To help neighbourhood-level people to get better access to public services, such as water and sanitation, education, healthcare, waste disposal and security by establishing and managing self-financed facilities like water and sanitation, schools, clinics etc.

**Funding modality:** The project itself is run through an NGO. Cost-sharing between neighbourhood-level people and the government where the government's role is to complement community 's work with larger facilities like trunk sewers and treatment plants, water mains and water, as well as colleges/universities and hospitals, main solid waste disposals and land fill sites.

The component-sharing concept clearly shows that where government partners with the people, sustainable development can be managed through local resources.

**Description:** The approach at the Oranji Pilot Project is to encourage and strengthen community initiatives (with social, technical guidance and credit for micro enterprise) and evolve partnerships with the government for development based on local resource. The intervention consists of several low-cost components:

*Sanitation programme:* It enables low income families to finance, manage and maintain sanitary latrines in their homes, underground sewerage lines and secondary sewers (this constitutes

---

<sup>103</sup> <http://www.oppinstitutions.org/>

internal development). Government is responsible to provide main sewers and treatment plants (i.e. external development). The model that has evolved from the programme is the component-sharing concept of development with people and government as partners.

*Housing programme:* It enables improvement in building components and construction techniques, through action research, provision of credit and technical guidance to building component manufacturing yards, training of youths and masons and mobilisation of house owners.

*Education programme:* It improves and upgrades the physical condition and academic standards of private schools in Oranji, through start up grants, credit and facilitation of teachers training. The effort is to support schools or groups of teachers to become teacher training resource groups.

*Health education and family planning programme:* It supports the local Oranji clinics set up by the people with supply of vaccines, family planning components and training of vaccinators/traditional birth attendants (TBAs).

Micro-enterprise credit programme: It supports small family businesses set up by the people in their homes, with credit.

**Preliminary findings:** The low-cost sanitation programme has extended to all of Oranji and to 279 settlements of Karachi and 13 cities covering a population of more than 2 million. Each year more than 2,500 households in Oranji benefit through the housing programme. 703 schools education more than 139,194 children have been supported through the education programme. 291 clinics, 204 vaccinators and 504 TBAs have been supported through the local clinics programme. The micro-enterprise programme has expanded to 12 cities and more than 50 villages. 7,469 units have been supported with credit of Rs. 148 million with 93% recovery rate. The programme has developed partnerships at country level to support similar initiatives and influence government policy.

**Research observations:** This initiative is worth researching because it is multi-sectoral in approach and expects the government to deliver certain services (even if in bulk). It has a track record of success in Karachi and has served a large number of slum dwellers. It has contributed to strengthening civil society movements, participation and voices of the poor. Better access to basic social services in slums is a precondition for better outcomes for the children living in these slums. This project is a large-scale and tested project, which presumably has also been evaluated by independent agencies, consultants, etc.

The project is a large one and therefore it might be necessary to limit research to specific aspects, such as access to basic health and education facilities and outcomes for children. Also, the local context in Karachi could have a major role in this project being a success; therefore before carefully examining the environmental context, it would be difficult to recommend it for replication in other South Asian countries.

## 4.4. Protection and Cross-Cutting areas (Including for migrants, IDPS, homeless, street children, etc.)

### 4.4.1. Integrated Programme for Street Children, India (2004-present)

**Focus of special effort:** children without homes and family ties i.e., street children and children especially vulnerable to abuse and exploitation such as children of sex workers and children of pavement dwellers. Children living in slums and with their parents are excluded from the coverage of this scheme.

#### **Objectives:**

To prevent destitution of children and to facilitate their withdrawal from a life on the streets and placement into the national mainstream.

To provide integrated community based non- institutional basic services for the care, protection and development of street children facing destitution, neglect, abuse and exploitation.

Programme interventions will be focused on reduction of exploitation and abuse and withdrawal of children engaged in hazardous work.<sup>104</sup>

**Funding modality:** State Governments, Union Territory Administrations, Local Bodies, Educational Institutions and Voluntary Organisations are eligible for financial assistance under this programme. Up to 90% of the cost of the project is provided by the Government of India and remaining has to be borne by the Organisation/Institution concerned. Under the programme, no predefined cost heads are stipulated. Depending upon the type of activity and the nature of service, an appropriate amount not exceeding Rs. 1.5 million per annum can be sanctioned as recurring cost for each project. The grant under the programme is released to selected organisations in two equal half yearly instalments.

**Description:** Programme provides shelter, nutrition, health care, sanitation, hygiene, safe drinking water, education, and protection to destitute and neglected street children<sup>105</sup> The strategy is to develop awareness and provide support to build capacity of the Government, NGOs and the community at large to the rights of the child enshrined in the UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (CRC) and in the Juvenile Justice (Care and Protection of Children) Act, 2000.

**Preliminary findings:** Since the inception of the program, 250,938 street children have been extended help by the Ministry through 214 organisations in 24 States/UTs.<sup>106</sup>

**Research observations:** It does not appear that much research has been done on this programme, so research efforts could produce new insights on the programme's effects and new

---

<sup>104</sup> *Programmes for Child Development*, <http://www.kar.nic.in/dwcd/chidev.pdf>

<sup>105</sup> Government of India, *Ninth Plan, Chapter 15: Social Welfare* p. 366, <http://planningcommission.nic.in/plans/mta/mta-9702/mta-ch15.pdf>, accessed 23-5-06

<sup>106</sup> <http://socialjustice.nic.in/social/children.htm#p1>,

[http://www.unodc.org/pdf/india/publications/inventory\\_of\\_Schemes\\_and\\_Programmes/06\\_section4.pdf](http://www.unodc.org/pdf/india/publications/inventory_of_Schemes_and_Programmes/06_section4.pdf)

lessons for other interventions. In addition, this programme seems progressive because it has adopted an integrated approach, cutting across various sectors (housing, nutrition, health, water, sanitation, hygiene, education and protection). This research could provide lessons on the implementation of integrated programmes focusing on a specific group in order to achieve universal access to social services.

Because the programme has not been widely researched or evaluated, it is not clear if it has been well implemented or achieved positive results. Thus it could prove not to be a good example of a transformative social policy intervention.

#### **4.4.2. Residential Care Centres for Migrant Families' Children, Orissa, India (2002-present)**

**Focus of special effort:** Children of rural migrant workers who migrate under conditions of distress.

**Objectives:** The provision of the care centres seeks to:

Allow children to continue their education without disruptions caused by migration

Ensure that children are still within the reach of the community to provide them care and support while they are residents

Build on existing schooling infrastructure (by using an existing school room) rather than creating new or alternative education infrastructure.

It emphasises the rights and needs of migrant children in a context where large-scale migration under distress conditions is not recognised in state policy measures. The intervention aims to increase access to education by offering parents the option to educate their children at the source and destination of migration.

**Funding modality:** The District Primary Education Programme's funds were leveraged for this programme, continuing under the Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan, drawing on the budget component for innovative programmes.

**Description:** Provision by the Orissa government, in partnership with ActionAid, of community based residential care centres (RCCs) for children of rural migrant workers who migrate under conditions of distress. Based on community level demand and parental consent, children are enrolled in the RCC. Financial provisions by the Government's Sarva Shiksha Abhiyan allow the children two meals in addition the lunch through the Midday Meal programme. Children are also provided with soap for a daily bath. The care centres consist of school rooms and thus have not been equipped for a residential function, so children sleep on the floor.

As of early 2006, there were 93 RCCs functioning in Balangir district, established and managed by the Government. Each RCC has a capacity of 20 children, as per government norms, though in some schools this covers up to 25 children where the need is immense. This suggests that RCCs absorb anywhere between 1860 and 2325 children. Where the community comes forward with a plan and a list of eligible children, Block Resource Centres established by the Education

Department forward the details to the government and a RCC is sanctioned. A further strength of the approach is Action Aid's advocacy to ensure that schools are also offered at the 'destination' site.

**Preliminary findings:** A major achievement of the RCCs is to place special emphasis on the rights and needs of migrant children in a context where large-scale migration under distress conditions is not recognised fully in the policy measures of the state. By offering parents options to educate their children, both at source and destination of migration, the intervention provides parents with some degree of choice, ensuring that these choices do not harm children's access to education. A recent study of the programme revealed that there were more girls than boys participating.<sup>107</sup> The gender dimensions of the decisions that parents make are critical to analyse as it is generally thought that parents take girls with them to look after younger siblings. RCCs may help to promote girls' education if it means that younger children (6 upwards) can be left in the school, thereby not necessitating child care at destination.

The importance of government schools expanding their mode of provision to accommodate those with different needs is critical in Balangir, given the lack of alternatives to government provided education.

In the recent study commissioned by DFID, it was reported that the children visited in the RCCs seemed well-adjusted and happy. Their routines start early in the day as they have to clear the school room that they stay in for the functioning of school. Once classes end for the day, they play and then review their school work with the volunteer, particularly the older children. Children may or may not leave the school to visit relatives or other friends in the village; for the most part they are visited in the school by community members. Members of the Village Education Committee and the Panchayats support the local volunteer in running the school effectively.

The intervention is successful because of community commitment. In conditions of high poverty and significant out-migration, there is a degree of sympathy that remaining parents have for the condition of migrants – it could be them next year. For parents to agree to leave behind such young children (ages 6-12), the level of trust and confidence in the community must be high. State-NGO partnership was also vital in making the intervention possible.

Concerns have been raised about leakages, as many children of destitute families in the village are attracted to the RCCs. It has been argued that these “leakages” are to the poor and not to the elites of the villages. The DFID study suggests consultation with the community to debate the pros and cons of an intervention specifically for migrants or a more fluid intervention which can include self-targeted destitute children.

Action Aid's review of the RCCs (2004) highlights consequences of poor administration - particularly the actions of Block Resource Centres, the delays in sanctioning schools, and the delay in allocating funds – on the sustainability of schools, arguing that in many cases local communities and parents are losing faith in the intervention. It also voiced concerns about corruption in the absence of local monitoring, where there is no NGO, particularly of connivance

---

<sup>107</sup> Janet Gardener and Ramya Subrahmanian, *Tackling Social Exclusion in Health and Education in Asia*. For DFID Asia Division, June 2005. (Description of entire programme taken from this report).

between head teachers and Block Resource Centre staff to delay payments keep some of the money or create false RCCs.

**Research observations:** This intervention is an example of a community-centred and needs-based response to a significant and recurrent problem, and also recognizes the intergenerational transmission of poverty as a fundamental aspect of chronic poverty. By providing the children of migrants with the opportunity to receive an education, it is attempting to break the cycle of intergenerational poverty and thus could provide useful insights and lessons for other interventions that also seek to address the transmission of poverty from one generation to another. One useful point of research might be to see whether the intervention contains a “pull factor” – i.e. poor parents migrating so that their children can receive better food and care at the RCCs.

This has been researched by DFID (Janet Gardener and Ramya Subrahmanian), so measures would have to be taken to ensure that the research is not duplicated.

#### **4.4.3. National Time Bound Programme (Tbp) To Eliminate Child Labour, Pakistan (2002-Present)<sup>108</sup>**

**Focus of special effort:** Children working in several sectors in Pakistan, including in the soccer ball industry, carpet manufacturing, and surgical instruments industry.

**Objective:** To implement an integrated approach to eradicate child labour, including bonded child labour, in Pakistan within a period of 5-10 years. The Time Bound Programme approach is designed primarily to assist with an integrated approach for implementing Convention No. 182.

**Eligibility:** children working in the manufacturing sector (esp. soccer ball industry, carpet industry, surgical instruments manufacturing).

**Funding modality:** ILO (IPEC)

**Description<sup>109</sup>:** The TBP combines sectional and thematic approaches. It links action against child labour to national development policy. TBPs aim to prevent and eliminate all incidences of the worst forms of child labour within a defined period of time.

The Government of Pakistan has adopted a policy of immediate withdrawal of children from worst forms of child labour. Under the Time Bound Programme for the Elimination of Worst Form of Child Labour, a list of 29 hazardous occupations for children has been identified and the Government is taking measures to ensure their strict compliance.

Downstream, the Programme directly targets the community level through the provision of social protection to an estimated 11,800 children working in hazardous sectors by providing non-formal

---

<sup>108</sup> ILO Sub-Regional Office for South Asia, <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/asro/newdelhi/ipec/responses/pakistan/p6.htm>; Government of Pakistan, Ministry of Labour, Manpower and Overseas Pakistanis, Labour and Manpower Division, [http://202.83.164.7/divisions/ContentInfo.jsp?DivID=30&cPath=349\\_353\\_563&ContentID=2218](http://202.83.164.7/divisions/ContentInfo.jsp?DivID=30&cPath=349_353_563&ContentID=2218); ILO IPEC (International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour) <http://www.ipec-pakistan.org/tbp/tbp-phase-03.html>

<sup>109</sup> ILO IPEC, <http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/asro/newdelhi/ipec/responses/pakistan/p6.htm>

education, literacy, pre-vocational and skills training in non-hazardous occupations, and awareness of occupational safety and health (OSH) related issues, in 7 targeted districts across the 4 provinces of Pakistan.

Upstream, the Programme revises the Employment of Children Act, 1991, the National Policy and the Plan of Action to Combat Child Labour to reflect the Government's commitment under the ILO Convention No. 182, apart from other policy level interventions.

**Preliminary findings:** The programme has been implemented through several projects, including:

- Elimination of child labour in the soccer ball industry in Sialkot – 10,572 soccer ball stitching children were provided with non-formal education, among which 5,838 were mainstreamed into formal schools
- Combating child labour in the carpet industry – pre-vocational education to about 23,000 carpet waving children and access to micro-credit to the 1,000 poorest carpet weaving households
- Combating hazardous and exploitation child labour in surgical instruments manufacturing – 1,496 children employed in surgical instruments production workshops have been provided non-formal education and pre-vocational training
- Combating child labour through education and training in the North West Frontier Province – a total of 532 children received pre-vocational training at the government technical training centre
- Activating media in combating child labour
- Combating trafficking for labour and sexual exploitation
- Preventing and eliminating exploitative domestic work in South Asia.

**Research observations:** This is a special effort aimed at immediately eliminating child labour and building children's life and work skills for earning a living later in life, as well as offering them educational opportunities previously denied to them.

However, this is a programme whose success would depend on the simultaneous interventions (such as employment generation programmes for adults/families and poverty-alleviation programmes) in the larger economy.

## 5. Intervention for Social Inclusion via the Fiscal Domain and Vulnerability Assessment Tools

### 5.1. National Livelihoods Based Food Security and Nutritional Surveillance System (NSS), Afghanistan (2003-present)<sup>110</sup>

#### Focus Of Special Effort: The Rural Poor

**Objectives:** To be able to develop a nation-wide food need assessment by establishing a strong livelihood based national Food Security and Nutritional Surveillance System to supply the government and the development community with the information necessary to consolidate and systematise national poverty reduction efforts directed towards the most vulnerable sector of the Afghan population. Focus of the programme is on the rural of the Afghan population who remain extremely vulnerable to any type of stress (natural disaster, conflict, market fluctuations, displacement, gender inequities etc.)

**Funding modality:** This system is launched and supervised under the National Surveillance System Central Statistics Office - Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development

**Description:** In the early stages of the project it was envisioned that each participating ministry would work within its own respective ministry to develop the necessary institutional structures to incorporate and support NSS activities and outputs. The following department within each agency was responsible for NSS activities:

1. Public Nutrition Unit (Ministry of health): this unit is responsible for improving and protecting the nutritional status of Afghan population. One of the responsibilities of this unit is to use food security and vulnerability information to better understand nutritional risks in Afghanistan.
2. Food Security, Agriculture and Animal husbandry information management and Policy Unit (Ministry of Agriculture, Animal Husbandry and Food): With the guidance of FAO, this unit was created as the policy analysis unit of MAAH, responsible for data collection, analysis and dissemination of findings.
3. Vulnerability Analysis Unit (Ministry of Rural rehabilitation and development): This unit in MRRD is responsible for providing analysis on national data in order to guide the policy and design of MRRD programmes aiming to reduce the prevalence of vulnerability, poverty, food insecurity, and poor nutritional and health status in the Afghan population.

**Preliminary findings:** The outcomes and the lessons of phase I (2003-2004) of this project have been used for the conceptualisation of the second phase of NSS (2005 to 2008). The first phase of the project was instrumental in establishing the methodological approach that will inform and

---

<sup>110</sup> Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development, Afghanistan  
<http://www.mrrd.gov.af/vau/Project%20Reports/NSS%20EC%20Phase%20I%20Final%20Report%20Oct%2005.pdf>

guide the second phase of the development of a National Surveillance System (NSS), along with making significant progress with the institutionalisation of the structures required to collect process and use data. Above all, the important process consultation with key stakeholders has led to the refinement of the methodology.

One of the major achievements of the project has been its strong response to a range of government and partner agencies' needs for data and information, including the production of poverty headcounts, food security monitoring, and emergency assessments. All of these require different methodologies and different skills and institutional partners to be able to respond in all situations.

**Research observations:**

Mapping of food security is an important component of emergency preparedness, especially in emergency prone areas, such as affected by drought, floods, and other natural disasters which have a significant impact on the food security of the area. A good mapping database would ideally help inform the authorities of the extent of the damage and the size of catchment's area and of the affected population and help respond adequately without creating imbalances in the food security nationally, e.g. food scarcity in the areas where food distribution system purchases food stocks to respond to the emergency. In this connection, it would be interesting to document the extent to which the database has been actually used to inform emergency response, the changes in the level and degree of response, the impact on the affected population (especially children and women) compared to pre-database years.

## **5.2. 20/20 Initiative for Basic Social Services , Bhutan<sup>111</sup>**

**Focus of special effort: All the People of Bhutan Specially the Under-Privileged**

**Objectives:** To allocate more than 20% of the national budget to social services

**Funding modality:** Government expenditures

**Description:** The 20/20 initiative supports programmes on poverty alleviation. Its underlying principle is that such poverty alleviation programmes cannot be sustained unless these are linked with human development issues, such as education, health, drinking water and sanitation. These are therefore addressed by increasing investment in basic education, basic health and basic drinking water supply and sanitation.

**Preliminary findings:** n/a

**Research observations:** n/a

---

<sup>111</sup> UNICEF country office

### 5.3. Gender Responsive Budgeting (GRB), India (2000- present)

**Focus of special effort:** The development and empowerment of women

**Objectives:** Gender responsive budgeting (GRB) is about ensuring that government budgets and the policies and programmes that underlie them address the needs and interests of individuals that belong to different social groups. It is about determining where the needs of men and women are the same, and where they differ. Where the needs are different, allocations should be different.

**Eligibility:** Woman

**Description:** Gender Responsive Budgeting (GRB) is an initiative of the Central and the State Government introduced in 2000 that reaffirms their commitment to the development and empowerment of women. (Gender equality is recognised in the Indian Constitution). GRB in the department of Woman and Child Development serves to access:

- How effectively the services of Government meet the needs of women and girls, in relation to those of men;
- How much the policies are focused towards women; and
- How much the expenditure of the State in the Department reaches women

Categorisation of specifically targeted expenditure<sup>112</sup>:

#### Protective and Welfare Services

To prevent atrocities viz. domestic violence, kidnapping, rape, dowry deaths

#### Social Services

Education, health, nutrition

#### Economic Services

Self employment and training programmes

#### Regulatory Services and Awareness Generation Programmes

Maternal benefit schemes

**Preliminary findings:** Quick results are not to be expected by GRB Initiatives because the integration of gender-analysis into a budget cycle is a medium to long-term task. Collaboration between government and civil society is needed because it has been proved to be successful in countries where inside and outside government initiatives complemented each other. In India,

---

<sup>112</sup> Gender Budgeting in India, Ashok Lahiri, Lekha S Chakraborty, P N Bhattacharyya, 2003, <http://www.gender-budgets.org/content/view/110/144/>

GRB can be considered successful because the budget guidelines have been changed in a gender-responsive way.<sup>113</sup>

**Research observations:** It would be of interest to research what types of gender-empowerment and inclusion programmes were persistently lacking from the budget documents over the years, and why; how gender budgeting has been able to link expenditures to outlays and most importantly outcomes; where these cause-effect relationships are most difficult to make and why; how gender budget has changed bureaucratic thinking; what legislative and process difficulties are usually encountered in gender budgeting exercises and what recommendations often fail to be included into the budget exercise and why; the role of the political process of decision-making and the role of different actors in budgeting and the implications for the expected impact of gender budgeting reports; whether gender budgeting reports create sensitivity to gender issues in technical committees other than the ones focusing on women and children and how.

#### **5.4. Participatory Budget Analysis in Gujarat, India and Performance Monitoring – Citizen Report Card, Bangalore, India**

**Focus of special effort:** Marginalised and excluded groups and communities, which are to be politically and socially empowered to influence decision-making towards a just and equitable allocation of public finance.

**Objectives:** To empower the marginalised and socially excluded to participate in fiscal resource allocation for greater equity in outcomes from development projects

**Funding modality:** [local government providing meeting space; to be researched further]

**Description:** Participatory budgeting is a publicly-supported intervention which aims to redress the inequalities inherent in the budgeting process through a participatory public review of the budget aimed at identifying ways to improve allocations to address the problems of the marginalised and socially excluded. Participatory budgeting is usually characterised by several basic design features: identification of spending priorities by community members, election of budget delegates to represent different communities, facilitation and technical assistance by public employees, local and higher level assemblies to deliberate and vote on spending priorities, and the implementation of local direct-impact community projects<sup>114</sup>.

It was initiated after the Government of India promised to allocate money for social programmes for so-called tribal groups in Gujarat, but on close inspection of the budget, failed to follow up on commitments.

Performance monitoring is also a publicly-supported intervention which aims to gather feedback on the quality of public services provided (esp. water, sewage, electricity, transportation, telephone).

---

<sup>113</sup> UNDP, Gender Responsive Budgeting: Overview of GRB activities in different countries, good practices and lessons learnt. Presentation by Katrin Schneider, Bangkok, May 2007

[www.undp.or.th/mdg/documents/Katrin3.ppt](http://www.undp.or.th/mdg/documents/Katrin3.ppt)

<sup>114</sup> [http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Participatory\\_budgeting](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Participatory_budgeting)

## **Preliminary findings<sup>115</sup>:**

Participatory budget analysis in Gujarat:

- Allocation and release of funds to priority sectors has improved
- Numeric discrepancies and other errors (around 600 in the first year) are picked up by members of the legislature.
- Media has publicised results.
- There is a better flow of information among ministries.
- The Gujarat model is being replicated in 12 other Indian states.
- The national budget is now analysed by the People's Budget Information and Analysis Service (An NGO where budgets of all departments of State as well as Federal Government of India are analysed, especially in terms of provisions and commitment made towards the poor and backward, vis-à-vis policy priorities of the government.)

Performance monitoring – citizen report card, in Bangalore<sup>116</sup>:

- Formerly unresponsive public agencies now listen and react to citizen concerns
- Worst-rated agency helped create public forums, reviewed internal systems for service delivery and introduced reforms to resolve high-priority problems
- Some public agencies formalised periodic dialogues with household consumer association to redress grievances
- Public awareness on issues of service quality has substantially increased
- Report cards have stimulated civil society activism in Bangalore with many more groups engaged in citizen monitoring
- Report cards have been replicated in other Indian cities and internationally (i.e. Philippines, the Ukraine, Kenya)

**Research observations:** These initiatives present opportunities for the socially excluded to have a say in the budgeting process and influence allocations towards a more just and socially inclusive approach. Participatory budget analysis seems to directly empower the poor and excluded to claim their rights and entitlements. It could be an opportunity for children's direct participation and for raising public awareness about child and gender budgeting approaches.

Performance monitoring – citizen report card, which is based on surveys of citizens on the access, quality and use of public services, links back to the third broad research theme whereby the socially excluded could potentially contribute to improving service delivery.

South Asia presents multiple forms and layers of social exclusion both within the society at large and within the socially excluded groups themselves. Thus, given the problem of hierarchical relationships and proneness to elite capture, there is a high risk of exclusionary participation even in participatory exercises like public budget reviews, and it could be that the socially excluded children and women have little influence over budget allocation and recommendations.

---

<sup>115</sup> Information excerpted from [www.icgfm.org/documents/Sirker.ppt](http://www.icgfm.org/documents/Sirker.ppt)

<sup>116</sup> Information excerpted from [www.icgfm.org/documents/Sirker.ppt](http://www.icgfm.org/documents/Sirker.ppt)

In the case of performance monitoring, given that in many slum dwellers public services are not available or their coverage is limited, surveyors might choose to avoid these areas because their inhabitants would not have significant positive experiences to report on the quality of services in their area, and therefore rank down public services overall.

### **5.5. 20/20 Initiative for Basic Social Services, Nepal (1996-present)<sup>117</sup>**

**Focus of special effort:** The 20/20 initiative is driven by the idea that the delivery of basic social services is one of the most cost-effective ways of combating the worst manifestation of poverty. The 20/20 initiative is supposed to put emphasis on the vital role of public sector in guaranteeing universal access to basic social services.

**Objectives:** To allocate 20% of the national public budget and 20% of ODA to basic social services.

**Funding modality:** ODA and state budget in proportion of 20% each spent on basic social services

**Description:** The 20/20 initiative supports programmes on poverty alleviation. Its underlying principle is that such poverty alleviation programmes cannot be sustained unless these are linked with human development issues, such as education, health, drinking water and sanitation. These are therefore addressed by increasing investment in basic education, basic health and basic drinking water supply and sanitation.

UNDP and UNICEF developed two types of norms of expenditure, to be pursued and monitored for maximising expenditure on human development. The UNDP norm is known as human expenditure ratio, and is based on three ratios as follow: 1) Public expenditure ratio (PER): the percentage of national income that goes to public expenditures; 2) Social sector expenditure ratio (SSER): the percentage of public expenditure earmarked for social services; and 3) Basic social sector ratio (BSSR): the percentage of social expenditure devoted to human priority concerns, key areas with the greatest impact on the well-being of the population. The Human Expenditure Ratio, which is a multiple of the other three, is the percentage of national income devoted to human priority areas (basic social services).

UNICEF took the second ratio - Social sector expenditure ratio 40 % and the third ratio - Basic social sector ratio 50 %, and multiplied them to arrive at 20 % human development priority ratio, which came to be known as the component of the 20/20 initiative. It calls for the allocation of 20 % of the budget of developing countries and 20 % of ODA to basic social services: basic health, including reproductive health services, basic education, nutrition programme and low-cost water supply and sanitation. Hence, it is called 20/20 initiative or compact. It was presented at the World Summit for Social Development held in Copenhagen in 1995 and is widely endorsed by UNICEF, UNDP and WHO, among other international agencies. Further endorsement of this human development priority ratio in the Oslo Consensus of 1996, and in the Convention of Rights of Children (CRC) Committee recently added more value to it.

---

<sup>117</sup> The information presented draws on Nepal National Planning Commission, Basic Social Services, draft report (no date), [www.npc.gov.np/report/basicSocialService/Chapter1.doc](http://www.npc.gov.np/report/basicSocialService/Chapter1.doc)

The 20/20 initiative is a widely used benchmark for assessing the government's performance in meeting the resource requirements for human development. Nepal has been pursuing the policy of 20/20 initiative in its annual budget exercise as a government tool for enhancing resources allocation to basic social services. It has helped to increase the government expenditure on basic social services.

**Preliminary findings:** Recent findings<sup>118</sup> show that spending on basic social services has been progressing towards meeting the 20/20 target over the recent years. More than 17% of the total budget was spent on basic social services in 2002/03-2004/05. In education, spending on basic education increased as a share in total public expenditure from 11.5% in 2002/03 to 12.3% in 2005/06, and as a share in total education expenditures from 70.1% in 2002/03 to 70.4% in 2005/06. In healthcare, spending on basic health as a share in total public expenditures increased from 3.6% in 2002/03 to 5.1% in 2005/06, and as a share in total health expenditures from 76.9% to 80.7%. In water and sanitation, spending on basic drinking water and sanitation as a share in total public expenditures increased from 2% in 2002/03 to 2.8% in 2005/60 and as a share in total drinking and sanitation expenditures from 59% to 59.5%.

Audit of the programme related to social services shows that less than 8% was spent on women-focused programmes.

Spending by local institutions (VDC, DDC and municipalities) on basic social services from their own resource or government grant is minimal.

**Research observations:** Of particular importance in this research would be the equity patterns of budget resources allocation, along with the outcomes and impacts in terms of access, quality etc. for the users (meaningfully disaggregated by gender, caste, location etc. and other vectors of social exclusion). Meaningful gender-audit-generated data have been obtained during the previous reviews.

Recent research has been conducted on the implementing of 20/20 Initiative in Nepal by the NPC and UNICEF, and therefore additional research would be required only at the level of assessing distributional impact of the programme, including its poverty-targeting effects on children.

## **5.6. Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiative (GRBI), Pakistan (2005-present)<sup>119</sup>**

**Focus of special effort:** The development and empowerment of women

**Objectives:** To develop skills to prepare, review and analyse budgets using a gender lens; to promote policy and resource allocation with a gender perspective; and to build advocacy skills of GOP and civil society organisations for gender budgeting.

---

<sup>118</sup> UNICEF, An Analytical Study of Basic Social Services in Nepal, National Planning Commission/UNICEF, by Institute for Sustainable Development, Kathmandu, 2006, p.25

<sup>119</sup> Government of Pakistan, Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiative (GRBI), Annual Progress report 2006, [www.grbi.gov.pk/documents/apr\\_2006.pdf](http://www.grbi.gov.pk/documents/apr_2006.pdf)

**Eligibility:** The project is focusing its work on the sectors of Education, Health and Population Welfare

**Funding modality:** The Ministry of Finance, Government of Pakistan with technical and financial support from and cost sharing with UNDP, the Swiss Agency for Development and Cooperation (SDC) and Royal Norwegian Embassy, initiated a two and half year's pilot project 'Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiative' (GRBI), beginning 2005.

DONORS	COST (\$)
SWISS AGENCY FOR DEVELOPMENT AND COOPERATION (SDC)	418,156.00
ROYAL NORWEGIAN EMBASSY	60,288.00
TOTAL COST (2006)	478,444.00

**Description:** It started in 2005 at the national, provincial (pilot province: Punjab) and district (two pilot districts) level and the pilot sectors are Health, Education and Population Welfare.

To achieve its objectives, project activities are planned in following five stages:

- Awareness raising and consensus-building
- Training in gender budgeting for the stakeholders
- Gender analysis of the priority sectors
- Review of research
- Advocacy

The outputs are:

- Government spending addresses the needs of women and men and attends especially to the needs of the poor
- Budget reviewed through a gender lens, in order to analyse if budget allocations are in line with women's and men's different priorities and needs; and
- Civil society and government partnership promotes transparency in the determination of government priorities and in public spending.

**Preliminary findings:** Quick results are not to be expected by GRB Initiatives because the integration of gender-analysis into a budget cycle is a medium to long-term task. Collaboration between government and civil society is needed because it has been proved to be successful in

countries where inside and outside government initiatives complemented each other. In Pakistan, GRBI can be considered successful because the budget guidelines have been changed in a gender-responsive way.<sup>120</sup>

**Research observations:** It would be interesting to research what types of gender-empowerment and inclusion programmes were persistently lacking from the budget documents over the years, and why; how gender budgeting has been able to link expenditures to outlays and most importantly outcomes; where these cause-effect relationships are most difficult to make and why; how gender budget has changed bureaucratic thinking; what legislative and process difficulties are usually encountered in gender budgeting exercises and what recommendations often fail to be included into the budget exercise and why; the role of the political process of decision-making and the role of different actors in budgeting and the implications for the expected impact of gender budgeting reports; whether gender budgeting reports create sensitivity to gender issues in technical committees other the ones focusing on women and children and how.

## 6. Interventions for Social Inclusion in Post-Conflict and Fragile States

CONTRARY TO THE PREVIOUSLY LISTED INTERVENTIONS, THE FOLLOWING INTERVENTIONS ARE MAINLY INITIATED AND SUPPORTED BY FOREIGN DONORS AND AGENCIES

### 6.1. Food For Work, Part of Protracted Relief and Recovery Operation, Afghanistan (2003-present)<sup>121</sup>

**Focus of special effort:** Vulnerable people who receive support to protect their livelihoods by filling in food gaps and helping them with recovery efforts through reconstruction/rehabilitation of community assets

**Objectives:** To meet immediate food needs of the most vulnerable and enable them to restore their livelihoods

**Eligibility:** the rural poor

**Funding modality:** WFP support

**Description:** The programme provides a total of 78,974 MT, 24 kg/person. The programme covers over 3 million people.

---

<sup>120</sup> UNDP, Gender responsive budgeting: Overview of GRB activities in different countries, good practices, and lessons learnt. Presentation by Katrin Schneider, Bangkok, May 2007 [www.undp.or.th/mdg/documents/Katrin3.ppt](http://www.undp.or.th/mdg/documents/Katrin3.ppt)

<sup>121</sup> Armando Barrientos and Rebecca Holmes, Social Assistance in Developing Countries Database, version 2.0 March 2006, IDS, University of Sussex, DFID

**Preliminary findings:** During the first year of implementation the programme under-achieved on the food transfers but over-achieved on the number of beneficiaries targeted. Targeting was low and inefficient. The project reported a generally weak connection with livelihood recovery, poor quality and durability of public works and lack of attention to equity issues, especially for irrigation rehabilitation. The average quantity of food received through the programme per beneficiary was enough for 45 days at 2,100 kcals/day, which was inappropriate for districts with acute food insecurity of 8-10 months of food gaps.

**Research observations:** It is a special effort aimed at providing minimum income for rural areas suffering from severe food shortages. It could be transformative in nature because it aims to change the rural economy through asset creation, which in turn should be expected to generate further employment and income-generating opportunities.

Afghanistan presents a special development context, where the largest part of the public budget comes from ODA and where most programmes are implemented directly by international agencies and development partners. Also, the country is characterised by continued conflict and emergency; which qualifies most development assistance as emergency relief or recovery. Any research/evaluation of programmes should bear this in mind, especially given that these programmes would most probably present problems of sustainability and weak potential for mainstreaming into government programmes.

## **6.2. Action Plan for Children Affected by War, Sri Lanka (2003-present)**

**Focus of special effort:** Vulnerable children, including children engaged in hazardous labour, street children, and child soldiers

**Objective:** To support families and communities to create a protective environment for the reintegration of these children through access to health, education, vocational training, income generating activities and psycho-social care. It is estimated that 50,000 children in the affected region are out of school; around 140,000 have been displaced from their homes while landmines have killed 20 and maimed 17 children in 2003 alone.

**Funding modality:** Partners implementing the Action Plan include the Ministry of Social Welfare, Tamils Rehabilitation Organisation (TRO), ILO, and Save the Children in Sri Lanka, UNDP, UNHCR, and UNICEF.

The total cost to implement the Action Plan's 10 components over a three year period is \$14.2 million, with \$4 for micro credit and income generation (UNDP), \$2.2 million for vocational training (ILO) and \$8 million for different components including health, education, and protection (UNICEF).

**Description:** This initiative—a multi-sectoral, multi-agency plan to practically address the needs of war affected children—is a direct outcome of the Berlin and Oslo peace talks, and is the result of an ongoing dialogue between the LTTE and UN agencies with the Government of Sri Lanka's support.

**Preliminary findings:** A holistic approach has been achieved covering education, health, protection, and economic improvement<sup>122</sup>. If fully implemented over the period envisaged by the plan, the result could be a vast improvement in the lives of war-affected children. In 2003 ‘catch up’ education programmes reached 23,500 children, a total of 244 school buildings were refurbished and the recruitment of teachers to address the deficit has begun. The ILO has established vocational training capacity and the UNDP has systems in place for micro-credit schemes. The Ministry of Social Welfare has expanded its capacity on probation and child care. Save the Children is providing social work support and follow up reporting on former child soldiers, which is essential to ensure reintegration and rehabilitation with their families and communities. TRO is working on specific categories of vulnerable children such as street children.

**Research observations:** By offering a holistic approach to child development through interventions in the education, health, vocational training etc. to war-affected areas, the Plan represents a comprehensive recovery, rehabilitation and development plan. The multi-sectoral approach has the strength of informing the different sectors of the needs and rights of these children based on a joint assessment of their situation. Monitoring the situation of these children across the different sectors and dimensions of deprivation has the advantage of reducing the risk of oversight and unmet needs. It would be interesting to research how the Plan addresses the situation of girls and ethnic and religious minority groups and what special forms of inclusion it proposes; as well as whether the monitoring mechanism (inch the indicators used) is also based on the principle of inter-sectorality and how it has worked in practice.

\*\*\*\*\*

---

<sup>122</sup> From the meeting between the UNICEF representative to Sri Lanka, Mr. Ted Chaiban and the leader of the LTTE’s political wing, Mr. S.P. Tamilselvan, January 2004.

## 7. Bibliography

- Canadian Agency for International Development. Afghanistan. (<http://www.acdi-cida.gc.ca/CIDAWEB/acdicida.nsf/En/JUD-125141414-QKF#1>)
- Acharya, S. and Bhargava, V. *First Steps...Maldives...A giant Leap for Humankind: An evaluation of the ECCD Campaign*, UNICEF Maldives, 2004
- A Future Within Reach: Reshaping institutions in a region of disparities to meet the Millennium Development Goals in Asia and the Pacific 2005*, UN ESCAP, 2005, ([www.unescap.org](http://www.unescap.org))
- Ahmed Akhter U. et al., *Bangladesh's Food-for-Work Programme and Alternatives to Improve Food Security* ([www.ifpri.org/pubs/books/vonBraun95/vonBraun95ch03.pdf](http://www.ifpri.org/pubs/books/vonBraun95/vonBraun95ch03.pdf))
- Ahmed et al., K. *Social Protection Index for Committed Poverty Reduction*, Asian Development Bank, 2006
- Alderman, Harold *Subsidies as a Social Safety Net: Effectiveness and Challenges*, No. 0224, September 2002, page 12 (<http://siteresources.worldbank.org/SOCIALPROTECTION/Resources/SP-Discussion-papers/Safety-Nets-DP/0224.pdf>)
- Alderman, Harold *Subsidies as a Social Safety Net: Effectiveness and Challenges*, No. 0224, September 2002, page 22 (<http://siteresources.worldbank.org/SOCIALPROTECTION/Resources/SP-Discussion-papers/Safety-Nets-DP/0224.pdf>)
- All About India's Rural Job Guarantee Scheme, (<http://www.rediff.com/money/2005/aug/22spec1.html>)
- An Analytical Study of Basic Social Services in Nepal*, National Planning Commission/UNICEF, by Institute for Sustainable Development, Kathmandu, 2006, page 25
- Babu, Suresh Chandra *Social Safety Net for Poverty Reduction*, *Sri Lankan Journal of Agricultural Economics*, Vol. 5, No. 1, 2003 (<http://www.slageconr.net/sjae/sjae51f/sjae05101.pdf>)
- Bangladesh's Ministry of Women and Children affairs ([http://www.mopme.gov.bd/Basic%20Education%20to%20Hard%20to%20Reach%20\(06-07\).html](http://www.mopme.gov.bd/Basic%20Education%20to%20Hard%20to%20Reach%20(06-07).html)) (accessed 09-07-2007)
- Barrientos, Armando and Holmes, Rebecca *Social Assistance in Developing Countries Database*, IDS, University of Sussex, DFID, version 2.0 March 2006.
- Canadian International Development Agency, Micro finance programme in Afghanistan – National Programme (<http://www.acdi-cida.gc.ca/CIDAWEB/acdicida.nsf/En/JUD-1251644-SQ4>)
- Child Labour and the Globalising Economy: Lessons from Asia/Pacific*, Countries UNICEF – Bangladesh, Stanford University, California (<http://www.childlabour.org/symposium/noble.html>)
- Closing Statement by Shah M. Ali, Country Director, Pakistan Resident Mission Asian Development Bank, at the Pakistan Development Forum Organised by Government of Pakistan in Islamabad, Islamabad, Pakistan, 25-26 April 2005 (<http://www.adb.org/Documents/Speeches/2005/sp2005027.asp>)

Community-based education, Islamic government of Afghanistan, Ministry of Education, August 2006

*Do Crowded Classrooms Crowd Out Learning*, International Food Policy Research Institute, Evidence From the Food for Education Programme in Bangladesh (<http://www.ifpri.org/themes/mp18/wfp/FFE.pdf>)

*Fact Sheets on MDGs in South Asia*, UN ESCAP, October 2006

Gardener, Janet and Subrahmanian, Ramya, *Tackling Social Exclusion in Health and Education in Asia*. For DFID Asia Division, June 2005

*Gender Responsive Budgeting Initiative (GRBI)*, Annual Progress report 2006, Government of Pakistan, 2006 ([www.grbi.gov.pk/documents/apr\\_2006.pdf](http://www.grbi.gov.pk/documents/apr_2006.pdf))

Ghosh, Jayati *Making the Employment Guarantee Work* ([www.macrosan.org](http://www.macrosan.org))

Government of India, Freedom of Information Act, 2002, (<http://persmin.nic.in/actrules1.html>)

Government of Pakistan, Bait-ul-Mal ([http://www.pbm.gov.pk/new/Introduction\\_Links.html](http://www.pbm.gov.pk/new/Introduction_Links.html))

Government of Pakistan, Ministry of Labour, Manpower and Overseas Pakistanis, Labour and Manpower Division ([http://202.83.164.7/divisions/ContentInfo.jsp?DivID=30&cPath=349\\_353\\_563&ContentID=2218](http://202.83.164.7/divisions/ContentInfo.jsp?DivID=30&cPath=349_353_563&ContentID=2218))

Gupta, D.B. *Conditional Cash Transfers and Behaviour Change in India*, first preliminary draft, 2006, page 10-13

Gupta, D.B. *Conditional Cash Transfers and Behaviour Change in India*, first preliminary draft, 2006, page 17

Holzner, Bridget M. and Wit, Joop de, *Supporting Decentralised urban Governance: Training Women Municipal Councilors in Mumbai*, India, November 2003, ISS Working Paper no. 386

Husein, Ishrat *Pakistan's economic turnaround: An Untold Story*, *Reproduced from the Pakistan Supplement Global Agenda*, World Economic Forum Annual Meeting 2005 held at Davos in January, 2005 ([http://www.sbp.org.pk/about/speech/economic\\_management\\_policies/2005/Pakistan\\_Economic\\_Turnaround.pdf](http://www.sbp.org.pk/about/speech/economic_management_policies/2005/Pakistan_Economic_Turnaround.pdf))

ILO ([http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/gems/eo/program/pakistan/t\\_mce.html](http://www.ilo.org/public/english/employment/gems/eo/program/pakistan/t_mce.html))

ILO IPEC (<http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/asro/newdelhi/ipec/responses/pakistan/p6.html>)  
Information excerpted from [www.icgfm.org/documents/Sirker.ppt](http://www.icgfm.org/documents/Sirker.ppt)

ILO IPEC (International Programme on the Elimination of Child Labour) (<http://www.ipec-pakistan.org/tbp/tbp-phase-03.html>)

ILO Sub-Regional Office for South Asia, (<http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/asro/newdelhi/ipec/responses/pakistan/p6.html>)

***Increasing Contraceptive Use in Rural Pakistan: An Evaluation of the Lady Health Worker Programme***

(<http://www.comminit.com/healthcomm/case-studies.php?showdetails=290>)

Köhler, Gabriele and Keane, Jennifer Analytical Report. *Social Policy in South Asia: Towards Universal Coverage and Transformation for Achieving the Millennium Development Goals*, UNICEF/UNRISD

Köhler, Gabriele *Social Policy in South Asia: Towards Universal Coverage and Transformation for Achieving the Millennium Development Goals* CD, Kathmandu, May 2006;

Köhler, Gabriele *Concept note on social policy*, Kathmandu, November 2006, ([www.unicef.rosa.org](http://www.unicef.rosa.org))

Köhler, Gabriele *Paradox of the South Asian Welfare State*, Himal South Asian, Nepal, September 2006, Volume 19, No. 6, ([www.himalmag.com](http://www.himalmag.com))

Lady Health Workers, National Programme for Family Planning and Primary Health care, Ministry of Health, Government of Pakistan (<http://www.phc.gov.pk/template.php?id=30>)

Lahiri, Ashok Chakraborty, Lekha S. and Bhattacharyya, P. N. *Gender Budgeting in India*, 2003 (<http://www.gender-budgets.org/content/view/110/144/>)

Lawoti, Sagun S. *Welcome to School: Rallying for Universal Access to Education in Nepal*, 7 June 2006 (<http://www.reliefweb.int/rw/RWB.NSF/db900SID/EGUA-6QKRPG?OpenDocument>)

*Learning from Good Practices in Children's and Young People's Participation: Child Club Case Studies*, Volume III, UNICEF, December 2004

Local shuras are an equivalent of village-level councils (<http://hrw.org/press/2002/04/qna-loyagirga.pdf>)

Mahmud Simeen, *Female Secondary School Stipend Programme in Bangladesh: A critical assessment*, Bangladesh Institute of Development Studies, July 2003 ([http://72.14.235.104/search?q=cache:A6V4M2tZMIJ:portal.unesco.org/education/en/file\\_download.php/6c1807a68c58613a407957a6adbd8cc7Female%2Bsecondary%2Bschool%2Bstipend%2Bprogramme%2Bin%2BBangladesh.doc+Female+Secondary+School+Stipend+Programme+in+Bangladesh&hl=en&ct=clnk&cd=1](http://72.14.235.104/search?q=cache:A6V4M2tZMIJ:portal.unesco.org/education/en/file_download.php/6c1807a68c58613a407957a6adbd8cc7Female%2Bsecondary%2Bschool%2Bstipend%2Bprogramme%2Bin%2BBangladesh.doc+Female+Secondary+School+Stipend+Programme+in+Bangladesh&hl=en&ct=clnk&cd=1))

Mander Harsh, Joshi Abha, *The Movement for the Right to Information in India: People's Power for the Control of Corruption* (<http://www.humanrightsinitiative.org/programs/ai/rti/india/articles/The%20Movement%20for%20RTI%20in%20India.pdf>)

Ministry of Labour, Manpower and Overseas Pakistanis, Labour and Manpower Division, ([http://202.83.164.7/divisions/ContentInfo.jsp?DivID=30&cPath=349\\_353\\_563&ContentID=2218](http://202.83.164.7/divisions/ContentInfo.jsp?DivID=30&cPath=349_353_563&ContentID=2218))

Ministry of Rural Development, India, NREGA (<http://nrega.nic.in/>)

Ministry of Rural Development, India, NREGA (<http://nrega.nic.in/conf.asp>)

Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development, Afghanistan (<http://www.mrrd.gov.af/nabdp/>) (accessed on 09-07-2007)

Ministry of Rural Rehabilitation and Development, Afghanistan  
(<http://www.mrrd.gov.af/vau/Project%20Reports/NSS%20EC%20Phase%20I%20Final%20Report%20Oct%2005.pdf>)

Ministry of Women development, Pakistan  
([http://www.pakistan.gov.pk/ministries/ContentInfo.jsp?MinID=17&cPath=182\\_413&ContentID=5056](http://www.pakistan.gov.pk/ministries/ContentInfo.jsp?MinID=17&cPath=182_413&ContentID=5056))  
(accessed on 09-07-2007)

Mkandaware, Thandika *Social Policy in a Development Context*, UNRISD, Geneva, 2005, page 1

Mkandaware, Thandika *ibid*; Ortiz Isabel, *Social Policy Guidance Note*, UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs (DESA), New York, 2006, ([www.undesa.org](http://www.undesa.org))

Murgai Rinku, Zaidi Salman, *Effectiveness of Food Assistance Programmes in Bangladesh*, abstract  
(<http://jds.sagepub.com/cgi/content/abstract/21/1-2/121?ck=nck>)

National Health Policy 2001, Government of Pakistan

*Ninth Plan, Chapter 15: Social Welfare, Government of India*, page 366  
(<http://planningcommission.nic.in/plans/mta/mta-9702/mta-ch15.pdf>) (Accessed 23-5-06)

Orangi Pilot Project (<http://www.oppinstitutions.org/>)

Ortiz, Isabel *Social Policy Guidance Note*, UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs (DESA), New York, 2006, page 5, ([www.undesa.org](http://www.undesa.org))

Pakistan MDG Report 2005, Government of Pakistan, page 37  
(<http://www.un.org.pk/undp/publication/PMDGR05.pdf>)

Pakistan Residential Mission working paper, *Targeting efficiency of Poverty Reduction Programmes in Pakistan*, ADB, 2006 ([http://www.adb.org/documents/PRM/Working\\_Papers/wp-04.pdf](http://www.adb.org/documents/PRM/Working_Papers/wp-04.pdf))

Participatory budgeting ([http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Participatory\\_budgeting](http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Participatory_budgeting))

*Para-legal Committees in Nepal: Information Kit*, UNICEF, Kathmandu, 2006

*Poverty in Pakistan in the 1990s: An Interim Assessment: Summary of the Report*, World Bank for the Pakistan Human Development Forum (January 24-16, 2002), Islamabad, January 2002  
(<http://siteresources.worldbank.org/PAKISTANEXTN/Resources/pdf-Files-in-Events/Poverty+Paper.pdf>)

*Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper: Accelerating Economic Growth and Reducing Poverty: The Road Ahead*, IMF Country Report No. 04/24, January 2004  
[http://www.pakistan.gov.pk/ministries/planninganddevelopment-ministry/annual%20plans/2006-07/Chapter\\_6/Rural%20Development.pdf](http://www.pakistan.gov.pk/ministries/planninganddevelopment-ministry/annual%20plans/2006-07/Chapter_6/Rural%20Development.pdf)

*Poverty Reduction Strategy Paper Third Quarter Progress Report for the Year 2004-05*, PRSP Secretariat, Finance Division, Government of Pakistan  
([http://www.moe.gov.pk/3rd%20Quarter%20Progress%20Report%20\(2004-05\).pdf](http://www.moe.gov.pk/3rd%20Quarter%20Progress%20Report%20(2004-05).pdf))

Presentation by Schneider Katrin UNDP, *Gender Responsive Budgeting: Overview of GRB activities in different countries, good practices and lessons learnt*, Bangkok, May 2007  
([www.undp.or.th/mdg/documents/Katrin3.ppt](http://www.undp.or.th/mdg/documents/Katrin3.ppt))

Presentation by Schneider Katrin UNDP, *Gender Responsive Budgeting: Overview of GRB activities in different countries, good practices and lessons learnt*, Bangkok, May 2007  
([www.undp.or.th/mdg/documents/Katrin3.ppt](http://www.undp.or.th/mdg/documents/Katrin3.ppt))

Programmes and Schemes, Empowerment and rehabilitation of children (as orphans, destitute, victims of drug abuse, sexual exploitation, dependents of addicts etc.)  
([http://www.unodc.org/pdf/india/publications/inventory\\_of\\_Schemes\\_and\\_Programmes/06\\_section4.pdf](http://www.unodc.org/pdf/india/publications/inventory_of_Schemes_and_Programmes/06_section4.pdf))

*Programming experience in Early Child Protection (ECP)*, UNICEF, November 2006

*Programmes for Child Development* (<http://www.kar.nic.in/dwcd/chidev.pdf>)

*Regaining Sri Lanka: Vision and Strategy for Accelerated Development*, Government of Sri Lanka, December 2002

Regional Poverty Profile 2005; *Poverty Reduction in South Asia through Productive Employment*, SAARC Secretariat, Kathmandu, August 2006

Relief Web (taken from World Health Report 2006, WHO)  
(<http://reliefweb.int/rw/RWB.NSF/db900SID/KH11-6PG3X4?OpenDocument>)

Sampoorna Grameen Rozgar Yojana (SGRY) Guidelines (<http://rural.nic.in/SGRY%20Guidelines%20-%20Final.html>)

Samson, Michael Niekerk, Ingrid van and Quene, Kenneth Mac, *Designing and Implementing Social Transfer Programmes*, EPRI Press, Capetown, ([www.epri.org.za/socialtransfers](http://www.epri.org.za/socialtransfers))

*South Asia Booklet on Child-relevant Socioeconomic Indicators*, UNICEF ROSA, Kathmandu, July 2006, ([www.unicef.rosa.org](http://www.unicef.rosa.org))

*South Asia Report*, UNICEF ROSA, Kathmandu, 2006, ([www.unicef.rosa.org](http://www.unicef.rosa.org))

Statement by Mr. Ahsan Akhtar Malik, Joint Secretary (LW) on Global Report Under the Follow Up to the ILO Declaration on Fundamental Principle and Rights at Work, Geneva, 9 June 2006  
([http://missions.itu.int/~pakistan/2005\\_Statements/Labour\\_ILO/stakhtarmalik\\_9jun06.html](http://missions.itu.int/~pakistan/2005_Statements/Labour_ILO/stakhtarmalik_9jun06.html))

*State of the World's Children 2007*, Global Report, New York 2006, ([www.unicef.org](http://www.unicef.org))

The information presented draws on Nepal National Planning Commission, Basic Social Services, draft report (no date) ([www.npc.gov.np/report/basicSocialService/Chapter1.doc](http://www.npc.gov.np/report/basicSocialService/Chapter1.doc))

*The Millennium Development Goals: Progress and Challenges in South Asia 2006*, UNICEF ROSA, Kathmandu

UNDP, Afghanistan, ([http://www.undp.org.af/about\\_us/overview\\_undp\\_afg/psl/prj\\_nabdp.html](http://www.undp.org.af/about_us/overview_undp_afg/psl/prj_nabdp.html))



For more information, please contact:

The United Nations Children's Fund (UNICEF)  
3 United Nations Plaza,  
Knowledge Management and Policy Advocacy Section,  
New York, NY 10017, USA

E-mail: [workingpapers@unicef.org](mailto:workingpapers@unicef.org)

Website: [www.unicef.org/policyanalysis](http://www.unicef.org/policyanalysis)